

Pigott, Charles Maurice (2013) *Voices of the mountains: language and identity in Andeansongs*. PhD Thesis. SOAS, University of London

http://eprints.soas.ac.uk/17358

Copyright © and Moral Rights for this thesis are retained by the author and/or other copyright owners.

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.

This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder/s.

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

When referring to this thesis, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given e.g. AUTHOR (year of submission) "Full thesis title", name of the School or Department, PhD Thesis, pagination.

# Voices of the Mountains Language and Identity in Andean Songs

# **Charles Maurice Pigott**

Thesis submitted for the degree of PhD in Linguistics 2013

Department of Languages and Cultures of Africa

School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

## **Declaration**

I have read and understood regulation 17.9 of the Regulations for students of the School of Oriental and African Studies concerning plagiarism. I undertake that all the material presented for examination is my own work and has not been written for me, in whole or in part, by any other person. I also undertake that any quotation or paraphrase from the published or unpublished work of another person has been duly acknowledged in the work which I present for examination.

Signed: Date: 15/08/13

# **Dedication**

Llapan Bolognesiwan Pumapampa kaq runakunapaq, shunqunkunaman chaskimaqta, paykunapis shunquuman yaykurkaqta.

Para toda la gente de Bolognesi y de Pomabamba, que me recibieron en sus corazones, y que también llegaron a ser parte de mí.

Dedicated to the people of Bolognesi and Pomabamba, who welcomed me into their hearts, and who have, in turn, become part of me.

#### Abstract

This thesis is a conceptual exegesis of 'identity' through the lens of Andean song-texts. I collected the songs during a year's fieldwork in Ancash department, Peru. The texts are in the two local languages, Ancash Quechua and Spanish. By exploring various discourses of Self and Other in the texts, I engage with two differing accounts of 'identity' in academia: 1) 'identity' as fluid, fragmentary and unstable; 2) 'identity' as an abiding, transcendental essence. My aim is not to advocate one over the other, but to question why these two interpretations have evolved, and how they can be reconciled in a global interpretation. The structure of the thesis reflects these two main orientations of 'identity': Chapters Two (Part One) and Three explore more 'processual' accounts, while Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four discuss more 'essentialist' discourses. Chapter Two as a whole explores interview-excerpts concerning the social role of waynus, an Andean song-genre. Chapter Three examines the building of community through reciprocity, as portrayed in four songgenres. Chapter Four discusses two genres which reinvent the Incan past and posit a clear divide between 'in-group' and 'out-group'. My main finding in all of the texts is the predication of identification on survival, whereby we define the social world in such a way that our sense of security is maximized. This, in turn, results from the mutual constitution of Self and Environment. In the Conclusion, I draw on Heidegger (1927), Merleau-Ponty (1964) and Derrida (1967) to engage in depth with the issues of Self and Other, 'identity' and 'alterity' that reveal themselves in the texts. My final exegesis of the texts, informed by such congruent philosophical theorizations, offers a way out of the apparent contradictions in the diverse usages of 'identity', but only if we reconceptualize the notions of 'entity' and 'process'.

#### **Acknowledgements**

This thesis was funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council, and my participation in the Quechua language-course was facilitated by a grant from the School of Oriental and African Studies. I am most grateful to both institutions. I also extend my warmest thanks to my supervisors at various stages, Prof. Graham Furniss, Prof. Trevor Marchand, Prof. Peter Sells and Prof. Itesh Sachdey, for their interest and support during my project. A big 'thank you' to Dr Nicole Bourque, who gave me free range over her extensive collection of articles. Drs. Dan and Diane Hintz, and Oscar and Janet Huárac gave invaluable help and guidance in terms of suggesting research-sites and putting me in touch with Quechua-speakers, and I wish to express my deepest gratitude to them. Emil Mejía, a musician, folklorist and Quechua-teacher, was a wealth of information and remains a good friend, as well as helping me considerably with making contacts in Chiquián. I also give heartfelt thanks to Don Fidel Convercio and Doña Dora Ibarra, for opening their home to me during my stay in Chiquián, and for receiving me into their family. Also to their sons, Edison Convercio and Arelí Convercio, who became close friends, wonderful travelling companions, and close collaborators in this project, their daughters-in-law, Gina and Daniela, and their grandchildren, David, Kimberley, Chris, Mitzi, Brandon and Rose. I am grateful to Joel Rivas and his wife, Nancy, for welcoming me to their home during my many visits to Pacllón, and to Doña Alejandrina Sabina Loarte for her generous information on songs in Chiquián. In Pomabamba, I thank Don Antonio Vidal and Doña Enma Valverde, for their wonderful hospitality, and Moisés Zavaleta and his family for their friendship, enthusiasm and invaluable support in collecting and interpreting local songs. Deepest thanks also to Don Eber Álvarez, Don Jorge Álvarez, Don Julio Álvarez and their families for their friendship and generous assistance in making contacts in Pomabamba, and to Don Marianito Paulino, custodian of ancient Yayno, for his friendship, kindness and generosity in offering me a wealth of information on Pomabamba's traditions. I express my warmest gratitude to the many people who gave me their time and invited me into their homes to share their poetry with me, and to all the people of Bolognesi and Pomabamba, who received me with such warmth. Finally, I thank my parents, Maurice and Kathryn, for their unshakeable support through thick and thin, and, above all, for their encouragement always to follow where my heart and mind may lead me.

# **Contents**

Chapter		Page
	Preliminaries	
	A: Declaration	2
	B: Dedication	3
	C: Abstract	4
	D: Acknowledgements	5
	E: Contents	6
	F: Illustrative Materials	8
	G: Key to Abbreviations	9
	H: Note on References	9
One	Introduction: The Prelude	11
	A: The Nature of the Study	11
	A1: The Question	11
	A2: A Dialogic Methodology	12
	B: Theoretical Framework	16
	B1: Quechua Philosophical Concepts	16
	B2: Selected European Philosophers	21
	C: The Data	27
	C1: Rationale for Studying Songs	27
	C2: On Genre	31
	C3: Methods of Data-Collection	32
	C4: Self-Selection of Themes	35
	D: Contexts	36
	D1: Contribution to the Literature	37
	D2: Potential Objections	38
	D3: The Setting	43
	E: Ancash Quechua: An Overview	48
	E1: History	48
	E2: Contemporary Sociolinguistic Situation	51
	E3: Phonology (Sound System)	54
	E4: Morpho-Syntax (Structure of Words and Sentences)	55
	E5: Contact Phenomena	58
	E6: Orthography (Writing System)	58
	F: Presentation	60
o	Weaving Worlds with Waynu	64
	A: Part One: Identity-Creation as an Intersubjective Process	65
	A1: Formation of Waynus from a Subjective State	66

	A2: The Communication of Subjective Experience A3: The Intersubjective Basis of Social Unity A4: Summary	68 75 82
	B: Part Two: Waynus as Abiding Identity	84
	B1: General Level	85
	B2: Town and Provincial Level	88
	B3: Andean Level	96
	B4: National Level	102
	B5: Summary	113
	C: Conclusion	114
Three	The Resonance of Reciprocity: Creating Community through Cooperation	124
	A: Carnaval	126
	B: Masha	133
	B1: Start of the Festival	134
	B2: Arrival of the Grandfather and Black Man	139
	B3: Arrival of People from Lima B4: The Bullfight	144 146
	C: Wayta Muruy	153
	D: Negritos	166
	E: Conclusion	177
	E1: Synthesis of Chair, Trace and Dasein	177
	E2: Dialogue with the Andean Songs	182
Four	The Last Inca: Poetic Perceptions of the Past	187
	A: Apu Inka	190
	A1: Inka Hipimuy	191
	A2: Camino del Inca	195
	A3: Harawi mañakuna / Adoración	202
	A4: Pizarrowan Kaptinqa Kaynawmi A5: Adoración Ushaskiptin	207 213
	A6: Resentimiento del Inca	213
	A7: Tambo Inkapa	224
	A8: Southern Quechua in the <i>Apu Inka</i>	230
	A9: Phonological Modification of Quechua Words	231
	B: Las Pallas	232
	B1: Tambo (Version from Pacllón)	232
	B2: Entrada (Version from Carcas)	237
	B3: Verso del Inca (Raquia)	241
	C: Conclusion	244

Five	Conclusion: Identity and Alterity – Re-Uniting the Threads	254
	A: The Dynamic Substance	255
	B: The Temporality of Being	262
	C: The Mutual Emergence of Categories	270
	D: The Meaning of 'Identity': Beyond 'Entity' and 'Process' towards 'Potentiality'	276
Bibliography		283

# **Illustrative Materials**

List o	f Photographs and Illustrations	Page
1.	. Martín del Río with his harps	10
2.	. Faustino Emigio Aguado Alva and his family	10
3.	. Map of Peru	40
4.	. Map of Ancash	40
5.	. Map of Bolognesi	41
6.	. Map of Pomabamba	41
7.	Juan Vergara with his textile depiction of waynus	63
8.	. The front door of César Bolo's house	63
9.	. Carnaval in Huasta	123
10	0. The <i>Antis</i>	123
1:	1. An ancient depiction of the sun at Rarapunta	186
17	2. Don Marianito giving thanks to <i>Pachamama</i>	186
13	3. Waychaw bird	253
14	4. The church in Mangas	253
1!	5. Brass band in Shilla	282
10	6. Chris, Mitzi and the author at Úsgor	282
List o	f Tables	
1.	Consonant inventory of Ancash Quechua	54
2.	Vowel inventory of Ancash Quechua	54
3.	Present tense verbal suffixes of Ancash Quechua	56
4.	Orthography used in this thesis	60

## **Contents of CD**

Tracks 1-4: *Pallas* (Pacllón version), sung by Hilda Osoriano with Arelí Convercio and Luís Lucio Mendoza Osoriano on the guitar:

- 1. Entrada en la Iglesia (Entering the Church)
- 2. Vestimenta (Dressing the Inca)
- 3. *Pasacalle* (Walking through the Streets)
- 4. Tambo (Execution of the Inca) and Waynu

Tracks 5-9: *Apu Inka* (Pomabamba version), sung by Célica Álvarez Jaramillo with Jorge Álvarez on the violin and Francisco Vergaray on the harp:

- 5. Canto de Presagio de las Ñustas (The Ñustas' Foreboding)
- 6. Tambo (Eulogy to the Inca)
- 7. Felipillo Tupamaru (Song about Felipe)
- 8. Canto de Aflicción de las Ñustas (Before the Execution of the Inca)
- 9. Canto de Aflicción de las Ñustas (After the Execution of the Inca)

Note: The transcription of Track Four is presented in Chapter Four. The *Apu Inka* presented in Chapter Four is a different, older, version of the songs in the CD, which are integral parts of a play performed in Pomabamba (the author is anonymous).

# **Key to Abbreviations**

Abbreviations are presented in alphabetical and numerical order:

#### Beginning with a Letter

AQ: Ancash Quechua

IFUT: Inclusive first-person plural, future tense

IOBJ: Inclusive first-person plural objectIPOSS: Inclusive first-person plural possessivemt: my translation (used in references)

SQ: Southern Quechua

VR: Verbal root

#### Beginning with a Number

1EVI: Evidential of certainty

2EVI: Evidential of suggestion/doubt2PRES: Second-person present tense3EVI: Evidential of reported information

3PRES: Third-person present tense

#### **Note on References**

This thesis follows the Harvard system. If I mention an author's name in the text, then, to avoid waste of space through duplication, only the year and page-number appear in the following parentheses. For example: 'according to [author X], [quote/paraphrase] (year: page-number)'. If the author is not specified in the text, then the name appears in the reference, e.g.: (author year: page-number). Thus, unless otherwise indicated, references pertain to the author mentioned immediately prior to the reference. Where I have translated quotes into English, this is indicated by 'mt' ('my translation'), following the page-reference.



Martín del Río, singer, composer and manufacturer of harps, here displaying his creations above the main square in Pomabamba.



Faustino Emigio Aguado Alva, a *waynu* singer and composer from Gorgorillo, Bolognesi, and his family. The lady is wearing a hat with yellow amancay flowers (*Alstroemeria* species), indicative of the relation between flowers and femininity in the Andes.

#### **Chapter One: Introduction**

#### The Prelude

#### The Nature of the Study

#### The Question

This thesis is about one word. Identity. It explores how the language of songs in two Andean provinces can inform our theoretical understanding of this word. Believing, with Bauman, that 'Conventional meanings can carry scholarship just so far...before the lack of conceptual rigor begins to constrain analytical insight rather than advancing it' (1978:4), I do not attempt to give a clear-cut definition of 'identity' from the outset and then see how 'identity' plays itself out in the data. Rather, I use the data in order to engage in a conceptual exegesis of what 'identity' means. Etymologically, 'identity' derives from the Latin idem 'the same' (Allen et al. 2000:695), but the multifarious ways it is used belie a simplistic reduction to 'sameness'. Moreover, and to recall Leibnitz (particularly his Principle of the Identity of Indiscernibles), two 'things' cannot be exactly the same because the very act of comparison presupposes some difference. This thesis is therefore motivated by criticisms such as the following: "identity" is too ambiguous, too torn between "hard" and "soft" meanings, essentialist connotations and constructivist qualifiers, to serve well the demands of social analysis' (Brubaker & Cooper 2000:2); 'Tied to a concept as flexible as society, the notion of identity is as multiform as quicksilver and just as difficult to pin down' (Berger 1999:126); 'identity cannot and should not be used as an explanatory concept in the study of linguistic practices, as it is itself in need of explanation' (Pavlenko & Blackledge's paraphrasing of critical trends in sociolinguistics, in Pavlenko & Blackledge 2004:9). The discourse of 'identity' cannot, nonetheless, be ignored: 'The broad scope of this concept has made identity the common theoretic property of folklorists of every stripe and scholars from most of the other branches of the humanities and social sciences' (Berger 1999:102). Given that to talk of 'identity' means opening up a scholarly can of worms, it is high time that the lid be cast aside and the contents scooped out. I do not argue for or against the use of 'identity' as an analytical term, but accept that it is used in such a manner and aim to account for its application to such diverse discussions. The question is neither 'what is "identity"?' nor 'is "identity" a useful term?' but 'what do we mean when we talk of "identity""?

In order to answer this question, the thesis discusses the texts of Andean folksongs (and interviews thereupon) which I collected in various settlements of the central Peruvian Andes. These texts are part of a repository of oral literature that survives in the mountains of Ancash department, and are alternately in Ancash Quechua (the indigenous language) (henceforth AQ) and Spanish (the national language), and often a mixture of the two. My analysis shall therefore draw on the linguistic features of both languages. I transcribed all of the texts during a year's period of fieldwork between 2010 and 2011. What is interesting about these texts in terms of 'identity' is that the issues of Self and Other, groupness and individuality, surface in many diverse ways, although this diversity can be reduced to a number of central themes (which informs the division between chapters in this thesis). Many of these discourses seem at first to be irreconcilable, and it is the attempt to reconcile such diverse understandings that will allow us, in turn, to resolve the alleged contradictions of 'identity'. My analytical methodology is therefore unusual insofar as it does not treat the Andean texts as passive 'objects' to be analysed by the intellectual 'agent'. Rather, the roles are partially reversed: the agent becomes exoticized while the exotic Other becomes familiarized. It is out of this cultural reconciliation that the conceptual reconciliation of 'identity' can be achieved.

#### A Dialogic Methodology

A key distinction that is the starting point for this thesis is the contrast between 'emic' amd 'etic'. The terms were originally coined by Pike (1967), who took them from the linguistic concepts of 'phonemic' and 'phonetic'. The 'phonetic' pertains to the sounds that people utter, while the 'phonemic' pertains to people's perceptions of these sounds in the creation of meaning (different languages classify the same sounds in different ways, so that the same two sounds can signify different words in one language, and just different pronunciations of the same word in another language). Thus, the 'etic' (from 'phonetic') is what really goes on, while the 'emic' (from 'phonemic') is what people perceive. Transferring this distinction from linguistics to anthropology, however, is problematic, since, in the context of cultural practice, 'what' happens – the event – is often definable only in terms of culturally specific motivations. Thus, the terms have undergone a degree of conceptual evolution, so that, nowadays, they are definable as follows: 'An emic analysis documents valid principles that describe behavior in any one culture, taking into account what the people themselves value as meaningful and important. The goal of an etic analysis is to make generalizations across cultures that take into account all human behaviour' (Brislin 1976:215).

Thus, an etic concept would be one that applies everywhere, and an emic concept is one that applies locally. However, any concept must originate in a context and have its own historical trajectory, which raises the question of how it is possible to privilege some concepts as 'etic' over others that are merely 'emic'. Why should *identity* (English) have precedence over *tinku* (Quechua)? A partial solution would be to extend the etic so that it encompasses the emic. Price-Williams argues that 'What we need is an extension of our etic categories through a sufficient knowledge of the emic categories' (1974:100). Similarly, Peek and Yankah state that 'we must understand the emic...aspects first, before moving to the etic...dimensions' (2003:XI). Thus, the emic/etic distinction does not imply that our analytical categories be uncritically applied to every context. Rather, it implies a constant renegotiation of the 'etic' through deep engagement with the 'emic'. In this view, then, neither the 'emic' nor the 'etic' can be taken as rigidly distinct categories, because any situation calls for the reappraisal of personal understandings on the basis of novel contexts (cf. Finnegan 1992b:127).

The 'emic' and 'etic' are, then, to be understood as points of departure, and the application of each term to a specific concept is inherently relational. No concept is intrinsically etic, and none is intrinsically emic. For me (a British scholar with English as my first language), the concept of 'identity' is etic, because it is part of my cultural baggage. I therefore use this term as a point of access to the world around me. I see Andean notions such as *tinku* as emic, because they are part of a world that I have, by comparison, only recently encountered. For someone born in the mountains of Peru, however, *tinku* may be their initial optic, and view the concept of 'identity' – once they encounter it – as more foreign, or at least less familiar. For this person, *tinku* is etic, and 'identity' is emic. The question, for them, is how to interpret 'identity' within the framework of *tinku*, not the other way round. Thus, the way to reconcile the situatedness of concepts with their deployment as categories of analysis is to view them as ever-evolving stances, which engage in a constant dialectic process out of which neither concept (etic or emic) emerges as it was before. The act of reconciliation is, after all, an act of change, but an act of change that is true to the general orientation, or dialectic projection, of each hitherto separate category. Berry (1969:124) outlines this methodological approach as follows:

'Modification of our external categories must...be made in the direction of the system under study, until we eventually achieve a truly emic description of behaviour within that culture. That is, an emic description can be made by progressively altering the imposed etic until it matches a purely emic point of view; if this can be done without entirely destroying or losing all of the etic character of the entry categories, then we can proceed to the next step [i.e. that of applying the etic to other contexts]. If some of the etic is left, we can now note the

categories or concepts which are shared by the behaviour system we knew previously and the one we have just come to understand emically. We can now set up a derived etic which is valid for making comparisons between two behavior settings and we have essentially resolved the problem of obtaining a descriptive framework valid for comparing behavior across behavioral settings'.

This means that the etic is never a finished product, but is constantly sharpened and nuanced with each application to new contexts. If the same acts of reconciliation are conducted from the 'other side' (i.e. from the other culture's 'etic', which is my 'emic'), then the capacity is formed for building cognitive bridges between societies. This allows us to elucidate and thereby challenge unquestioned assumptions, while ensuring that the universalization of knowledge is conducted not through hegemony but instead through widening circles of inclusion. Thus, if we are to truly overcome the colonial project of treating indigenous cultures as mere 'objects' of analysis, we must apply the same analytical rigour to such cultures as we would to a scholarly publication in the academic setting. We must treat indigenous concepts as serious rational propositions — and therefore critically — rather than as singular cultural items which only have validity within their limited contexts. That way, through critical dialogue between European and non-European orientations, the latter can feed directly back into academic theory and methodology, so that the 'etic', or universal, ceases to be the property of one specific group.

This methodology, of critical dialogue, is the central analytical tool that I deploy in this thesis. Through detailed analysis of specific linguistic, literary, cultural and historical references in the Andean songs, I seek to uncover underlying philosophical orientations about Self and Other, groupness and individuality. I set up a dialogue between these Andean philosophical tendencies and elements of European philosophy – specifically, the writings of Heidegger (1927/1967), Derrida (1967) and Merleau-Ponty (1964) – which display similar ways of conceptualizing 'identity'. The outcome of this dialogue is a reconciliation between the 'processual' and 'essential' dimensions of identity, and a consequent resolution of the alleged contradictions alluded to on the first page.

In this way, then, the engagement with the Other (the Andean texts) is highly reflexive, because it is through this engagement that we can challenge our own assumptions. My focus on the concept of 'identity' does not, therefore, represent the desire to privilege European terms over Andean ones, but quite the opposite: to reveal certain unquestioned and logically unsubstantiated European (perhaps not only European?) assumptions which create false intellectual dilemmas. It is only by 'cutting one's conceptual teeth' against seemingly very different worldviews that these assumptions can be brought to the surface and reformulated in more productive directions. This methodology,

while maintaining the rigour of logical analysis, questions the divide between student (subject) and studied (object), insofar as the latter becomes empowered as an equal player in the discussion, and the former continuously modifies his/her own cognitive orientations in accordance with what the latter has to say. Indeed, this ideal of dialogue between equals is arguably where the ethical and the intellectual domains of existence have a common origin: true intellectual openness is achieved through acts of reconciliation, by treating the difference between Self and Other as a point of convergence and not as a point of radical separation.

It is crucial to note that this dialogue occurs on several levels and between several agents. Conflating these levels would result in the same kind of imposition that I am attempting to avoid. One level of dialogue is that between Andean concepts and Western philosophical theories. Together, these form 'theory', and the theoretical corpus enters into dialogue at another, secondary, level with the data. Positing the Andean concepts as 'data' rather than 'theory' (and thereby conflating these two levels) would be to commit a significant error, because these concepts only surface in some parts of the data (notably, in Chapters Three and Four). Likewise, each Western philosophical treatise speaks more directly with some parts of the data than with others. To posit the Andean concepts as synonymous with the texts themselves would therefore be to impose the concepts on those texts where they do not feature, reifying the texts as part of a monolithic Andean Worldview. Thus, in keeping with the non-hierarchical relation between the etic and emic, the theory and data inform each other and partially derive from each other without being entirely conflated from the outset. Just as there is a dialogue internal to the theory, so there is a parallel dialogue among the data: texts are compared with each other and grouped according to similar themes, and these themes are placed in dialogue with each other so that their apparent differences can be reconciled. The third level is that between the whole discussion (theory plus data) on the one hand, and the concept of 'identity' on the other hand. Again, there is a connection between each half, but not a conflation, for the reconciliation must be achieved through meaningful dialogue on the same plane.

Thus, there are three main levels of dialogue. Within the first level, two dialogues occur independently: 1) between Andean concepts and Western philosophical treatises (theory); 2) between texts with different themes (data). The second level is a dialogue between theory and data. The third level is a dialogue between 'theory plus data' and 'identity'. Within these levels occur several sub-levels (theory-internal dialogues between related concepts; between myself and my interlocutors in Peru; between different interlocutors living in the Andes, etc. etc.). These levels

are not hierarchical in an intrinsic sense but are rather an expression of elements that are brought into meaningful relation by the overall question: what do we mean by 'identity'? And the levels must be defined in order to avoid imposing one voice over another, thus maintaining the intellectual ideal of dialogue between equals.

#### **Theoretical Framework**

Having presented the overall aims and rationale of the thesis, I now introduce the theoretical framework that will be deployed in order to tie together the diverse voices emanating from the texts, and thereby lead us towards an elucidation of the concept of 'identity'. Given that the main methodological innovation of this thesis is that of overcoming the agent/patient division by way of meaningful dialogue, 'framework' is not to be understood here as a rigid structure that is imposed on the data. Instead, it is one level of the dialogue as defined above, and is itself composed of a dialogue between Andean philosophical concepts and selected treatises from Western philosophers. The theory is therefore malleable, open to modification in accordance with the data. In this section, I first review some key Andean concepts, then introduce the writings of Merleau-Ponty, Derrida and Heidegger.

#### **Quechua Philosophical Concepts**

Tinku refers most generally to the 'convergence of oppositional forces' (Seligmann 2004:131), such as the meeting of two rivers or paths (Carranza Romero 2003:236, mt), or 'between two people on a footpath or even between lovers' (Stobart 2006:140). This convergence informs a second definition of the term as 'the correct, the exact, the necessary' (Stobart 2006:140) (understood as the perfect 'fit'). Harrison notes a more specific use of the term: 'A pan-Andean phenomenon, the tinkuy is a ritual battle between groups of men (and often women) which can end in death' (Harrison 1994:69, mt). Thus, tinku denotes "ritual battles in which two opposing [groups] meet one another...It resembles a combat between warriors, but in reality it concerns a rite: which unifies rather than separates...From the confrontation is born life, [which] is the realm of fertility and reproduction" (webpage of 'Fraternidad Taller Cultural Tinkus Wist'us', in Stobart 2006:134). The notion of tinku, then, stresses how productive relations emerge as much from difference as from similarity, so that tinku 'is a way of uniting opposite sides in a dialectic that clearly defines and recognizes the other as well as establishes their interdependence' (Bastien 1992:159, commenting on the Aymara cognate, nuwasi). Stobart notes how 'tinku has been widely associated with the definition and maintenance of balanced relations', so that the concept denotes a kind of "violent harmony" (Stobart 2006:140)

in non-hierarchical opposition (Bastien 1992:159). Thus, 'through *tinkuy*, social unity is created dialectically and expressed in terms of complementary opposition' (Allen 1988:205).

The transformative nature of tinku, whereby entities engage in a cathartic process of negotiation and transformation, dialogues with the concept of yachay, whose root meaning is 'to know, to understand deeply' (Carranza Romero 2003: 285), but which can also mean 'to get used to' and 'to like'. Stobart suggests that yachay may have derived from two verbalizing suffixes: -ya- (the intransitive act of becoming something) and -cha- (the transitive act of changing something). From this would originate the dual meaning of yachay as 'a) taking on form, becoming something, as the transformation of the subject, and (b) acting upon something (or someone) else, the object' (Stobart 2002:81). While this interpretation works better in Southern Quechua than in central Peru where the songs some from (the -cha- of Southern Quechua corresponds to the -tsi- of AQ), Stobart's etymological inferences are highly concordant with the intersubjective vision of knowledge as presented in the Andean songs. Howard also notes how yachay is a 'transformational process', whereby to "know" in Quechua...has to do with achieving a fuller state of being, in the sense that it is a process through which persons or states of affairs become "other" than what they were before the process was undergone' (Howard 2002:19). In this view, knowledge is to be conceptualized as 'processual "knowing", occurring in and through subjective practice, rather than as ready established, objectified fact, alienable from the experiential process in which it takes shape, and there to be "got" in an instrumental way' (Howard 2002:19). Crickmay similarly argues that yachay incorporates a worldview whereby 'the acquisition of knowledge is inseparable from experience of the human life cycle' (Crickmay 2002:43). Thus, like tinku, yachay denotes an existential transformation of Self through engagement with some Other, anticipating the fusion of epistemology (knowledge) and identity (being), as communicated by the three European philosophers I later draw upon.

The term *ayni*, like *tinku* and *yachay*, denotes a negotiated process of relation between two entities. Carranza Romero defines *ayni* as 'a free service that should be reciprocated in kind' (2003:42, mt), with *ayni* aruy denoting 'work that is conducted through solidarity' (2003:42, mt). *Ayni* has been defined as the "fundamental principle of Andean socioeconomic organization that consists of the reciprocal exchange of goods and services" (Valderrama and Escalante 1977, in Gelles & Escobar 1996:175), and 'refers to the equal exchange of a given good or service' (1996:175). Allen notes how, at 'the most abstract level, *ayni* is the basic give-and-take that governs the universal circulation of vitality. It can be positive, as when brothers-in-law labour in each others' fields; or it can be

negative, as when the two men quarrel and exchange insults' (1997:77), which means that *ayni* can also be defined as both 'advice' and 'reprimand' (Carranza Romero 2003:42). *Ayni* is therefore 'a system of continuous reciprocal interchanges, a kind of dialectical pumping mechanism' (1997:77) which facilitates the circulation of vital resources. Moreover, 'Every category of being, at every level, participates in this cosmic circulation' so that 'Humans maintain interactive reciprocity relationships, not only with each other but also with their animals, their houses, their potato fields, the earth, and the sacred places in their landscape' (1997:77). Thus, *ayni* is conceptualized 'not as an abstract principle of governing social interaction, but as the fundamental organizing basis of the material world' (Mannheim 1991:19).

The circulation of vital resources in ayni is also depicted in the concept of kallpa, which Carranza Romero defines as 'force, energy, vigour, power' (noun) and 'strong, energetic, vigorous' (adjective) (2003:91, mt). For Taylor, the term kallpa 'is used to indicate the power that results from effort and, above all, the power of the shaman' (1987:27, mt). Various interpretations of kallpa have been grouped by Godenzzi. For Santo Tomás, kallpay [callpay] denotes fuerza 'energy, force, strength' (1560/1951:245-246, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt); González Holguín defines kallpa [callpa] as las potencias 'power, capacity' (1608/1989:45, 527, in Godenzzi 2005:60); an anonymous source defines it as fuerza, vigor, trabajo 'strength, vigour, work' (Anonymous 1586/1951:20, in Godenzzi 2005:60). For Lira, kallpachay denotes 'animation, the act of animating or encouraging, to transmit energy, strengthen, invigorate, communicate strength' (1982:99, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt); for Herrero & Sánchez de Lozada, it means 'to make stronger or more vigorous, strengthen' (1983:122, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt), while, for Beyersdorff, it signifies 'to fertilize the land with guano' (1984:45, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt). Godenzzi argues that this term represents an 'economy of reciprocal animation of the world: each element interacts with others, allowing the transmission of vital energy so that, both singularly and as a unity, each element can completely fulfil its functions' (2005:65, mt).

Thus, while the core meaning of *kallpa* is 'strength' or 'energy', intrinsic to this concept is the sense that this energy can only arise through harmonious interaction with the Other, in the manner of *ayni*, which is achieved through a transformation of Self (*yachay*) in the encounter of *tinku*. Adelaar suggests that *kallpa* is 'one of the very rare cases of a non-derived noun which denotes an abstract notion' (1994:6-7, mt), which leads him to conclude that it may initially have been a physical attribute of the body, such as blood (1994:7). However, all of the above concepts problematize the division between the concrete (physical) and abstract (mental, ideological), insofar as the 'theory' is

also a practical guideline as to how to survive through proper relations with the environment. Following this conceptual review, I explain the significance of this insight for the thesis.

A concept that is closely related to *kallpa* is *kamay*. Carranza Romero defines this concept as 'to create' (2003:92, mt), an interpretation that is also followed by Lira (Lira 1982:100, in Godenzzi 2005:63) and Cusihuamán (Cusihuamán 1976:62, in Godenzzi 2005:63). Godenzzi argues that this is a modern meaning, resulting from missionary activity that has introduced a European religious worldview (2005:63, mt). Supporting this interpretation is Godenzzi's citation of colonial documents, which would suggest a broader – though by no means unrelated – conceptual basis for the term. For Garcilaso, *kama* [*cama*] denotes the Spanish *ánima* (Garcilaso de la Vega 1609/1973:72, in Godenzzi 2005:61), generally translated as 'soul' but with a life-giving connotation as in the verbal root *anima*- 'animate'. For Santo Tomás, the verb *kamani*- [*camani*] means 'fill', 'rear, or do something again', 'skim', 'fit in a place', 'fulfil'; *kamaynin* is 'the soul [*ánima*] thanks to which we live'; *kamaq* is 'breeder, or the one who does something again' (Santo Tomás 1560/1951:245-6, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt).

For González Holguín, kamaq [camak] means 'God, creator God', while sara [çara] camak [kamaq] allpa denotes 'land that is fertile for corn'; the verbal root camani is 'bear fruit, produce or rear'; verb root kamani [camani] means 'fit, enter well'; kamay [camay] is 'my obligation' (González Holguín 1608/1989: 47, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt). In addition, Godenzzi notes how, in numerous ritualistic usages of kama-, the morpheme denotes 'animation' or 'transmission of vital force' (Godenzzi 2005:61, mt). Summarizing the above usages, Godenzzi concludes that 'The term kamay contains two fundamental concepts: that of globality (all, total, fill, etc.) and that of orientation (until, responsible to, deserves, etc.) (Taylor 1976:234), so that Itier (1992b:1023) can define it as "to adjust to a volume", based on Domingo de Santo Tomás' definition "to fit in a place" (Godenzzi 2005:64). From this central definition, various meanings can be generated, such as 'to ensure that everything which has a purpose can fulfil it completely' or 'to transmit energy so that everything that should be can be' (Godenzzi 2005:64). Howard-Malverde argues that kamayuq [kamayoq] means 'the one who has the power to animate', and 'is the quintessential power to bring about transformation in the external world, in Quechua philosophy. The concept of kamayuq is the best illustration of the interdependency of economic and spiritual life in the Quechua productive enterprise' (1992:3). Thus, whilst the modern glossing of kamay as 'creation' does not contradict these interpretations, it is crucial to distinguish 'creation' in traditional Andean cosmology from 'creation' in a European religious sense: 'Kamay refers to creation not in the sense of making

something from nothing, but in the sense of controlling how something happens, of directing its mode of existence' (Allen 2002:34). This concords with the concept of *ayni*, whereby entities originate and are maintained through the reciprocal flow of *kallpa*, the vital energy that ceases to exist once it stagnates.

The concept of *aylluy* denotes 'to gather, bring together' (Carranza Romero 2003:41, mt), but, in the nominal form of *ayllu*, has the more specific meaning of 'community, a group of people who have family, historical or geographical ties' (2003:41, mt). Wissler notes that *ayllu* can refer to 'any indigenous group with a common frame of reference or connection. These connections include, for example, kinship ties, adherence to the same mountain deities, and the common focuses of cosmology, social structure, and economic organization' (2009:24). Allen likewise conveys how the term *ayllu* can be applied to many different situations: 'In many contemporary Andean communities, the word *ayllu* refers to a bilateral kindred, the group of people a given individual recognizes as kinsmen on both parents' sides of the family. Sometimes the word *ayllu* refers to moieties, or two halves, of a community, whereas in other contexts it refers to work groups temporarily mobilized to accomplish a specific task. Moreover, different usages can co-occur in a single community, and any given use of the word seems to make sense only within a limited context' (2002:82). What unites the above usages is the sense of the *ayllu* as a 'community...whose members share a common focus' (Allen 1988:257).

That the term *ayllu* denotes very different kinds of groups reflects the fact that different tasks call for different allegiances. Thus, in common with the aforementioned terms, the concept of *ayllu* unites the ideological with the practical, whereby group-affiliation is maintained insofar as it facilitates the successful performance of certain activities. The ultimate motivation is arguably physical survival. Allen, for example, notes how, in her field-site of Sonqo (Southern Peru), the *ayllu* is 'a great source of security and moral support' (2002:85), and Sichra highlights the role of the *ayllu* as 'the basis of the Andean productive system', whereby adherence to the *ayllu* 'implies obligations to its members, as well as rights over communal land' (Sichra 2005:50, ft. 14). The maintenance of the *ayllu* therefore depends on *ayni* (reciprocal cooperation) as well as *tinku* (strategic convergence and differentiation): 'it is the dialectical relationship between communalism and differentiation which, in the first place, motivates work by everyone in the community on certain tasks but which at the same time insists that such tasks should be performed by people working in their different *ayllu* groupings' (Urton 1981:231, my italics). This pattern of social organization allows for the efficient

circulation of *kallpa* (life-giving strength), which is the basis of production (*kamay*). And this process calls for an attunement of Self and Other in the act of engagement (*yachay*).

Gonzales notes how the 'ayllu is a kinship group, but it is not reduced to human lineage, but rather gathers each member of the local pacha (local landscape)' (2000:203). Pacha (or patsa in AQ) is the last concept to be examined in this initial review. Most specifically, pacha refers to the locality in which one is situated (2000:203), and 'is characterized by being animated, sacred, variable, harmonious, diverse, immanent, and cosubstantial' (2000:203). This means that 'the practice of agriculture represents the dialogue which occurs between diverse beings within the natural collectivity' (2000:203). The concept of pacha communicates how 'Everything is alive – a mountain, a rock, water, women, and men - and everything is incomplete', with this incompleteness representing the basis for 'dialogue and reciprocity in all aspects of existence' (2000:203). Therefore, pacha incorporates the notions of ayni (reciprocity), tinku (mutual genesis), kallpa (vital energy), kamay (reciprocal animation), yachay (knowledge and understanding) and ayllu (community). More generally, pacha can mean 'earth, including space, time, history, world' and 'cosmos' (Baumann 1996:25), fusing time and space in a single concept. Thus, pacha 'expresses in its spatial and chronic aspects the inner connectedness of the whole on all levels of world constructs' (1996:25). Salomon & Urioste designate pacha as 'an untranslatable word that simultaneously denotes a moment or interval in time and a locus or extension in space - and does so, moreover, at any scale' (1991:14); pacha is thus 'the world as a given arrangement of time, space, and matter' (1991:15).

#### Selected European Philosophers

The second theoretical corpus I draw upon is that of twentieth-century European philosophy. Insofar as this thesis is primarily a philosophical exegesis of the concept of 'identity', it makes sense to dialogue with philosophical tendencies in Europe, where this concept originates. I have selected certain writings from Merleau-Ponty, Heidegger and Derrida because of their close correspondence with the Andean texts that I collected, and which reflect the Quechua concepts that I outlined above. Insofar as this thesis is fundamentally dialogic, elucidating philosophical orientations through detailed engagement with texts, I deploy the same methodology for these philosophers as I do for the Andean poetry. Namely, in Chapter Five, I present extracts from each philosopher in the original language, citing specific terms and turns of phrase in the French and German which will guide us intuitively towards an accurate understanding of the passages. Each philosopher corresponds to

sections of a particular chapter: Merleau-Ponty to Chapter Two (Part One); Heidegger to Chapter Three; Derrida to Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four. Thus, I shall invoke each philosopher in the corresponding chapter. It must be stressed that my aim is not to provide a comprehensive review of each philosopher, but instead to select those aspects of their philosophies that are most congruent with the Andean data, in order to work towards a conceptual clarification of 'identity'.

Our discussion of Merleau-Ponty centres around the notion of chair 'flesh'. Merleau-Ponty notes how chair is not to be understood as a 'thing', rather as the condition of being which renders it possible to speak of 'things' at all (1964:175). Thus, it would be misleading to characterize chair as a 'concept', insofar as 'concept' suggests an entity that is bounded and localizable. Rather, chair is the universal substance out of which everything derives. Merleau-Ponty describes chair as 'the tissue which doubles, supports, nourishes [things] and which, itself, is not "thing" but "possibility", "latency", and "flesh" of things' (1964:175, mt). The nature of chair is revealed in any act of perception, where the individual perceives both his/her difference and yet similarity with the surrounding environment. Merleau-Ponty invokes the example of two touching hands in order to convey this fact: in the act of touching, each hand becomes aware of its own situatedness as well as the existence of the other hand (1964:176). Thus, chair communicates how the awareness of Self and Other arise simultaneously, through the very act of engagement. Any entity, then, is not to be understood as discrete and incompatible, rather as contingent and mutually constitutive. Merleau-Ponty defines the contingent nature of entities as facticité 'facticity' (1964:184), which corresponds roughly to 'situatedness', the fact of inhering with a particular context or set of relations. In this vision, difference is a mode of communication, not an unbreachable gap that separates irreconcilable categories (1964:178). The inherently dialogic nature of beings gives them a dual nature, namely that of 'object' (for others) and 'subject' (for itself), a nature that is revealed through every process of interaction. This is what Merleau-Ponty terms 'reversability' (1964:194).

Merleau-Ponty stresses that *chair* is not to be understood in terms of 'matter', 'spirit/mind' or 'substance', since defining it in these terms would be to favour one side of the Cartesian dichotomy between the physical and mental world: '*Chair* must be considered not on the basis of substances, body and mind/spirit, since then it would be the union of contradictions, but, we would argue, as an element, a concrete emblem of a generalized way of being' (1964:193-194, mt). *Chair* overcomes the mind/body division by defining perception (mental processes) in terms of our physical engagement with our environment. Thus, the creation of meaning is an expression of the creation of being, of the linking of Self with Other in relevant ways so that each become transformed in the

process. This transformative potentiality means that no entity is ever entirely complete, for dialogue, relation, interaction, presupposes a continuously modifying stance whereby Self and Other automatically engage in novel modes of being. Fullness, completeness, would preclude relation, for the very act of projection implies change (1964:194). Merleau-Ponty's insights correspond closely to the insights of the speakers in Chapter Two (Part One), where songs are endowed with an intersubjective role of uniting people on the basis of shared experience.

Derrida's notion of the *trace* is in many ways similar to Merleau-Ponty's *chair*, though there are significant differences, too. Like *chair*, the *trace* is not a bounded 'concept', rather an expression of how it is possible for meaning to derive at all (1967:110). The *trace* can best be defined as an unmotivated discursive inertia, through which oppositions come into existence. What something 'is' thus exists in tandem with the possibility of what it is 'not', so that the 'positive' and the 'negative' are mutually entailing. Derrida notes how the *trace*, while unmotivated, is not random. Rather, it is a trajectory of meaning-creation that forms the unquestioned premise for significant dialogue (1967:38). The nature of the relation between Self and Other emerges through the movement of the *trace*, so that, as with Merleau-Ponty's *chair*, 'one must consider the *trace* before the extant' (1967:69, mt). The extant (the definable entity) acquires meaning only insofar as it is a product of a particular kind of dialogue. This means that the 'field of being...is structured according to the diverse possibilities...of the *trace*' (1967:69, mt), not by pre-existing entities.

Derrida, like Merleau-Ponty, notes how the *trace* is no more 'natural' than 'cultural', nor is it 'physical', 'mental', 'biological' or 'spiritual'. Like Merleau-Ponty's *chair*, then, it operates prior to the dualistic sepration of the 'mental' and the 'physical'. Unlike the *chair*, however, it is the *trace* that gives origin to the meaningfulness of this separation. While *chair* negates the mind/body dualism, the *trace* may or may not perpetuate it. If discourse has ramified in such a way as it becomes a general cultural assumption to define 'mind' (culture) and 'body' (nature) as separate, then this can be interpreted as a particular instance of the *trace* in action. If, in other cultural contexts, the 'mental' and the 'physical' are not meaningful categories (i.e. are not a dyad), then the *trace* operates distinctly in this environment. Thus, whereas *chair* emerges directly from perception, the *trace* emerges from dialogue. There is therefore an important epistemic difference between the two terms, since the entities that the *trace* defines as meaningful may have varying degrees of accuracy when compared to those that emanate from our direct interaction as produced by *chair*. I may believe unquestioningly in the discourse of mind/body dualism because this is the discursive inertia – the *trace* – of my cultural environment in Europe, even although, departing solely from my

phenomenological insertion in the world as *chair*, I would never see a reason for defining the two as distinct in the first place. This important difference between *chair* and *trace* informs my inclusion of the latter in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, where I argue that Andean resistance to discrimination perpetuates the very same discriminating discourse. Another difference between Merleau-Ponty and Derrida is the fact that Merleau-Ponty privileges 'presence' (the substantive interaction) over 'absence', whereas Derrida privileges 'absence' or the 'gap' over 'presence'. While this difference led Derrida to criticize Merleau-Ponty, Reynolds has shown that Derrida cannot entirely remove the notion of the 'substantive' from his philosophy, nor is Merleau-Ponty focused entirely on 'presence', with the result that the two philosophers are in fact complementary in many ways (Reynolds 2004). I shall show, by way of the Andean expressions, that 'identity' is not localizable in terms of either the 'substantive' or the 'non-substantive', but requires moving beyond the 'process / essence' dichotomy.

The central notion of Heidegger's philosophy is the German compound word, Dasein, which refers primarily to the human being. While Heidegger specifically deploys the notion of Dasein for the human context, many of Dasein's dimensions can profitably be extended to encompass the natural world, in congruence with the Andean expressions. My exposition of Dasein in this thesis centres on these dimensions. Etymologically, Dasein presupposes location in a particular context (da- 'there'; sein 'to be'), and this relationality is fundamental to understanding the nature of Dasein. Heidegger stresses that we do not simply choose to form connections with our environment at some times and then opt for solipsism at others. Rather, it is impossible to exist at all without continuously engaging with the world around us and adopting stances towards the elements that we perceive (1927/1967:58). Thus, like Merleau-Ponty's chair, Heidegger's Dasein illustrates how the Self derives from interaction. In order to understand the nature of this interaction, Heidegger distinguishes between the perception of entities as zuhanden 'ready-to-hand' and vorhanden 'present-at-hand'. Zuhanden objects are those that are in some way relevant to us; they are perceived in terms of what potential effect they might have on us and what kind of response they merit. All objects are initially perceived as zuhanden. Only when we engage more deeply with the object in question do we come to see it for what it is in reality (i.e. including those aspects that might have escaped our attention because we were not predisposed to observe them). This is the object as vorhanden (1927/1967:361).

The relation between *vorhanden* and *zuhanden* is a circular one: the nature of the pre-given (*vorhanden*) reality around us conditions the way that we engage with the phenomena that we

encounter in the future (i.e. those which are *zuhanden* to us). This engagement in turn informs the kinds of stances that we might adopt towards future elements of our environment. Thus, a temporal notion of being is introduced, which lies at the core of *Dasein*. Heidegger defines *Dasein* in terms of three temporal horizons (1927/1967:175-180): *Geworfenheit* (thrownness) communicates how the individual is necessarily in an environment that constrains possibilities for action (the *vorhanden*); *Verfallen* (fallenness) describes one's engagement with the phenomena (on the basis of their relevance as *zuhanden*); *Existenz* (existence) elucidates how this engagement informs the stances that one might have to future phenomena (i.e. the *zuhanden* stance that one adopts to the *vorhanden*). Thus, in common with Merleau-Ponty and Derrida, Heidegger's philosophy shows how the Self emerges dialectically through interaction with an emergent Other. I shall invoke Heidegger's philosophy particularly in the conclusion to Chapter Three, for there we shall see how *Dasein* provides a solid interpretative basis for understanding Andean notions of reciprocity.

We are now in a position to see how these three philosophical notions – chair, trace and Dasein – dialogue with the Quechua concepts that I introduced earlier. My purpose in this conceptual summation is not to argue for an exact correspondence between the two 'halves' ('Andean' and 'European'), but rather to foreground their congruencies as a prelude for my analysis of the songs, which will, in turn, pave the way for a reconceptualization of 'identity'. The concept of tinku (mutual genesis of oppositions) dialogues with chair and trace which both communicate how oppositions arise through an indefinable process of interaction. Likewise, Dasein conveys how the Self can only take form through relation with an Other. Yachay expresses how this process of dialogue results in the transformation of the Self, insofar as greater engagement leads to more informed stances in the future. This concords with Heidegger's transition from zuhanden (relevant to one's predisposition) to vorhanden (the phenomenon in-and-of itself), fine-tuning the definition of future entities as zuhanden. Ayni (reciprocity) conveys how Self and Other are mutually dependent and how their maintenance relies on a constant give-and-take between them, as conveyed by the notion of chair (at the physical level) and trace (at the discursive level) and in the strategic evolution of Dasein. The basis of this interaction is kallpa, the unified and unifying energy whence variation derives and is maintained. A similar idea is conveyed by chair. Kamay, which expresses how creation does not originate ex nihilo, but rather through the strategic interaction of entities in the circulation of kallpa, also dialogues with the unifying and dynamic nature of chair, realized through the operation of the discursive trace, and thereby leading to the conception of existence as continuous self-creation through interaction, as expressed by Dasein. This strategic formation of allegiances, as implicit in

the term *ayllu*, also recalls the defining-out of entities as *zuhanden* (relevant to us), while the term *pacha* expresses the unified (*chair*) and inherently dialogic (*trace*) nature of the world.

There is another point at which the Andean and Western philosophical visions that I have cited interact. Namely, all question the validity of the divide between the realm of 'ideas' and that of the 'physical' world. Such a Cartesian division has no place in the above philosophies. Instead, interpretation is a function of our situatedness within a particular context, the search for viable possibilities to maintain ourselves through strategic interaction with our environment. As Kutsch states, 'Indigenous philosophy does not separate knowledge from life. To the contrary, it revolves around precisely this life. Kay pacha ["this world"] is linked with nameable things, what we call habitat, in a here and now not far from worries about food' (2010:68). We saw this in tinku, where oppositions are created for strategic purposes, in yachay, where deepening knowledge entails greater possibilities for successful action, in ayni, where an ethics of exchange is oriented around physical goods for physical benefit, in kallpa, which differs from 'spirit' precisely in its life-enhancing physicality and is thus closer to a modern scientific conception of 'energy', in kamay, which is the creative effect of the strategic targeting of this energy, in ayllu, whose primary function is physical and psychological security, and in patsa which grounds identity in profoundly ecological terms. Indeed, according to these concepts, the ethical and pragmatic do not contradict each other, but are instead mutually reinforcing, for ideology emerges out of rational possibilities for action.

Likewise, we saw how Merleau-Ponty explicitly rejects any classification of *chair* in terms of 'matter' or 'spirit', and Derrida equally negates any categorization of *trace* in terms of 'nature' or 'culture'. Heidegger's *Dasein* also treads a middle path between idealism and realism by negating the foundations of each (cf. Stepanich 1991). The unity of the mental and the physical, as conveyed by the above review, has informed the minor inclusion of another discourse in this thesis: the biological. Taking my lead from the songs, I see the ultimate motivation of action as being that of survival, of the maintenance of our forms through strategic interaction with the environment. This is strongly indicated by the Andean concepts cited above, and is also at the root of highly influential theories of perception, notably that of Gibson (1979) and Varela, Thompson & Rosch (1991).

Gibson argues that perception can be understood in terms of the selection of 'affordances', those phenomena that attract our attention in terms of defining possibilities for action. If I am hungry, I am liable to zoom in on a chocolate gateau before noticing the cloth next to it, while, once I have had my fill, the cloth will be more salient because I need to wipe my sticky hands. In fact, Gibson's

notion of affordances is remarkably close to Heidegger's notion of *zuhanden*, whereby entities appear to us in terms of their relevance. Similarly, the 'embodied cognition' paradigm developed by Varela, Thompson & Rosch (1991) advocates an enactive view of cognition, whereby 'thinking' forms part of the action of selecting viable ways of interacting with the environment, in such a way that our possibilities of self-maintenance are enhanced. For reasons of space, it is not possible to go into any detail regarding these scientific discourses, but I have invoked them here by way of justifying my use of biological 'language' at certain points during this thesis. This occurs in two principle contexts:

1) my citation of neurological research in Chapter Two (Part One) which provides a biological grounding of intersubjectivity; 2) reference to the notion of 'survival' throughout this thesis, grounding our negotiation of identity as a strategic attempt to find viable ways of maintaining ourselves as an organism in an ecosystem. The Andean concepts as well as the three European philosophers have all strongly indicated that the dialogue of identity will profit from an attempt to bridge the hiatus between the 'physical' and the 'mental', and therefore between Sciences and Humanities.

#### The Data

#### Rationale for Studying Songs

Having outlined the theory (one part of the dialogue), it is now time to introduce the data (the other dialogic component). I have chosen song, rather than ordinary discourse, as the corpus of data for two main reasons. First, previous studies treating the themes of 'language' and 'identity' in the Andes have generally centred their discussion on other genres such as conversation and storytelling. My discussion of song is intended to complement these studies, which have revealed fascinating discourses of identity through fine-grained linguistic and cultural analysis. Second, there are several reasons why certain discourses of identity may be foregrounded more in Andean songs than in other local genres. These have to do with the context of the songs as well as song-internal features.

Regarding the context, Andean songs are frequently associated with ritual, liminal situations which mark a departure from other spheres of daily life. Taking my inspiration from Turner's (1969) account of ritual dynamics, I would argue that this departure does not constitute a radical break with the 'secular', so much as open up a new performative arena within which underlying cognitive orientations can be foregrounded. The relevance of these orientations can then be renegotiated, realigned and reconfirmed through communal participation. We shall see that this cathartic role of

ritual is indeed indicated by the song-texts themselves. In this way, the ritual sphere of the songs can be viewed as an arena for refreshing the social bonds that are necessary for productive action. For example, the *Carnaval*, *Masha*, *Wayta Muruy* and *Negritos* songs of Chapter Three all foreground the importance of *ayni* (reciprocity) as the basis of the social order. Likewise, the *Apu Inka* and *Pallas* songs of Chapter Four are arguably a strategy of overcoming marginalization and group-fragmentation through imaginative association with an idealized Incan past. The *waynu* songs presented in Chapter Two are also generally sung in festive contexts, and the interview-responses clearly depict the role of this genre in fostering social bonds on the basis of empathy, and in renegotiating stances towards the perceived non-Andean 'alter'. Thus, the liminal nature of song in these contexts allows the researcher to identify underlying cognitive orientations and modes of identity-construction which may be less explicit in other genres. Indeed, I did not find the above discourses in other genres of language to such a high extent, which suggests that they may have eluded me had my focus been on other, more documented, genres.

The ritual context of songs, which arguably endows them with a special capacity to foreground and renegotiate identity-positionings, feeds into song-internal features too. One example is the ritual use of Southern Quechua (SQ) in the *Apu Inka* (Chapter Four); here, the liminal sphere of the songs informs the incorporation of words from a 'foreign' variety of Quechua, that spoken in the Inca heartland of Cuzco. These words were, in my experience, never uttered outside the specific ritual context of *Apu Inka*. Thus, they arguably index a performative break with the mundane and a renegotiation of identity through association with the Incas. Another crucial feature is the fact that songs are musicalized genres of discourse, where the transition from 'speaking' to 'singing' automatically introduces a new communicative context. The musical and linguistic aspects interact closely, reflecting the fact that I found no folkloric 'poems' independent of music. Indeed, Stobart argues that, in his Bolivian fieldsite, 'most people's sense of identity and political affiliation is, to a surprisingly large degree, constructed, known and maintained through musical performance and sensibilities' (2006:89).

My experience, moreover, concords with Bigenho's: as 'a referential written song text emerged in my notes, I found that singers had difficulty confirming this text without singing the song' (2004:268). Thus, it sometimes took several sung recitations for a text to be confirmed. Rather than the 'language' and the 'music' constituting radically separate domains, then, it would appear that people conceived of a unified artistic Gestalt (impression), whereby the separation of any one artistic dimension (e.g. the musical) from the whole impacted on people's ability to cognitively

engage with other dimensions (e.g. the linguistic). One reason may be the fact that the music helped the singer to 'locate' him/herself imaginatively in the context of the festival, given that the songs were usually elicited away from their performative contexts. Thus, the music, by creating a specific 'soundscape', may have made the text more meaningful in the context of my interview with the singer. Another plausible reason is the close association between song and metre, whereby the metrical dimension of the song may have been maintained by the musical rhythm.

While the musical – and, indeed, dress and choreographic – dimensions all constitute fascinating lines of enquiry, I have concentrated my analysis on the linguistic aspects. This is because the focus of my study is textual and discursive, and an attempt to look at every aspect of every festival would have been impossible within the time-period. I thus decided to collect as many song-texts as possible, ensuring, however, that this did not preclude the gathering of important contextual information during each interview (where I asked about the instruments, dress and other artistic dimensions). Thus, whilst my study centres on only one dimension of the songs (i.e. the linguistic), I have tried to make this focus a targeted rather than exclusive one. The fact, moreover, that it has been possible to conduct a detailed and consistent analysis of just the textual elements suggests that the examination of non-textual aspects is likely to complement, rather than undermine, the analysis in the following pages. Nonetheless, the strong suggestions that musical and linguistic (and other) dimensions of the songs constitute, for participants, a unified whole, suggest that this study would be greatly enriched by contributions from specialists in these areas. Thus, I hope that this thesis may inspire other researchers, such as ethnomusicologists or dance specialists, to travel to Ancash and explore these elements, thus elucidating the multiple dimensions of Ancash songs through interdisciplinary dialogue.

Aside from its relation with the music, the intrinsic nature of rhythm may also enable song to foreground certain philosophical orientations more than other genres. The structural constraints imposed by metre demand a concise elucidation of pertinent issues, encouraging the formation of utterances that are highly targeted and succinct. Another structural feature that arguably facilitates a similar result is that of parallelism. This has been a very salient characteristic of Andean poetry since pre-Hispanic times (Husson 1985, Itier 1992) (and is also a feature of numerous poetic traditions across the globe, cf. Fox 1974/1989). The most frequent form of parallelism in the Andes is 'semantic doubling', 'a characteristically Quechua poetic device, in which two semantically related words appear in successive lines, in identical morphological contexts' (Mannheim 1998:239) (termed difrasismo by Adelaar with Muysken 2004:236). By placing linguistic elements in identical structural

positions, semantic doubling allows for the relations between these elements to be foregrounded, clearly expressing perceived levels of opposition and complementarity. This special feature of songs will be important in my analysis of the linguistic construction of identity. Allen (2011), Arnold and Yapita (1998), Lienhard (1993) and Mannheim (1998) all suggest a close relation between poetic parallelism and Andean textiles, since both involve the juxtaposition of similar, yet, different, patterns in the production of the unified 'text' (cf. the photo on p.63). The connection seems highly plausible from a synchronic perspective, though it is perhaps more difficult to ascertain whether this similarity comes from common origins or whether they have instead evolved independently and have only accidentally come to index similar cognitive patterns. Both poetic parallelism and geometric textile patterning are, after all, very common cultural features on a global scale, and can occur separately or in conjunction in widely varying contexts.

Overall, then, the specific contextual and intrinsic features of Ancash songs means that we can agree with the following (referring to *waynus* but equally applicable to all song-genres that I collected): 'Due to the more intensive appeal to the poetic and expressive functions of language, a variety of linguistic resources are used in Ancash *waynu* [a local genre] songs. Thus, more than in natural everyday discourse, Ancash *waynus* offer us very rich material for a study from grammatical, sociolinguistic, verbal art, linguistic anthropological, and sociocultural perspectives' (Julca-Guerrero 2009b:74). If, as Harrison plausibly argues, a 'philosophical and ideological orientation of the society can appear with the detailed analysis of texts, their semantic fields and conversation' (1994:133, mt), then song-texts would seem a context that is ripe for the elucidation of novel forms of identity-construction.

Importantly, however, this thesis does not claim that the texts present an accurate vision of life in the places where they originated, or that their 'messages' are always advocated by every resident. My sole aim is to show how the texts can illuminate our understanding of 'identity' in their capacity as texts, as creations, which maintain a link with other aspects of life but with which they are not isomorphic. Nor do I claim that they represent a bona fide Andean 'culture', or Andean 'take' on identity. Whilst I link my discussion with scholarship on the Andes, the region is as diverse as it is similar, though this does not preclude some common elements: 'It would be as foolhardy to lump [indigenous Andeans] together as some generalized Andean culture as it would be to treat them as the still-separate products of entirely discrete cultures' (Abercrombie 1991:120). The data are, then, to be taken for what they are, namely texts from specific localities that have one thing in common:

they all express different ways of conceptualizing Self and Other. The question of how far these conceptualizations are adopted in daily life requires a different study with different methods.

#### On Genre

Lara distinguishes the following genres recorded in colonial texts: jailli (hymn); arawi (love-song); wawaki (love-song in the form of a dialogue); taki (songs sung for specific themes as well as more general purposes); wayñu (less subjective than the arawi); qhashwa (song for festivals); aranway (humorous song); wanka (elegy) (1969:36-54) (though the European terms are clearly to be taken as rough guides, not as bona fide 'translations', given the very different artistic environments). Husson notes how, despite the loss and considerable modification of Quechua poetry after the European colonization (particularly in religious or ludic genres), a degree of continuity remains, particularly in sentimental genres (e.g. waynu) and in the parallel structure of the verses (1985:336). According to Barber, 'Genre orients a speaker's or writer's utterance towards a listener or reader; and it orients the listener or reader towards the text. The producer of a text operates in the expectation that the receiver will identify the genre and in turn bring the right kind of expectations to bear on it' (2007:32). In my experience, this process of mutual orientation was generally not conducted by the text on its own, but by the whole event. This was certainly true of the ritual songs of Chapters Three and Four, whose 'denominations' were generally descriptions of what happened as they were sung. For waynus, a genre performed in daily life (but mainly at celebrations), the role of the song was much more autonomous; definition as waynu (or its regional variants, chimaychi or chuscada) depended on musical or choreographic features (cf. p.64). Thus, I follow Hymes in his broad definition of 'genre': they 'can occur as whole events, or in various relationships to whole events' (1974:443), varying 'from simple to complex, and from looseness to tightness in what they accommodate, incorporate, permit, as to modes and other genres' (1974:443). As Finnegan states, 'the whole idea of a "genre" is relative and ambiguous, dependent on culturally-accepted canons of differentiations rather than universal criteria' (1992a:15). That is why I prefer to adopt an emic (local) classification of the songs, based on how they are defined by their performers. I have identified the twenty-seven genres that I collected (and, for ritual-songs, sub-genres) on purely local criteria.

#### Methods of Data-Collection

I conducted fieldwork over three visits to Peru between 2010 and 2011, which comprised a total of eleven months. During the first visit (May-July 2010), I gained proficiency in AQ by attending a six-week language-course in Carhuaz, Ancash department, and by concurrent self-study and practice with local people. My initial plan was to study Quechua/Spanish language-mixing in waynus (a specific song-genre) and relate this to language-attitudes in the locality. I aimed to compare one Quechua-predominant locality with a Spanish-predominant locality. Therefore, I was keen to choose two field-sites. Chiquián, capital of Bolognesi province, had been suggested to me by Dan and Diane Hintz and Janet and Oscar Huárac of the Summer Institute of Linguistics. Chiquián was interesting given the paucity of studies there, and the situation of language-shift. During the language-course, teachers suggested Pomabamba as a second site, given its denomination as Folkloric Capital of Ancash and the apparent predominance of Quechua. Following the language-course, I spent two weeks researching each town and making contacts with local people, before finally settling on them as field-sites. The Quechua varieties spoken in Chiquián and Pomabamba were, whilst different, sufficiently similar to the Huaylas variety in Carhuaz for comprehension not to be a problem. I then returned to the UK for three months to target my reading in view of the field-situation.

I returned to Peru in November to commence data-collection, beginning with Chiquián which I used as a base for four and a half months. I conducted thirty interviews/focus-groups on the respective roles of Quechua and Spanish in Chiquián, then thirty on the social role of waynus (a traditional song-genre), equally balancing the interviews between different ages, genders and professions. Interviews varied between twenty minutes and one and a half hours, depending on the number of people present. I identified the main social groups in Chiquián and Pomabamba, and planned my schedule of interviews so as to represent these groups equally. The groups were: schoolpupils/students; teachers; market-vendors, café- and shop-owners; agricultural workers; authorities. In addition, I identified composers/singers as a separate group given the focus of my study on their area of expertise. I took care to avoid bias by selecting people randomly (i.e. according to my established social networks in the towns which were independent of my topic of research). Occasionally, in classrooms, I had to defer to the authority of the teacher in selecting pupils for my interviews, but balanced this potential bias with most other situations where I was able to select the pupils at random. Thus, the results were not 'skewed' in favour of those who had an interest in folklore. In order to represent a good cross-section of society in my interviews, I conducted at least five interviews for each social category. In schools, I interviewed groups of final-year pupils during class-hours. In exchange, I taught a number of classes, focusing particularly on Quechua given the general absence of this language in the curriculum. For interviews outside schools, I initially made appointments but soon changed tactic when I discovered forgetfulness to be the norm rather than the exception! My revised approach was to turn up spontaneously with drinks, biscuits and a wide smile accompanied by a few cheery phrases in Quechua. This usually guaranteed a warm welcome and a prompt start to the interview!

The interviews were, according to Russell Bernard's typology (2002:205), of the semi-structured kind. I prepared a uniform set of questions for each person/group, but did not hold to these if the discussion was pursuing interesting avenues away from the specific topic of each question. Thus, I found a balance between structure and flexibility, ensuring that all relevant aspects were covered for each interviewee, but giving the interviewee free reign to offer insights which I had not anticipated. Often I would probe these new insights further, departing from the 'script' in front of me, targeting my questions to the specific context. I aimed to keep the interviews informal, more akin to a discussion than a question-and-answer session; this proved fruitful insofar as people generally opened up and felt comfortable voicing their true opinions on the social and personal role of waynus. I made sure that my questions were neutral and did not presuppose a particular response, and refrained from using the term 'identity' to avoid conditioning the situations in which the term surfaced, which would have significantly undermined the validity of the emic analysis. In order to stimulate as full a response as possible, I asked open (what/why/where/when) rather than closed (yes/no) questions. I asked each question in Quechua and Spanish, leaving it up to the consultant which to choose in response. This provided interesting sociolinguistic data (most responses were in Spanish despite the expressed attachment to 'Quechua' as an 'idea'). Focusgroups took the same form as interviews, and varied between two and seven people. I conducted most focus-groups in schools, since it was easy to group people together in this environment. I recorded interviews with a digital recorder and microphone.

The other part of my study was the collection and analysis of songs. I soon discovered that there were many more local genres than just *waynus*, and that in order to gain access to the majority of these I could not remain in Chiquián. I also realized that organizing my study around a strict linguistic divide (Spanish versus Quechua) was not the most productive approach. What counted as 'Spanish' and 'Quechua' was highly subjective and context-specific, and presupposing these categories from the outset would not be letting the texts speak for themselves. Moreover, speakers were generally unconcerned about how to classify the language of the various songs. Thus, I

decided to engage in a full textual analysis, adopting an interdisciplinary approach so as not to stultify the holistic voice that was emerging from each text. I spent two months travelling around the fifteen districts of Bolognesi province (of which Chiquián is the capital), transcribing any lyrical texts that I could encounter. Arriving in villages on my own – and even in Chiquián and Pomabamba – I was sometimes met by bemusement, not least because of my height (which I put down to eating grasshoppers in China), but found that speaking Quechua was an invaluable 'diplomatic passport' in breaking the ice and starting a flow of conversation. Without Quechua, I believe I would have had much more difficulty in gaining trust and being welcomed in the various communities. Stating that fried guinea pig – an Andean delicacy – is my favourite meal also helped! In each town/village I visited, I asked several people for the names of local composers, singers and folklorists, and also solicited an initial review of the local traditions, given that these varied from place to place. I then visited each folklorist who had been recommended, and asked them to sing the local songs so that I could transcribe them. Following the transcription, I would ask the performer to explain the meaning of the text (both generically and in specific phrases), and the context of its performance.

In March 2011, after spending four weeks in Britain for a period of mid-fieldwork reflection, I travelled to my second field-site, Pomabamba, where I remained for another four and a half months. There, I followed the same method, conducting thirty-two sociolinguistic interviews and thirty-three on folksongs. I then travelled around the province of Pomabamba. Since there are only four districts in this province, I visited the thirteen municipalities, the next level of political organization. Whilst administrative boundaries are to a large extent arbitrary, I found them useful ways of demarcating the geographical parameters of the study, and ensuring that few gaps were left. Provincial boundaries are not, moreover, entirely artificial, given the to-ing and fro-ing between the provincial capital and its districts, and the degree of political uniformity that an administrative area entails. In addition to the material gathered first-hand from consultants, I bought copies of every local CD I could find in Chiquián and Pomabamba and, in Pomabamba, employed Moisés Zavaleta, a local folklorist, teacher and singer/composer, to transcribe them and explain the significance of each text.

Often, songs would form part of a specific festival, in which case I solicited detailed information on the festival as a whole (its rationale, a day-by-day chronology, participants, location etc.). Ideally, I would have wished to attend every festival in the area, but since each of the numerous villages had several festivals throughout the year, this was impracticable. Moreover, I preferred to maintain a detailed focus on the song-texts (the central aim of this study), rather than attempt several lines of

enquiry at once which would have favoured superficiality over rigour. Thus, I concentrated my efforts on documenting as many song-texts as possible, always however soliciting detailed contextual information on each text. I did, nonetheless, ensure that I participated in at least one festival of its 'kind', such as the *Pallas* in Pacllón (an extract of which is presented in Chapter Four), *Carnaval* in Chiquián and Huasta (I present the Pacllón version in Chapter Three), *Wayta Muruy* of Chuyas (the variety from Pajas is analysed in Chapter Three), *Semana Santa* and the *Apu Inka* in Pomabamba (the Huanchacbamba version of the latter is presented in Chapter Four), *Negritos* in various locations (the Huanchacbamba version occurs in Chapter Three), as well as several political anniversaries of different villages, and, of course, several renditions of *waynu*.

#### Self-Selection of Themes

By the end of fieldwork, I had around two hundred thousand words worth of interviews, and ninety thousand words of song-texts totalling twenty-seven genres. On my return to London, I was therefore faced with the enormous challenge of selecting relevant excerpts from a vast range of data. My first realization was that there would simply be no space to include the sociolinguistic dimensions in any detail. Thus, I have left these interviews for subsequent analysis. I then organized the data according to the emic (local) genres, and read through these in order to identify the most salient themes. I took great care not to impose my own pre-judgements on the texts, but ensured that the themes emerged objectively from the data. Regarding the interviews, I found that the following themes were commonly repeated: the function of waynu as forming an intersubjective sphere on the basis of shared experience; the function of waynu as a totem of local identity opposed to 'outsiders'; perceived changes in the lyrics of waynu over time (i.e. from more traditional cosmology to contemporary social issues); perceived changes in popularity (some argued that there was a decrease in interest among the younger generation, whereas others argued that commercialization of waynu had increased its popularity); the sense that waynus in Quechua were more 'authentic' than those in Spanish. Given that it would be impossible to treat all of these themes within the confines of this thesis, I decided to focus on those that are most contrasting, yet for which the concept of 'identity' is most salient: namely, the first two themes (intersubjective and totemic functions, respectively). By examing how the concept of 'identity' can apply to those discourses that seem the most difficult to reconcile, it is possible to engage deeply with the alleged contradictions of 'identity' - specifically its 'processual' and the 'essentialist' dimensions - and thereby grapple with the question of precisely what 'identity' means.

I conducted a similar process with the song-texts, the themes of which were not passively chosen by me as the active intellectual agent, but rather selected themselves insofar as similar discourses were readily identifiable. The twenty-seven song-genres divided themselves into three thematic groups: waynus (which were snapshots of personal experience that could be sung at any moment); songs that formed part of agricultural rituals; songs that posited a link between contemporary identity and the glorified world of the Incas. It was logical to include the waynu-excerpts along with my analysis of the interviews in a single chapter, given that these interviews pertained principally to waynus. Moreover, the other two song-groups naturally fell into different chapters, both thematically (agricultural and historical, respectively) and because they presented different visions of identity: the agricultural songs generally presented a vision of identity as contingent and context-specific, whereas those concerning the Incas conveyed a highly essentialist and transcendental picture of abiding Incan identity. Thus, they dialogued with the two themes that had emerged from the waynu-interviews: the intersubjective role of waynus corresponded to the more fluid visions of identity in the agricultural songs, while the totemic role of waynu dialogued with the essentialist vision of Incan identity. I then chose the songs and interview-passages that were the most salient examples of these generalized discourses.

The self-selection of these themes has informed the tripartite structure of this thesis: Chapter Two, concerning waynu-songs and related interviews, is divided into two halves, with Part One conveying the processual constructivist vision of identity, and Part Two conveying the essentialist, totemic role of waynus; Chapter Three presents the agricultural songs which dialogue with Chapter Two (Part One) in their more fluid conceptualization of 'identity'; Chapter Four presents the songs which advocate a glorified Incan past and thereby dialogue with the essentialist visions of identity in Chapter Two (Part Two). The structure of the thesis can thereby be understood in terms of the Quechua concept of tinku (as discussed above): two halves that are brought into relation by a third zone of interaction. Specifically, the 'processual' discourses in Chapter Three and the 'essentialist' discourses in Chapter Four are introduced already in the split structure of Chapter Two, whose conclusion functions as a prelimary synthesis of the two orientations.

# **Contexts**

Having outlined the nature of both theory and data (our two main protagonists of the dialogue), I now situate this thesis more firmly in the various contexts of which it forms part. These are: the

established literature on Andean songs; potential objections from the various disciplines with which the thesis dialogues; the geographical setting; the past, present and future of Quechua.

### Contribution to the Literature

Most works on Andean folkloric songs are anthologies with a general thematic introduction (e.g. Alvarado 2009; Arguedas 1938, 1949, 1965; Aybar 1980; Hurtado & Santander 1994; Lara 1969; Montoya et al. 1987). Four monographs have been published: D'Harcourt & D'Harcourt (1925) examine the music, lyrics and dance of songs which they recorded in their travels across Peru; Husson (1985) analyses the poetry recorded in the chronicles of the seventeenth-century writer Garcilaso de la Vega; Harrison (1994) explores poetry collected both from archival and ethnographic work from a literary perspective; Arnold and Yapita (1998) expound the relation between songs, textiles and agriculture in a contemporary Andean village. A small range of articles has also been published: Mannheim has explored colonial and contemporary songs from the perspective of linguistic anthropology (1986, 1987, 1998, 1999); Itier (1992) analyses the linguistic features of songs in a seventeenth-century manuscript; the 1993 edition of the Revista de Crítica Latinoamericana has a range of articles on Andean songs; Delgado & Schechter (2004) have edited a collection of conference-proceedings on Quechua verbal art, with some of the articles dealing with song-texts; Julca-Guerrero (2009b) discusses codeswitching in bilingual waynu songs. There have been three doctoral studies on folkloric Andean songs and poetry: Harrison Macdonald (1979) explored various Ecuadorian Quechua texts in their illumination of Andean culture; Canales (2005) studied expressions of alcoholism in waynus; Gonzalez (2010) discussed the issue of translation in Quechua and Spanish texts. Musicological studies frequently include some reference to the lyrics (e.g. Baumann 1996, Otter 1985, Stobart 2006), but here the texts are only an ancillary component.

All of the above studies have engaged with Andean songs from diverse and fascinating angles. As well as constituting one of the few full-scale studies on Andean songs, this thesis provides a unique contribution to the literature in the following interrelated dimensions: 1) its deep theoretical motivation (elucidating what we mean by 'identity'); 2) its deployment and advocacy of a new dialogic methodology (replacing the subject/object or agent/patient distinction with a dialogue between equals at each level of analysis); 3) its interdisciplinary mode of analysis, whereby texts are examined in anthropological, linguistic, literary and psychological terms and then compared with philosophical theories. Another contribution of the thesis is its focus on Ancash Quechua (AQ). Andean scholarship is proportionally skewed towards the south, where Southern Quechua (SQ) is

spoken (the descendant of the 'Inca' language). This is perhaps not surprising, since the purist indigenista movement (which sees Cuzco Quechua as the paragon of all varieties) has rendered SQ more accessible; there are more facilities for learning SQ, more opportunities to practise it, and, given the Incan expansion, more similarities between SQ and most other varieties. But central Peruvian Quechua varieties (of which AQ is one group) are especially fascinating from a historical perspective, being by far the oldest group of Quechua languages (Parker 1976b:27-28). This makes them much more diverse. But they are also some of the most vulnerable. One variety, Junín Quechua, declined from 75% of the population in the 1940s to only 10% in 1993 (Pozzi-Escot 1998:258). Chirinos (1998) also notes how AQ is at greater risk than many other Quechua languages. This is not to say that central Peruvian Quechua has been devoid of research. AQ has two main grammars (Parker 1976b, Julca-Guerrero 2009a), dictionaries (Parker 1976a, Carranza Romero 2003), and other linguistic studies (e.g. D.J. Hintz 2007, D.M. Hintz 2007, Yábar-Dextre 1985, 1986, 1987, 1990). There is a dictionary of Huánuco Quechua (Weber 1998), also a central Peruvian variety, and Howard has conducted studies on storytelling in the Huamalíes variety (Howard-Malverde 1990a, Howard 2012). But it is hoped that this study will be one small contribution to correcting the geographical imbalance in scholarship.

### **Potential Objections**

Here, I anticipate some potential objections to this study. First, one might question the validity of engaging in a conceptual exegesis of 'identity' on the basis of just two provinces in one geographical region. My response is that this study (like any study) is not to be taken as the final word. The kernel of my analysis is the elucidation of philosophical orientations in the texts themselves, and it is by comparing the texts both with each other, and with congruent philosophical writings from Europe, that a more global account of 'identity' can be attained. The development of my conclusions during the course of this thesis can be understood as a gradual widening of concentric circles: from the exegesis of particular texts, to an account of texts with similar themes in the conclusions to each chapter, to an overarching interpretation of the diverse themes in all of the chapters, to a final discussion of how this overarching interpretation can be meaningfully applied to all sorts of issues relating to Entity and Process. Clearly, the further the circle spirals out from the textual core, the more tentative the conclusions become.

With this caveat, there are nonetheless good grounds for arguing that the wider conclusions may indeed be universally applicable: the conclusions unite Andean discourses which are very different

from each other and which arise in different contexts; there are striking similarities between the Andean discourses and philosophical discourses which have arisen in Europe under very different circumstances (as illustrated earlier by the congruence between Andean concepts, on the one hand, and the philosophical writings of Heidegger, Merleau-Ponty and Derrida, on the other hand); notwithstanding cultural differences, we must all have broadly similar ways of creating meaning as organisms in interaction with the environment (we are, after all, the same species); the study pertains to universal issues (of Self and Other, Entity and Process), despite wide cultural variations in how they are expressed. Therefore, I present this thesis as a constructive challenge, urging scholars of diverse disciplines, and diverse geographical expertise, to test the emerging account against their own findings, and thereby to ascertain the extent to which my dialogic interpretation of the Andean texts can be globally applied.

Other possible objections may relate to my methods. Whilst I hope that this study appeals to people from a wide range of backgrounds and disciplinary orientations, perhaps the closest disciplines are linguistics, anthropology and literary studies. Thus, it is most productive to engage with potential criticisms from these areas. The linguistic aspect is manifest most clearly in my detailed treatment of the texts, where I analyse morphological, syntactic and phonological features in their conveyance of 'identity'. But my hermeneutic methodology, and the absence of a quantitative element, may insight criticism from those who would wish to see things 'proven' along more positivist lines. Namely, that X is about identity and Y is not. Quantitative methods are invaluable in many areas of research, but they do not suit this study which is less about proof as about conceptual clarification. Such methods can tell us relative frequencies of affirmations, but they are limited in their capacity for understanding the rationale behind such affirmations. Detailed textual analysis, on the other hand, allows for a more nuanced appraisal, and also allows us to identify the general themes that a statistical approach might highlight. Moreover, statistics can give us a false sense of security if we do not seriously question the concepts that we deploy as the basis of our quantitative analysis.

The anthropological aspect is manifest in my culturally-informed analysis of the texts, both in the field (eliciting local interpretations of texts, conducting interviews, and participating in festivals), and through linkage with other ethnographic studies. Some ethnographers, however, might question why the texts were elicited away from their performative contexts. To record the texts during performance, whilst perhaps ideal, would have been impossible, given that I would have had to stand next to the singer with microphone in hand. Finnegan asks, however: 'Is there really any such thing as a truly 'natural' or truly 'artificial' situation? Surely all settings are in some way socially

# Map of Peru



Image © Huhsunqu, Wikimedia Commons

# Map of Ancash



Sumaq Perú Travel SAC, http://www.sumaqperu.com/, accessed 05/11/12

# Map of Bolognesi



Provincia de Bolognesi - Chiquián

Courtesy of www.bolognesino.wordpress.com, accessed 05/11/12

# Map of Pomabamba PATAZ PATAZ PATAZ POMABAMBA POMABAMBA MARISCAL LUZURIAGA HUAYLLAN

Courtesy of <a href="http://www.perutoptours.com/">http://www.perutoptours.com/</a>, accessed 05/11/12

constructed?' (1992b:81). Indeed, the context in which elicitation was conducted did not impede communication of relevant themes via specific linguistic constructions or cultural references. Where possible, I participated in the festival, and always gathered relevant contextual information from consultants. In some cases, however, (e.g. the *Masha* festival) the festival was no longer performed, so that the detailed commentaries from consultants were the only way of gaining information.

Another possible anthropological objection may be the fact that I collected texts from a range of locations, rather than investing all of my time in establishing networks and soliciting information on the basis of these. This may be one difference between certain positions in anthropology, on the one hand, and folklore studies, on the other, the former focusing more on face-to-face interpersonal situations and the latter being, on average, more text-based. While my study is, I believe, as much 'anthropological' as 'folkloristic', the rationale for this method was, again, the research-question: a dialogic exegesis of 'identity'. In order to fulfil the demands of this question, I had to collect a wide variety of texts from a range of locations. Indeed, restricting my data to just one place would have severely hampered the validity of the project, since its strength lies in reconciling widely varying discourses as a means of unifying diverse interpretations of 'identity'. I nonetheless chose to conduct all interviews in the semi-urban context (i.e. the two provincial capitals), so that general themes could be identified and analysed according to a similar context; these themes were salient across all ages, genders and professions (as indicated after each quote). These discourses could then, as a group, be juxtaposed with discourses from different contexts (i.e. song-texts from rural areas). Thus, I found a balance between not being overly restricted geographically (which would have undermined the validity of this exegesis of 'identity'), and not being so wide that the textual analysis was superficial.

The literary aspect is manifest in the global analysis of the texts, taking into account rhetorical features and expressed philosophical orientations. Scholars of literature may query the validity of including oral texts as a written corpus. However, this has not prevented Homer's epics, an originally oral form of verbal art, from establishing itself as a mainstay of the European literary canon (Lord 1968). Indeed, the divide between literacy and orality can, I believe, be overstated; whether the words are recorded in writing or purely aurally, they remain the same words. It is, in fact, questionable whether there *is* a divide. Finnegan stresses continuity between the 'oral' and the 'written': 'they shade into each other both in the present and over many centuries of historical development, and there are innumerable cases of poetry which has both "oral" and "written" elements' (1992a:24). For example, I transcribed the *Apu Inka* (Chapter Four) from a shaman who

knew many of the lines by heart and yet dictated them orally from his notebook. Most of the texts I transcribed were written down in people's notebooks, but there were exceptions such as the *Masha* and *Wayta Muruy* songs, which have no written forms in their communities and are sung with minor variations on each occasion. More 'literate' and more 'oral' texts were, however, more similar than different: all were precise renditions of themes that characterized the contexts in which they are ordinarily performed.

The question of 'writing' has, nonetheless, been ideologically important in Peru, where the *indigenista* movement has deployed writing as a tool to raise the prestige of Quechua: 'Writing has given a "literature" to the aborigine and, to the Quechua language, a literary prestige which beforehand, in the Western sense, was denied to them' (Noriega 1993:35, mt). The past denial of the validity of 'oral' literature – a denial which continues up to the present in many circles – is clear on appraisal of the following, which refers to the *kipu* (cord-devices used to record information): 'Considering this defective system of writing, it should not cause surprise that the Quechua language lacks old literature, at least intelligible for us' (Rivero & Tschudi 1851:106, in Relucé 2004:100, mt). This relates to another ethical and intellectual contribution of this thesis: the thesis proves that an oral corpus of texts can be engaged with in the manner of deep literary criticism, and that folk literature therefore merits the same kind of intellectual respect that is given to more 'established' corpuses in the literary canon. Of course, this respect also entails the necessity of challenging, upholding or undermining the views expressed by these texts through the rigour of logical dialogue.

# The Setting

The provinces of Bolognesi and Pomabamba are both located in Ancash department, central-western Peru. Their capitals, Chiquián and Pomabamba, are located at 3350 and 2950 metres respectively, each with populations of around 4,500 people. Bolognesi is named after the General Francisco Bolognesi, a notable military figure in nineteenth-century Peru. Pomabamba derives from the Quechua *puma pampa* 'plain of pumas', which may refer to the local preponderance of this animal in pre-Hispanic days, or may be a totemic reference to a group of people. Bolognesi is located in southern Ancash and ranges from the xerophytic landscapes of Chasqui near the coast to the peak of Yerupajá at 6634 metres. The Huayhuash mountains, to which Yerupajá pertains, are a popular hiking destination for tourists. The flat pastoral land along the river Pativilca has made Chiquián a renowned producer of cheeses. Pomabamba is located in north-eastern Ancash, in the Conchucos Valley which runs parallel to the Huaylas Valley in which Huaraz (the capital of Ancash) is

located. It borders the Huascarán national park to the West and the river Marañón to the east, which is also the eastern border of Ancash with Huánuco. Pomabamba is known for its artisanal gold and silver jewellery. Chiquián is only two and a half hours away from Huaraz, whereas it takes nine hours from Pomabamba. There are, however, frequent bus services throughout the week from both towns, so that there is significant transiting between the provincial and departmental capitals. As in most of the Andes, agricultural land is organized in small private allotments called *chacras* (from AQ *chakra* 'field') on which a variety of crops are grown concurrently.

Both provinces have numerous archaeological sites that are testament to the diversity of pre-Hispanic cultures that once existed. The nearby UNESCO site of Chavín in Conchucos was a metropolis of the central Andes, and held considerable religious and political sway over the whole region between BCE 900-200. The most extensive archaeological site in the two provinces is Yayno (Pomabamba province), a centre of the Recuay culture between CE 400-800 (Lau 2010). There is also evidence of the later Wari (Huari) and Incan civilizations in both provinces. One of the main Incan paths runs through both Bolognesi and Pomabamba. The ridge along the southern border of Bolognesi has a chain of archaeological sites. Despite this archaeological wealth, the vast majority of sites in both provinces have never been excavated, and those that have been, only to a limited extent. There is great potential for developing a locally organized tourist industry if funding can be secured for excavations and protection of these sites. Until the land-reforms of the Alvarado government in 1970s, both provinces were divided between haciendas, private land-ownerships operating under a feudal system. Several modern villages were previous hacienda settlements. Both provinces range from fertile valleys (where the capitals are located) to mountain-peaks. The Quechua in Pomabamba North Conchucan Quechua spoken pertains to (http://www.ethnologue.com/language/qxn, accessed 15/07/13). In Bolognesi, Chiquián Quechua is spoken west of the river Pativilca (http://www.ethnologue.com/language/qxa, accessed 15/07/13), and Cajatambo North Quechua east of the river (http://www.ethnologue.com/language/qvl, accessed 15/07/13).

The social composition of the various communities I worked in should be sketched. In line with the semi-urban nature of both Chiquián and Pomabamba, most of their inhabitants are employed either in commerce or in education. Commerce is small-scale, with a number of restaurants, shops and even internet cafés. People involved in industry were generally self-employed. Women and men alike worked in these industries, with no noticeable gender-difference. Another substantial group in both towns comprised teachers. There were a number of primary and secondary schools, as well as

institutes of higher education in both towns, with the result that teachers comprised a sizeable proportion of the population. Again, there was no noticeable gender-difference. Students comprised another important group, with everyone up to the age of sixteen attending school, and many attending the higher education institutes beyond that age. Each town also had a range of authorities, notably mayor, priest, governor, head of police and judge, all of whom I interviewed. Both towns also have small groups of farmers who work on their own fields at a largely subsistence level. However, almost everyone in this category is involved in some commercial activity as a means of gaining monetary income. Several people I talked to had moved to the semi-urban centres from smaller settlements; these people were generally integrated into the local economy, either as selfemployed commercialists (often with some subsistence agriculture) or as teachers (this integration into the market economy partially accounts for the strong sense, in the interviews, that one's Andean 'identity' is being lost). The economic integration of migrants, together with the small size of Chiquián and Pomabamba, probably accounts for the relatively insignificant socioeconomic differences between the inhabitants (although the upper half of each town was generally viewed as more prosperous, reflecting the dual divisions of Andean settlements which will be particularly salient in the *Masha* songs of Chapter Three).

The surrounding settlements were uneven in terms of size and social composition. There were larger settlements such as Huallanca (a mining town in Bolognesi province and of comparable size to Chiquián) and Parobamba (a semi-urban town in Pomabamba province, though smaller than the provincial capital) where the social composition was much as described for the towns of Pomabamba and Chiquián. Most of the surrounding communities were, however, small settlements, and were generally characterized by a greater proportion of subsistence farmers. However, the market economy was far from absent in these communities. In Pomabamba province, women would migrate weekly from their rural settlements to the weekend markets in the town of Pomabamba. There, they would sell the produce of their chakra (allotment) and so complement subsistence agriculture with some commercial gain. There was no similar market in Chiquián, but in the rural settlements of both provinces there were always one or two informal shops. These shops were not, however, a full-time business but an occasional means of supplementing the primary subsistence activity. Each settlement had a primary school, but few offered secondary education, so that many of the pupils in Pomabamba town and Chiquián had travelled there from the villages in order to study (as reflected in the interviews in Chapter Two).

There was a notable difference in dress between semi-urban and rural communities: many women in the smaller settlements wore the traditional *pollera* or *pintay baata* (dresses of brightly coloured textiles, each of which indicates the *ayllu* to which one belongs), while the men often wore the Andean poncho (although men also commonly wore Western-style clothing as in the semi-urban centres, reflecting the tendency of women in that region to be more conservative in terms of dress). Generally, people from the surrounding communities spoke more Quechua than the inhabitants of Chiquián and Pomabamba, though there was also a marked difference between Chiquián and Pomabamba in this respect: in Chiquián, only people older than about forty years could speak Quechua, unless they were from the rural communities; in Pomabamba, by contrast, it was common to find young people who could converse in that language.

Insofar as this study is a conceptual exegesis of what 'identity' means, rather than a narrower attempt to define 'ethnicity' (a concept that is arguably subsumed by 'identity' but which is neither a necessary nor sufficient criterion of the latter), I do not engage explicitly with the concept of 'ethnicity' to a great extent in the thesis. The reason for this is so as not to confuse the reader by detracting from the central conceptual theme. However, this is not to imply the absence of ethnicity in the study. Indeed, the issues of identity that surface in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four primarily concern perceived allegiances to ostensibly different historical groups, which can be termed 'ethnic' affiliations. These perceived ethnic groupings are: blanco 'white' (Hispanicdescended); indio 'Indian' or indígena 'indigenous'; mestizo or criollo (the 'hybrid' group that today forms the dominant Peruvian culture). As Femenías notes, the 'categories of "Indian" (indio, indigena), "white" (blanco), and "mixed" (mestizo) still dominate the complex system of race, ethnicity, and class that operates in todays Peru. Many Peruvians trace their heritage to ancestors who inhabited the land before Spaniards arrived' (2005:22). It is also true, however, that few people I spoke to self-identified as 'Indians' or 'indigenous' (also recalling Femenías 2005:22), preferring instead to situate themselves as the descendants of the Incas. In Chapter Four, I account for this in terms of a desire to associate with a prestigious group and counter the marginalized status of the category 'indigenous'. The discourse of ethnic inferiority/superiority is often implicit in the term mestizo, which generally denotes 'a Spanish and Indian racialized cultural mixture, evolving from "primitive" Indianness into a more "civilized" stage, and eventually incompatible with indigenous ways' (De la Cadena 2000:5), although De la Cadena's study shows how this term does not necessarily preclude association with an 'indigenous' identity and can acquire different meanings in different contexts.

It is interesting that, while the above ethnic categories implicitly drive many of the discourses that I examine, the terms themselves rarely surface in the corpus of texts. This may be because the (re)assertion of an 'autochthonous Andean identity' has been institutionalized primarily in the Incan heartland of southern Peru, from which Ancash is remote both physically and linguistically, hosting a very different Quechua language. Thus, the common ethnic terms may have infiltrated less into daily speech. It may be, moreover, that the relatively small size of Chiquián and Pomabamba, and the apparent absence of significant socioeconomic distinctions, meant that ethnic labels had less currency than in larger urban centres. Thus, I introduce these ethnic categories only by way of background, so that readers unfamiliar with Peru can gain a feel for the general context which informs certain discourses of identity in the texts, even if the specific ethnic labels are largely absent. One dimension that I have not included is that of the politics of identity. This is because such discourses were not to be found in the Andean songs, and the thesis is driven only by what is present in the data itself. In this respect, the corpus of waynus I collected differs from songs of other localities such as Ayacucho, where they have served a very political purpose (Ritter 2002).

In Chiquián and Pomabamba, waynus are generic folksongs that can be sung by anyone and can relate to any theme, while songs for particular festivals are usually performed by a capitana 'female captain', from whom I collected the texts. Many festivals seem to be dying out, or losing many of their principal features such as the songs. There is an increasing trend for those remaining songs to be sung in Spanish rather than Quechua. As Fabián states of Canis, a small town in Bolognesi, 'Many of these customs, with the passing of the years,...have become simplified, and others have ceased altogether' (2003:8, mt). Some communities have produced recordings of their musical and dance traditions (e.g. the Masha of Mangas, the Wayta Muruy of Huanchayllo, the Apu Inka of Pomabamba and Vilcabamba, and the Negritos of Pomabamba and Chogo). By and large, preservation of the musical and dance tradition is given precedence over the texts; thus, many of the lyrics that I documented had not previously been recorded. Whilst, in Bolognesi, there are no institutions dedicated to folklore (though there are individual artists), Pomabamba has been declared Ancash Capital of Folklore, mainly thanks to the thirty-six dances present in the province.

There are also two folkloric associations, *Qantu Wayta* (named after a widespread Andean flower, *Cantua buxifolia*) and *Shumaq Qantu Wayta* (beautiful *qantu wayta*). According to the presidents of both associations, they were created in order to *rescatar* 'rescue' traditions from extinction, by training adolescents to perform local dances at various events and *para no percibir musicas que no son de nosotros* 'so they don't listen to music that isn't our own'. The dances are divorced from their

original ritual contexts, being performed as pieces of theatre. The most significant example is the annual competition between schools, each of which showcases a section of a dance from the province in Pomabamba's football stadium. Thus, the dances have taken on a very different meaning: from an inseparable part of a ritual of fertility and agriculture to a totem of a reified local identity. This corresponds to the two dimensions of this thesis, where I contrast essentialist and processual accounts of 'identity'. The following could equally speak of Pomabamba:

'With the best of intentions, these cultural administrators were, and are, fighting for the legitimacy, recognition, and preservation of Andean arts through actions such as organizing performance contests, theatre-stage presentations, and "folklore" schools. In the very act of doing so, however, they are bowing to the greater prestige of urban-Western values and institutions by suggesting that such contexts are the final proving ground for performers and art forms. Moreover, in such contexts Andean arts are highly influenced by urban-Western aesthetics and *criollo* stereotypes regarding Andeans. Legitimacy is indeed enhanced but on *criollo* terms and within their control' (Turino 1991:272).

Rather than viewing the impact of Western notions as a negative feature, it is perhaps more productive to consider the paradox as an interesting phenomenon which can shed light on the dynamics of 'identity'. In Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, I shall argue that essentialist ideas have arisen in the provinces precisely *because* people have adopted Western practices. Indeed, the very ideal of 'preservation' is arguably the product of a European mindset dating back to Herder and the emergence of the concept of 'nation' in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

### **Ancash Quechua: An Overview**

This section offers a brief introduction into the history, sound-system and grammar of Ancash Quechua (AQ).

### History

The Andes have played host to several language-families, of which Quechua is one. Torero argues that seven independent languages are grouped under the term 'Quechua' (2002:88), though any precise demarcation is problematic (Torero 1974:36). Where the 'dialect' ends and the 'language' begins is an often arbitrary issue, since language diversification operates along a continuum. Moreover, varieties with greater social status tend to be classed as 'languages' even if they are closely related (e.g. in Scandinavia). Given its subordinate social status, 'Quechua' is often spoken of as a single language (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:168). But this is far from the truth since its internal

variation is considerable. The term kichwa literally denotes an ecological zone ('temperate valley') and its denomination as a 'language' was allegedly a misunderstanding of the Spanish newcomers (cf. Sichra 2003:94-96), though this was only a partial misunderstanding since languages were probably divided more by ecological zones than by political boundaries (Albó 2004b:18). For Mannheim, 'it is not only the name of the language that is an imposition from without, but even the idea that languages could be named at all' (1991:8). The precursor of all Quechua varieties was probably spoken by the inhabitants of Caral, the oldest known South American civilization which thrived on the Ancash coast around 2750 BCE (Torero 2002:45). Proto-Quechua would have developed from this, expanding along the central Peruvian coastline. At the turn of the Common Era, and with the flourishing of classical Peruvian civilizations, proto-Quechua spread into the mountains, ramifying into Quechua I (in the mountains) and Quechua II (on the coast) (Torero 2002:47-48, Adelaar with Muysken 2004:188) (Parker (1963) adopts the same classification with different terms: Torero's Quechua I corresponds to Parker's Quechua B, while Torero's Quechua II corresponds to Parker's Quechua A). This dualistic relation between 'mountain' and 'coast' would be a key factor in the development of Andean trade (Kolata 1993:49), and is reflected in the Masha songs of Chapter Three. Torero suggests, moreover, that the regularity of Quechua grammar emanates from its role as a language of contact and trade between different regions (2002:87).

Quechua I remained in the central Peruvian highlands, and would have had contact with Culli, a now extinct language that was spoken in northern Ancash until the mid-twentieth century (Solís 2003b:26). Quechua II spread across the southern massif, reaching Cuzco, which was to become the Incan capital. Given the far greater diversity of Quechua I (Quechua B), we know that it is much older than Quechua II (Quechua A) (Parker 1976b:27-28), despite the very common misbelief that Cuzco Quechua represents an original standard. The sub-families are separated primarily on lexical and morphological grounds, since there is wide phonological variation within each sub-family (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:184). As they expanded, the Quechua varieties eliminated many other varieties (Torero 1974:9), rendering the contemporary designation of Quechua as a 'native language' somewhat dubious. Equally dubious is the common assertion that Quechua is the 'Incan language'. The Incas are alleged to have spoken a 'secret language' which may have been an Aymara or Puquina variety (Cerrón-Palomino 1989:15), or a royal register of multilingual wordplay (Randall 1987), though they adopted Quechua II as the lingua franca of their Empire given the preponderance of this language in the region. Today, the Quechua-speaking zone is roughly coterminous with the boundaries of the Incan Empire, with around ten million speakers (Torero 2002:55) from southern Colombia to northern Chile and Argentina. Following the Spanish invasion,

the colonizers maintained Quechua as the *lengua general* (official language), since the unity implied by Quechua was useful in safeguarding political control (Urban 1991:312). The overall aim was to gradually replace Quechua with Spanish among the population, though there were many vacillations in the extent to which this was considered practicable or desirable (von Gleich 1994:84). Following the Third Council of Lima (1582-1583), full professorships were set up for Quechua in Peruvian universities (Cerrón Palomino 1989:20). By the middle of the seventeenth century, however, the emphasis had shifted to Hispanization and Quechua was promoted less and less (1989:21). The language was conclusively banned in 1780 following the revolution of Tupaq Amaru who attempted to reinstate the Incan Empire by routing the Spanish (Aybar 1980:XXVIII).

Quechua had almost no support from criollo/Hispanic society throughout colonial and early republican days, until the early 1900s when the indigenista 'indigenist' movement arose. As van der Lee states, the 'idea was to rescue this indigenous culture as the new ground upon which to build the modern Peruvian society' (2000:35-36). Indigenistas attempted to establish 'continuity between a glorified Inca past and the marginal situation of contemporary peasants' (Mendoza, Zoila 2000:49). The sole focus on the Incas reflected the movement's ideological motivation of opposition to the sociocultural eminence of Lima. This led to a form of discrimination in turn, whereby Cuzco Quechua 'became a symbol of Andean identity' (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:182), and that which was Andean, but non-Incan, was sidelined (Ninawaman 2005:164). During fieldwork, I found that the vast majority of people still considered Cuzco Quechua to be the pure, original, language, with other varieties (including their own) only dialects. This ideology has been promoted by some members of the Academy of the Quechua Language, based in Cuzco: 'the academicians consider the dialects of rural communities (runa simi) bastardized forms, uncultured and impure' (Niño-Murcia 1997:150). We shall witness similar ideologies to those of the *indigenista* movement in Chapters Two and Four. Movements are not, however, homogeneous and not all indigenistas would have advocated such views; thus, the above descriptions conform to a general tendency, not a uniform categorization. Arguedas was one proponent whose activities emanated from a strong humanitarian sympathy with marginalized Andeans, rather than the idolization of Incan culture in purely symbolic terms. Moreover, the movement endowed Quechua with a prestige that had been significantly lacking, by rendering it a language of literature and the arts (Turino 1991:269) (albeit overwhelmingly in the Cuzco variety).

Quechua was rendered an official language on 27<sup>th</sup> May 1975, by the Alvarado government (Cerrón-Palomino 1989:25). Spanish remained the national language, while Quechua and Aymara were

official in their respective areas. Quechua was legally classed as a single language (a product of its lack of prestige in the past), but Alvarado was keen to document the regional varieties, employing linguists to classify the Peruvian Quechua languages into six regional standards. It is on the basis of this that Ancash Quechua (AQ) became a recognized linguistic entity, with its own grammar and dictionary (Parker 1976a, 1976b). Whilst the notion of 'Ancash Quechua' is to some extent artificial (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:256), I have chosen to use this term rather than the more general Quechua I (or Quechua B). This is because I am well acquainted only with the Quechua varieties internal to Ancash, which are sufficiently close to be grouped as a single language, but have little first-hand knowledge of the varieties in the greater Quechua I (Quechua B) area. Thus, I prefer to err on the side of caution rather than attempt hazardous generalizations of Quechua I (Quechua B) on the basis of only a few varieties in Ancash. Since the mid-twentieth century, Peruvian society has been characterized by mass migration from the country to coastal cities, with a concomitant shift from Quechua to Spanish (von Gleich 1992:59, Chirinos 2001).

# **Contemporary Sociolinguistic Situation**

There have been several sociolinguistic studies on contemporary Quechua-speakers. These are summarized in this section, with the caveat that, despite 'some sociolinguistic commonalities across regions, the diverse mosaic of sociocultural contexts and experiences makes it difficult to generalize regarding a single, monolithic "Quechua situation" (Hornberger & Coronel-Molina 2004:10). A major issue that informs language-choice in the Andes is that of status. For example, Wölck notes how, among the Peruvian bilinguals he studied, Spanish was generally rated higher in terms of status and education, and Quechua in terms of affect, strength, sincerity and intelligence (1973:138). Bilinguals were generally more sensitive to class than monolinguals (1973:140). Hornberger (1988) found, in a rural community in southern Peru, that the low status of Quechua led most mothertongue Quechua-speakers to favour Spanish, and young migrants to abandon Quechua altogether. Recalling Wölck's findings on the status (Spanish) / solidarity (Quechua) divide, Hornberger notes how Spanish was associated with literacy, progress, work, government, education, industry, commerce and bureaucracy, and Quechua with orality, informality and humour. Similar situations, particularly among young people, are noted by Gugenberger (1999), Marr (1998) and Chirinos (2001:20). Indeed, Chirinos notes how, in 'countries where being indigenous is not a reason for admiration but of marginalization, it is understandable that one wishes to disassociate oneself from some of the symbols which impede access to full citizenship' (Chirinos 1998:455).

The status differential between Quechua and Spanish informs another major theme in the sociolinguistic literature: that of intergenerational transmission. Gugenberger found in Arequipa that parents strongly supported Quechua tuition at school, but were not willing to teach it directly to their own children. Thus, the affective relation towards Quechua (as noted by Wölck and Hornberger) was plausibly subsumed by the perceived difference in prestige. Supporting this interpretation is Albó's study in Bolivia, which revealed that mothers' unwillingness to promote Quechua was because they had experienced discrimination and wished to safeguard their children from experiencing it themselves (2004a:124). Indeed, Howard found across the Andes that stigmatization causes people to change their surnames (2007:188-198), mitigates pride at professional success (2007:194), and causes fathers to reject Quechua so as to avoid humiliation for their children (2007:194). In several regions, then, bilingualism is often a transitory stage between Quechua and Spanish monolingualism (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:258). Gugenberger interprets these data as evidence of a fragmented identity (1999:239), a theme which will surface in Chapters Two and Four where I argue that discriminatory discourses have been deeply internalized by indigenous populations.

Despite these discouraging developments, a range of studies has shown that the picture is not entirely bleak: there are many contexts in which Quechua is positively valued. De Bedia and de Martínez, studying Quechua-speakers who had migrated illegally from Bolivia to Jujuy (Argentina), found that 70% had a positive attitude towards Quechua, 10% negative, and 20% ambivalent (2001:91); code-switching (mixing languages) was a strategy to convey solidarity and to counter discrimination (2001:92). Here, then, it would seem that the affective significance of Quechua overrides potential threats to its status. Moreover, King presents evidence to suggest that Quechua may enjoy higher status than Spanish in specific contexts: in her Ecuadorian field-site, it was polite to talk 'up' to elders in Quichua (Ecuadorian Quechua) and 'down' to children in Spanish (1999:23); overall, Quichua had higher status in the town, where economic prosperity reduced the risk of discrimination (1999:31).

Solís presents more evidence of positive valuation of Quechua: in the southern Peruvian villages that he studied, the 'use of the indigenous language in the community is a characteristic and a necessity, as well as a social pressure. In *q'iru* communities, one should only speak Quechua even if one knows Spanish' (2003a:18, mt). While young bilinguals generally wished to maintain their Quechua language (2003a:20-21), most older people believed that even knowledge of Spanish is illegitimate (2003a:19). Similarly, Ninawaman notes how, in many communities, fathers completely ignore

teenage sons who insist on speaking Spanish, forcing them to converse in Quechua (2005:161). These findings point to another theme that will be salient in this thesis: the indication that discrimination against Quechua speakers produces an equally discriminatory discourse in the opposite direction, so that the strategy of resistance often operates along the same principles as the original racism.

While the above studies suggest a degree of resilience in the use of Quechua, much of the valuation of Quechua is symbolic rather than practical. Sichra notes how, in Cochabamba (Bolivia), the strong ideological valuation of Quechua did not translate into an attempt to 'modernize' the language by rendering it compatible with the urban environment. Instead, Quechua remained limited to expressions of the idealized rural environment (2005:25). Haboud similarly notes how 'The symbolic values of a language or even the strong emotional connection of speakers to it, cannot guarantee language maintanence' (2004:81).

The issue of precisely what is to be 'maintened' or 'lost', however, is more complex than our analytical labels might suggest. The notions of discrete 'languages' and 'cultures' can mislead us into presupposing that 'Quechua', 'Spanish' and their 'communities of speakers' have some kind of foundational ontological reality, eclipsing the fact that they are first and foremost social practices, and hence contingent and relational. Social practice, on the ground, rarely – if ever – corresponds to idealized categories. Van den Berghe (1979:260), Abercrombie (1991:99) and Howard (2007:166) all note that speaking Quechua does not automatically index self-ascribed indigenous identity. Andean modes of identification are flexible and context-dependent, with the result that symbols of groupadhesion cannot be taken as absolute and transcendant categories (Howard 2007:172). Two particularly salient examples are given by Feke and Muysken respectively. Feke has demonstrated that indigenous solidarity in Cuzco was often conveyed through non-standard agreement in Spanish (2004:56), rather than through direct use of a Quechua 'language'. Muysken has described the Ecuadorian code of Media Lengua, a hybrid Quechua/Spanish form which 'came into existence because acculturated Indians could not identify completely with either the traditional rural Quechua culture or the urban Spanish culture' (1997:376). Moreover, 'there is not always a clear-cut classbased rural-urban dichotomy between Spanish and Quechua-speaking populations' (Howard 2011:190). Since the colonial era, intermarriage, feudal tenure and trade resulted in both populations learning each other's language, so that 'relations between Spanish and Quechuaspeaking sectors became increasingly intertwined over the centuries' (2011:190).

Indeed, classifying 'Quechua' as a single language with a single community of speakers would be a gross simplification. Identities are negotiated not just in relation to Spanish but also between different varieties of Quechua. Weber notes how, being 'symbols of identification with one's own ethnic group or community, differences between neighbouring varieties – though perhaps small – can be of great importance for their speakers' (1987:14). This was certainly the case for Quechua speakers in my fieldsites. People in Conchucos and Bolognesi were keen to point out differences from the Huaylas variety, such as monopthongization of diphthongs in Huaylas but not elsewhere, and the frication of the uvular stop [q] in Conchucos and parts of Bolognesi, but not Huaylas.

In sum, while use of Quechua is undoubtedly declining, there are reasons to be optimistic about its presence in the Andean societies of the future. It is unlikely to attain predominance in a demographic sense, but not all communities are giving it up, it is assuming a clear symbolic role, and it will plausibly continue to be an object of academic study and discussion. There are also attempts to give primary school education in local varieties of Quechua where these predominate. In the section on Contact Phenomena, moreover, I show how Quechua survives even in presumed monolingual Spanish speech, for it has passed on many of its lexical and grammatical features to Andean Spanish.

# **Phonology (Sound System)**

AQ has twenty-three consonants, five of which only appear in Spanish loanwords. Unlike some Quechua II varieties, AQ has no aspirate or ejective consonants. Below is the consonant-inventory (adapted from Parker 1976b:38), with Spanish loans in brackets:

	Bilabial	Labiodental	Alveolar	Post-	Retroflex	Palatal	Velar	Uvular
				alveolar				
Plosive	p (b)		t (d)				k (g)	q
Nasal	m		n			'n		
Trill			(r)					
Flap			١					
Fricatives		(f)	S			ç	х	
Approximant	w					j		
Lateral			1			٨		
Approximant								
Affricates			ts	t∫	tş	сç		

Excluding Spanish loans, AQ has six vocalic phonemes, three short and three long. Vowel-length is phonemic (i.e. a change in vowel-length changes the meaning) (1976b:47). The vowels [e] and [o]

are allophones (phonetic variations) of /i/ and /u/, respectively. However, in some Spanish loans, [e] and [o] are phonemes in their own right (i.e. are /e/ and /o/), representing different meanings rather than just different pronunciations. Thus, taking into account the long and short versions of these loaned phonemes, modern AQ has ten vocalic phonemes in total. Below is a table of the vocalic inventory, with the Spanish loans in brackets (adapted from 1976b:47):

	Front	Central	Back
High	i, i:		u, uː
Middle	(e, eː)		(o, oː)
Low		a,aː	

The syllable can have any of the following structures: V; CV; VC; CVC (where V is 'vowel' and C is 'consonant'). For example (1976b:55):

```
/hatʃa / 'plant' (CVCV)
/kiswar/ 'a kind of tree' (CVCCVC)
```

Stress falls on the penultimate syllable, except in exclamations (1976b:57). In the case of Spanish loans, the vowel that would be stressed in Spanish is usually reinterpreted as a long vowel in Quechua (1976b:60). For example:

/tona:da/ 'melody' /tri:gu/ 'wheat'

# Morpho-Syntax (Structure of Words and Sentences)

Quechua is classed as a nominative-accusative, polysynthetic and agglutinating language-family. A polysynthetic language is one which 'allows the formation of extremely long words with many affixes' (Parker 1976b:29, mt), an 'affix' being a particle added to a word-root. An agglutinating language is one where the affixes 'undergo very little fusion or morphophonemic change' (1976b:29, mt); in other words, adding new affixes does not change the form of those already there. The affixes are simply added onto each other. An example of the polysynthetic agglutinating nature of AQ is (Parker 1976b:29):

wayinkunamanraq 'still to their houses' wayi-n-kuna-man-raq

wayi is the noun 'house'; -n marks the third person possessive; -kuna marks the plural; -man marks movement 'towards' the houses; -raq is the adverbial marker 'still'.

Whilst the number of affixes in a word is theoretically limitless, there are usually no more than seven. All affixes are suffixes, going at the end of the word (1976b:30). There are around one hundred suffixes in AQ (Julca-Guerrero 2009a:399), of which almost all are fully productive. Productivity here refers to the ability of most suffixes to combine spontaneously with word-roots and other suffixes, so that new words are often formed ad hoc in conversation, unlike languages such as Spanish and English where word-formation is generally a historical process. The productivity of suffixes means that relatively few lexical items (or word-roots) exist in the language; meaning is fine-tuned by the way different suffixes are combined (Adelaar with Muysken 2004:233). Hence, a comprehensive AQ dictionary would contain only around five thousand entries (Parker 1976b:31). The agglutinative nature of Quechua means that Quechua 'can better express tonalities and affects without depending entirely on an extensive vocabulary' (Mazzotti 2003:101); as we shall see, this gives AQ a great ability to convey nuances of meaning. Given that grammar is conveyed almost entirely by suffixes, AQ word-order is very flexible. There is, however, a tendency for the order of 'subject-object-verb' (Parker 1976b:71). Adjectives precede nouns (1976b:34). Word-class is also less rigid in AQ than in other languages such as English. Thus, many AQ words can function as nouns, adjectives or verbs. For example (1976b:34):

ullqu 'man' or 'to be angry'
wegru 'deformed (of the foot)' or 'to limp'

The following table illustrates the verbal suffixes for the present tense:

Person	Marker	Example (wiya- to hear')
1 <sup>st</sup> singular	-: (i.e. vowel-lengthening)	wiyaa
2 <sup>nd</sup> singular	-nki	wiyanki
3 <sup>rd</sup> singular	-n	wiyan
1 <sup>st</sup> plural inclusive	-ntsik	wiyantsik

Plurality is indicated by inserting the suffix –ya between the verb-root and the person marker (1976b:106); thus, wiya-ya-nki 'you (pl.) hear'. The exception is the first plural inclusive –ntsik, but it is debatable as to whether this is plural at all, since its focus is frequently more on the unity of the group than on the individuality of its members. To clarify, Quechua has two different categories for

'we': an inclusive (noqantsik), whereby the addressee is included in the group ('all of us including you'), and an exclusive (noqakuna), whereby the addressee is excluded ('all of us but not you'). Given the ambivalent status of the inclusive form — which, in my data, conveys the formation of a singular 'group' through merging of multiplicities — I prefer not to categorize it in terms of singularity or plurality, referring to it simply as the 'inclusive' form. Indeed, the contrast between noqakuna (the 'true' plural) and noqantsik will be significant in my exegesis of 'identity' in the songs.

AQ has no articles; however, the distinction between definite and indefinite article ('the man' and 'a man') is normally apparent in the context. Prepositions and conjunctions are conveyed by suffixes rather than individual words (though nowadays Spanish conjunctions are increasingly deployed) (1976b:32). Nouns inflect (denote grammatical characteristics) according to person (possessive), number (plural) and case in that order. For example (1976b:33):

maki-yki-kuna-wan 'with your hands': maki- 'hand'; -yki 'second person singular possessive'; -kuna 'plurality'; -wan 'genitive (i.e. 'with')'.

One particularly interesting aspect of AQ grammar is the category of 'evidentiality'. This is an epistemic category which conveys relative degrees of certainty and/or source of information. In AQ, evidentiality is conveyed by three suffixes, -mi, -chi and -shi. According to Weber, 'with -mi the speaker assumes responsibility, with -shi he defers it (to someone else), and with -chi he indicates that it is not the sort of information for which anyone should be held responsible' (1986:138). Given that I frequently heard the use of -mi in questions, I would argue that evidentiality conveys degrees of 'intensity' or 'vividness' rather than purely concerning responsibility. Affective dimensions seem, moreover, to be as important as sensory 'data' in the conveyance of certainty or doubt. As Dedenbach-Salazar Sáenz states, Quechua evidentiality 'reflects both the actual evidential situation of the narrator and his attitude toward the narrated account – for example, whether he is or feels involved – and his attitude toward the addressee' (1997:164). Thus, it would seem that many 'Quechua speakers have...a predilection for considering the strongest, most aesthetically salient version of their perceptual experiences' (Nuckolls 1993:249), rather than separating the 'data' from the process of engagement. Evidentiality will be important in understanding the conveyance of 'identity' in the songs.

### Contact Phenomena

AQ and Andean Spanish have influenced each other through their contact spanning half a millennium. There was a degree of Spanish influence in almost every Quechua song or conversation that I heard. Adelaar notes that Spanish loanwords have either added new concepts, or replaced lexical items for extant concepts in AQ (1994:3). This concords with my experience, whereby AQspeakers were often unfamiliar with the original Quechua words I had been taught, using Spanish loans instead (the 'Quechua' lyrics all display significant lexical influence from Spanish, most notably in the Pallas from Pacllón, Chapter Four). Language-mixing also seems to coincide with a shift from a more synthetic communicative orientation to a more periphrastic one (i.e. from the fine-tuning of meaning through adding affixes onto a single word, as in AQ, to the construction of meaning through deploying different word-roots altogether, as in Spanish). The unequal influence from Spanish to AQ reflects the differential in prestige, Spanish being generally more prestigious than AQ. Indeed, Winford notes that borrowing is generally more limited where both languages have the same status (2003:37). Aside from word-borrowings, Carranza Romero observed many grammatical influences from Spanish when he collected oral texts from consultants between 1988 and 1992, in Ancash, La Libertad and Lima departments (1993:201). Spanish influenced AQ phonologically, in the lowering of high vowels: /u/ > [o] and /i/ > [e] (1993:247) (evident particularly in the Hispanization of 'Incan' terms in the Apu Inka, Chapter Four, cf. p.231). Morpho-syntactically, there was the addition of certain Spanish morphemes and a shift to Spanish sentence-structure (subject-verb-object) (1993:252-253). AQ has also had some influence on Spanish. Phonologically there were several changes, including vowel-raising: /o/ > [u] and /e/ > [i] (notably in the Negritos song of Chapter Three). Morpho-syntactically, there was loss of number- and gender-agreement (AQ has no gender), loss of prepositions in certain verbal phrases, restructuring of the possessive according to AQ wordorder, conflation of formal and informal second person pronouns (there is no such distinction in AQ), replacement of the subjunctive by other moods (1993:254-260). In terms of word-borrowings, AQ has had limited (though by no means zero) influence on Spanish. The numerous cross-linguistic influences will be apparent throughout this thesis.

# **Orthography (Writing System)**

The development of a Quechua writing-system has incited much controversy since colonial times, and even today most Quechua-speakers I talked to stated that writing in this language is 'very difficult'. The problems derive less from the intrinsic difficulty of writing Quechua (which, being a

regular language, is comparatively easy to codify) so much as from disagreements over which system should be used. There have been several revisions of the Quechua alphabet over history. The first attempt to develop a standardized Quechua orthography was probably the Third Provincial Council of Lima which took place between 1582-1583. In republican times, the first concentrated effort was Julio Tello's development of the *Alfabeto de las Lenguas Aborígenes* [Alphabet of Aboriginal Languages], published in 1932 (Hornberger 1993:329). In 1954, the *III Congreso Indigenista Interamericano* [Third Interamerican Indigenist Congress] took place in La Paz, Bolivia, and resulted in the adoption of the *Sistema Único de Escritura para las Lenguas Quechua y Aymara* [Single Writing System for the Quechua and Aymara Languages]. This was essentially the same system that had been developed by Bible translators assisted by Kenneth Pike in 1944. The *Academia Peruana de la Lengua Quechua* [Quechua Language Academy of Peru] adopted this alphabet by law in 1958 (Hornberger 1993:329). In 1983, Quechua academics in Lima and Ayacucho organized the First Workshop on Quechua and Aymara Writing, intended to resolve certain practical difficulties that teachers has found when deploying the official alphabet (Hornberger 1993:240). The Workshop's recommendations were legally adopted in Peru on 18<sup>th</sup> November 1985 (Hornberger 1993:249).

Today, two main orthographies are used for AQ. The Summer Institute of Linguistics, a protestant missionary organization which has conducted extensive linguistic research, has translated several biblical documents into AQ. Their writing-system is based on Spanish. The orthography of the Ancash Regional Academy, by contrast, derives from that introduced by the 1985 law. I have deployed the latter system, given that this is the official standard. Nonetheless, both alphabets appear to be equally suited to conveying the full range of sounds in AQ. Below is a table (adapted from Parker 1976b:62) illustrating how sounds are represented by the official alphabet. Vowellength is indicated by doubling the vowel, for example (1976b:63): /miku:/ mikuu 'I eat'.

Phone (Sound)	Letter
[p]	р
[t]	t
[cç]	ts
[tʃ]	ch
[tş]	tr
[k]	k
[q]	q
[s]	S
[ç]	sh
[x]	h
[m]	m
[n]	n
[ɲ]	ñ
[1]	1
[λ]	II
[r] or [ɾ]	r
[w]	w
[j]	у
[a]	a
[e]	е
[o]	0
[i]	i
[u]	u

# Presentation

This thesis is organized in five parts: three core chapters plus the Introduction and Conclusion. The core chapters consist of detailed analysis of data collected in the field. In the conclusions to each chapter, I summarize the main threads and discuss their implications for the theoretical question of 'identity'. In the conclusion to the thesis, I take up the threads and unite them in a final exegesis. I present each text in the original language, along with my own translations. The translations are meant as rough guides only, since the core of this thesis is a fine-grained analysis of texts in the original language. As Barber states for the interpretation of oral literature, 'the only way to start, and the only place to end up, is with actual texts. We have to apprehend just how the words work' (2007:225). This analysis is, however, accessible to people without knowledge of either Spanish or Quechua, since I explain the significance of each linguistic element. In the interests of space, I can only present extracts of each song or interview. I have ensured that this has had no impact on my interpretations. I have chosen to analyse each particular instance of a linguistic category in its context, rather than discussing the overall relevance of a given category as a whole, since the 'same' morpheme can have different functions depending on where it is used. For example, changes in the denotation of the 'group possessive' –ntsik will be important in the Masha songs. This case-by-case

approach may seem more laborious, but it is the only way to apprehend all of the subtleties involved in the linguistic indexing of 'identity' in the songs.

In Chapter Two, we explore the popular genre of waynu and its variant in Pomabamba, chimaychi, in terms of their social roles. The data comprise interview-responses interspersed with songs collected in different parts of the provinces. The Chapter comprises two parts. In Part One, we see how the songs serve a purpose of uniting people intersubjectively, through bonds of shared understanding and affect. There is a blurring of the boundaries between individuals. Part Two presents a vision that is in many respects opposite to this. Here, the genres serve a purpose of hardening boundaries between 'in-group' and 'out-group'. In the Chapter's conclusion, I argue that the two parts can be interpreted along the same lines. Both suggest that our patterns of affiliation and distancing are motivated by survival, and that it is by virtue of our intersubjective nature that boundaries are created at all. In Chapter Three, we witness the ritual genres of Carnaval, Masha, Wayta Muruy and Negritos. The key theme in all of these songs is the formation of social ties through mutual engagement (reciprocity). How we engage depends on our predisposition, and this in turn informs the kinds of social bonds that we create. Thus, social bonds are expressions of particular stances motivated, again, by survival. The creation of difference is as important as the creation of unity, since difference is what allows elements to be complementary and sets the precedent for productive exchange.

In Chapter Four, we journey to the distant past, exploring representations of the Incan Empire in contemporary rituals. There is strong identification with the Inca, presented as the lifeblood of Andean society, and rejection of the European 'newcomers', presented as amoral and irreconcilable. I analyse these representations by building on my conclusion to Chapter Two, arguing that the divide between 'in-group' and 'out-group' is a combination of our intersubjective susceptibility and our instinct for survival. The thesis represents the two strands of 'identity' alluded to by Brubaker and Cooper (2000:2), which I cited on the first page of this introduction and which motivated the conceptual exegesis of 'identity' as a means of reconciling the apparent contradictions. The first, 'constructivist', strand is more salient in Chapters Two (Part One) and Three, while the second, 'essentialist', strand is more salient in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four. In the conclusions to each chapter, I argue that these strands are not, in fact, contradictory, since they are both strategies for survival informed by different contexts and dispositions. In Chapter Five, I combine the insights of each chapter by recourse to detailed textual analysis of selected passages from Merleau-Ponty,

Heidegger and Derrida. I examine these passages while summarizing their corresponding chapter, thus maintaining the dialogue throughout the thesis.

At the end of each chapter the reader will find two photographs which depict some of the themes discussed during the thesis. In most cases they anticipate the following chapter. And accompanying the thesis is a CD of some songs which I recorded and which pertain to Chapter Four. Thus, the reader can engage with the subject in an experiential as well as purely literary manner, so that both of us, reader and writer, can tread those same paths that are opened up to us by the voices of the mountains. The prelude has been set. It beholds us now to turn the page, and to enter into the world of Andean songs, on the first stage of our quest for the meaning of 'identity'.



Words woven on wool: *Waynu* lyrics on a belt made by Don Juan Vergara, who is displaying it here. The text translates as: 'Jealous of me, suspicious of me / She made me go away / Who could have been the cause? / My cabbage-headed mother-in-law.'



Words on wood: The front door of César Bolo Diestra's house, indicating that its occupant is a renowned singer/composer of *chimaychi*. The inscription reads 'To the sound of *chimaychi*'.

### **Chapter Two**

## Weaving Worlds with Waynu

Our initial foray into the realm of Andean songs begins with the most widespread and popular native genre: the waynu (huayno in Spanish). The waynus which I collected follow the pattern described by Otter: 'Huaynos generally consist of two or three stanzas followed by a faster fuga. The stanzas and the fuga are often repeated and have four lines of six to ten syllables...Two lines form a couplet, and two couplets form a stanza' (1985:133). While every waynu has a fuga, the fuga does not necessarily bear a semantic relation to the stanzas, and the same fuga may be appended to different waynus (1985:151). There are many widely acknowledged sub-genres of waynu, defined by place of origin and musical and dance characteristics; literary features, by contrast, play little part in defining waynu-genres. In Bolognesi, the chuscada is popular, and is played with the harp, violin and guitar or charango, a smaller instrument derived from the guitar; the chuscada is relatively fast-paced. The waynu of Pomabamba is the chimaychi (chimayche in Spanish), a slower-paced dance with the use of handkerchiefs akin to Morris dancing; chimaychi is played with harp, violin and flute. As we shall see, the different dance-features of chimaychi mean that Pomabambinos identify with chimaychi before waynu, whereas Chiquianos identify with waynu, the term chuscada being deployed as a more technical term by musicians. Otter notes how the waynu is 'an inextricable unit of music, song, and dance' (1985:132), being "at the same time music, poetry, song, dance, musical instruments, tonal system, style, social classes, human groups, specific culture, etc." (Roel 1959, in Otter 1985:132). Many of these themes shall become apparent in the present chapter.

The Chapter is divided into two sections. Part One presents interview-excerpts which illustrate the intersubjective basis of identity-formation, problematizing right from the start the division between Self and Other. In the summary of this section, I note the close correspondence between the interview-extracts and Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* 'flesh'. Part Two discusses excerpts which illustrate a sense of identity as abiding, inalienable and bounded, defined in terms of an irreconcilable Other. I discuss the paradox of this dualistic vision, where the irreconcilability of the Other also entails a dependence on the Other for the definition of Self. In the light of Part One, I shall argue that this dualistic vision is itself intersubjectively constituted (by *chair*), but that intersubjectivity does not entail harmony. This, I shall show, is where Derrida's *trace* departs from Merleau-Ponty's *chair*, while also perpetuating it. This anticipates Chapter Three, where the

interplay of antagonism and approximation is what gives rise to discourse and historical progression, and Chapter Four where an inalienable commonality is similarly reliant on a supposedly irreconcilable alter. Ultimately, in Chapter Five, I argue that the creation of oppositions is the story of our emergence from a world with which we are partially contiguous and yet somehow distinct. The quotes in this chapter are all excerpts from interviews and focus-groups which I conducted with people of diverse ages, professions and genders, in the towns of Chiquián and Pomabamba. The themes of 'intersubjective communion' and 'discourses of Otherness' were very common in interviews, and were not restricted to a particular age-group, profession or place of origin. It is important to note, however, that all of the interviews were conducted in the urban centres of Chiquián and Pomabamba, small towns where there is widespread influence from the more 'Hispanic/criollo' culture of the coast (in terms of media, commerce, language, music, and physical to-ing and fro-ing). This influence will be significant when I analyse the motivation behind the discourses of 'otherness'. I have included biographical information after each quote, namely date of birth, gender, profession and place of birth, in that order. Rather than focusing on a few people, I have attempted to interview as many people as possible within a similar (i.e. semi-urban) social context, to gain a sense of general themes which can later be analysed according to context. Within each of the two sections in this chapter, I present the interview-excerpt, followed by my discussion thereof. I have peppered the discussion with a selection of waynu-lyrics, all of which were gathered in the field. Where there is a recognized author, I have indicated his/her name in brackets after the song; otherwise, the songs are anonymous.

# Part One: Identity-Creation as an Intersubjective Process

The term 'intersubjectivity' has had many uses, summarized by Gillespie & Cornish (2009:19): 'shared definition of an object' (e.g. Mori & Hayashi 2006); 'mutual awareness of agreement or disagreement and even the realisation of such understanding or misunderstanding' (e.g. Laing, Phillipson & Lee 1966); 'the attribution of intentionality, feelings and beliefs to others' (e.g. Gärdenfors 2008); 'implicit and often automatic behavioural orientations towards others' (e.g. Merleau-Ponty 1945, Coelho, Ernesto & Figueiredo 2003); 'the partially shared and largely taken-forgranted background which interlocutors assume' (e.g. Jovchelovitch 2007). My interest in this section is to show how waynus create unity on the basis of shared experience. Thus, I conceptualize 'intersubjectivity' as emotional and cognitive approximation between agents, which is consistent with the above definitions. The degree to which our intersubjective potentiality is realized between any two (or more) agents depends partly on our willingness to engage, and this is what I call

'reciprocity'. Reciprocity is the topic of the next chapter. I have ordered the following extracts according to degree: first, the formation of waynus from a subjective state; second, the communication of subjective states between people; third, the resultant unity. The holistic nature of intersubjectivity means that, in reality, elements of the social and individual are present in every quote. But, in order to understand something holistic, it is first necessary to group similar phenomena together and then examine how the groups relate to each other. Thus, the headings for this section (from more 'individual' to more 'social') are not classificatory, but only signposts that guide us through the exegesis of particular phenomena towards the realization of their inextricability. In the summary, I shall illustrate, by recourse to Merleau-Ponty's notion of chair, that the 'social' and 'individual' elements of existence are not mutually opposed, but are instead mutually entailing.

### Formation of Waynus from a Subjective State

The first quote conveys how waynus are formed on the basis of personal experience:

1. El chimayche es una danza bastante querendona, es una danza bastante intimista...Es lírico, ¿no? porque el poeta vierte lo que siente, lo que lleva adentro, es una cualidad interna en lo que siente, lo que sufre, las angustias, las tristezas, las penas, las alegrías del alma.

'The *chimaychi* is quite an affectionate dance, it's quite an intimate dance...It's lyrical, because the poet voices what (s)he feels, what (s)he carries inside, it's an internal quality in terms of what (s)he feels, what (s)he suffers, the anxieties, the sadness, the hardships, the happiness of the soul.' (1976; male; teacher; Pomabamba)

This speaker defines the *chimaychi* as *querendona* 'affectionate' and *intimista* 'intimate'. Both adjectives convey a deeply personal emotion in the core of the individual. The second adjective nonetheless differs from the more usual term, *intimo*, in that the suffix –*ista* conveys a performative dimension; *intimo* describes the way something *is*, whereas *intimista* describes what it *does*, namely create intimacy (*querendona*, by contrast, does not convey the same sense of projection insofar as the –*on* ending is augmentative, being more adjectival than adverbial). The depiction of intimacy in performative terms creates a sense of relation even in this most personal of utterances. Thus, in this example, subjectivity is intersubjectivity. The rest of the quote continues with the theme of *chimaychi* as an interior state, in *lo que lleva adentro* 'what (s)he carries inside' and *cualidad interna* 'internal quality', together with a description of the emotions that lie deep in the *alma* 'soul'. This quote coincides with Gálvez's affirmation that the 'paralinguistic substructure [of songs] comprises a dimension that is especially apt for creating an emotional state and for expressing inner feelings'

(2006:96, mt). The term *vierte* 'voices' illustrates that these internal states are communicated, thereby forming part of a relational process that is the *chimaychi*. The next quote likewise emphasises the role of *waynu* in conveying personal experiences:

2. Eso es el vivir de cada persona. Supongamos que tú has tenido un tropiezo con una chica, te ha pagado mal, o te ha pagado bien. Entonces de acuerdo a eso tú ya compones la música, el huayno, recordando esos momentos, recordándote de ella, o que hayas vivido otras clase de vidas más diferentes a eso, ¿no?, por decir que hayas tenido, pues, cualquier problema, lo que sea, y recordándote de eso, dedicado a ese problema, dedicado a eso, se compone, pues, el huayno.

'It's the lived experience of each person. Let's suppose you've had a slip-up with a girl, she's responded to your affection badly, or she's responded well. So, in line with this, you compose the music, the *waynu*, remembering those moments, remembering her, or perhaps you've had different experiences, let's say you've had any kind of problem, whatever it is, remembering this, dedicated to this problem, dedicated to this, you compose a *waynu*.' (1965; male; *waynu*-artist; Chiquián)

Here, the waynu is defined as el vivir de cada persona; the infinitive vivir can be translated as 'the act of living', though 'lived experience' is a more natural translation in English. The speaker's definition of the waynu in such terms indicates the genre's fundamental role in communicating highly personal experiences. The example of romance is given, whereby people compose waynu, recordando esos momentos 'through remembering those moments', suggesting the nature of the song as a form of private reflection. The adjective dedicado 'dedicated' likewise conveys the inextricable link between the song's raison d'être and the personal experience of the individual. As this quote illustrates, a highly salient theme of waynus is that of romance, often, but not necessarily, unfulfilled. The following extract of a Quechua waynu from Chuyas (Pomabamba) illustrates this:

Hanka chakillan siete sabio Tsaypa laadunchaw Rima rima wayta Eso señapis mala señapis Ay mananash tinkushuntsu Siete sabio of the mountains (snowfield)
By its side
Flower of rima rima
This sign is a bad sign
Oh, we will never meet again

The depiction of two Andean plants, siete sabio (Mutisia hastata) and rima rima (Krapfia weberauerii), as ill omens illustrates the common attribution of supernatural signs to elements of nature.

### The Communication of Subjective Experience

The quotes in this section emphasize the role of *waynu* in projecting this internal disposition to others. The next quote describes this in terms of a 'message':

3. A mí me gusta [el huayno] porque trata de la vivencia de las personas de esta zona. Algunas son alegres, algunas son tristes, pero al menos tienen un mensaje más realista de las cosas, porque la gente dice lo que siente desde el corazón, y...es su vivencia, las que interpretan al menos muestran sus vivencias.

'I like it [the waynu] because it's about people's lived experiences in this area. Some are happy, some are sad, but at least they have a more realistic message about things, because people say what they feel from their heart, and...it's their lived experience, those who perform at least demonstrate their experiences.' (1994; female; school-pupil; Chiquián)

This speaker emphasizes the waynu's role of communicating one's vivencia, which translates roughly as 'lived experience'; the threefold repetition of this term stresses its pivotal importance for the genre. The term mensaje 'message' foregrounds the fact that another role of the genre is to convey this personal experience to others. The phrase la gente dice lo que siente desde el corazón 'people say what they feel from their heart' affirms the communication of a deeply subjective condition, whereby that which is 'inside' an individual is also what brings people together when it is shared at a profound level. This is also conveyed by the phrase muestran sus vivencias 'display their experiences', whereby, through the waynu, personal experience becomes shared experience. This is possible because waynus are un mensaje más realista de las cosas 'a more realistic message about things', insofar as people can relate to each other intersubjectively about real-life experiences. The sense that the more personal the message, the greater the potency of the waynu, is also conveyed by the following:

4. Persona cantanqanqa exteriorizan penanta. Tal vez problemanta, exteriorizan alegrianta.

'The person who sings exteriorizes his/her suffering. Perhaps their problems, they exteriorize their happiness.' (1965; male; Governor of Pomabamba; Pomabamba)

This short extract is included because of the term *exteriorizan* 'exteriorizes', an integration of Spanish VR *exterioriz*- 'exteriorize' into AQ morphology (with 3PRES singular -n), which is applied to deeply personal emotional states (*pena* 'suffering', *problema* 'problem' and *alegría* 'happiness', all with the AQ third person possessive ending -n and the object-marker -ta). Again, the *chimaychi/waynu* is described in its capacity to convey private aspects of the Self to Others. This

extract is an example of the externalization of personal suffering through a Quechua *waynu* from Canis (Bolognesi):

Yakutsun tamyatsun karqaa Noqapa weqii Canisinapaq waqar purinaapaq Kullutsun rumitsun karqaa Noqapa shonquu Canisinapaq sufrir purinaapaq Water and rain
Should be my tears
Since I wander, crying, for my Canis girl
Tree-trunk, stone
Should be my heart
Since I wander, suffering, for my Canis girl

This sense of 'exteriorizing' a subjective state recalls biological research on macaque monkeys, which found that certain neurons are discharged 'both when the monkey grasps or manipulates objects and when it observes the experimenter making similar actions'. Thus, '[t]hese neurons (mirror neurons) appear to represent a system that matches observed events to similar, internally generated actions, and in this way forms a link between the observer and the actor' (Rizzolatti & Arbib 1998:188). The authors argue that this process should also operate in humans. Thus, the ability to cognitively bridge the gap between Self and Other may be innate in our physiology. The notion of the waynu as a 'message' resurfaces in the next example:

5. Las canciones componen de lo que uno siente. Bueno, a veces, hay cosas negativas como también positivas....La canción es un mensaje, ¿no?, una composición de la realidad del cantante, o de la realidad de las personas...y nosotros escogemos los mensajes positivos que nos cantan.

'Songs are composed out of what one feels. Well, sometimes there are negative things as well as positive things....The song is a message, a composition about the singer's reality, or people's reality...and we choose the positive messages that they sing to us.' (1987; female; student; Huayllán, Pomabamba province)

This quote also describes the basis of songs on personal experience, *lo que uno siente* 'what one feels', whether this results from *cosas negativas* 'negative things' or *positivas* 'positive' things. As in quote 3, the song is described as a *mensaje* 'message', and this 'message' is *la realidad del cantante* 'the singer's reality' or *la realidad de las personas* 'people's reality'. Such usage of *realidad* 'reality' in Spanish conveys the totality of a person's experiences, their subjective world. The fact that a person's own *realidad* 'reality' can be communicated as a *mensaje* 'message' means that it is not just a *subjective* world, but an *intersubjective* one — and, indeed, intersubjectivity is the basis of experience since there must be an interaction with something for an experience to occur. The intersubjective basis of the songs is expressed in the final clause, *nosotros escogemos los mensajes positivos que nos cantan* 'we choose the positive messages that they sing to us', whereby the

expression of the composer's personal experience enables other people to relate to this experience at an equally personal level. The next speaker, a *waynu* artist, notes how his ability to convey the intersubjective nature of *waynu* lies at the centre of his career:

6. Limaqchaw shutitsiyamashqa Galán Pomabambino, La Voz del Sentimiento, porque a veces noqanaw tantas decepciones, tantos sufrimientos pasayashqa, entonces tsay upyarnin, wiyayarnin musicaata, entonces paykunatasi waqatsin porque noqanaw paykunapis sufriyashqa. Noqata muchas, pasamashqa decepciones amorosas, tsaykuna pasamashqa entonces tsaykunata noqa cantaa, tsaykunatam qillqaa wiyayaamanampaq llapan y tsaymi noqata rikayaaman como la Voz del Sentimiento niyaaman, aw, porque musicaakuna waqatsikun, shonqunkunamanshi llakitsirnin chan letraakuna, tsaymi, runakuna niyaaman "tsaynawari", aw.

'In Lima they called me the *Gallant Pomabambino, The Voice of Sentiment*, because sometimes, like me, they had experienced so many disappointments, so much suffering, so, while drinking and listening to my music, it would make them cry because they had suffered as I had. I had many disappointments in love, that happened to me so I sing about these things, I write about these things so that they can all listen to me, and, consequently, they see me as the *Voice of Sentiment*, as they call me, yes, because my music makes them cry, they say that the words enter their hearts and make them sad, so people tell me "just like that", yes.' (1967; male; *chimaychi*-artist; Pomabamba)

Here, a singer/composer explains the origin of his artistic name, given to him in the Peruvian capital, Lima, when he travelled there to take part in a singing contest. The reason for his appellation was the congruence between the message of his songs and the personal experience of his audience: noqunaw tantas decepciones, tantos sufrimientos pasayashqa 'like me, they had experienced so many disappointments, so much suffering'. His songs would waqatsin (waqa- 'cry'; causative –tsi; 3PRES –n) 'make them cry', because noqunaw paykunapis sufriyashqa 'they had suffered as I had'. The theme of romantic disappointment is evident from the following extract of a composition by this speaker (Moisés Zavaleta Vilanueva):

Amiguchawpis parientechawpis Manam confianzatsu Kuyashqallaata, wayllushqallaata Kuyakurkullan With friends or relatives
There can't be trust
The one I love, the one I adore
They also adore

The depiction of uncertainty in this verse recalls Otter's comment in the 1980s that 'nostalgia, fatalism, and a wish to find forgetfulness are the emotions that occur most in the huaynos of the Callejón de Huaylas. This may be related directly to the marginal position of the Indians' (1985:152). Golte, Oelting and Degregori (1979) also found that suffering and romance are the most salient themes in their corpus of *waynus*; a similar conclusion was reached by Yaranga's (1982) analysis of

waynus from Ayacucho. Figueroa (1981), studying songs from southern and central Peru, found that distrust, conflict, impotence and insecurity were frequently expressed.

Thus, for this interviewee, songs such as the above catalyse the formation of affective bonds between the singer/composer and the audience, as well as between individual members of the audience. This recalls Niles' affirmation that 'Strong identification between the person singing or hearing a song and the person or persons whose fates are played out in the song is part of the essence of literature as a performed act' (1999:81). Likewise, the statement, tsaykunatam qillqaa wiyayamanampaq llapan 'I write about these things [his experiences] so that they can all listen to me' suggests the formation of unity through universal identification with the singer's message, particularly in the word *llapan* 'everyone'. Rather than this unity standing in contradiction to deeply personal states of being, the more personal the message, the greater the possibilities for uniting at an interpersonal level: shonqunkunamanshi llakitsirnin chan letraakuna 'they say that the words enter their hearts and make them sad'. The process of interpersonal engagement is conveyed by the interplay of possessives, whereby vowel-lengthening indexes the first-person singular possessive in letraakuna 'my lyrics', which chan 'arrive' shonqunkunaman 'in the direction of their hearts', where the -nkuna (following shonqu 'heart') indexes third-person possessive 'their hearts'; the process of conveyance from one person to another is also indicated by the directional -man 'towards'. The fact that interpersonal unity is created on the basis of linking 'hearts' - the core of the individual illustrates the difficulty in positing a rigid boundary between Self and Other, between 'internal' and 'external', since, according to these extracts, the more 'internal' the issue, the more it has the capacity of creating interpersonal bonds. Intersubjectivity can therefore be seen as occupying not just the space 'between' entities, but as part of the constitution of the entities themselves. This extract again recalls 'mirror neuron' research, whereby '[m]irror neurons represent the neural basis of a mechanism that creates a direct link between the sender of a message and its receiver. Thanks to this mechanism, actions done by other individuals become messages that are understood by an observer without any cognitive mediation' (Rizzolatti & Craighero 2004:183). This anticipates Merleau-Ponty (1964)'s notion of chair, which I discuss at the end of this section, and which conveys the mutual constitution of entities. This sense of the mutual projection of Self and Other through chimaychi is expressed in the following extract:

7. El chimayche antiguo es una situación que se cantaba con el sentimiento, con el corazón en la mano. Se cantaba el amor a la tierra, se cantaba el amor a la mujer, al hombre, o sea, era un intercambio de sentimientos entre el varón y la mujer. El chimayche en el fondo tiene unas letras que mayormente hacen alusión al amor, a la decepción, al triunfo, como en todos los géneros, pero mucho más sentimental, mucho más expresivo...Era como las coplas que se

hacían, como las coplas que se hacen por ejemplo en Cajamarca, que el hombre le dice alguna cosa a la mujer, la mujer al hombre, entonces era como un intercambio, era como una situación de diálogo. Pero en este caso, en el chimayche de acá, ha habido unas situaciones que realmente el hombre transmitía su sentimiento de igual mujer, entonces eso es la expresión autóctona de lo que es el chimayche.

'The old *chimaychi* is something which was sung with feeling, with one's heart on one's sleeve. One sang about one's love for one's land, one sang about love for a woman, for a man, it was an exchange of feelings between the man and the woman. The *chimaychi* at its core has lyrics which mostly allude to love, to disappointment, to triumph, as in every genre, but much more sentimental, much more expressive...It was like the couplets which they invent in Cajamarca for example, whereby the man says something to the woman, the woman to the man, so it was an exchange, like a situation of dialogue. But in this case, in the *chimaychi* from here, there were situations where the man really transmitted his feeling, the woman likewise, so this is the native expression of the *chimaychi*.' (1954; male; shopowner; Pomabamba)

The extension of Self towards Other at a deep personal level is also illustrated here, with the phrase corazón en la mano 'heart on one's sleeve' (literally 'heart in one's hand'). The speaker defines the chimaychi as un intercambio de sentimientos 'an exchange of feelings', where affective and communicative reciprocity is enacted through the projection of Self to Other on both sides (cf. the Negritos song, Chapter Three); this is also illustrated by the description of chimaychi as both sentimental 'sentimental' (highly personal) and expresivo 'expressive' (interpersonal). The chimaychi is likened to the oral tradition of coplas 'couplets', sung at Carnival in the northern city of Cajamarca, whereby men and women would respond to each other in verse. The theme of communicative reciprocity is again stressed by the description of chimaychi as an intercambio 'exchange' and diálogo 'dialogue'. The phrase transmitía su sentimiento 'transmitted their feelings' conveys the sense of the Self being projected towards the interlocutor, whereby Self and Other are mutually constitutive. The notion of 'transmitting emotion' recalls the concept of 'emotional contagion', whereby 'People tend: (a) to automatically mimic the facial expressions, vocal expressions, postures, and instrumental behaviors of those around them, and thereby (b) to feel a pale reflection of others' emotions as a consequence of such feedback. The result is that people tend (c) to catch one another's emotions' (Hatfield, Rapson & Le 2009:26). Ethological studies, moreover, have suggested that 'imitation of emotional expression constitutes a phylogenetically ancient and basic form of intraspecies communication' (2009:25). Thus we can see how chimaychi serves to unite people by stimulating an innate capacity for emotional exchange. The following speaker describes how it is this very unity that motivates people to perform waynu:

8. Es que expresan sus sentimientos, pues, ¿no?, por ejemplo, es de, una señorita no ha aceptado, por decir, a un jóven, entonces el jóven compone una canción a esa tristeza, pero

como es parte de la realidad, la gente lo acepta con alegría, ¿no?, dice 'a mí también me ha pasado', le hace suya, y así, ¿no?, todo, o puede expresar su tristeza o su alegría.

'It's that they express their feelings, for example, a girl hasn't accepted, let's say, a young man, so the young man composes a song for his sadness, but since it's part of reality, people accept it with happiness, they say "the same happened to me", they make it their own, they can express their sadness or happiness.' (1966; female; teacher; Pomabamba)

This illustrates the mixed emotions of sadness and joy that are often conveyed by the *chimaychi*. Whilst the message might be sad, *la gente lo acepta con alegría* 'people accept it with happiness' because it is *parte de la realidad* 'part of reality'. It is clear that the pleasure derives from the experience of shared understanding and solidarity that the *chimaychi* affords, insofar as people say *a mi también me ha pasado* 'the same happened to me', with the result that *le hace suya* 'they make it [the song] their own', and the song can thereby *expresar su tristeza o su alegría* 'express their own sadness or happiness'. Thus, there is the sense that the expression of the other person's experience is also an expression of one's own experience, so that the boundary between Self and Other is blurred. The act of making another person's experience *suya* 'one's own' relates once more to 'mirror neuron' research, which has shown that even physical sensations can be partially transmitted: 'The observation of other people's hands, legs, neck, or face being touched indeed triggers activity in regions of SII [an area of the brain] also responding when participants are touched on the same body part' (Keysers & Gazzola 2009:3). The following speaker likewise shows how the pleasure of *waynu* derives from sharing often negative experiences:

- 9. Cuánto más triste creo que lo bailan con más ganas, no sé, y ahí, como que, mitigando sus penas, de repente, o contagiando la alegría en este momento, que de acuerdo al estado de ánimo de la persona que lo escucha, por eso pueda bailarlo también, o la persona que compone...vivencias ajenas o vivencias propias puede explayarlo.
  - 'I think that, the sadder it is, the more they enjoy dancing to it, as if mitigating their suffering, perhaps, or being infected with the happiness of that moment, since, depending on the mood of the person who is listening to it, they can dance to it as well, or the person who composes...can offload their own or others' experiences.' (1965; female; teacher; Ayacucho, living in Pomabamba)

This speaker describes how the sharing of sadness through waynu allows people to mitiga- 'mitigate' sus penas 'their suffering. Key here is the VR contagia- 'contract, become infected', used in the positive sense of contagiando la alegría 'being infected with the happiness'. As with transmit- 'transmit' in quote 7, this verb portrays the emotional influence from one person to another in quasi-physical terms, as if the emotion were something substantive that circulates between people. Similar to the English expression 'contagious laughter', the verb creates a sense of interpersonal

cohesion. This means that, through the *chimaychi*, people *vivencias ajenas o vivencias propias* puede explayarlo 'can offload their own or others' experiences', to the extent that the division between *propio* 'of the self' and *ajeno* 'of the other' is highly porous. Skar, in her study of Andean migrants, discusses what she describes as the 'law of contagion' in Andean cosmology: 'Contact with foreign persons and objects implies a transfer of quality, with a contagious effect on personal characteristics...Ultimately contagion calls into question the unassailability of contiguity and allows for transformations in meaning' (1994:261). Such transformations are only possible, however, if contiguity does not entail the abandonment of the distinction altogether, since it is the difference between people that allows meaning to be negotiated, and their unity to be experienced through the process of identification. The next speaker describes how this mutual identification, as fostered through *waynu*, can lead to social change:

10. O sea que noqapa...vidaaman...chimaychikunananqa a veces kay comunidadnintsikchaw imasi pasanqanta cantayan, entonces a veces reflexionatsimantsik, aw. Tsay reflexionatsiskimashqa, tsay ideawan, imatasi mejorayta munanki comunidadniykichaw.

'Well, for my life, *chimaychis* sing about anything that might happen in this community of ours, so sometimes they make us reflect, yes. After having made me reflect, with that idea, sometimes you want to improve something in your community.' (1981; female; councillor; Huayllán, Pomabamba province)

This speaker describes how her ideas have been influenced by listening to chimaychi. The use of possessives is interesting here. She begins with the first-person singular possessive (indicated by vowel-lengthening) in vidaaman 'for my life', then deploys the IPOSS -ntsik in comunidadnintsikchaw 'in our community'; this suffix enacts a sense of unity by suggesting that the community both is 'everyone' and is 'for everyone', given the morphological inseparability between possessor and possessed. Insofar as the speaker is addressing me, someone whose origins are clearly not in Huayllán, one would normally expect the exclusive *nogakuna* to be used in place of the inclusive nogantsik (cf. pp.56-57); this suggests that nogantsik is becoming synonymous with the Spanish nosotros 'we', where there is no division between exclusive and inclusive forms (cf. quote 28); the significant lexical influence from Spanish in this quote adds weight to this interpretation. This, plus the widespread preference of interviewees to respond in Spanish (even while adulating Quechua), concords with Arguedas and Guerrero's (1967/1981:11) findings, in La Libertad department and Cajamarca province, that music had greater persistence than language. It is possible, however, that the speaker is using the inclusive form as a way of including me in the group, perhaps because of my knowledge of Quechua or interest in local folklore. reflexionatsimantsik (Spanish VR reflexiona- 'reflect'; causative -tsi; IOBJ -ma...ntsik; 3SING -n) 'makes us reflect' conveys the receptivity of the individual to the song, and the unity between individuals as part of the audience (again, conveyed by the inclusive first-person plural form –ntsik). Thus, the intersubjective basis of the *idea* 'idea, thought' is illustrated, together with the physical manifestation of this intersubjectivity in the form of action, in *tsay ideawan, imatasi mejorayta munanki comunidadniykichaw* 'with that idea, sometimes you want to improve something in your community'. The role of *waynus* in encouraging communal reflection is illustrated by the following extract from Corpangui (Bolognesi), composed as an appeal to open municipal elections:

Cuatro años de tristeza Cuatro años de alegría Cuatro años de sacrificio Y cuatro años de lucha

Autoridades provincials Autoridades distritales Autoridades departamentales Que haya justicia en este pueblo Four years of sadness
Four years of happiness
Four years of sacrifice
And four years of struggle

Provincial authorities
District authorities
Departmental authorities
Let there be justice in this town

In this section, we have seen how *waynu* facilitates the congruence of individual predispositions, a function which is central to people's enjoyment of the genre. The intersubjective role of *waynu* thus seems to be its primary purpose in both Chiquián and Pomabamba. In the next section, we shall see how this congruence, as facilitated by the 'message' of the *waynu*, results in greater social unity.

## The Intersubjective Basis of Social Unity

This speaker conveys how, for her, the pleasure of *waynu* resides in the intertwining of the lyrics with one's personal life:

11. Son de la vida misma, pues, ¿no? A veces coinciden con lo que tú estás pasando. Eso es lo que te incentiva a que cantes.

'They are about life itself. Sometimes they coincide with what you are going through. That is what motivates you to sing.' (1974; female; restaurant-owner; Chiquián)

Here, a singer describes how she chooses songs on the basis of congruence between the lyrics and her own life-experiences. The verb *coinciden* (Spanish VR *coincid-* 'coincide'; 3PRES plural –*en*) preempts the following quotes, which all illustrate the congruence of Self and Other, and their partial conflation in the *waynu/chimaychi*. It is this conflation that motivates this speaker to sing. Thus, there is a conflation between singer and composer, as well as between the singer and the audience,

so that the distinction between 'performer' and 'audience' is a porous one. The pleasure of performing waynu resides in the extent to which the voice of 'another' becomes one's own voice. The next extract likewise defines a 'good' waynu in terms of 'identification' with the content:

12. Y lo que también nosotros decimos para un buen huayno...es el cantante que debe tener una buena llegada, y que tengan pues sus versos bien definidos, que sean de vivencias reales, entonces ahí tú le dices 'tú lo cantas con sentimientos', te identificas con esa canción, porque tú dices 'ah, no, yo pasé así'.

'What we also say for a good *waynu*...is that the singer must make his message come home, and that their verses be well defined, they should be real experiences, so you say to him/her "you sing with feeling", you identify with that song, because you say "ah, that also happened to me."' (1955; female; shop-owner; Chiquián)

This speaker defines a good waynu as having una buena llegada, literally 'a good arrival', whereby the message, based on vivencias reales 'real experiences' that are shared, strikes home, resonates with the individual listener. The metaphor of physical movement is deployed, creating the sense of a metaphysical bond that follows the trajectory of the 'message', and that brings two entities into a contiguous relation with each other. The most crucial phrase in this quote is te identificas con esa canción 'you identify with that song', which conveys the sense that one's personal identity extends itself to incorporate part of the Other, through this relation of partial contiguity. This dialogues with Oring's statement that the 'term collective identity has meaning only as it refers to an intersection of personal identities and has no existence apart from the psyches of particular individuals', and that 'much of personal identity is predicated upon the interjection of the common and collective' (1994:212). Thus, the 'sociality' of identity is indissociable from its 'individuality'. In the above quote, the more 'individual' (personal) the experience that is conveyed, the greater its capacity for harnessing social bonding when converted into waynu. The following quote, by a renowned singer/composer of chimaychi, expresses this is more detail, in the specific context of romance:

13. Ahorita, con el chimaychi, se identifican todos, se identifican todos. En el chimaychi las composiciones en quechua son algo más jocosos, algo más reales de las vivencias que tiene la gente, ¿no? Por ejemplo yo hice una composición. Dice, es de, '¿imaraq kay kuyanakuy?', ¿no?, '¿qué cosa será este querer?', ¿no?, decía, yo me preguntaba '¿por qué tanto este querer?' En quechua le he puesto 'shonqutapis kushitsinmi / umatapis pierditsinmi', y, en algunas vivencias dice, en el siguiente verso nomás, 'ollqutapis y warmitapis gustarinmi / naani hananchaw y naani chakinchaw kuyanakuy', esos son versos reales y ha gustado mucho a la gente estos versos que compuse, todavía, entonces cuando yo canto, la gente de, por ejemplo, del campo, 'esto me hace recordar yo, cuando era jóven, con mi señora pues me metía debajo del camino y en el bosquecito ahí estábamos queriéndonos', esos son los versos en quechua, algo reales, algo que les identifica la gente del pueblo más que todo.

'Now, everyone identifies with the *chimaychi*, everyone identifies. In the *chimaychi*, the Quechua compositions are rather more humorous, rather more true to the experiences which people have. For example, I made a composition. It says "what is this mutual love?" [AQ], "what is this love?" [Spanish], it said, I asked myself "why is this love so great?" In Quechua I put "it makes the heart happy / it makes us lose our head", and, in line with certain experiences, in the following verse, "boy and girl both like it / this mutual love above the path and below the path", those are real verses and people have really liked those verses which I composed, still, so when I sing, people from, for example, the country, "this makes me remember when I was young, with my wife I hid myself under the path and in the wood there we were, making love to each other", those are verses in Quechua, something real, something which identifies people from the villages, above all.' (1972; male; *chimaychi*-artist; Pomabamba)

This speaker states that se identifican todos 'everyone identifies' con el chimaychi 'with the chimaychi', which depicts the creation of unity on the basis of shared experience. The speaker argues that chimaychis in AQ are más jocosos 'more humorous' and más reales 'more real' than their Spanish counterparts, a perception that was common in both provinces; Gálvez also notes how, in Huancavelica, 'Quechua is considered an eminently expressive language, particularly suitable for the manifestation of emotional states and feelings' (2006:94, mt). The speaker cites a song which he composed as an expression of his love for his wife, and how this song was appreciated by a large number of people. What is particularly noteworthy in this quote is the role of memory, the stimulation of which is the principal agent of the process of identification: 'esto me hace recordar yo, cuando era jóven...' "this makes me remember when I was young". Along with the congruence between the experience of the singer and that of the audience, then, is another form of congruence, that between present and past Self. Moreover, this sense of autobiographical contiguity is itself foregrounded by the interpersonal congruence. Thus, we see how different dimensions of intersubjectivity interact, and how the conceptualization of contiguity relies on a process of identification, a relation which illustrates that this contiguity is not complete uniformity. This is most salient in the context of romance, which originates through the congruence of complementary opposites. While, in the above quote, unity is created through shared memories of romance, the following speaker describes how the waynu can actually engender a romantic relationship:

14. Por ejemplo, tú de una chica estás enamorado, y mediante la canción tú le dedicas a ella...todo lo que sientes por ella, todo lo que sientes, y mediante la música, más antes como decían, era de enamoramiento, y más antes con la música, se enamoraban, y mediante la música nomás, llegaban a estar con ella, a ser enamorados.

'For example, you're in love with a girl, and through the song you dedicate to her...everything you feel for her, everything you feel, and through the music, earlier, as they say, it was of love, and earlier with music, they fell in love, and only through the music, they could be with her, to be lovers.' (1994; male; school-pupil; Pomabamba)

This extract expresses the unification of a couple through the performance of *chimaychi*. The term *dedicas* 2PRES singular 'dedicate' conveys the projection of the Self towards the Other, insofar as the boy expresses his emotions to the girl, *todo lo que sientes por ella* 'everything you feel for her'. If the girl is willing to align herself with this expression, then unity results: *llegaban a estar con ella, a ser enamorados* 'they could be with her, to be lovers'. In all of these examples, the unity is created intersubjectively, through a 'meeting of minds', but the very fact of 'meeting', and the rationale behind the unity in the first place, is the absence of complete contiguity between the two people (it is, for example, their difference in gender which motivates their unity). This anticipates the discussions of complementarity in the songs of Chapter Three, both between the sexes and in other contexts. The following song-extract from Chiquián (Bolognesi), moving in its simplicity, is one example of the performative role of waynu in engendering or reinforcing romantic attachments:

Linda Chiquiana Eres dueña de mi amor Con tu belleza cautivas mi corazón

Ahora que yo te quiero Ahora que tú me amas Qué feliz estamos Pretty Chiquián girl You are the owner of my love With your beauty, you capture my heart

Now that I love you Now that you adore me How happy we are

The next speaker shows how the unity engendered from *waynu* results in the sublimation of the 'individual' within the 'collectivity', so that personal identity becomes shared identity:

15. En las fiestas a veces nos olvidamos...tenemos que juntarnos todos, ricos, pobres, todos tenemos que juntarnos en los compromisos, en las fiestas, y ahí disfrutamos, no, la música, que es tan bonita, no, las letras, como le digo, a veces de Alicia Delgado, también, muy bonito, sus letras, de sufrimiento, la realidad de su vida, a veces hay artistas que lo dedican así bonitos, sí, bonitas letras tienen.

'In the festivals we sometimes forget ourselves...we have to join together, everyone, rich, poor, we all have to join together in the events, in the festivals, and we enjoy ourselves there, the music, which is so beautiful, the lyrics, of suffering, the reality of her life, sometimes there are artists who dedicate such pretty lyrics, yes, they have pretty lyrics.' (1955; female; shop-owner; Chiquián)

Here, the creation of community on the basis of intersubjectivity is displayed in the phrase *nos olvidamos* 'we forget ourselves', whereby the sense of a bounded Self largely disintegrates in the context of communal participation in the festivals. This is reinforced in the phrase *tenemos que juntarnos todos, ricos, pobres, todos tenemos que juntarnos* 'we have to join together, everyone,

rich, poor, we all have to join together'. Thus, for this speaker, the *waynu* dissolves social divisions and brings people back to a state of undifferentiated humanity. The role of *waynus* as a social leveller is exemplified in the following song-extract from Pacllón (Bolognesi), where a man sings to his lover:

Arrozta niptiyki Fidyusta niptiyki Pobrezallaachaw Tarillashaqtsu If you say 'rice'
If you say 'spaghetti'
In my poverty
I won't find it

Kamsallawanqa Papallawanqa Wiray wirayta Puritsishqayki

With kamsa With potato

I'll enable you to walk around

Fat and strong

(Joel Rivas)

Kamsa is a common Andean dish made of roasted corn. The implication is that the composer cannot afford expensive goods, but this won't prevent them from having a good life. In the interview-excerpt, the affirmation disfrutamos 'we enjoy' conveys the sense of a community that is created and perpetuated through enjoyment of the same music, and through the intersubjective knowledge that this enjoyment is shared. Thus, the quote communicates a strong feeling of contiguity between Self and Other, and the sense that this contiguity is personally enriching for all involved. The speaker describes the lyrics of the late and nationally celebrated singer Alicia Delgado as de sufrimiento, la realidad de su vida 'of suffering, the reality of her life', further emphasizing the role of the songs in creating a community on the basis of empathy and shared experiences. The same theme of the dissolution of boundaries between 'individuals' is expressed in the following extract:

16. Bueno, el propósito es confundirse, para poder confundirnos con la sociedad, con unos, con otros, porque tú sabes que cultivar la música es muy bonito, es muy interesante, y con la música, pues...o sea te confundes con cualquiera persona, que sean tus amigos, no sean tus amigos, con tu familia, con cualquiera persona tú te confundes, llegas a tener más amistades, y así sucesivamente.

'Well, the purpose is to blend together, so we can blend with society, with some people, with others, because you know that cultivating music is really beautiful, it's very interesting, and with music, well...you blend with anyone, whether they're your friends or not your friends, with your family, you blend with anyone, you come to have more friends, and from there on.' (1965; male; waynu-artist; Chiquián)

This quote relates closely to the preceding one, by describing the waynu as enabling people to confundirse 'to blend together'. Literally, the verb means 'to be confused', which relates to this context insofar as the boundaries between people are blurred, reflecting the dissolution of personal psychology into an intersubjective sense of shared consciousness. The reflexive se (at the end of the word) can be used in an individual sense (to oneself) or in a group sense (to each other); its ambiguity here arguably serves to conflate even more the individual with the community, whereby self-reflexivity is also communal engagement. The phrase confundirnos con la sociedad, con unos, con otros 'blend with society, with some people, with others' conveys the sense of particularities (unos, otros 'some people, others') forming part of a larger whole (sociedad 'society'), within which they are contiguous and yet partially distinct entities. Society here is not an abstract concept, but a quasi-physical reality held together by relations of contiguity - extensions of 'selves' - among its members. This sense of merging partly with the Other is reinforced in the affirmation, te confundes con cualquiera persona 'you blend with anyone'. The stress on cualquiera persona 'anyone' emphasizes this contiguity all the more, since personal distinctness is largely erased through the process of integration. Thus, communality can be fostered que sean tus amigos, no sean tus amigos 'whether they're your friends or not your friends', with the result that *llegas a tener más amistades* 'you come to have more friends'. This quote stresses the intersubjective basis of identity through enjoyment of waynus, both from the outset – the Other must already contain an element of the Self if it can be related to at all - and during the event itself - since the acknowledgement of this similarity unites people even more, further obfuscating the boundary between Self and Other. The last quote summarizes all of the stages of the intersubjective process, from the formation of a personal disposition through experience, to the conveyance of this disposition through waynu, and the resulting social unity:

17. Bien, para escribir el chimaychi, creo pues a veces hay una esquela de ver algo y sentir, percibir, ¿no? Entonces esa percepción o ese sentimiento de repente convertirlo en chimaychi, convertirlo en música, en huayno, significa que tiene un formato esencial, ¿no?, que tenga un mensaje más que nada. ¿Mensaje de qué? Mensaje de alegría, mensaje de tristeza, mensaje que confunda a la gente, ¿no?, que realmente llegue pues al corazón, porque la música cuando realmente escuchas llega, pues, hasta el alma, no, por las venas corre, y esto pues emotiva que uno escriba temas que realmente gusten y ha gustado a mucha gente los temas que hemos hecho.

'Well, to write the *chimaychi*, I think that sometimes there's a blueprint of seeing something and feeling, perceiving. So when this perception or feeling is sometimes converted into *chimaychi*, into music, into *waynu*, it means that it has an essential format, that it has a message, above all. What kind of message? A message of happiness, a message of sadness, a message which blends people together, which really gets to a person's heart, because the music, when you really listen, gets to the very soul, it runs through the veins, and this

inspires people to write themes which many people really like, and many people have liked the themes which we've composed.' (1978; male; *chimaychi*-artist; Pomabamba)

Here, a composer of chimaychi defines the capacity to write songs in terms of one's ability to ver algo y sentir, percibir 'see something and feel, perceive'. The intersubjective basis of inspiration is thereby acknowledged, insofar as the perception of algo 'something' engenders certain emotions. The chimaychi arises through a process of convertir 'converting' these emotions into a mensaje 'message'. This is another level of intersubjectivity, whereby aspects of personal psychology – which have themselves arisen through interaction – are projected towards other people, so that the song is in a sense an extension of Self. The mensaje 'message' is equated with un formato esencial 'an essential format' suggesting that an 'essence' consists of the streamlining of diffuse experience into a targeted, because communicable, form. This 'message' is described as a mensaje que confunda a la gente 'a message which blends people together', so that an intersubjective community is created through empathy and shared understanding of the message. The fact that the emotions (alegría 'happiness' or tristeza 'sadness') are at once deeply personal and yet also shared means that there is an intermeshing of Self and Other not simply at the superficial level, but at the core of each person. Thus, the message arrives at one's corazón 'heart' and alma 'soul', and por las venas corre 'runs through the veins' (anticipating the depiction of sangre 'blood' in quote 33), so that the message circulates not only between people, but also inside people, uniting them at the most fundamental level.

Hermans and Dimaggio similarly note how, according to the concept of 'emotion work', emotions should be 'conceived of not as purely internal impulses that have an existence on their own or as purely physiological reactions that take place within the skin, but as integral parts of an agentic process of social or personal positioning' (2007:47). Psychoanalysts (Lichtenberg, Lachman & Fosshage 1992), evolutionary psychologists (Buss 1995) and cognitivists (Gilbert 1989) have all noted the fundamental role of emotions for survival, presenting 'evidence that human behaviour can be understood as driven by a set of evolutionary-based motives that grant survival and fitness both to the individual and to the group' (Hermans & Dimaggio 2007:43), insofar as the individual is partially dependent on the group. A genetic predisposition for emotional contagion would therefore enhance survival-prospects, for example 'in competition, cooperation, sexuality, and fight–flight' (2007:43). The extent of this influence, or the direction that it takes, depends nonetheless on how willing we are to engage (our predisposition), for the effect of the *chimaychi* only occurs *cuando realmente escuchas* 'when you really listen'. Indeed, Brass, Ruby and Spengler have presented biological evidence that 'attribution of the observed behaviour to the self might only occur if the

observed behaviour is congruent to the planned behaviour, whereas observing an incongruent movement leads to an attribution of the observed behaviour to another person' (2009:2362). On the basis of this evidence, the authors suggest that the default state of the sensorimotor system may be intersubjectivity, whereby one does not 'differentiate between consequences in the environment that are produced by other agents or oneself' (2009:2365). Agency arises through the inhibition of this default state, through a cognitive monitoring system 'which is relying on the learning mechanism and the observation that specific sensory events in the environment are contingent upon one's own actions, while others are not' (2009:2365).

Intersubjectivity, then, does not entail complete conflation of minds. Rather, it involves a more subtle realization that our very ability to distinguish between Self and Other arises from our ability to learn through interaction, so that differentiation is as much a form of intersubjectivity as identification. It is consistent with the above findings to view the construction of the Self as a continuous re-ordering of experience within the neural connections of the brain, and it is this re-ordering – the formation of our predisposition – which means that our behaviour is targeted. Thus, our intersubjectivity can be manifest as much in conflict as in concordance, depending on how we are predisposed to react to the stimulus. This anticipates Part Two, where we witness an intersubjectively-grounded sense of incompatibility, as well as songs of antagonism in Chapter Three, and portrayals of dualistic irreconcilability in Chapter Four. In this quote, the formation of a single community through shared understanding is a primary motivation for composing *chimaychi: esto pues emotiva que uno escriba temas que realmente gusten* 'this inspires people to write themes which many people really like'. Thus, the interpersonal comes full circle to link with the subjective dimension at the beginning of the quote, so that personal motivation is also communal integration.

### Summary

There are several congruencies between the vision of intersubjectivity as presented in these interview-extracts and Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* as well as the Quechua concepts. The first sub-heading was 'formation of *waynus* from a subjective state'. Thus, the focus was on the deeply personal nature of the experience that was then communicated through song. Salient examples were: *lo que lleva adentro* 'what (s)he carries inside' and *cualidad interna* 'internal quality' (quote 1); the *waynu* as expressing *el vivir de cada persona* 'each person's lived experience', and as composed *recordando esos momentos* 'while remembering those moments' (quote 2). However, this internal state, rather than being opposed to sociality, served to make the *waynu's* intersubjective role all the

more significant, insofar as the songs' message derived from the core of the individual. This was evident particularly in the following examples under the second sub-heading ('communication of subjective experience'): *la gente dice lo que siente desde el corazón* 'people say what they feel from their heart' (quote 3); the phrase *exteriorizan penanta* '[people] exteriorize their suffering' (quote 4); *shonqunkunamanshi llakitsirnin chan letraakuna* 'they say that the words enter their heart and make them sad' (quote 6); *transmitía su sentimiento* 'transmitted their feelings' (quote 7); *le hace suya* '[people] make it [the message] their own' (quote 8); *contagiando la alegría* 'being infected with the happiness' of others (quote 9).

These themes dialogue closely with Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* as a 'possibility' or 'potentiality', insofar as the sharing of a universal substance allows for the possibility of affecting and being affected in turn. The fact that it is specifically the deep, personal messages that are the most conducive to forging social bonds recalls the fusion of the 'individual' and the 'social' in *chair*, whereby the 'social' is not just the outer shell of personhood, but part of the very fabric of our constitution. The extracts thereby convey Merleau-Ponty's notion of 'reversability', insofar as self-reflection (inwards) takes the form of social projection (outwards), fusing Self and Other in a unified communicative field. The Quechua concept of *tinku* likewise conveys how entities derive from mutual engagement, so that Self is inextricably bound with Other. The progression of this dialogue to ever deeper levels recalls the notion of *yachay*, where understanding is formed through simultaneous perception and transformation (both of Self and of Other). This can also be understood in terms of *ayni*, the inevitable reciprocal exchange between two emergent entities.

The ability of waynu to unite people through intersubjective communion was reinforced by the extracts under the third heading: the intersubjective basis of social unity. The following examples were particularly significant: A veces coinciden con lo que tú estás pasando. Eso es lo que te incentiva a que cantes 'Sometimes they [the songs] coincide with what you are going through. That is what motivates you to sing', where the voice of the author becomes the voice of the singer (quote 11); se identifican todos...con el chimaychi 'everyone identifies...with the chimaychi' (quote 13); the role of waynu in forging romantic bonds between male and female singers (quote 14); nos olvidamos 'we forget ourselves' in a state of undifferentiated humanity (quote 15); te confundes con cualquiera persona 'you blend with anyone' (quote 16).

Thus, waynu would seem to act as a catalyst for revealing the underlying nature of *chair* as a unifying substance shared by all, where individuals become subsumed in the collectivity. This dissolution of

the individual is not a negation of personal identity, because such conflation is only possible insofar as different people form different experiences. It is this difference that provides the possibility for meaningful connections to be drawn by *waynu*, so that similarities can be apprehended through a process of empathy. This is what Merleau-Ponty means by 'facticity' (1964:184): individual identity can be viewed as one's situatedness in a slightly different context from everyone else, which results in different but compatible dispositions. Such multiplicity, being a contingent expression of relation, is not a gap but rather allows for the possibility of meaningful connections to be made, so that *chair* (unified substance) is not inert but inherently dynamic. Our unity is constantly refreshed through the production of difference. The extracts reveal how novel experiences (diversification of Self) allow for creative ways to reconcile the Self to equally transformative Others (in this case, through *waynu*), just as Merleau-Ponty notes how the evolution of *chair* precludes any entity from arriving at a state of complete self-sufficiency and closure. Likewise, the Quechua concept of *kallpa* embodies the notion of a universal energy out of which everything derives through congruence of potentialities (*kamay*), just as we saw how *waynu* allows for the re-merging of Self and Other through the meeting of slightly different, but highly compatible, dispositions.

In the next section, we shall see how our phenomenological insertion in the world, as contingent manifestations of *chair* or *kallpa*, does not always manifest in harmony. Rather, our inherently communicative and relational nature can manifest equally in conflict and antagonism, in the attempted (though ultimately unsuccessful) negation of any kind of connection.

### Part Two: Waynus as Abiding Identity

In this section, I show how *waynus* are perceived to be an inalienable aspect of an absolute and transcendental 'identity'. This concords with what is understood by the term 'essentialism', defined by Bucholtz and Hall as 'a theoretical position that maintains that those who occupy an identity category...are both fundamentally similar to one another and fundamentally different from members of other groups' (2004:374); moreover, 'Essentialism takes as it starting point that these groupings are inevitable and natural, and that they are separated from one another by sharp boundaries' (2004:374). For Omoniyi, essentialism is 'the philosophy behind labelling any number of normative characteristics or practices as constituting the core of an individual or group which are then used to define them and held to be true of all members of the group' (2006:16). The following extracts portray an essentialist association between 'waynu/chimaychi' and 'identity' at three levels: town/province; Andes; Peru. As we shall see, the extracts are true to Bucholtz and Hall's affirmation

that '[t]he perception of shared identity often requires as its foil a sense of alterity, of an Other who can be positioned against those socially constituted as the same' (2004:371). In the summary to Part Two, I theorize these dualistic discourses by recourse to Derrida's notion of the *trace*, whereby the same underlying discourse is perpetuated at different levels and in different frames of reference. In the Chapter's conclusion, I link Parts One and Two by arguing that intersubjectivity (*chair*) has led to the internalization of a hegemonic discourse (*trace*) that is then reversed as a strategy of resistance. I begin with three quotes which introduce the theme of inalienable identity but do not specify the level of that perceived identity.

### **General Level**

The first speaker considers waynu so fundamental that it is the reason for existing at all:

18. El huayno es nuestro, es nuestra identidad, con esto nos identificamos. Allí está nuestro vivir, nuestra razón de ser.

'The waynu is ours, it's our identity, we identify with it. Our life, the reason for our existence, is there.' (1962; male; teacher; Chiquián)

Here, the *waynu* is defined as *nuestro* 'ours'. The first-person plural possessive *nuestro* 'ours' does not just appropriate the *waynu* as part of the group; rather, it defines the group in the process. This is why the *waynu* is *nuestro vivir* 'our fact of living', and *nuestra razón de ser* 'our reason for existence'. There is ambivalence as to whether this refers only to the existence of the group, or to that of each individual. This suggests that the vitality of the individual is indissociable from that of the group – one's personal identity is also one's social identity. The implication is that, without the *waynu*, the group would not exist and, consequentially, each individual would lose their own sense of who they are. The inextricable association between Self and 'community' is evident in the following *waynu*-extract from Huasta (Bolognesi):

Con el ritmo de mi sonido Dejo mi pecho y pensamiento En las estrofas de mi canto Que desde lejos viene añorando

Yo no quiero que mis versos Sean músicas extrañas Sino son anhelos que nacen En las faldas de mi Huasta With the rhythm of my music I leave my breast and my thought In the verses of my song Which yearns from afar

I don't want my verses
To be foreign music
They are yearnings that are born
On the slopes of my Huasta

The division between 'local' and 'foreign' will be important in this section. Despite the inalienability that is conveyed in the interview-excerpt, the nominal and verbal presentation of 'identity' reveals an interesting tension: the *waynu* is our *identidad* 'identity', but only because *con esto nos identificamos* 'we identify with it'. Whilst this may at first seem trivial, the very fact that the 'substance' ('identity') depends on process ('identification') sits somewhat uneasily with the sense of an enduring 'identity' that is presented as an analytical prime. The tension between, and interdependence of, process and entity is central to my exegesis of 'identity' in this thesis. In the following quote, the 'authenticity' of *waynu* is contrasted with the 'foreignness' of other genres:

19. La diferencia del huayno y las músicas actuales que ahora último se han creado es...que las músicas que ahora se crean son originales de otros sitios y de otros lugares. En cambio...el huayno es originario, es de nuestro, de nuestra localidad, de nuestra zona, y es originaria de nuestra zona, y las otras músicas son originales de otros lugares y deberían, por lo tanto, identificar a los lugares y el huayno a nosotros.

'The difference between waynu and contemporary kinds of music which have recently been created is...that the kinds of music which are being created now have their origin in other localities and other places. By contrast...the waynu is original, it's from our, from our locality, from our area, and it's original to our area, and the other kinds of music are original to other areas and should, therefore identify with those areas and the waynu with ourselves.' (1993; male; school-pupil; Chiquián)

The speaker describes the 'native' waynu as originario 'original'; de nuestra localidad, de nuestra zona 'from our locality, from our area'. Here, the waynu is true to Hamel's statement that 'one's original culture often persists as an idealized, pure, referent, in the conscience of subjects' (1995:79, mt). The 'foreign' genres are presented as: músicas actuales 'current music'; ahora último 'just recently'; ahora se crean 'create now'; de otros sitios y de otros lugares 'from other localities and other places'. The opposition is conveyed in spatial and temporal dimensions, with 'nativeness' discussed in terms of one's own town and a past origin, and 'foreignness' discussed in terms of faraway places and the present day. The spatiotemporal discussion of 'identity' will be a common theme in this thesis. The final line moves from the affirmative to the normative, whereby only the waynu can legitimately identify nosotros 'us', those from nuestra zona 'our area', whereas other music should not be appropriated. The perception of illegitimate influence from the outside is indicated with particular intensity in the following waynu-extract from Huallanca (Bolognesi)

Los ingenieros de Canadá Nos esperan con su trabajo Engañando a los peruanos Explotando nuestra riqueza The engineers from Canada
Are waiting for us with their work
Deceiving Peruvians
Exploiting our wealth

This foreshadows later quotes in this section, as well as Chapter Four where a similar theme is depicted in the re-enactment of the fall of the Incas. However, this strong opposition between the 'innocent' Peruvian and 'immoral' outsider belies an interiorized notion of ethnic inferiority, as conveyed by the following:

20. El huayno es, o sea, para no olvidar, o sea, la gente que se va a civilizar así a la costa, en otros departamentos más, o sea, vuelven a sus zonas, vienen a las fiestas costumbristas, o sea, bailar el huayno nuevamente. Porque es una cultura neta de...nuestros antepasados, y debemos seguirlo cultivando, aunque estemos en otros lugares, volver a nuestro pueblo y volver a renacer lo que hemos sido anteriormente.

'The waynu is so as not to forget, the people who go to become civilized on the coast, in other departments, return to their regions, come to folkloric festivals, to dance the waynu again. Because it's a culture which is peculiar to our...forefathers, and we must continue to cultivate it, though we may be in other places, return to our town and return to be reborn as we were before.' (1992; male; school-pupil; Qero, Bolognesi province)

This extract describes the *waynu's* function as encouraging people to return to their place of origin, in order to participate in the festivals where the *waynu* is performed. The phrase *se va a civilizar en la costa* 'go to become civilized on the coast' reflects the strong ambivalence of some Andean people regarding their own origins. This recalls Rousseau's 'noble savage', for the Andean is presented as more genuine, yet rather backward. The possibility of Andeans being civilized without migrating is not considered. This reflects Canessa's comments on Bolivia (which can equally be applied to Peru):

'the difference between being an Indian and a mestizo [a person of more 'Hispanic' culture] is the difference between being a member of a marginalized, relatively powerless, and frequently disdained group, and being part of the hegemonic metropolitan culture. One can move from one status to the other, principally by moving into the towns and the cities and by adopting the customs, language, and mores of the dominant culture' (2000:708).

The result is that 'Indians themselves can view Indian culture and practices as backward even as they offer meaning' (Canessa 2005:5). And, indeed, this speaker has moved from Qero, a small village, to the provincial capital of Chiquián; people frequently mentioned how, in Chiquián, there was an implicit sense of superiority over more rural areas, just as migrants from Chiquián to the coast told me of discrimination that they had experienced from city-dwellers. Indeed, the mention of the

'coast' suggests that this speaker may view Chiquián as a half-way stage to 'civilization'. In this quote, then, we see how the revaluation of a positive local or 'Andean' identity does not necessarily overcome racism, even if this ascribed identity is acknowledged as valuable. The relation between the waynu and local identity is grounded by reference to the past, a common theme in the interviews: the genre is presented as de nuestros antepasados 'from our forefathers'. The importance of maintaining autobiographical continuity is stressed in the assertion that people must volver a renacer lo que hemos sido anteriormente 'return to what we were before'. The word renacer 'be reborn' conveys both vitality and the sense of a profound split between origin and destination, that one becomes a different person when one is in one's community. This illustrates the importance of the social in personal self-understanding.

## Town and Provincial Level

The quotes in this section pertain to the role of *chimaychi* in Pomabamba. All describe the totemic role of the genre in symbolizing allegiance to one's town:

21. En Pomabamba el chimayche es más bonito porque nos identifica por su forma, pues, por ejemplo el chimayche nos representa a Pomabamba.

'In Pomabamba the *chimaychi* is more [aesthetically] appealing because it identifies us through its form, for example the *chimaychi* represents us as Pomabamba.' (1994; male; school-pupil; Pomabamba)

This quote shows how the aesthetic appeal of *chimaychi* incorporates not just its artistic qualities, but also its role for identity: *nos representa a Pomabamba* it 'represents us as Pomabamba'. This is illustrated in the following *waynu*-extract:

A mis paisanos yo le digo Que cuiden de nuestra querencia De esta tierra prodigiosa Pomabamba orgullo nuestro To my countrymen I ask them To take care of our dear place This prodigal land Pomabamba, our pride

# (Eberth Álvarez)

What is interesting about the verb *representa* 'represents', however, is that it is at once a strong affirmation of one's uniqueness as a group, but also a process of relation with those who are outside the group. Thus, in apparent paradox, the erection of group-boundaries is realized only through engagement with those on the other side, through acknowledgement of the Other as a conscious,

perceiving entity which can interpret one's distinctiveness. Moreover, the very motivation behind the engagement is the 'otherness' – and intrinsic separateness – of the two parties. Thus, the sense of an autonomous, essential, abiding identity does not only stand in opposition to the fact of relation, but is, ironically, actively constituted by this relation. Even if Pomabambino identity is only being represented to Pomabambinos themselves, there is still the fact that this identity can only be perceived if it is not synonymous with the Self. This apparent paradox anticipates Derrida's (1967) concept of the *trace*, whereby meaning originates through the interaction of opposites. The next quote grounds the sense of 'Pomabamban' identity in historical terms:

22. Las cualidades de un buen chimayche sería que practicamos como pomabambinos, ¿no?, porque nosotros nos identificamos con nuestro chimayche. Sería que practiquemos todos lo que nos han dejado los anteriores.

'The qualities of a good *chimaychi* would be that we practise it like Pomabambinos, because we identify ourselves with our *chimaychi*. We should practise everything that our forefathers left us'. (1992; female; student; Chacuabamba, Pomabamba province)

In this extract, a 'good chimaychi' is that which is performed como pomabambinos 'like Pomabambinos'. Such is the inextricable association between the chimaychi and Pomabamba that it is impossible to perform it well except by association with its alleged place of origin. It is interesting that this speaker, whilst coming from a small village to study in Pomabamba, identifies herself with 'Pomabamba'. This suggests that being 'Pomabambino' is not just a question of being from the town, but rather from the wider province. This is a way of grounding her sense of Self in membership of a large community, of which the chimaychi is a unifying totem. By identifying with 'Pomabamba', rather than just her own village, she is arguably bolstering her sense of authenticity in contrast to the perceived hegemonic culture of 'outside'. Here again, the association with 'place' is intertwined with a temporal dimension: que practiquemos todos lo que nos han dejado los anteriores 'we should practise everything that our forefathers left us'. The stress here is on grounding one's personal and social identity on a sense of continuity with the past. Change is unacceptable for it threatens the perceived stability of the group; likewise, the universality of todos 'everyone' conveys a desire to build solidarity in order to maintain the coherence of the group. The uncompromising nature of this quote suggests a defensive reaction to asymmetrical influence from outside Pomabamba. These perceived influences are described in the following extract:

23. Llapan kay marka mahiikunatam llapan gustan chimayche...Nuestra identidad de todo lo que es Conchucos, Pomabamba como capital folclórica de Ancash es el chimayche...El chimayche, cuando escuchan en otras zonas, ya nos identifican rápidamente de dónde somos, porque Pomabamba es mundialmente conocido por su chimayche...Ahora ha entrado el rap, el rock

and roll y tantas situaciones..., son músicas alienantes que van contra la cultura...misma de un pueblo, porque esas son músicas alienantes que vienen importadas de una situación muy diferente a la nuestra....Se crea en Puerto Rico un rap, fenómeno, llega al Perú, ya todos esos arrabaleros de los barrios marginales empiezan con el rap, desprecian lo que es la música nuestra que es el huayno....Entonces...me voy a Venezuela, me voy a España, pero canto el himno nacional, siento esa algarabía,...es igualito, me voy a la costa, me voy a cualquier otro sitio, escucho mi chimayche, siento ese mismo amor que a mi himno nacional.

'All of my fellow townspeople like *chimaychi*...Our identity of Conchucos, Pomabamba as folkloric capital of Ancash, is the *chimaychi*...The *chimaychi*, when they listen to it in other regions, they quickly identify where we're from, because Pomabamba is world famous for its *chimaychi* and for its style of music....Now rap, rock and roll and so many genres have entered now, they are alienating kinds of music which practically go counter to the...very culture of a town, because those are alienating kinds of music which are imported from a very different situation to our own....A rap is invented in Puerto Rico, phenomenal, it arrives in Peru, already all of the hoi polloi from the suburbs start with the rap, look down on our music which is the *waynu*....So,...I go to Venezuela, I go to Spain, but I sing the national anthem, I feel that jubilation,...it's the same, I go to the coast, I go to any other place, I listen to my *chimaychi*, I feel this same love that I feel for my national anthem.' (1954; male; electrician/shop-owner; Pomabamba)

This quote begins in AQ, then moves to Spanish, indicative of a common trend whereby people were uncomfortable discussing 'serious' issues in AQ, largely because the dominant language of many Pomabambinos is now Spanish. Here, AQ is probably deployed as a marker of solidarity: Llapan kay marka mahiikunatam Ilapan gustan chimayche 'All of my fellow townspeople like chimaychi'. The implication is that one is not Pomabambino if one does not like chimaychi. This is reinforced in the second line, where the chimaychi is described as nuestra identidad 'our identity'. This 'identity' is rooted in the capacity of people from the outside to ascertain one's origin: nos identifican rápidamente de qué zona somos 'they quickly identify which area we're from'. As in many of the quotes in this section, the delimitation of one's 'identity' rests on engagement with those beyond the horizon. Thus, Pomabamba becomes more consolidated insofar as it is mundialmente conocido 'world famous'. The role of the outside in legitimizing Pomabambino identity continues when the speaker discusses the former in negative terms: music from the outside is described as músicas alienantes que vienen importadas de una situación muy diferente a la nuestra, de una realidad muy diferente 'alienating kinds of music which are imported from a very different situation to our own, from a very different reality'. This statement, of course, could be applied to the chimaychi in other parts of the world. Thus, whilst it is legitimate for the chimaychi to colonize other regions (insofar as it is mundialmente conocido 'world famous'), the inverse is not acceptable. This asymmetrical stance is arguably a reaction against the perceived economic and cultural dominance of criollo society, from coastal and urban parts of Peru. This is confirmed by the assertion that people in the poor suburbs of Lima desprecian lo que es la música nuestra 'look down on our music'.

This perceived rejection of Andean music has been noted by other scholars: 'the relegated and discriminated status of this form of expression [the *waynu*] has had, as its consequence, an enthusiasm for imitation of other cultural models which modernity brings us, so that we are not what we are, but what we seem to be' (Alvarado 2009:35, mt). The interview-excerpts recall Hamel's statement that 'conflicts which occur between ethnic groups and the dominant society typically crystallize around particular traits which emphasise the otherness of the inferior group' (1995:79, mt). Indeed, the above interviewee argues that *waynu* is rejected because of the unfavourable social status of the group that the genre is seen to symbolize. Bolin notes a similar comment from a grandparent in a southern Andean village: "I like to sing these songs", he says, smiling apologetically, "but my grandchildren get bored. They are good children but when I sing old songs, they say 'Awkicha (grandpa), these songs are no longer of any use, forget them'" (1998:91). Indeed, whilst most people whom I interviewed expressed very positive attitudes towards *chimaychi* and *waynu* for reasons of 'identity' (including a large number of school-pupils chosen at random), younger people tended to listen more to coastal and foreign music, only dancing *chimaychi* or *waynu* for folkloric competitions or on other special occasions.

While musical tastes naturally change from generation to generation, this disjuncture between practice and expressed ideology strongly recalls the testimonies discussed in this chapter in which people talk of discrimination against 'Andean culture', and may indicate a tacit, deeply embedded and unconscious belief in the inferiority of Andean traditions. Indeed, several people told me of discrimination that they had witnessed (either towards themselves or other people), and Andean culture and language remain significantly underrepresented in official or educational spheres. A long history of discrimination, coupled with the economic and cultural pre-eminence of coastal/Hispanic/Western society, unsurprisingly leads to the perception that the 'outside' constitutes a threat, as expressed in the above quote. In the conclusion to this chapter, I shall argue, however, that the strategy of resistance (in-group versus out-group) only perpetuates the same discourse of discrimination, by defining the boundary between two groups which thereby become seemingly irreconcilable, though mutually constitutive, categories. Quote 23 ends with the discussion of identity at different structural levels, depending on the nature of the Other: whether the opposition is 'Pomabamba/coast' or 'Peru/abroad'. The same feature of widening circles of inclusion is evident in the following waynu-extract from Canis:

Soy ancashino por mi region Bolognesino por mi provincial Canisino por mi distrito Siempre lo digo a dónde voy por dónde voy I am Ancashino for my region Bolognesino for my province Canisino for my district I always say so wherever I go

Andrés Jorge Moreno Vergara

Thus, the boundary between Self and Other does not depend on the 'content' of each category, but simply on the discourse of opposition. This is reflected in the organization of this second part of the Chapter, where the same discourse is evident at local, Andean and national levels, and dialogues with Derrida's notion of the *trace* whereby the same discursive orientation ramifies into many different levels. The sense of one's 'identity' depending on a (rhetorically negated) relation to 'alterity' is evident in the following which speaks of geographical dissonance with one's perceived 'origin':

24. Un pomabambino que va a Lima, otros lugares, escuchas tu música, es como si corriera por tus venas la música, ¿no?, o sea, sientes una alegría, a veces tristeza, un amor a tu tierra, entonces forma parte no solo el chimayche, sino todo ese conjunto con todas sus variedades, forma parte de, de repente de una forma de identidad, no, de estos pueblos, no, que van siendo aplastados, no, por la civilización, por el empuje tecnológico, otros idiomas.

'A Pomabambino who goes to Lima, other places, you listen to your music, it's as if the music were running through your veins, you feel happiness, sometimes sadness, love for your land, so not only the *chimaychi*, but the whole lot with all its varieties, forms part of, possibly a form of identity, of these towns, which are being crushed by civilization, by technological advance, other languages.' (1953; male; pharmacist; Pomabamba)

This quote illustrates how a sense of local identity is accentuated through dislocation from one's town. The phrase *corriera por tus venas* 'running through your veins', conveys the sense of unity with one's community at the most intrinsic, fundamental, level, whereby Self and community are extensions of each other (cf. the discussion of *sangre* 'blood' in quote 33). The theme of physical estrangement is very commonplace in *waynu* lyrics, reflecting the fact that many Andeans have migrated to the coast in search of better economic opportunities: in 1940, 35% of Peruvians lived in cities, 65% in rural areas; by 1982 these figures were reversed (von Gleich 1992:59). The following *waynu*-extract from Chiquián (Bolognesi) is one example:

Cuando me vaya lejos de esta tierra Recordaré su hermoso paisaje Su Hawacocha, Rondoy, Shirishanka Yerupajá, Tuku y Conococha When I travel far from this land I will remember its beautiful landscapes Its Hawacocha, Rondoy, Shirishanka Yerupajá, Tuku and Conococha

(Teodoro Onofre)

In the interview-extract, the bond with one's community is described in emotional terms, as *alegría* 'happiness', *tristeza* 'sadness' and *amor a tu tierra* 'love for your land'. It is, then, in contact with the Other that this aspect of the Self becomes most salient, revealing the apparently paradoxical nature of contrast, whereby entities derive their existence from their mutual differences. The Other is, as in quote 23, perceived as illegitimately threatening one's own community: *estos pueblos...van siendo aplastados...por la civilización, por el empuje tecnológico, otros idiomas* 'these towns...are being crushed by civilization, by technological advance, other languages'. The term *civilización* 'civilization' nonetheless reveals a clear ambivalence regarding this influence. The suggestion is that the town of origin is not civilized, and that, in order to become so, one must migrate to other parts of the country (recalling quote 20). Pomabamba is associated with emotional warmth and rusticity, whereas the destination is associated with cold rationality and refinement. Masson witnessed similar ambivalence in Saraguro, Ecuador, in the 1980s:

'This socially ambiguous position is the cause of an ambiguous self-valuation: on the one hand, they maintain their ethnic identity with a certain pride, demonstrating it, above all, in their dialogue on dress and plaits [typical of Andean women], traditional celebrations and religious roles; on the other hand, they have interiorized their marginal position according to social/ethnic prestige, resulting in a certain feeling of inferiority regarding issues removed from their peasant environment' (1983:81, mt).

The sense of rural Andeans clinging to their origins as an idealized referent, as suggested by speaker 24, is arguably intertwined with their perceived marginal social status in cities. In this context, one's perceived 'origins' (which are only defined through contrast with the Other) can act as a secure anchor in a vulnerable situation. The next speaker describes a desire to engage more directly with the Other, but this only serves to strengthen the essentialist basis of his 'identity' within Pomabamba:

25. Bueno, como profesor quise identificarme, buscar mi identidad más que todo, dentro de mi provincia, una identidad cultural que debería de difundir. Eso fue una de las inspiraciones, identificarme con mi pueblo mismo, y tratar de llevar adelante este tipo de música para intercambiar con otros tipos de músicas....Entonces los chimaychis antiguos, las letras sí han quedado, son ya patrimonio, son como himnos de Pomabamba, digamos.

'Well, as a teacher I wanted to identify myself, search for my identity above all, in my province, a cultural identity which should be propagated. That was one of the inspirations, to identify myself with my home town, and try to bring to the forefront this kind of music to exchange it with other kinds of music....Well, the old *chimaychis*, the lyrics have remained, they are already heritage, they are like anthems of Pomabamba, let's say.' (male; 1968; *chimaychi*-artist; Pomabamba)

Here, a singer/composer of chimaychi expresses his reasons for promoting the genre. The verb buscar 'to look, search' portrays identidad 'identity' as something pre-existent that can be found, rather than something that is actively created. This bona fide 'identity' is firmly located dentro de mi provincia 'within my province', and is common to all people in Pomabamba. Despite defining the chimaychi as redolent of a highly localized sense of identity, the speaker then argues that it is una identidad cultural que debería de difundir 'a cultural identity which should be propagated'. This juxtaposition is conveyed in different terms in the following sentence: the speaker wished to identificarme con mi pueblo mismo 'identify myself with my own town', but also thereby llevar adelante este tipo de música para intercambiar con otros tipos de músicas 'bring to the forefront this kind of music to exchange it with other kinds of music'. Whilst exchange with the outside is deemed positive, the boundary remains, for part of the value of the exchange is the acknowledgement that the chimaychi remains Pomabambino – otherwise it would not be a question of propagating one's own 'identity'. Again, it is through engagement with the Other that the boundaries between Self and Other are consolidated. And this is realized partly by recourse to history: it is specifically the old songs which are patrimonio 'heritage' of Pomabamba. I would suggest that this is because contemporary reality – which is constantly in flux – sits uneasily with an essentialist ideology which stresses permanence as opposed to change (cf. the discussion of a dynamic kay patsa 'present world' sitting between two stable patsas, p.205). Contemporary chimaychis, which relate to modern society and are often sung in Spanish, reflect transformation, whereas older songs, in depicting a bygone era, are sealed off from such concerns, and can be related to as an icon – a totem – of the group's alleged origins. Contemporary songs often reflect undesired influence from the 'outside' (the necessity of migration to cities, widespread alcoholism, poverty, etc.), with the result that they are less suited to representing 'Pomabambino identity'. The congruence between lack of contemporary relevance, and symbolic function as a totem of identity, is also suggested by the annual showcasing of thirty-six local dances in the stadium of Pomabamba, whereas these dances are facing extinction in the rural villages where they were originally performed. The next speaker conveys the shifting boundaries between the 'inside' (Self) and 'outside' (Other), insofar as Pomabamba is acknowledged as the stake-holder of chimaychi even although this, so he claims, resulted from the town's appropriation of the genre from an even smaller community. Again, we see how the discourse of 'insider' and 'outsider', 'Andean' and 'Hispanic', 'authentic' and 'foreign' is played out at many structural levels, recalling the predication of categories on the dialogic trajectory of the *trace*:

26. El chimaychi no nace acá en Pomabamba, nace en un lugar llamado Vilcabamba. Entonces como cultivaban acá en Vilcabamba es un pueblo de paisanos, acá en Pomabamba había gente más culturizada, entonces...poco a poco iban jalando esos, rescatando esos costumbres. Acá había gente...que había estudiado, ya sabía leer, es por eso que Pomabamba patentiza chimaychi como de Pomabamba pero en cuanto a la historia no es así. Pero ahora el chimaychi es de Pomabamba, le ha patentizado...es una folclórica a nivel Ancash.

'The *chimaychi* was not born here in Pomabamba, it was born in a place called Vilcabamba. So, given that they cultivated it there in Vilcabamba, it's a village of peasants, here in Pomabamba there were more cultured people, well...little by little they extracted those, rescued those customs. Here there were people...who had studied, could already read, it's because of this that Pomabamba has patented *chimaychi* as 'from Pomabamba', but historically this isn't the case. But now the *chimaychi* is from Pomabamba, it's been patented...it's a folkloric tradition at the level of Ancash.' (1983; male; *chimaychi*-artist; hamlet of Cuspán, village of Yurma, lives in Pomabamba)

A clear opposition is set up between Vilcabamba, which, according to this speaker, is the origin of *chimaychi*, and Pomabamba, which appropriated the genre; this may have something to do with the fact that the speaker was born in the province of Marizal Luzuriaga, to which most of Vilcabamba pertains. The origin of *chimaychi* is a hotly debated topic in Pomabamba, with some claiming that it originated in Pomabamba and others claiming its origin to be Vilcabamba or elsewhere. Egúsquiza agrees with the speaker here: 'The community of Vilcabamba…is a sui generis society, its inhabitants are artisans, all of them weavers and also musicians, they are eminent "*chimaycheros*" and constitute a focus of irradiation which reaches Pomabamba, where there is concern for conserving and revaluing the "*chimaychi*" (2000:99, mt).

The speaker describes Vilcabamba as *un pueblo de paisanos* 'a peasant village', whereas Pomabamba is the locus of *gente más culturizada* 'more cultured people'. A dualism is therefore set up between creativity and civilization, recalling the speakers in quotes 20 and 24 where the notion of the 'noble savage' surfaced. Indeed, both this speaker and the speaker in quote 24 come from isolated rural communities and now reside in more urban environments. This may account for their greater ambivalence, whereby a hegemonic discourse of urban superiority has been partly internalized, despite the desire to reaffirm the value of local culture (just as people from the semi-urban departmental capitals told, in turn, of discrimination against themselves as 'Andeans' in coastal cities). This speaker denies any agency on the part of those from Vilcabamba: thanks to being more *culturalizada* 'cultured', Pomabambinos were able to *rescata*- 'rescue' the tradition. Nonetheless, this is not altogether unjust, considering that many traditions are dying out in their original villages given a loss of relevance to contemporary society, but have gained new relevance as a marker of 'identity' through their annual showcasing in the semi-urban context. As Astvaldsson

states of Titiri, Bolivia, 'It is clear that the old practices no longer "make sense" to many people, especially those of the younger generation. The logic underpinning them no longer provides "an adequate description of things" (Bourdieu 1977:78), since the "reality" on which it was based has been called into question by the modern world and by the new knowledge it has brought with it' (2002:123).

According to the speaker in quote 26, Pomabamba's involvement has involved a degree of duplicity (again perhaps suggesting that he has been the subject of discrimination owing to his rural origins and Quechua accent): Pomabamba patentiza chimaychi como de Pomabamba pero en cuanto a la historia no es así 'Pomabamba has patented chimaychi as 'from Pomabamba', but historically this isn't the case'. Thus, civilization is equated with pragmatic superiority yet moral inferiority, since it is through literacy (ya sabía leer 'they could already read') that one is able to hoodwink – whether intentionally or not - less educated people (the alleged moral inferiority of Hispanic society is a major theme in Chapter Four). The allusion to writing is a potent reminder of the Spanish colonization of an originally non-literate community, and therefore has racial overtones, having been a major factor in the exploitation of indigenous people by the Hispanic elite. For the speaker, however, the fact that Pomabamba has patentizado 'patented' the genre means that, unequivocally, ahora el chimaychi es de Pomabamba 'now the chimaychi is of Pomabamba'. Moreover, the greater influence of Pomabamba means that the chimaychi is now promoted all over the department of Ancash and beyond. The complaint of exploitation by privileged people was also reflected in comments regarding the false appropriation of songs. This was already salient in the 1980s: 'Composers often complain of others "stealing" their songs and guard their compositions jealously' (Otter 1985:122). Montoya et al. also note how people have started 'claiming' their compositions in order to safeguard them against 'theft' (1999:18). Escóbar likewise indicates how 'Many songs are being appropriated by the singers, now public and individualized, who cut records or perform on improvised stages in cities for the large public of migrants' (1984:7).

### Andean Level

In this section, we see how the projection of a dialogue (*trace*) of irreconcilable dualism engenders division at another level, namely that of the 'Andean' against 'non-Andean'. The *waynu*, according to the interviewees, serves the purpose of reinforcing the former category. Lienhard has similarly noted that the *waynu* has become 'representative of "Andean" (*serrana*) culture' (1993:89, mt).

27. El propósito en primer lugar es seguir manteniendo nuestras raíces, nuestra cultura, nuestra esencia andina.

'The purpose is first and foremost to continue maintaining our roots, our culture, our Andean essence.' (1953; male; mayor of Chiquián; Chiquián)

This extract stresses the importance of continuity through time: the *waynu* allows people to *seguir manteniendo* 'continue maintaining' their *esencia andina* 'Andean essence'. The word *raíces* 'roots' stresses stability, continuity, strongly conveying the notion that this sense of identity provides an anchor in a world of flux. Hence, the *waynu* is perceived as a direct representation of a solid – because essential (*esencia* 'essence') – *cultura* 'culture'. The following comment by Hermans and Dimaggio is apposite: 'Whereas globalization challenges people to extend their selves and identities beyond the reach of traditional structures, this extension implies the pervasive experience of uncertainty. Intensification of this experience motivates individuals and groups to maintain, defend, and even expand their local values and practices by establishing a niche for the formation of a stable identity' (2007:35). The reification of the *waynu* as a repository of indigenous culture is one way of establishing this 'niche'. This corresponds with Haarman's statement that the 'ethnic identity of any ethnic group comprises elements which are the reflection of a sum of experiences in the group's ecological settings' (1986:1), and that, therefore, 'the identity of an ethnic group cannot be adequately described when environmental factors which have shaped ethnicity to a decisive degree have been left out' (1986:1).

I suggest that the sense of security derives not only from the solidity of an imagined 'culture' and 'essence', but also from the sense that these are shared attributes, which, being intrinsic to each Andean individual, are felt to bind people together in a quasi-physical manner. The fact that Chiquián is rapidly transforming (people are shifting from AQ to Spanish, there is significant migration to cities, non-Andean cultural influences are becoming more and more popular) means that this sense of a shared culture is far from self-evident. This is clear from the very fact that the waynu has, as its propósito 'purpose', the maintenance of the Andean 'culture' or 'essence'; the very preoccupation with 'maintenance' shows that it is not straightforward. Thus, the possessive nuestra 'our' is not merely expressive, but also enactive, in reinforcing a sense of unity and stability which is far from obvious. This is why the function of the waynu is more totemic than just symbolic; it acts as a centripetal focus where people can imagine their unity when this is no longer empirically evident. As Romero states (2001:21), citing Hobsbawn, 'Traditions are invented and claimed because "they normally attempt to establish continuity with a suitable historic past" (Hobsbawn 1983:1). It does not matter whether this continuity is imaginary or based on hard facts; what matters is the structure

it brings to social groups otherwise immersed in constant change and innovation (Hobsbawn 1983:2)'. The interview-extracts suggest that the tradition is not, in the case of our fieldsites, entirely invented. Rather, the invention lies in the process of simplification or 'ideological erasure' (Irvine & Gal 2000), whereby a general practice is redefined as an intrinsic essence, common to everyone in the putative group. And the fundamental motivation is arguably the need for security. Hermans and Dimaggio are worth quoting at length on this point:

'Apparently, people are in need of an environment stable enough to feel at home and to experience a feeling of security and safety in a quickly changing world. Moreover, people tend to respond with anxiety, anger, hate, loathing, or disgust when they feel threatened in their need for protection and local security. Such observations require that a psychology of emotions be included as part of the processes of globalization and localization. As Kinnvall (2004) has noted, reducing emotions to present social relations in society would neglect the deeply rooted need for safety and stability in one's life circumstances' (2007:43).

The following quote likewise defines the purpose of *waynu* as that of maintaining cultural continuity, and thereby reinforcing a localized sense of identity that is rooted in a historical tradition:

28. Mana costumbrintsikta qonqanantsikpaqari, de los antepasadoskunam tsay waynu. Tsay tradición siguin, siguinmi, mana qonqakaanantsikpaq, serranukuna más identificadu waynu, más waynuntsikwan.

'It's so we don't forget our custom, it's from the ancestors, that waynu. That tradition continues, continues, so that we don't forget, mountain people are more identified with waynu, more with our waynu.' (female; 1959; market-vendor; Chiquián)

This quote, in AQ, reflects the fact that, in Chiquián, older females are generally more proficient in this language than other social groups (except migrants from the surrounding villages, where men and children are often fluent AQ-speakers, too). Here, the purpose of the waynu is Mana costumbrintsikta qonqanantsikpaqari 'So we don't forget our custom'. The very fact that this issue is raised echoes the fact that many of the old customs are no longer practised. As in the previous quote, the essentialized vision of the waynu is rooted in history, with a mention of the antespasadoskunam 'forefathers'. This reflects a preoccupation with autobiographical continuity, finding a sense of stability in a world of change.

The term *serranukuna* refers to people from the Andes (singular *serrano*). This term can have pejorative connotations when used by people from the coast, conveying a sense of backwardness and lack of sophistication. Here, however, it has been appropriated as an in-group term, reflecting a widespread strategy of countering discrimination by appropriating discriminatory words and endowing them with a positive connotation (cf. the following for Afro-Americans: Alim 2009:280;

Bucholtz 1999:452; Carter 2003:141, ft 3; also see a more extensive discussion of this phenomenon for quote 32). Arguably, the discriminatory overtones of this word serve to strengthen even more the sense of solidarity. Inherent in this term, therefore, is an opposition with coastal populations who mostly live in large cities and are monolingual in Spanish. Thus, it is only insofar as the coastal Other exists that people can perceive themselves as having a serrano identity (cf. the Masha songs of Chapter Three). By recourse to a defined geographical space and an ancient history, the speaker is able to root herself as part of a community comprised of inalienable bonds between each individual, and between the individual and the physical environment. This sense of stability inherent in tradition is reinforced by the final phrase waynuntsikwan 'with our waynu'. Here, the inclusive first person plural form, -ntsik, is used. Since I was the addressee, and do not have an Andean origin, one would normally have expected the exclusive –: kuna to have been deployed instead. As in quote 10, it is possible that the inclusive form is used because I spoke AQ, or because of my interest in Andean culture. It is also possible that the distinction between the two possessive forms is becoming obsolete in Chiquián, since I only rarely heard the exclusive form being used (an exception is quote 29). Nevertheless, the fact that the speaker chooses to appropriate the waynu by deploying a possessive suffix suggests that the waynu has an existential function of enacting a sense of intrinsic commonality in people's minds. The next speaker, by contrast, deploys the exclusive nogakuna:

29. Tsay waynukuna imankuna gustayaa, unay unay Inkakunapis tsay waynuta naa yarqun, ari. Epoca cultivayarqun paykunaari, tsaypitam noqakunapis tsayta qatirayaa, unay unaykuna, inkakunapa, tsay fundacionkuna, kay kinraypis pasashqa tsay inkakunapis.

'All of us like those waynus, the ancient Incas also practised those waynus. In their time, they cultivated them, subsequently we also continue this, those ancient people, the Incas, that foundation, those Incas passed right by here.' (female; 1954; market-vendor; Chiquián)

In this extract, by another female market-vendor in Chiquián and also in AQ, the *waynu* is presented as deriving directly from the Incas, who are the *fundacionkuna* 'foundations'. The perception that the Incas were the original, and the only significant, Andean civilization was very widespread in both Chiquián and Pomabamba (likewise, Southern Quechua was almost universally seen as older and superior to AQ because of its association with the Incas). As Galindo states, 'Mention of the Incas is commonplace in any discourse. Nobody is surprised if their ancient technology or supposed ethical principles are presented as responses to current problems' (1986:21, mt). Similarly, Tomoeda and Millones state that Peruvian society 'has been strongly determined by a sense of belonging to an Incan past, and which functions and continues to act as an ideal model of government and an axiological scale in present society' (1992:14, mt). This echoes Otter's statement that *waynus* 'are

an expression of peasant ideology, a way of reacting to reality, by looking back at the ideal past, reflecting on the difficult present, or trying to forget about the future' (1985:155). Golte, Oelting and Degregori (1979) similarly argued that *waynus* convey past utopia, present suffering, and future evasion of this suffering.

The notion of the Incas existing in the ancient past is conveyed by the phrase *unay unay*, with *unay* meaning 'ancient, beforehand', intensified with the reduplication. This serves to endow the *waynu* with an almost mythical origin, akin to the origin myths of nationalist rhetoric and religion. While *waynus* rarely mention the Incas (in contrast to other genres), the following song-extract from Chogo (Pomabamba) is an exception that illustrates the ideological role of the Incas in the presentation of nationhood:

Para estar en mira de grandes países Así es mi Perú, resto de los Incas Grandeza eterna de los Ancashinos Verso de amor que te canto yo To be seen among the great countries So is my Peru, left by the Incas Eternal grandeur of Ancashinos A verse of love which I sing to you

(Donato Marcos Capillo Muñoz)

In contrast to the previous interview-excerpt, interviewee 29 used the exclusive first-person plural (noqakuna), perhaps because the speaker is defining the present community as the continuation of the Incas, whereas the previous speaker only discussed culture. Whilst interest in local culture might make me an honorary serrano, it is clear that I do not trace my ancestry back to the Incas. The sense of direct continuity between the Incas and contemporary Andeans is evident in: tsaypitam noqakunapis tsayta qatirayaa 'subsequently we also continue this', with the exclusive shown by noqakuna 'we (exclusive)' and the corresponding verbal agreement shown by vowel-lengthening in qatirayaa 'we continue'. Harrison states that such usages of the first-person plural exclusive form 'reflect the unity of an entire community to protect its land' (1994:114, mt).

The cohesion of this community is conveyed by *imankuna gustayaa* 'we (exclusive) all like', whereby individual differences are ignored in favour of a universal appreciation of the *waynu* (cf. quote 23). What Zoila Mendoza states of indigenous dances in Cuzco could equally be said of the *waynu* here: 'The creation [of folkloric culture] has to come from a hypothetically unified community (folk) that has to be the product of an equally hypothetical common knowledge (lore)' (2000:55). Ironically, the hypotheticality is rendered evident by the very process that creates the desire for cohesion; in other words, it is precisely because Chiquián society is changing that people wish to reinforce its

presumed traditional nature. The essentialized view is not entirely inaccurate, however. The waynu has, after all, been part of Andean society, and it is undeniable that there are different cultural trends in different parts of the world. The inaccuracy – because ideological motivation – resides in the presumed homogeneity of the group. This recalls Irvine & Gal's twin processes of 'erasure' and 'iconization' (conceptualized for sociolinguistics but equally applicable to this situation): 'Erasure is the process in which ideology, in simplifying the sociolinguistic field, renders some persons or activities (or sociolinguistic phenomena) invisible. Facts that are inconsistent with the ideological scheme either go unnoticed or get explained away' (2000:38). Here, it is the individuality which is erased, since, in the Andes, imankuna 'everyone' is said to appreciate waynu. The acknowledgement of heterogeneity would remove the feeling of security that results from deploying the waynu as a totem of group-cohesion.

This deployment is an example of 'iconization': 'Iconization involves a transformation of the sign relationship between linguistic features (or varieties) and the social images with which they are linked. Linguistic features that index social groups or activities appear to be iconic representations of them, as if a linguistic feature somehow depicted or displayed a social group's inherent nature or essence' (Irvine & Gal 2000:37). We can replace 'linguistic features' with 'waynu', whereby the waynu is felt to convey the essence of Andean society. I prefer to use the term 'totem' rather than 'sign' or 'representation', since the former more accurately conveys the intense intertwining of the affective and cognitive in identitarian ideology, as well as the enactive, forward-looking, orientation of these ideologies whose purpose is not to describe a pre-existing state of affairs but to interpret the past in order to change the present (even if the change is limited to the enhancement of psychological security). Bucholtz and Hall make a similar point to Irvine and Gal: 'Social grouping is a process not merely of discovering or acknowledging a similarity that precedes and establishes identity but, more fundamentally, of inventing similarity by downplaying difference' (2004:371); the converse, of inventing difference by downplaying similarity, is part of the same dynamic. Hermans and Dimaggio describe the trade-off that such a process entails: 'The dominance of one voice or a few voices over the others leads to a reduction of the experience of uncertainty, but at the same time, it has the questionable effect that other voices, as possible contributors or innovators of the self, are silenced or split off' (2007:39).

### **National Level**

In this section, the *trace* ramifies to another context, conveying irreconcilable dualism at the level of the nation, whereby the *waynu* is appropriated as 'Peruvian' in contrast to 'foreign' genres:

30. Más que todo, la función del huayno, ¿no?, saca adelante nuestro Perú, nos identifica como peruanos.

'Above all, the function of the *waynu*, it's to bring Peru to the forefront, it identifies us as Peruvians.' (1994, female, school-pupil, Chiquián)

For this speaker, the principal function of the genre is to *saca adelante nuestro Perú* 'bring our Peru to the forefront'. In so doing, *nos identifica como peruanos* 'it identifies us as Peruvians'. As in many of the previous quotes, this depends on the existence of the Other: it is only possible to bring Peru to the forefront if there are others who are not Peruvian but who can nonetheless appreciate the rise of Peruvian culture. Likewise, it is only possible to be identified as Peruvian, or to identify oneself as Peruvian, if there are those who are not Peruvian against whom one can be contrasted. The dependence on the Other is therefore existential as well as logical; engagement with the Other is part of what constitutes being distinct. In apparent paradox, the maintenance of the barrier depends on the successful communication between 'inside' and 'outside', the Other recognizing that this genre belongs to a specific group of which they are not a part. In this Chapter's summary, I shall draw on Merleau-Ponty (1964) and Derrida (1967) to illustrate how this apparent paradox can shed light on 'identity'. The next speaker explicitly mentions the negative impact of 'foreign' cultures:

31. Bueno, yo personalmente creo que el huayno es para identificarnos, ¿no?, como peruanos, porque últimamente, ya nuestra población está alienada, ¿no?, por tantas culturas, música, ¿no?, de otros países, que nosotros supuestamente creemos mejores quizás que nosotros, la mayoría pensaba así, ¿no?, que mejor es un gringo que una india, ¿no?. Pero no es así, nosotros tenemos que valorar, esas son nuestras raíces, nuestras costumbres, y lo debemos de conservar, ¿no?, y hacer que todo el mundo lo conozca, ¿no?, difundir, ¿no?

'Well, I personally think that the *waynu* is to identify us as Peruvians, because ultimately our population is already alienated due to so many cultures, music, from other countries, which we supposedly think are better than us, the majority thought so, that a *gringo* is better than an *india*. But it's not the case, we must value, these are our roots, our customs, and we must conserve them, and make the whole world aware of it, disseminate it.' (1974; female; teacher; Chiquián)

The speaker begins by defining the function of *waynu* as to *identificarnos...como peruanos* 'identify ourselves...as Peruvians'. As in many of the quotes in this section, this depends on engagement with

the outside, but this time the engagement is seen as negative: ya nuestra población está alienada 'our population is already alienated' by music from otros países 'other countries'. This reflects the common perception that 'foreign' culture is eroding 'native' practises, whether 'native' is defined in local, Andean or national terms. This perception has a large element of truth, given the wide acceptance of foreign music by the younger generation, and the widespread shift from AQ to Spanish. Nonetheless, the fact that almost all young people I interviewed had very positive attitudes towards waynus suggests that the alienation is not as extreme as is commonly perceived to be, though there may well be a disjunction between expressed ideology (waynus as positive for identitarian reasons) and actual practice (preference for foreign music in daily life); a detailed ethnographic study would be required in order to ascertain the extent to which perceptions reflect the social reality.

Indeed, Barth notes how, in practice, 'the issue as to which new cultural forms are compatible with the native ethnic identity...is generally settled in favour of syncretism', but 'a great amount of attention may be paid to the revival of select traditional culture traits, and to the establishment of historical traditions to justify and glorify the idioms and the identity' (1969:35). In any case, the very fact of engaging with 'outside' - which is automatic whether one wishes to or not, since one can reject but not ignore foreign influences – serves to stress this speaker's psychological distinctiveness all the more. Laidlaw describes a similar process for the Jaina community in India, arguing that 'separateness is maintained in part through acts of inclusion' (1995/2003:95), whereby participation in Hindu rituals reinforces Jains' subjective sense of distinctiveness. The sense of being a 'different group' may arise, then, simply through contact with the Other; what is ideologically motivated is the desire to either reinforce or dismantle the boundary. Regardless of which choice is made (and people rarely make a unidirectional 'decision' since our psychology is infinitely more complex than our stated opinions), the inescapable fact is that the Self is never fully autonomous, but involves the Other as part of the very fabric of its constitution. As Hames-García notes, 'the subjective experience of any social group membership depends fundamentally on relations to memberships in other social groups' (2000:103-104).

The extract also illustrates the common perception of discrimination of Andeans or Peruvians by others and even by themselves: nosotros supuestamente creemos mejores quizás que nosotros 'we supposedly think they are better than us'. This is presented in racist and sexist terms, reflecting the perception of women's subordination in addition to racial discrimination: mejor es un gringo que una india 'a gringo man is better than an Indian woman' (the term gringo originally refers to white North

Americans, though nowadays it can refer to anyone with white skin). These overtones of racism allude to a long history of racial discrimination of Andeans within Peru, and a more recent history of discrimination of Latinos in North America. Arguedas describes his experience of discrimination in the 1950s:

'When I arrived at the coastal cities, I found that the people still scorned the mountain folk. In these cities *huaynos* could not be sung, everyone looked on a singer of *huaynos* as an inferior being, as a servant, and laughed at him. Therefore, all the students from the mountain districts who went to study there tried to learn as quickly as possible the coastal ways in speaking, walking, and dressing, and when they heard a *huayno*, they, too, laughed. "That is sung only by Indians", they would say. And when they returned to their towns they tried to flaunt the "elegance" which they had learned on the coast; they did not want to listen to the *huaynos* of their towns; they sang tangos, one-steps, jazz. They were convinced that whatever is European is superior, that everything native is bad and shameful' (1957:29-30).

The lower socioeconomic status of many indigenous communities is, indeed, a common theme in waynus, for example in the following from Parobamba (Pomabamba):

Razón tenía mi madre Cuando supo que te amaba 'Hijo ella no te quiere Por tu pobreza te desprecia' My mother was right When she knew that I loved you 'Son, she doesn't love you She despises you for your poverty'

(Tulio Dominguez Herrera)

Speaker 31's strategy of countering such discrimination is to root herself more firmly within her community: esas son nuestras raíces, nuestras costumbres, y lo debemos de conservar 'these are our roots, our customs, and we must conserve them'. The rejection of the waynu, then, is presented as a form of betrayal, of joining the Other, discriminating, group. Nonetheless, the solution is, once more, one of engagement with the 'outside': hacer que todo el mundo lo conozca 'make the whole world aware of it'. As in quote 23, it is legitimate for Peru to influence other countries but the converse is not acceptable (arguably, because of the asymmetrical power-relations). Again, the 'outside' is both a threat to one's group, and also a means of defining – and thereby creating – it.

This extract recalls social identity theory, which argues that social identity 'only acquires meaning by comparison with other groups' (Giles, Bourhis & Taylor 1977:319). Such a comparison may cause one to appraise one's own group in positive or negative terms (Giles & Johnson 1987:70-71, see also Tajfel 1982); if positive, one will emphasize the distinct attributes of one's group; if negative, one will attempt to change one's group-membership (Giles, Bourhis & Taylor 1977:319-20). This speaker

views her group in positive terms and thereby emphasizes the waynu, whereas the people she

describes reject the waynu because they perceive their group negatively. However, in these quotes,

the waynu is valued not just because of a pre-existent positive identity, but in order to consolidate

that sense of identity and make it positive in the face of discrimination. The issue, then, is more

complex than simply expressing 'positive' or 'negative' identities; essentialist discourse seems to be

a strategy of transforming potentially negative self-images into positive ones (and, in any case, the

ambiguity of some responses - particularly 20, 24, and 26 - suggests that perceptions are rarely

entirely positive or entirely negative). The next extract represents a dialogue between school-pupils

who alternately define waynu in terms of 'Andean-ness' and 'Peruvian-ness' in such a manner as to

reinforce the underlying trace of irreconcilable dualism between two groups:

32. Interview-extract with sixth-grade pupils, all born between 1993-1994 in Chiquián:

Girl 1: Su función del huayno acá en el Perú es identificarnos naturalmente como somos

porque, como dice, los peruanos somos cholos, cholos y el huayno te identifica.

Author: ¿Qué quiere decir 'cholo'?

Girl 1: Es serra-, es... ¿Qué es 'cholo'? [ríe con compañeros] 'Cholo' significa, o sea, ser

serrano, ¿no?, o sea.

Boy 1: iNooo!

Girl 2: ¡Nooo!

Girl 2: Ser peruano

Girl 1: Ser peruano

Boy 2: Mira, para explicar, el cholo, es toda la persona que está ubicado o vive en los Andes

de Sudamérica.

Girl 2: Eso es 'cholo', sí.

Boy 2: Sí, son todos cholos, sí. En realidad, el huayno tiene una función que identificamos

todos acá a la zona de la sierra del Perú.

Girl 1: 'The waynu's function here in Peru is to identify us naturally as we are because, as

they say, we Peruvians are cholos, cholos and the waynu identifies you.'

Author: 'What does cholo mean?'

Girl 1: 'It's mountain-, it's...What's cholo? [laughs with classmates] Well, cholo means being

from the mountains.'

Boy 1: 'Nooo!'

105

Girl 2: 'Nooo!'

Girl 2: 'Being Peruvian'

Girl 1: 'Being Peruvian'

Boy 2: 'Look, to explain, the *cholo*, it's everyone who is located or lives in the Andes of South America.'

Girl 2: 'That's cholo, yes.'

Boy 2: 'Yes, they're all *cholos*, yes. In reality, the *waynu* has the function whereby we all identify with the mountain area of Peru.'

This dialogue begins with the statement that the waynu exists in order to identificarnos naturalmente como somos 'identify us naturally as we are'. The word naturalmente 'naturally' suggests an inalienable association between waynu and Andeanness, rooted in the fundamental order of the world (anticipating the association between the Inca, nature and divinity, discussed in Chapter Four). This is also conveyed by somos 'we are', which is an inflexion of one of the two verbs denoting existence in Spanish: ser (whence somos) conveys intrinsic qualities, whereas estar conveys transitory states. The most interesting dimension of this extract is the debate around the term cholo. This term has been extensively discussed in Andean scholarship. Seligman states that ""Cholo" began to be used in the colonial period as a caste category; it is used today as both a racialized and social category to refer to those individuals who do not appear to be Indigenous but who also do not appear to pertain to the Hispanicized middle classes' (2004:125). Similarly, Wölck defines cholo as 'a person who has left the Indian culture and has not yet been integrated into the Western, Spanish-speaking Mestizo [i.e. racially mixed] culture' (1973:135). Albó defines cholo as 'a name that is given by the nonindigenous to those Indians who attempt to become mestizos, mostly migrants to the cities' (2004b:21). Van den Berghe identifies three main usages of the term in scholarship: 1) 'people intermediate in status between Indians and mestizos'; 2) 'cholification' as 'a process of movement from "Indianness" to "mestizo-ness" or 'a process of syncretism between the two cultures'; 3) the view endorsed by van den Berghe that 'the term cholo does not correspond to any objective reality at all, but rather that it is used up and down the social scale as a term of derogation towards one's social inferiors. In other words, who is cholo is determined not by any objective characteristics a person may possess but by the social distance between the person so designated and the one who does the name-calling' (1979:261).

This emphasis on discrimination has been noted by other scholars: 'Cholo is a term loaded with negative connotations and is traditionally used by the criollo [i.e. coastal, primarily Hispanic] population to classify and discriminate against Andean migrants' (Paerregaard 2003:275); it 'is virtually never used as self-identification and as a term of address is one of the worst insults' (Spedding 1989:167-168); for Masson, *cholo* refers to indigenous people, who 'automatically understand the contempt expressed against them, the hostile, aggressive attitude, the intended insult. The reaction is, often, irritation, indignation, disgust, even anger' (1983:90, mt). Nonetheless, Masson, contrary to Spedding, notes how the term is 'often deployed by indigenous people themselves, as a term of reference and as a term of relation'; the term has therefore been 'interiorized by indigenous people [and is deployed] to refer to one's own children, with affection and shades of humour'; likewise, lovers sometimes call themselves *cholo/a* (1983:90) (cf. the term *serrano* in quote 28).

The term *cholo* is salient in many *waynus*, always, in my data, in a positive sense (reflecting the fact that *waynus* are still considered an 'in-group' form of expression). For example, the following extract from Yamyán (Pomabamba) which uses the term in a romantic context:

¿Maychawmi wamraa puñun? ¿Maychawmi chola puñun? Tsayllata willaykamay Where is my girl sleeping? Where is my *chola* sleeping? Please tell me

And the following from Pomabamba which conveys pride at one's Andean origins:

Yo soy ancashino señores Cholo conchucano Canto mi chimayche alegre Para que lo bailes

I'm *Ancashino*, gentlemen Conchucan *cholo* I sing happily my *chimaychi* For you to dance to it

(Moisés Zavaleta Vilanueva)

In view of the aforementioned interpretations by Andean scholars, it seems that *cholo* reflects the sense of distinctness that arises when people from the Andes encounter the society of the coastal or urban environments, a distinctness that is mutually constructed by the categories of 'Andean' and 'non-Andean'. It reflects the difficulties that migrants experience as they attempt to integrate with coastal society, encapsulating the whole complex issue of racism and discrimination against the indigenous population. But, as a term of endearment, it also reflects the erection of boundaries by people of Andean origin, who seem to deploy the term as an expression of solidarity, consolidating the sense of a separate 'Andean' culture or society. The liminality of the term – being faced with the

Other and yet not permitted to *become* the Other – is redefined from impossibility to possibility: it is in view of the existence of the Other that one can self-identify as 'indigenous' all the more clearly (even if, in contrast to the rural environment, one is less *cholo* and more *mestizo*, echoing van den Berghe's comment above that the term is relative, as is to be expected if categories are mutually constitutive rather than absolute and intrinsic).

This redefinition from perceived impossibility to possibility seems to be what is happening in the extract from Chiquián. The first speaker states that los peruanos somos cholos 'we Peruvians are cholos'. The informal second person singular in te identifica 'identifies you' arguably conveys solidarity. When I ask what cholo means, the speaker replies that it means serrano, or 'someone from the Andes', thus partially backtracking on her assertion that it denotes 'Peruvians'. But her answer is made hesitantly, while she appeals to her classmates, suggesting a desire to absolve responsibility for any controversial statements regarding this highly sensitive issue. Two of her classmates nonetheless emphatically deny her interpretation, though amidst everyone's laughter which arguably serves to diffuse any potential tension. A second girl then states that *cholo* means ser peruano 'being Peruvian', which is readily agreed with by the first speaker (who, in any case, defined Peruvians as cholos in her first statement). Their male classmate then states that cholo denotes toda la persona que está ubicado o vive en los Andes de Sudamérica 'everyone who is located or lives in the Andes of South America', which the second girl agrees with. The male classmate then sums up the discussion by bringing it back into the context of the waynu: el huayno tiene una función que identificamos todos acá a la zona de la sierra del Perú 'the waynu has the function whereby we all identify with the mountain area of Peru'. What is most evident in this conversation is the degree to which the same speakers would seem to contradict themselves. The first girl defines cholo in terms of being 'Peruvian' in her first statement, yet, when asked to define cholo, states that it means serrano 'from the mountains', only to go back to her original interpretation in accordance with her female classmate. Likewise, the second girl, while initially defining cholo in terms of being 'Peruvian', later agrees with her male classmate that it denotes someone from the Andes. And their male classmate first defines cholo in terms of being from the Andes of South America, and then links the cholo to the waynu to state that the waynu indexes people from the Andes of Peru (the re-focus back to the waynu may indicate a wish to diverge from this controversial issue).

I would argue that the contradictions, rather than indicating confusion, reveal interesting dynamics of the semiotics of identity. While the prototypical meaning of *cholo* is 'someone from the Andes',

by associating *cholo*-ness with national identity the speakers are making a political point: that authentic Peruvian identity is based on Andean identity. Thus, the discrimination of 'Andeans' (which defines people *as* 'Andeans') is countered by acknowledging an Andean identity, and defining this identity as the basis for the nation as a whole. Therefore, if one is Peruvian, to discriminate against *cholos* is to discriminate against oneself. This reflects a process of ideological erasure and iconization (Irvine & Gal 2000), whereby the numerous pre-Hispanic societies of the coast and contemporary indigenous peoples of Amazonia are ignored as part of a strategy to counter perceived marginalization, namely the strategy of asserting that one's own culture is the only authentic way of being 'Peruvian'. While non-Andean 'indigenous' cultures are conveniently forgotten, the knowledge of the Hispanic Other tacitly remains, since it is the perceived discrimination from this group which motivates the conflation of 'Andean' with 'Peruvian', a conflation which serves the purpose of rending the Hispanic Other irrelevant to the modern nation. In this way, the apparent inclusiveness ('all Peruvians are *cholos'*) rests on a parallel process of othering (the Hispanic dimension is not *cholo*, therefore not legitimately Peruvian). To paraphrase Orwell, 'We are all *cholos*, but some are more *cholo* than others'.

Perhaps ironically, the conflation of *cholo* with *peruano* can only be ideologically meaningful if there is a tacit acknowledgement that they are not, in fact, synonyms, otherwise the conflation would be meaningless tautology rather than politically potent. This is only paradoxical if one remains in a synchronic perspective; if, however, one views language as enactive, then one can interpret such conflations as attempts to reconfigure past understandings so that newer, more (inter)subjectively appealing, understandings can be formed in the future. This entails the knowledge that word-definitions are not static, but operate in a diachronic process of change, and that this change is facilitated by the simultaneous foregrounding and subversion of differences between hitherto divergent categories. The final quote unites many of the themes explored in this section: the contrast between 'insider' and 'outsider' at both Andean and national levels, the reinforcement of this divide by recourse to history, and the sense of an abiding 'Incan' identity that must be preserved at all costs:

33. En nuestra zona sierra, claro...el huayno es oriundo, es autóctono, y es algo que nos han dejado nuestros ancestros también, el huayno. Porque ya posterior son la música chicha, balada, bolero esas cosas, ¿no? Pero el huayno es nuestro. Desde la época del incanato, ellos celebraban por ejemplo la siembra, la cosecha, pura música, ¿no?, cantaban. Entonces nosotros llevamos en la sangre esto, ¿no?, desde nuestros ancestros, desde nuestros antepasados....Ya que el huayno es peruano, ¿no? Es nuestra, nuestra danza peruana. Y esto se ha practicado desde, de la época de los Incas. Entonces, para nosotros, es una reliquia, nuestro huayno. Entonces tenemos que seguir conservándolo y preservándolo,

pues, ¿no?, para que no se pierda.... Y más bien seguir cultivándolo con todo ese fervor y tratar de transmitir a...nuestras generaciones que vienen. Entonces, porque el huayno identifica al Perú.

'In our mountain region, of course...the waynu is native, it's autochthonous, and it's something which our ancestors have left us, too, the waynu. Because chicha music, balada, bolero, these things, are all later. But the waynu is our own. Since the Incan period, they celebrated for example sowing, harvesting, all music, they sang. So we carry this in our blood, from our ancestors, from our forefathers....Because the waynu is Peruvian, isn't it. It's our, our Peruvian dance. And this has been practised since, from the time of the Incas. So, for us, it's a relic, our waynu. So we must continue to conserve it and to preserve it, so that it doesn't get lost....And instead continue to cultivate it with all that fervour and try to transmit it to...our generations to come. So, because the waynu identifies Peru.' (1956; female; librarian in pedagogical institute; Chiquián)

This extract begins with an appropriation of a particular geographical space: nuestra zona sierra 'our mountain region'. Here, the possessive nuestra defines the community through people's common association with the land. This provides the basis for defining the waynu as oriundo 'original' and autóctono 'native': if the community is defined by this geographical space, then it is also defined by the waynu, given that the latter is inseparable from the mountain region. The inseparability of community, place and waynu is then grounded in an affirmation of historical continuity: es algo que nos han dejado nuestros ancestros 'it's something which our ancestors have left us'. The waynu is contrasted with modern music, which is posterior 'later', whereas the waynu is nuestro 'ours'. Thus, that which is recent cannot properly be claimed as one's own, since it lacks the stability and sense of naturalness that derives from historical continuity. Here again, we see how a sense of identity and a sense of otherness are mutually constitutive, emerging simultaneously. As in quote 29, the Incas are presented as the origin of true Andean culture, and the sense of communality is reinforced by defining contemporary Andeans as their descendants. This is shown by the statement that waynus were performed during the Incanato 'Incan period', with the result that Ilevamos en la sangre esto 'we carry this in our blood', from nuestros ancestros 'our ancestors'. This is also a process of ideological erasure and iconization (Irvine & Gal 2000), whereby the partly Hispanic and African descent of many Andean people is ignored, as is the fact that the Incas were only the ruling elite during a small period of Andean history.

Similarly to the discussion of quote 32, this ideological erasure is arguably conducted as part of a process of 'strategic essentialism', whereby discrimination is countered by recourse to clearly-defined concepts which can define Andeans as intrinsically different in a positive sense, with the suggestion that they are more authentic and more noble (because descended from a royal lineage). The notion of 'essentialism' as a 'strategy' was introduced by Spivak, who described 'strategic use of

a positive essentialism in a scrupulously visible political interest' (1988:13). Likewise, Bucholtz states that essentialism can arise as 'a deliberate attempt to enable scholarly activity, to forge a political alliance through the creation of a common identity, or to otherwise provide a temporarily stable ground for further social action' (2003:401). I would argue that the strategy can be as much one of regaining a positive self-appraisal and of finding security as of promoting a particular political agenda – in which case all identity-related ideology (and ideologies in general) can perhaps be defined as 'strategic', in that they have a purpose.

'Strategic essentialism', then, can be seen as a useful tautology, which reminds us that we define things in accordance with our predisposition (more on this in Chapters Three and Five). In the interview-quotes, the strategy seems to be 'to appropriate the constructions that have been foisted upon them [Andeans] in order to forge social unity as a strategic response to oppression' (Turino 1996:478) or, indeed, social flux. In this way, 'Cultural essentialism – an unquestioned belief in who one is – may be necessary along with a healthy dose of pragmatism' (1996:478). Thus, in the Andean context, essentialism is both a result of discrimination, and a strategy for overcoming it. Gustafsson notes the paradox that this strategy entails:

'The fact that, nowadays, *indianist* discourses take for granted this shared identity and view it as a historical "essence"...corresponds to a kind of logic..., but it doesn't stop being paradoxical. And the paradox resides not in the acceptation of an identity imposed through repression, but in the continuation of a repressive colonial and postcolonial project based on the maintenance of exclusive ethnic boundaries' (2009:8).

In this chapter's conclusion, I seek to account for why the reaction to discrimination is so often the perpetuation of a discriminating discourse. I shall do this by recourse to Derrida's (1967) notion of the *trace*, whereby 'resistance', to be meaningful, is often conducted on the same terms as the discriminatory discourse.

The mention of *sangre* 'blood' is a powerful depiction of group-unity, for blood permeates the very core of an individual and yet also circulates. It therefore conveys an inalienable intertwining of people at their most fundamental level; the *waynu* is presented as an attribute which evidences this quasi-biological contiguity. This depiction of 'blood' recalls Merleau-Ponty's (1964) concept of *chair* 'flesh', which pervades within and between entities, and allows for intersubjective engagement and mutual constitution of each individual. Blood, moreover, is what gives life and warmth, vitality and security, just as being part of a stable community can enhance one's resilience and, ultimately, chances of survival. Its liquidity means that it is both substance and process; hence, it is an ideal

metaphor of spatiotemporal continuity – and only partly metaphorical if one believes certain ethnic characteristics to be shared, and passed down, in the blood. Indeed, Masson notes how 'the notion of "race", in the Spanish-speaking world, refers not only to genetics, physical-biological and somatic elements, but also includes the cultural, the spiritual and historical tradition' (1983:84, mt). The stress on circulation as underlying unity is echoed in Chapter Three, when we examine the redistribution of resources in the Carnival song and the concept of irrigation in the *Wayta Muruy*, and, in Chapter Four, when we explore the concepts of *apu* and *kallpa*. In all of these concepts, stasis – non-circulation – means destruction; thus, individual wellbeing is predicated on membership of a strong and reciprocal community.

The sharing of the *waynu* through blood is explained *Ya que el huayno es peruano* 'Because the *waynu* is Peruvian'. This is reinforced by the phrase *nuestra danza peruana* 'our Peruvian dance', where the possessive construction now relates to Peruvians in general. This conflation of 'Andeanness' and 'Peruvianness' grounds the modern state in terms of Andean culture, whereby the latter is presented as the only authentic way of being Peruvian. As in quote 32, this arguably serves to counter discrimination by presenting Andean culture not as marginal, but instead as the core of national identity. The Incas are again brought in as the basis of Andean – and now Peruvian – society: *esto se ha practicado desde...la época de los Incas* 'this has been practised since...the time of the Incas'. By defining the *waynu* as a *reliquia* 'relic', and by emphasizing the importance of conserving and preserving it, the speaker affirms the totemic role of the genre: the *waynu* acts as an anchor around which a sense of solidarity is enacted in a world of flux, fusing past and present in an emblem of continuity. It is arguably the sense of security afforded by the *waynu* which means that it is presented, in essentialist terms, as a stable, transcendent, entity, not as an artistic orientation open to constant change and adaptation. Its function is not one of art *per se*, but one of reassurance.

The link between past and present already established, the speaker ends with a vision towards the future: it is people's responsibility to *transmitir a...nuestras generaciones que vienen* 'transmit [the *waynu*] to our generations to come'. The possessive *nuestras* 'our' presents these generations as the spatiotemporal extension of Self and community, heightening the sense of vitality of the individual who locates him/herself within this group, and strengthening the resonance of the community by depicting its extension into past and future. The final line endows the *waynu* with an important role: that of representing Peru on the international stage. This reinforces the presumed centrality of Andean culture for the nation, and raises the prestige of this culture as the only one

which can allow Peru to stand shoulder to shoulder with the rest of the world. Thus, the strength of the group is portrayed in international dimensions.

## Summary

All of the extracts in Part Two posit a strict divide between 'in-group' and 'out-group' at different structural levels. This operation of the same discourse in different frames of reference can be understood in terms of Derrida's notion of the trace, whereby an underlying discourse ramifies in many different directions, thereby producing ostensibly different (local/Andean/Peruvian) that emanate from the same cognitive orientation. The opposite categories constructed by the trace (i.e. the non-Andean, non-Peruvian or Western) are, whilst radically negated by their alters, in fact mutually constituted with them. Thus, the categories of 'Andean' and non-Andean would have no meaning outside of this dyad; likewise for 'Peruvian' and 'non-Peruvian'. The unavoidable communication between these mutually constitutive categories is evidenced in several of the interview-extracts. Some of the most salient examples are: the importance of chimaychi specifically in contrast to modern music from abroad (quote 19); the special relevance of chimaychi for people who live in the urban centres along the coast (quote 20); the statement that the chimaychi nos representa a Pomabamba 'represents us as Pomabamba', whereby the erection of group-boundaries is realized through engagement with those on the other side (quote 21); the waynu's function as to saca adelante nuestro Perú 'bring our Peru to the forefront' (quote 30); the suggestion that people should hacer que todo el mundo lo conozca 'make the whole world aware of it [the waynu]' (quote 31).

Thus, while the speakers in Part Two all attempt to construct an impenetrable buttress between ingroup and out-group, the manner of doing so only serves to reinforce the inextricable connection between the two discursive categories. As Derrida states, difference is not something pre-extant that must be bridged; instead, it emerges out of the 'pure movement' of the *trace*, its dialectic creativity, so that 'discourse' must be conceptualized before the 'category' (1967:92). Moreover, the diverse structural levels along which the *trace* operates serve to reinforce the underlying dualistic discourse of the *trace*. This is particularly evident in the juxtaposition between the 'national' and 'Andean' levels, where the definition of *waynu* as 'Peruvian' serves to rhetorically eliminate the non-Andean cultures in Peru (notably, the Hispanic) and define 'Andean-ness' as the only legitimate way of being Peruvian. The same process can also be interpreted in terms of *tinku*, whereby two categories emerge mutually, dialectically, through constant divergent yet congruent

exchange. Of course, this is not the same kind of *tinku* that we saw in Part One, where there was physical, face-to-face interaction between participants. The discourses of Part Two did not arrive at *yachay*, because the perpetuation of the *trace* of dualistic irreconcilability resulted in greater distancing from the interconnectedness of reality, with a negative result for knowledge and understanding. In the conclusion to this chapter, I unite Parts One and Two in a global interpretation, thus resolving the contradictions between the open, intersubjective, role of *waynu* that we observed in Part One, and, in Part Two, the essentialist discourses that stressed an unbreachable divide between two groups.

#### Conclusion

It is now time to unite the two threads that I have separated in this chapter. Part One might be seen to correspond to a processual – perhaps more postmodernist – conception of 'identity', stressing fluidity over stasis. Part Two, on the other hand, presents a vision of 'identity' as stable, abiding and inalienable. But we have seen elements of cohesion and process in both sections (even the most fluid conceptualization of the intertwining of Self and Other relies on the existence of two entities that can be extended, and even the most transcendent depiction of 'identity' entails processes of 'identification' and 'representation'). So, how do we account for this strange interplay of fluidity and consolidation?

In Part One, the combination of interview-excerpts and citation of scientific studies suggested that we are innately predisposed to intersubjectivity. The interviews suggested that one of the main functions of waynu/chimaychi was to conflate Self and Other in cognitive and emotional communion. This was reinforced through the citation of: a) mirror-neuron research (Rizzolatti & Arbib 1998, Rizzolatti & Craighero 2004, Keysers & Gazzola 2009) which suggested that the actions and sensations of others are understood without any need for cognitive mediation; b) research on 'emotional contagion' (Hatfield, Rapson & Le 2009), where automatic mimicry means that other people's emotions are frequently appropriated at the unconscious level, this being a fundamental form of communication within species; c) multidisciplinary studies which have all indicated the sharing of emotions to be fundamental for survival (Lichtenberg, Lachman & Fosshage 1992, Buss 1995, Gilbert 1989); d) the concept of 'emotion work' which locates emotions as both physiological and interactional (Hermans & Dimaggio 2007). This all indicates significant contiguity between Self and Other, so that the distinction between the two is highly porous.

But equally important was the realization that Self and Other are not identical either. As much as the interviewees suggested conflation of these entities, the chimaychi/waynu was necessary in order to realize this conflation; it was not pre-given from the start. The power of the songs depended as much on our ability to differentiate as to unite. Likewise, Brass, Ruby and Spengler (2009) presented evidence that, whilst our default state is likely to be imitative, this reflex may be inhibited should it conflict with our planned behaviour. This is consistent with the fact that we are, after all, different organisms with differing genetic endowments and a more or less different array of experiences (depending on the similarities of our life-histories and environments). Thus, insofar as our brain grows through interaction with our environment, our mental configurations are never identical to those of others, and we operate with different, though often similar, predispositions. The individual predispositions that are thereby formed do not negate our intersubjective constitution, but they do mean that new experiences are increasingly sifted and interpreted according to the patterns that our brains have already created (in cognitive science, this is the 'habituation principle' of Hebb's Law (Goldblum 2001:58); it also concords with Sperber & Wilson's (2004) Relevance Theory). This is clearly an important process for survival, since the alternative, i.e. unconditional receptivity, ultimately means non-receptivity (just as complete freedom is impossible since action presupposes structure). Thus, both our intersubjective nature, and our consolidation as Self (our ability for selfdifferentiation) would appear to be biologically innate in us, since both are necessary for us to survive at all.

Given that our physical and mental development is contingent on the environment, we require a degree of stability in that environment in order to be able to locate ourselves in relation to phenomena, and align ourselves with those phenomena that are likely to be conducive to survival (as Gibson (1979) would say, to select 'affordances'). Part of this means being part of a stable community of people around us (our parents, siblings, relatives, friends), the interaction with whom allows us to consolidate our understanding of the world (in our receptivity to their interpretations), and the emotional bonding with whom affords a sense of solidarity which arguably minimizes feelings of vulnerability (the group is stronger than a single individual). Thus, conceptualizations of 'identity', which locate the individual in strategic positions within the environment, are at once affective and epistemological, or, as Mohanty puts it, akin to 'theories': 'realism about identity requires that we see identities as complex theories about (and explanations of) the social world' (2000:64). Unlike scientific theories, 'Such explanations are not purely empirical, and what makes them "good" is in part the cogency of the background theories they draw on, which often necessarily have deep moral and evaluative content' (2000:64) – since the motivation is, ultimately, survival,

where the 'emotional' plays a key role as well as the 'analytical'. Thus, as Montoya et al. state, 'Every social act is economic, political, cultural and ideological, affective and aesthetic, at the same time. All of these aspects unite simultaneously and it is this unity as a totality in movement which the social sciences should consider their object' (1999:5, mt).

Arguably, then, our interaction with the environment presupposes a degree of essentialism, since that is what gives us the emotional and cognitive stability we need to survive. As Bucholtz & Hall state, 'it is important not to essentialize essentialism itself: like all ideologies, it is situated and strategic' (2004:376). This means that identities 'never just appear, they are always used; they only make sense as part of an interactional structure (like a story or argument)' (Antaki, Condor & Levine 1996:473). The strategic element behind identity-creation is the basis for erasure and iconization (Irvine & Gal 2000), since strategy involves simplifying a complex reality to render the environment understandable and consistent with one's emotional and cognitive predispositions. As Edwards states, 'Identity – for all groups – is...a personal matter in which people define themselves as they see fit within their circumstances' (1985:303).

So far so good. Our chances of survival are enhanced through the formation of a stable base, built on emotional and cognitive grounds, and this is realized through supportive and productive interaction with those around us from an early age. In Part Two, I argued, citing Hermans and Dimaggio (2007), that the negative reactions to the 'outside' derive from a sense of insecurity that, in turn, results from the challenges that globalization presents to this stability. But this is not, on its own, a sufficient explanation, since not everything 'new' has to be considered 'threatening', and society is by nature adaptive, and the influence of wider society has been ongoing long before many of the interviewees were born. The interviews were, after all, conducted in a semi-urban environment with significant influence from coastal culture. Thus, we have to answer why this so-called 'external' influence threatens psychological stability, and why it is felt to be 'external'.

Arguably, the greater one's sense of security, the greater one's openness to unfamiliar phenomena – since one is stable enough to be able to deal with things without their being felt as a threat. The problem in my fieldsites, is, I suggest, that a discourse of unequal dualism (Andeans as inferior to Hispanic society) has been so widespread and pervasive that it is internalized intersubjectively, with the result that this initial security is threatened. This is suggested by the quotes which complained about people's rejection of their origins or emphasized 'remembering' one's origins (implying that there was a danger of 'forgetting') (e.g. quotes 20, 21, 23, 26, 27, 28, 31, 33), the ambivalent quotes

which portrayed 'Andeans' in the manner of the 'noble savage', as opposed to 'civilization' (e.g. quotes 20, 21, 26), the fact that most people responded in Spanish (despite knowing Quechua), and the disjuncture I observed with young people who appreciated *waynus* theoretically but preferred other music in practice. While we are able to filter *some* phenomena if they conflict with our interests, *other* environmental factors may simply be too salient or too insidious *not* to affect us. As Hechter notes, 'ideological ranking' enables the hegemonic group to comprise 'the norm from which all others diverge' (1978:372). The numerous sociolinguistic studies on Quechua, cited in the Introduction, and the scholarship focusing on the term *cholo* (cf. quote 32) suggest that there is still significant discrimination towards those perceived as 'Andean'. A discourse of inequality can, moreover, be manifest as much in *silence* as in *talk* (in the fact, for example, that Andean languages and cultures are not deemed academic enough to feature in the educational system, despite some encouraging first steps at bilingual/bicultural education in primary schools in remote communities). Due to the internalization of this omnipresent discriminatory discourse, one's origins – that stable environment within which one constructs one's understanding of the world, and self-understanding as part of that world – is not experienced as valid. And insecurity results.

This discourse of dualism has been noted by van Dam and Salman, who argue that 'the image of the indigenous world is hardly ever created on an exclusively emic basis; the very vocabulary of distinction is born out of the confrontation with the other, and the lexicon for articulating belonging is learned outside' (2003:19-20). Likewise Abercrombie: 'To suggest the existence of a rural/indigenous culture in the Andes, what is often called in the literature, "the Andean", is usually to fall victim to non-Indian's essentializing stereotype of "the Indian". In other words, the "Andean" is only rightly studied as an...image projected by various urban groups' (1991:97). And Brienen:

The manner in which *lo andino* [Andean-ness] is defined, leaning heavily on the maintenance of traditional lifestyles handed down from times of yore, dictates that the individual must belong either to *lo andino* or to its Western counterpart: the two are mutually exclusive. This mutual exclusivity translates into a belief in the incompatibility of the two opposing cultural spheres in the Andean region...*Lo andino*, then, is not so much a descriptor of indigenous culture in the Andes, as an expression of the idea that traditional indigenous culture is as different from Western culture today as it was when the Spanish first made landfall in what to them was a New World' (2003:190).

That this dualism is an unequal one is illustrated by the several sociolinguistic studies examined in the Introduction.

Ossio rightly notes, however, that 'it is possible that, regardless of the domination to which they were subject, Andeans were predisposed against the colonizers because of their [colonizers'] mere presence in their [Andeans'] territories. The fact of their being foreigners was a sufficient reason for the illegitimacy of the Spanish in Andean territories' (1973:XXIV, mt). Thus, the sense of irreconcilability may have originated as much among Andeans as among the European newcomers. However, the interview-responses suggest that what keeps the two groups apart (in the minds of my interviewees) is the sense that Hispanic society is threatening to Andeans, even to the point where some Andeans even believe themselves to be inferior. It is possible that, given the long history of discrimination, Andeans are still predisposed to view the criollo as 'discriminatory', even when the level of discrimination is no longer what it was (a highly debatable point) - since the discourse of 'criollo as discriminatory' circulates intersubjectively within the community. But the fact is that the perception of the Other as irreconcilable and threatening to Self is internalized through some kind of intersubjective relation with the Other, whether first-hand discrimination or knowledge of discrimination towards other Andeans; indeed, the fact that waynus frequently depict class-related discrimination means that, in addition to acting as an 'Andean totem', they also play a role in propagating the discourse of the 'threatening Other', at once hardening the boundaries and increasing cohesion. Thus, the main point is this: intersubjectivity results in appropriation of influences from the 'outside' (non-Andean); but it also results in a sense that the 'outside' is threatening, reconfirming the ideological boundary between 'in-group' and 'out-group'. As LePage & Tabouret-Keller state, 'Neither "race" nor "ethnic group" nor "language" turns out to be a clearlydefinable external object. Rather, each is a concept we form as individuals, and the extent to which, and the manner in which, we project our concepts on to those around us and establish networks of shared suppositions determines the nature of the groups in our society and their mode of operation' (1985:247).

This internalization of unequal dualism means that any intersubjective appropriation of that which has arrived from the 'coast' or the 'West' – even if it is familiar – is experienced as an appropriation of the Other which threatens one's stable base. And, being intersubjective creatures, it is impossible not to appropriate elements from wider society (in language, dress, music, philosophy, way of life in general). Here it is useful to draw on Kinnvall's concept of the abject, as 'an unconscious part of the self that has become internalized as an "enemy" (Hermans & Dimaggio 2007:40). The Other is threatening not just because it discriminates, but because the Other becomes, by virtue of the intersubjective process, part of the Self (the inextricability of Self and Other in the process of interaction is one of the main characteristics of Merleau-Ponty's chair, as we saw in Part One). And,

due to the concomitant internalization of a discourse of unequal dualism, this 'Self-Other' is *irreconcilable* to other aspects of the Self. No matter how internalized the Other might become, the Other will never be reconciled to Self, since part of what is internalized is *also* a discourse of irreconcilability, which defines some people as Other and some people as 'like Self'. The internalization of the Other (which is experienced as Other only through internalizing a discourse of 'otherness') arguably leads to the greater consolidation of the boundary, since the threat is all the more immediate. That which is appropriated from the Other is thereby abjected, and everything that remains is bracketed as the 'true Self', safe from the threat of the self-negating Other; this recalls Butler's discussion of the subject/abject boundary (1990:134), though Butler suggests a more top-down influence of 'society' *on* the person, whereas I stress individual agency *within* the social environment. The examples of ideological erasure can be understood as a strategic attempt to harden the boundary between the bracketed Self and the abject Self, since by presenting each as uniform the relation between the two is negated.

Thus, both the idea of the abject Self (the Other) and the bracketed Self (or 'true Self') are born of the same intersubjectively internalized discourse. And the discourse is perpetuated by the distinction between, yet mutual interdependence between, these ideas that the discourse itself creates; in other words, the discourse is self-realizing, for the more one talks of 'otherness', the more it is reinforced. The categories of 'Andean' and 'Hispanic/criollo' are, then, mutually constitutive constructs. People in the semi-urban environments of Chiquián and Pomabamba (where the interviews were taken) sit on an uneasy borderline between these constructs. Compared to the coast, they exhibit more 'indigenous' characteristics (e.g. the relative prevalence of Quechua, and the sense of marginalization from the political and economic nuclei along the coast), but compared to the countryside, they are far more assimilated (in terms of education, norms of dress, relative use of Spanish, etc.). This means that neither category can be ignored as part of the Self, yet neither can the apparent irreconcilability given the discourse of inequality. The solution is to define one of those categories as a threatening Other (i.e. the *criollo*/Hispanic/European), maintaining the rest as the authentic Self. This results in a hiatus between ideology and practice, where assimilation with coastal norms is radically denied or rejected in expressed attitudes.

The same discourse of dualism is, in Part Two, evident at different levels (local, Andean and national). These levels interact in such a way as to reinforce the discourse. Particularly, the juxtaposition of the 'Peruvian' and the 'Andean' was a way of defining the former in terms of the latter, so that everything non-Andean about Peru was ideologically erased as part of a strategic

essentialism to raise the prestige of Andean society; Andeanness was not just fit to represent Peru on the world stage, but was the *only* aspect of Peru that was suitable for this role. The abject Other is eliminated from consideration by the discourse, through the extension of the bracketed Self. Thus, people 'use their identities as warrants or authority for a variety of claims they make and challenge, and the identities they invoke change as they are deployed to meet changing conversational demands' (Antaki, Condor & Levine 1996:473). But the discourse itself relies on an underlying acknowledgement of the difference that one attempts to undermine; in other words, one can only meaningfully conflate 'Andean' and 'Peruvian' if they are not, in fact, perceived as the same, otherwise the affirmation is a mere tautology rather than being ideologically loaded. What seems to be important in identity-discourse, then, is the juxtaposition *between* levels rather than the levels themselves (recalling Barth (1969) whereby identity is reproduced at the *boundaries*); this was suggested by the close congruence between the discourses of identity in the extracts, on the one hand, and Derrida's notion of the *trace*, on the other, whereby categories only come into existence through an underlying discursive orientation.

Part of the strategy of separating the bracketed 'true Self' from the internalized Other, or 'abject Self', is to anchor the former in historical continuity with the past, so that 'individual' and 'community' are conflated; the result is a sense of strength and stability through the dissolution of the individual in a large community with deep roots stretching back to time immemorial. Thus, there is a drive to 'preserve' everything with local origins: older songs become 'anthems' of the locality where they were first disseminated and, in Pomabamba, there is an annual 'showcasing' of thirty-six local dances (which has led to its denomination as 'Folkloric Capital of Ancash'). These dances are fast becoming extinct in their respective communities, arguably because of their decreased relevance in a society that is moving away from traditional subsistence towards a market economy (the dances are principally associated with agricultural rituals). However, they acquire a new relevance in the semi-urban context as a totem of identity, as a means of consolidating the bracketed Self as part of a strong community with a demonstrable 'tradition' that clearly separates it from the threatening Other – the abject Self.

The simultaneous loss and gain of relevance are not unrelated: the former indicates the appropriation of the Other and alienation from traditional Andean culture and society; the latter is the reaction to this, bracketing, safeguarding and consolidating the 'true Self' by aligning it with a strong body of creativity that 'proves' the resilience of the 'true Self' and the community whence it derives. Moreover, that which is older, and thereby removed from the flux of contemporary life, is

able to act as a psychological anchor and foundation for the 'true Self'. Hence the identification with the Incas (which we saw hints of in quote 29, and is the main theme in Chapter Four). In an effort to define the bracketed Self as both 'authentic' and part of a resilient community, Andean history becomes autobiographical history, through which the separation between 'insider' and 'outsider' is consolidated. Thus, reconciliation becomes illegitimate as well as impracticable. Indeed, the internalization of an unequal discourse of 'otherness' explains why discriminatory discourses are so frequently countered by equally discriminatory discourses; the inequality is simply inverted. And as long as the strategy involves inversion, the discourse of dualism is perpetuated; the strategy thereby illustrates how deeply internalized that particular discourse has become. Thus, the process of bracketing can only be a partial solution. The appropriation of the Other is, after all, evident in every aspect of life; it was the very prevalence of the Other that led to its internalization in the first place. Thus, the conflict, the threat to security, always remains.

I explained Part One of this Chapter by recourse to Merleau-Ponty's notion of chair, and Part Two by engaging with Derrida's notion of trace. Both of these notions revealed the mutual constitution of Self and Other (tinku), and it is this realization that has allowed us to reconcile the seemingly intractable differences between the two halves: the one based on openness, the other on selective closure. Merleau-Ponty's chair showed how the Self takes form through relation, and thus cannot be defined in any bounded or categorical sense. Our attributes are expressions of our stance towards the world we inhabit, and, since the world around us is constantly shifting (though in usually recognizable ways), so we adapt accordingly, and form different modes of engagement with different interlocutors. This was clearly illustrated by the excerpts in Part One which illustrated our ability to empathize with those around us, on the basis of highly personal experiences which become more meaningful by being shared. But our inextricable connectedness as manifestations of chair also opens us up to particularly salient phenomena that are not necessarily beneficial to us. This is the potency of the threat of hegemony, which operates as a kind of mind-control: the more salient a discourse becomes, the more it is liable to be internalized, which, in turn, increases its salience and results in further internalization. This is where Derrida's trace comes in, as a discursive level that emanates from chair (unconditional receptivity) but which streamlines the mind by configuring our neural networks along particular trajectories that are tacit and unquestioned. Thus, through our very openness to the world, this openness becomes directed in favour of that which we are taught to expect, and thereby reduced. So internalized does this hegemonic trace become that even the strategy of resistance operates according to the very same principles. We saw this clearly in Part Two, where the construction of an abject Other failed to achieve its purpose as a bulwark against discrimination because it simply perpetuated an identical form of discrimination from the other side. Rather than revealing the underlying flaw in the hegemonic argument (the existence of the 'Andean' and 'Hispanic' as ontologically valid and intrinsically distinct categories), the strategy of resistance served to reinforce it.

The solution, then, to borrow Dauenhauer and Dauenhauer's (1998) phrase, is 'ideological clarification'. By making people aware of the dualistic discourse that they have internalized, one can enable people to openly discuss it, and challenge it. The answer is not to blame or denigrate those who are seen as 'powerful', since this only inverts the dualism, rendering one the mirror image of the other, and causes the Other to become more entrenched. Such strategies are therefore likely to be self-confirming. Nor is it to romanticize as innocent victims those who are seen as 'weak', since this is likely to lead to apathy, counter-exploitation, and even greater insecurity, being also selfconfirming. Rather, it is to acknowledge that everyone has agency and everyone can be willing to adapt to each other in the realization of personal goals, if one's interlocutor also has a consensual predisposition. That is, after all, what negotiation and diplomacy are all about. The change may take decades, but gradually, through the fostering of open discussion in education, media, politics and, above all, in the family, a new discourse of inclusiveness can gain momentum, and greater social and psychological security can ensue. After all, a correlate of our intersubjectivity is that discourse is not just expressive, but also enactive. And we saw this particularly in Part One, where the purpose of the waynus was not just to express experiences, but to unite people as a result. In this Chapter, we have seen how Self and Other derive from a pre-discursive state of interaction within the world (chair). We saw, however, that the kind of interactions we make depend on our predisposition (formed by the trace). In the next chapter, I develop this insight through an in-depth exegesis of songs which I collected in various settlements. These songs reveal how the definition of Self and Other is conducted strategically, in accordance with our most fundamental predisposition of all: the goal of physical perpetuation.



Carnaval in Huasta, Bolognesi. People dance around the tree, and the man who succeeds in splitting the trunk will organize the festival the following year.



Performers of the *Antis*, who sometimes sing in opposition to the *Negrito* (cf. p.166). The *guiadora* is wearing the blue dress.

#### **Chapter Three**

## The Resonance of Reciprocity: Creating Community through Cooperation

The previous chapter explored how our unavoidable receptivity towards the world (expressed in Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair*) resulted in the tacit assumption of shared discourses (expressed in Derrida's notion of the *trace*). The Self, rather than being autonomous, therefore emerges out of the interaction with an Other (however this 'Other' is defined). In this chapter, we proceed in our exegesis of 'identity' by further exploring the implications of this realization. Two central concepts in the chapter are *ayni* (Quechua) and 'reciprocity' (English). Rather than unproblematically equating two terms from very different cultural contexts, I offer a brief sketch of both concepts by means of justifying their linkage. In keeping with the dialogic orientation of this thesis, the aim of this conceptual foregrounding is to find the meaningful points of convergence between the two terms, a convergence that will drive the theoretical conclusions of this chapter.

Ayni has already been foregrounded in Chapter One's review of Quechua concepts, so its definition here serves merely as a reminder. Ayni was 'the basic give-and-take that governs the universal circulation of vitality' (Allen 1997:77), where actions are responded to in proportionate measure, whether positively or negatively. Rather than being an abstract ideal, it is generally considered a basic operating-principle of the universe at large (Mannheim 1991:19), partaken in by all elements, human and non-human alike. In more specific situations, ayni can manifest as the 'exchange of goods and services' (Valderrama and Escalante 1977, in Gelles & Escobar 1996:175), in labour in each other's fields, or in occasions of quarrel where interlocutors trade insults (Allen 1997:77). Similarly, Falk and Fischbacher state that 'Reciprocity means that people reward kind actions and punish unkind ones' (2000:1); likewise, for Dufwenberg and Kirchsteiger, 'Reciprocation entails responding to positive perceived kindness with positive kindness, and to negative perceived kindness with negative kindness' (2004:272). Complementarity can be defined as 'stable and enduring relations of reciprocity'. This is consistent with Gouldner's distinction between reciprocity, which 'connotes that each party has rights and duties' (1960:168), and complementarity, which 'connotes that one's rights are another's obligations, and vice versa' (1960:168); in the former, the relation is potentially (but not necessarily) ad hoc, whereas, in the latter, the relation is stabilized and institutionalized. This progression from reciprocity to complementarity is evidenced in the

songs we are about to examine, which, in many instances, convey the stabilization of relationships through mutual attunement.

It is clear, then, that there are close correspondences between the Quechua term ayni and the English term 'reciprocity', namely in their mode of interaction as based on equal exchange. Thus, when I speak of 'reciprocity' in this chapter, my usage may be understood in terms of ayni. Reciprocity can be viewed as the practical manifestation of 'intersubjectivity', insofar as I defined the latter as 'emotional and cognitive approximation between agents' in Chapter Two. Reciprocity is the mechanism through which our intersubjective potential is realized. Along with the concept of ayni, I deploy other Quechua terms as part of the theoretical dialogue. These are tinku (convergence and emergence of oppositions), yachay (formation of knowledge through engagement), kallpa (vital energy that circulates), kamay (creation through strategic direction of energy), ayllu (community as defined by a common focus) and patsa (the reciprocal animation of all elements of the world). While, for clarity, I have retained the term ayni as a central focus, in reality all of these terms are equally as relevant, with each incorporating the philosophical basis of the other terms. The difference between them is only in how they foreground this foundational orientation. In this way, the Quechua notions function similarly to Derrida's various terms which are less different 'concepts' so much as diverse foregroundings of a single narrative; again, to avoid confusion, this thesis centres on just one of Derrida's terms (the trace).

The focus of this chapter is to reveal how the principle of *ayni* (reciprocity) pervades the songs that I examine, revealing how Self and Other emerge within a process of mutual attunement. This builds on the notions of *chair* (insofar as entities derive from their sharing of the same substance) and *trace* (insofar as, in the songs, this is realized discursively by partaking in the same tacit and unquestioned discourse). This chapter also witnesses the incorporation of our third philosopher, Heidegger, whose notion of *Dasein* allows for a synthesis of *chair* and *trace* in a temporal vision of Being: engagement leads to the formation of a disposition, which informs the manner in which one will enter into future acts of engagement, so that Self is defined not in terms of specific qualities but instead in terms of ever-shifting stances along a historical trajectory. This chapter, then, continues the dialogue between Western and Andean philosophical orientations in the quest for the meaning of 'identity'.

First, in the Pacllón *Carnaval* song, we see the creation of unity organized around the circulation of resources, where the survival of the individual depends on the health of the group as a whole. Second, in the *Masha* songs of Mangas, we witness a form of cooperation that is perpetuated

through competition – and therefore a degree of antagonism – between two halves of the village; the rivalry is a particular manifestation of reciprocity which reinforces the 'difference' that makes the 'unity' productive. Third, in *Wayta Muruy* of Chuyas, we explore how reciprocal relations are formed with human, natural and divine elements in order to perpetuate the chain of production necessary for survival; an abject Other is also depicted to foreground the validity of these practices. Finally, in the *Negrito* song, we witness an attempt to enter into reciprocal relations, and how its converse, discrimination (or dismissal), is construed as self-destructive, suggesting that reciprocity is a natural law even if one wishes to avoid it. One reminder: my aim is not to reify reciprocity as an essentialized 'Andean' trait, rather to show how the depiction of *ayni* (and its related concepts) in specific songs opens up a dialogue with certain Western philosophical orientations, and how this dialogue can lead us towards a conceptual clarification of 'identity'.

#### Carnaval

We begin with a song performed during the February Carnaval (Carnival) festivities in the village of Pacllón, Bolognesi. The cycle of reciprocity is evident in the very organization of the festival: during the Carnival celebrations, men compete to cut down a tree which is placed in the main square; the person who succeeds in cutting it down will organize the festival for the following year. Thus, obligations are exchanged through a cycle of reciprocity that ensures that every able-bodied man has the opportunity to play a part in the continuation of this tradition. The fact that the 'winner' is selected on a test of strength means that the catalyst of this reciprocal process is the vitality of each social member. Thus, the cycle of reciprocity is contiguous with the fertility of the group and its ability to reproduce across the generations. The fact that the tree-cutting is a kind of 'competition' reinforces, rather than negates, the predication of the festival on ayni (reciprocity). It is through competition that each participant is able to actualize his latent potentiality and thereby set in motion the cyclical rotation of the festival from year to year (that ayni often involves a degree of competition – even antagonism – will be more clearly revealed in the discussion of the Masha songs later in this chapter). The words of the song describe this cyclical exchange of duties. As with the majority of festivals, the Carnaval lyrics are sung by a capitana, literally 'female captain' (Spanish), whose role is to voice the central message of the festival. Thus, the individual identity of the capitana is subsumed by her role as a communal 'spokesperson', indicating the importance of these festivals for building a sense of community. The reason that a female intones the songs may be because, in the Andes, women 'symbolize life, fecundity, happiness, they give children for agricultural activity, for marriages, to take care of livestock, to construct houses, to rotate the

earth...Without the woman any activity would be impossible, there would not be procreation, hence the *Pachamama* [Mother Nature] and the *Apus* [mountain spirits] feel more placated when women sing' (Carrasco 1985:237, mt). The lyrics were sung to me by the *capitana* Doña Hilda Osoriano (who also sang the Pacllón *Pallas* song on pp. 232-233). In this chapter, we witness this strong link between agriculture, reciprocity, and survival. My friend from Pacllón, Don Fidel, told me that the song is a *harawi*, a genre which, according to Carrasco, is only performed for festivals, and has strong connotations of fecundity and fertility (Carrasco 1985:237). This extract is true to Carrasco's interpretation. I have included the second half of the song as this is most relevant to our discussion of *ayni*:

Ay ¿imanawparaq kutiratsishqayki Ay ¿aykanawparaq vueltaritsishqayki Kay dinerullaykita gastaranqaykita? Kay licorllaykita gastaranqaykita?

Kanan hunaqlla kanan dialla Vitarte ponchupa diallanchawchi Kanan hunaqlla kanan dialla Merinu ponchupa diallanchawchi

Wayillaykita depositayki Chakrallaykita depositayki Arbollantsikta parlapaanaykipaq Arbollantsikta rimapaanaykipag

Watan añuta kutiratsishunki Watan añuta vueltaritsishunki Kanan hunaqlla kanan díalla Merinu ponchupa diallanchawchi Oh, how will I give back to you
Oh, how much will I return to you
This money of yours which you are spending?
This liquor of yours which you are spending?

Today, this day
On this day of woollen ponchos
Today, this day
On this day of woollen ponchos

You deposit your house You deposit your field To speak with our tree To talk with our tree

Next year he will give back to you Next year he will return to you Today, this day This day of woollen ponchos

The first verse begins with two rhetorical questions: Ay ¿imanawparaq kutiratsishqayki / Ay aykanawparaq vueltaritsishqayki? 'Oh, how will I give back to you? / Oh, how much will I return to you?'. The juxtaposition of imanaw- 'how' with aykanaw- 'how much', and also kuti- 'return' with vuelta- 'return', displays the Andean poetic device of semantic parallelism (cf. pp. 29-30), which we shall see repeatedly throughout this thesis. According to my consultant, these two lines refer to the amount of money which the organizer has spent on the festival. The words rhetorically ask how the money will be repaid, indicating a strong preoccupation with reciprocity. The verb kutiratsishqayki comprises: VR kuti- 'return'; durative –ra (indicating long duration); causative –tsi; second-person object –shqayki. The literal meaning is therefore 'make return to you'. The question-word imanawparaq comprises: ima 'what'; comparative –naw; adverbial –pa; temporal -raq (indicating

action of indefinite conclusion). The temporal -raq and durative -ra both create the sense of a debt that will take a long time to pay off; indeed, it seems probable that the suffix -raq is a grammaticalized combination of durative -ra and topic-marker -q. The Spanish interjection ay (now widespread in AQ), which indicates compassion or regret, raises the emotional tone, whereby the obligation of reciprocity is not just acknowledged but felt at a personal level. The sense of increased preoccupation is conveyed by the progression from simply imanaw 'how' to the more dramatic, because quantified, aykanaw 'how much' in line two, reinforced through the parallelism.

The following two lines complete the sentence: Kay dinerullaykita gastaranqaykita / Kay licorllaykita qastaranqaykita 'This money of yours which you are spending / This liquor of yours which you are spending'. These lines explicitly state what has been sacrificed in order to make the festival a success. Again, the lines are in a parallel relationship, with only dineru 'money' being replaced with licor 'liquor'. The second-person possessive -yki after each noun stresses that the money and alcohol previously belonged to the organizer, and that he has gifted his own resources to the community. The affective -lla serves, like the interjection ay in the previous lines, to emphasize the sense of appreciation, empathy, and ethical obligation. As Bendezú states, 'The meaning of the poem depends to a great extent on the function of certain morphemes with emotional connotations...The morpheme Ila indicates a softened affirmation, not categorical, of someone who...asks [or affirms] with a degree of courtesy' (1993:111, mt). The adjective kay 'this' adds immediacy to the situation, pointing to the empirical evidence of the expenditure. This serves to foreground the generosity of the donor and the corresponding obligation of the recipients. The durative suffix -ra plausibly conveys the long period of time over which the financial sacrifice has been made, recalling the use of the same suffix in line one which related to the return of this expenditure by the future organizer. The noun dineru 'money' and VR qasta- 'spend' are Spanish loans, indicating the extensive language-mixing in this society; vuelta (from volver) is also a Spanish loan, but here it has the specific function of acting as a semantic partner with kuti-.

The second verse locates the festival at a definite moment in time, beginning with *Kanan hunaqlla kanan díalla* 'Today, this day'. The AQ *hunaq* 'day' is paralleled by its Spanish cognate, *día*. Here, the repetition arguably emphasizes the immediacy of the event, located at the present moment. The suffix –*lla* could be interpreted as both affective and limitative (another of its meanings), given that the event *only* occurs on this specific day. The phrase *Vitarte ponchupa diallanchawchi* 'On the day of woollen ponchos' refers to the ponchos, or cloaks, that are traditional for men in the Andes, and which are made from sheep's wool. The foregrounding of the 'sheep' in the near-synonyms

vitarte and merinu (> merino) emphasizes the fact that the ponchos have been created through proper rearing of livestock; thus, if respectfully treated, the sheep will provide the resources for making the garments that are necessary for warmth and, ultimately, survival. The paired possessive -pa and third-person possessive -n define the day as intrinsically of the woollen poncho, indicating the inseparability of agriculture from the event. The 2EVI -chi, indicating uncertainty, hints to us that nothing is guaranteed, recalling the rhetorical question in the first verse, where, despite the strong desire to fulfil the reciprocal obligations, there is still a doubt as to whether this will be possible. The implication is that all the more care must be taken to cultivate proper relations in an uncertain environment.

In the third verse, the song shifts from the reflexive focus on reciprocal obligation to a simple statement of the facts: Wayillaykita depositayki / Chakrallaykita depositayki 'You deposit your house / You deposit your field'. This refers to the fact that the organizer of the festival has temporarily had to give away his house and fields in order to raise funds for the festival. The supreme importance of the home, in providing shelter, and of the field, in providing food, emphasizes the extent of the person's sacrifice for the community, reinforced by the affective -lla. Moreover, without his own shelter and food, the organizer of Carnaval must be able to depend fully on the community if he and his family are to survive. This line therefore stresses the reciprocal obligations of the organizer and the community at large. This is more than just an ethical obligation: if the organizer struggles to survive, then the festival will not be a success. Thus, personal interest and ethical obligations are indissociable from each other. The final two lines, Arbollantsikta parlapaanaykipaq / Arbollantsikta rimapaanaykipaq 'So you may speak to our tree / So you may talk to our tree'. This refers to the chopping down of the tree. There is a clear link with human reproduction, given that only the most vital men have the ability to cut the tree down; these males are likely to produce strong offspring for the continuation of the group. The tree is also a clear phallic symbol which conveys the indissociability of human reproduction and agriculture. As Montoya et al. note, 'it is well known that in Inca times love was linked to agricultural labour and care of livestock. These are the roots of the pugllay or Indian carnival, of the Harawis, Wankas and Pinwas which are still sung today' (1999:28, mt).

In addition, by conveying the relation with the tree in communicative terms, the song sets up an inherently dialogic, reciprocal, state of interaction between the man and the tree. The object of cutting down the tree is not to destroy it; rather, the tree is considered a fully conscious person who merits respect. The act of cutting wood, moreover, is a vital skill which men must learn if they are to

provide their own shelter and make fires for warmth and cooking. Thus, the dialogic relationship with the tree serves as a lesson as to how to interact with elements of the environment so that they will provide the resources which one requires for survival. This is achieved not unilaterally, but by setting up a reciprocal relationship where the natural element can be persuaded to cooperate. In Stobart's words, 'production [of which agriculture is an example] is in essence a communicative process that brings beings or things into relation with one another....From this perspective the notion of "production" becomes a useful way of thinking about identity and processes of relatedness' (2006:7). The affective –*Ila* and IPOSS –*ntsik* serve to appropriate the tree in terms of the group, and to thereby foreground the consolidation of this group through this relation. As Vokral notes, Carnival is 'a temporal space where extant social relations are ordered and confirmed and new relations can be set up' (1996:398, mt).

The progression from the second-person possessive –yki to IPOSS –ntsik mirrors the direction of flow of resources, whereby one person's possessions become reintegrated into the community, reinforcing the fact that ownership is not absolute, but only temporary custodianship of communal resources. This links with the focus on circulation in several other parts of this thesis: sangre 'blood' in Chapter Two (pp. 109-110); yaku 'water' in this chapter (p.161); kallpa 'strength, vitality, energy' throughout. In the words of Mayer, reciprocity is, in the Andes, 'a social relation which links a person with other people, with social groups and with the community, groups with groups, communities with communities, producers with producers and producers with consumers, through the flow of resources and services between the interrelated parts' (1974:37, mt). In the Carnaval song, other members of the community, as well as the tree and other natural elements, enhance individual survival prospects if related to in a suitable manner. It is, moreover, through a process of empathetic engagement that actors can ascertain the potential for productive interchange, so that the perpetuation of Self relies on partial merging with Other, and this accounts for the merging of the ethical and the pragmatic, the affective and the cognitive, that we witness in this song.

While the third verse communicates from the standpoint of the present, providing the context for reciprocal obligations, the fourth verse again looks towards the future:  $Watan\ a\~nuta\ kutiratsishunki$  /  $Watan\ a\~nuta\ vueltaritsishunki$  'Next year he will give back to you / Next year he will return to you'. This couplet reinforces the obligation to return the expenditure to the organizer, and also serves as reassurance that he will not be let down. The phrase  $watan\ a\~nu$  'next year' (followed by object-marker -ta) is linguistically noteworthy. In AQ, wata means 'year', with the -n (third-person possessive or 3PRES) added to denote 'next year'. Thus, no other modifier is needed to indicate

'next year' as opposed to simply 'year'. In this phrase, however, watan modifies añu. The most likely explanation is that the phrase is modelled on the Spanish próximo año, whereby año 'year' is modified by próximo 'next'. This is congruent with the high degree of language-mixing in the area. The song finishes with a repetition of Kanan hunaqlla kanan dialla / Merinu ponchupa diallanchawchi 'Today, this day / This day of woollen ponchos', this time referring to the same day next year. Here, the certainty of reciprocity is reinforced by the cyclical nature of time, whereby reciprocal relations 'are maintained latently and can be activated through the initiation of new cycles of exchange' (Mayer 1974:48, mt). Resources do not accumulate in the hands of a few individuals, rather circulate throughout the community. Moreover, the fact that the festival is organized only by the most fit and healthy in the community (he who is able to chop down the tree) means that the whole ethos of the festival is the manifestation of vital energy; the main actors are themselves evidence of the energy that results from proper social relations, grounded in reciprocity. For, without reciprocity, there would be impoverishment and therefore fewer men who could compete. In addition, the strongest men are also, as a rule, most likely to survive the temporary disadvantages of giving away their home and land.

Thus, this song expresses the building and maintenance of community through reciprocity: through the constant interchange of sacrifice and repayment of this sacrifice, people become wedded in bonds of obligation and bonds of affect which are the network that provides support for each individual. As Condori and Condori note regarding Andean festivals in general, 'The social role of the festival allows ties of solidarity to operate, family ties are renewed, relatives who live in different places meet to spend time together and reach agreements of an economic or social nature, the festival is shared not only with relatives, but with the whole community, generating communal togetherness based on reciprocity' (2009:52, mt). In the Pacllón Carnival song, such reciprocity, and the ensuing communality, is grounded on the pragmatic will to survive – which, as indicated by the affective morphemes, is not incompatible with, rather reinforced by, emotional bonding. This pragmatic basis of Andean ethics is noted by Harris: 'Mutual aid is...based on institutions perceived by contemporary members to be of long-term benefit, reproducing ties of interdependence, and in many cases representing a cost-effective way of distributing labor to land' (1995:369). The intertwining of the ethical and pragmatic again anticipates my discussion of Heidegger, whereby our stance towards entities is informed by what these entities can afford us and how best to harness their beneficial potential.

The *Carnaval* song anticipates several of the themes that will be important in this chapter. At the core of the song is the Quechua concept of *ayni*, which denotes balanced reciprocal relations

between actors. This is evident in the fact that the central focus of the verses is the transfer of obligations and resources from one person to another. One of the many linguistic devices that conveys this theme is the progression from the second-person possessive —yki ('yours') to IPOSS — ntsik ('ours'), which mirrors the direction of flow of resources from 'individual' back to 'community'. That the ultimate goal of this strategy is self-perpetuation (survival) is clear in the references to agriculture and physical strength, particularly in the fact that future responsibility for the festival is determined by men's ability to cut down the tree. Another Quechua concept that this song recalls is kallpa, the energy that moves between all elements of the world and that dissipates if its circulation is halted. The circulation of resources in this song can thus be interpreted as the movement of kallpa which endows each being with the energy needed for survival.

This portrayal of reciprocity dialogues with Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair*, the universal and dynamic substance out of which individual forms evolve, forms which, as stressed by the verses of *Carnaval*, are not bounded and discrete but inherently dependent on the world around them. Our reality as manifestations of *chair* both determines the necessity of interdependence, and provides the means of realizing this interdependence in diverse ways. The kind of interaction that develops is not pre-given from the outset, but, in the case of conscious beings, is based on one's fundamental motivation which, in the case of *Carnaval*, the verses reveal to be self-perpetuation. The attainment of this goal depends on strategic dialogue with relevant interlocutors. In the *Carnaval* verses, the form of engagement that this dialogue takes is *ayni*, reciprocity on egalitarian terms.

This dialogue can be understood in terms of Derrida's *trace*, whereby meaning is negotiated with the tacit understanding of operating on the same terms, and with the same assumptions. While the *trace* is not itself motivated, motivation (and ensuing strategy) can be interpreted as an example of the unquestioned assumptions that underlie any discourse, as the formation of a discursive predisposition shared by interlocutors, and thus an instance of the *trace* in action. Just as the *trace* is never pre-given but constantly evolving, so, in *Carnaval*, the nature of the dialogue has to be worked out between interlocutors, so that the best strategy can be found. This mutual attunement of meaning is foregrounded in the conversation with the tree, whereby the potentiality of the tree – as an entity that can be conducive to survival – can only be realized by getting to know the tree's predisposition, through communicative reciprocity.

This recalls the Quechua concepts of *yachay* (whereby knowledge is achieved not in a subject/object form, rather in the act of dialogue, through mutual openness to the Other) and *pacha* (whereby all

elements of the environment – human and non-human – engage in constant communication with each other). In this worldview, it makes no sense to separate the emotional and cognitive dimensions of existence, for the affective relation enhances, rather than challenges, the underlying strategy of harnessing the Other's beneficial potential. Likewise, the ethical is indissociable from the pragmatic. In the verses, this is evidenced by the presence of the affective morphemes *ay* (indexing preoccupation) and –*lla* (the diminutive suffix that conveys emotional approximation).

The dialogic emergence of Self and Other through the strategic negotiation of mutual benefit itself dialogues with Heidegger's philosophy as introduced in Chapter One. Heidegger noted how our first encounter with entities is through a non-subject/object mode of engagement on the basis of the relevance of these entities to our disposition at that time. Only when we engage further do the categories of Self and Other emerge, as the strategic engagement with that Other reveals both the disposition of the Other and, reflexively, the disposition of the Self. This is the transition from engagement as relevance (*zuhanden* 'ready-to-hand') to engagement as *vorhanden* ('present-at-hand'), ascertaining whether the Other really concords with one's initial impression, and, on the basis of this understanding (*yachay*), finding suitable modes of interaction. In this interactive process, Self and Other emerge distinctly from what they were before, informing the temporal nature of being that lies at the core of *Dasein* (existence). This dialogues with the Quechua concept of *kamay*, which, as we saw in Chapter One, conveys the actualization of *kallpa* in the process of ontogenesis. In the next section, where the *Masha* songs are presented, we shall see more clearly how Self and Other emerge through a cathartic process of engagement, where the creation of difference is a necessary step for the strategic enactment of unity.

# Masha

The festival of *Masha* was realized annually in mid-November in the town of Mangas, Bolognesi, until about three years prior to my visit. When I was there, there were rumours that *Masha* may recommence in the future. Thus, I am cautious to classify the festival as already 'extinct', which explains my use of the present tense. The festival lasts for two weeks, and centres on the construction of the church roof which is changed every year by replacing the straw. While *techa casa* 'roof-building' festivals used to be widespread across Bolognesi, the *Masha* of Mangas seems to be the only festival of its kind in recent memory. The term *masha* literally means 'son in law', but is more loosely used in Bolognesi to denote any relation who helps in the construction of a house; the literal meaning of the word, however, indicates how this reciprocal practice serves to visibly unite

otherwise distinct families. Much of the festival in Mangas concerns the traditional opposition and complementarity between the two halves of the town, Kotos and Allawkay. Burga, who conducted historical and ethnographic fieldwork in Mangas, notes how the division is not necessarily based on physical location, but largely construed through kin relations (1998:32). The two districts compete to construct the roof more quickly than their counterpart and engage in a mock bullfight at the end, but they also exchange goods in an expression of solidarity. This interplay of complementarity and opposition, both forms of reciprocity, is reflected in the songs. The songs are again performed by a *capitana*, termed *awayaq* for this festival, which perhaps derives from the verb *away* 'to weave' (given that weaving is a major female occupation in the Andes). Each year there would be two *awayaqs*, each representing one of the two districts. The texts detailed below were sung by Doña Clotilde Rojas Varillas, who was in her early seventies at the time. Doña Clotilde did not define each song in terms of a particular genre, or even give a title. Instead, she explained the location of each song in relation to the overall festival. Rather than attempt to classify the songs, then, I have followed an emic lead and deployed Doña Clotilde's temporal categorization as a title.

## Start of the Festival

Llapan yarpanqaykitachi Tsaylla parlakuykallarqayki parlakuykarqayki Tsayllata tantiar tantiallarqayki Mahallaywan wallqillaywan

'Ama tsaapis, mana tsaapis' Nikyayllapachi pasarillaychi Común nunallantsik rimashllapis Pachak nunallantsik parlashllapis

Shuyakurllaashun Huk hankaq barriumi shuyakallaamantsik Apurayllapa papaakuna, Yusulpay varallantsikmi

Maynachi tsaynachi ashiykaamantsik, watukaykaamantsik Yarpanqaykita tantyanqaykita Kay carguykita

Kay fiestata rurakurqayki Ishkay mahallayki parlakurqaychi rimakurqaychi, Nikyayllapachi parlakuykallarqayki All of your worrying
You only spoke of that, spoke of it
You only thought of that, thought of it
With your spouse, with your companion

You spend your time thinking 'Will it come to pass, will it not come to pass?' While everyone is gossiping While a hundred people are whispering

We shall wait
The other, mountain, district is waiting for us
Make haste, fathers,
Mayor

Everywhere they are looking for us, they are visiting us
For what you are preoccupied about, thinking about
This responsibility of yours

You made this festival Speaking, talking as a couple, Talking, speaking The first verse describes the preoccupation of the *mayordomo*, the festival's organizer: *Llapan yarpanqaykitachi* 'All of your worrying'. The remaining lines state that only this, *tsaylla*, has been discussed between the husband and wife, *mahallaywan wallqillaywan* 'With your spouse, with your companion'. The mentioning of *maha* 'partner' and *wallqi* 'companion' introduces the theme of binary complementarity between the sexes, which will be a common theme throughout this chapter (Wissler similarly shows how *yanantin*, 'complementary opposition' in Southern Quechua, plays itself out in musical song-structure with the juxtaposition of male and female voices, 2009:89-102). Here, the unity between husband and wife results in the creation of the festival, which would have been impossible without this synthesis. In the song, the suffixes *–lla* (diminutive and affective) and *– y* (semi-possessive and affective) both emphasize the affective nature of this relationship.

The second verse begins with the clause 'Ama tsaapis, mana tsaapis' / Nikyayllapachi pasarillaychi 'You spend your time thinking / "Will it come to pass, will it not come to pass?"'. This follows the typical head-final word-order of AQ, whereby what is quoted precedes the verb which marks the quoted speech (hence my English translation is the inverse of the AQ). This sentence reinforces the contingency of life, whereby nothing is guaranteed. Beatriz Arcayo, a schoolteacher from Mangas in her late thirties with whom I discussed the text, explained the meaning thus: if everyone makes an effort, the festival should be a success, whereas if they do not, it will not be. Therefore, the success of the festival depends on the extent to which people are willing to join together and cooperate. The final two lines nonetheless convey a strong sense of community already: Común nunallantsik rimashllapis / Pachak nunallantsik parlashllapis 'While everyone is gossiping / While a hundred people are whispering'. The term nuna, or runa, as Skar explains, 'refers to person in a general sense, conveying in a broad sweep the condition of humanity while at the same time having the potential descriptively to qualify the many sub-categories of the particular reference group' (1994:200), meaning also 'member of one's particular community'. Thus, the word here indicates an undifferentiated mass of people who form a single community, also conveyed by común 'common' and pachak 'hundred'. The affective -lla and IPOSS -ntsik combine to stress the unity of the group on bonds of affect, and the emphasis on speech illustrates a communicative, cooperative, basis to the unity, enhanced by the semantic parallelism of the two lines.

The third verse introduces the notion of an external community: *Shuyakurllaashun / Huk hankaq barriumi shuyakallaamantsik* 'We shall wait / The other, mountain, district is waiting for us'. This refers to the moiety (bipartite) division of Mangas into two halves, the 'lowland' district of Kotos and the 'mountain' district of Allawka, a pattern that is common throughout the Andes (Bourque

1994:230; Bouysse-Cassagne 1986:202-203; Fock 1981:316-317; Platt 1986:230-31; Sallnow 1987:37; Urton 1981:40-42; Zuidema 1964:2-10). The two lines reveal that the unity depicted in the previous verse refers only to Kotos, since the huk 'other' district referred to is hankaq 'of the mountains', and hence Allawkay. Urton, citing Zuidema (1964:2-10) notes how, as in Mangas, 'The two halves or moieties of Inca Cuzco were called hanan ("upper") and hurin ("lower")' (1981:42). According to Beatriz, the populations of the two halves meet in the centre of the village during the festival and, in the past, young men and women would choose their husbands and wives. The key term here for our purposes is huk 'other'. This term conveys the fact that the two halves of the village are separate. However, this does not imply an unbreachable divide in the way that the word wakin, also 'other', does (p.208). The term huk is also the number 'one', which serves to stress the wholeness of an entity rather than its marginality; a more appropriate translation might therefore be 'the other', 'another' or 'one more'. Thus, the term huk, whilst stressing difference, conveys the possibility of the two entities becoming linked in meaningful ways. The moiety division of towns, the semantic parallelism, and the emphasis of male/female unity, are all examples of what, in SQ, is referred to as yanantin or iskaynintin: 'The terms yanantin and iskaynintin represent what we could call imperative forces that "urge" the linkage of things considered to have a natural, complementary relationship to each other' (Urton 1997:78).

The complementarity between Kotos and Allawkay is reflected in the two uses of the first person inclusive plural in combination with the VR *shuya-* 'wait'. The word *shuyakurllaashun* contains IFUT —*shun* 'We (incl.) shall wait'; *shuyakallaamantsik* contains the first-person object-marker —*ma* and IPRES —*ntsik* which combine to make IOBJ 'waits for us'. Thus, each half waits for the other half. The opposition between the two districts, then, is not just what allows each half to become united *internally*, but is *also* what allows for them to become united *externally*, i.e. with each other. It is the consolidation of each half that allows for each half, in turn, to mirror the other, and to approximate itself towards the other half. The final two lines, *Apurayllapa papaakuna / Yusulpay varallantsikmi* 'Make haste, our fathers, / Our mayor', refers to the fact that each of the two districts has its own *Yusulpay vara* or *alcalde* 'mayor' for the festival (akin to the *mayordomo* in the *Wayta Muruy* and *Carnaval*), whose role is to oversee the festival and provide food and drink to the community. The *alcalde* of Kotos is urged, along with the other authorities, to make haste so that they may join their counterparts from Allawkay. The fact that there is no single organizer of the festival, rather the responsibilities are divided equally between the two districts, again illustrates the complementarity that is generated through opposition.

The fourth verse is addressed to the organizers: *Maynachi tsaynachi ashiykaamantsik, watukaykaamantsik / Yarpanqaykita tantyanqaykita / Kay carguykita* 'Everywhere they are looking for us, they are visiting us / For what you are preoccupied about, thinking about / This responsibility of yours'. Here, the use of the first person inclusive plural again changes. The phrase *Maynachi tsaynachi* 'everywhere' consists of: *may* 'where'; *tsay* 'there'; temporal –*na* 'already'; 2EVI –*chi*. This phrase serves to show, then, that people are coming from all directions, looking for (*ashiy*) and visiting (*watukay*) the group. The group is defined here by the IOBJ construction of *ma...ntsik*. The boundaries of the group, precisely who is included and who is not, are more difficult to ascertain here (does it just refer to the speaker and the authorities, or to Kotos, or to the whole village?), but it is clear that the group is no longer defined by its opposition to Allawkay, for otherwise people would be coming from a specific direction rather than *Maynachi tsaynachi* 'everywhere'. The fact that the original location of the visitors is ill-defined is highlighted by the 2EVI –*chi*, which denotes doubt and uncertainty. The temporal suffix –*yka* indicates continuous action, serving to highlight both the act of travelling a long way and the number of people who are continuously arriving.

The last two lines make it clear that people are arriving for the purpose of the festival: *Yarpanqaykita tantyanqaykita* 'For what you are preoccupied about, thinking about' (VR *yarpa-*'consider, worry about'; nominal *-nqa*; second-person possessive *-yki*; object-marker *-ta*; VR *tantya-* 'deal with'). The responsibility of the organizers for making the festival a success is emphasized in the final line: *Kay carguykita* '(For) this responsibility of yours', referring to the authorities' role in bringing the festival to fruition. This links with the first line of the second verse, where it is stressed that the festival's success is far from guaranteed, and with Beatriz's comment that its success depends on the degree to which people are willing to participate. Therefore, the creation of a wider 'group', where *-ntsik* would include everyone who has arrived and not just those located in Kotos, depends on the actions of the authorities, for it is the festival which brings people together. The adjective *kay* 'this' emphasizes the present location as the centre to which people are gravitating, and also the immediacy of the authorities' responsibility. This is stressed in the final verse: *Kay fiestata rurakurqayki* 'You made this festival'. It is clear, then, who is to be acclaimed if the festival is a success, and who is to be blamed if it is not!

That this was not a solitary affair, however, is emphasized in the rest of the verse: *Ishkay mahallayki parlakurqaychi rimakurqaychi / Nikyayllapachi parlakuykallarqayki* 'Speaking, talking as a couple / Talking, speaking'. Again, the stress is on relationship, this time between husband and wife (linking with the first verse), illustrated by the number *ishkay* 'two', followed by *mahallayki*, comprising:

maha 'partner'; affective —lla; second-person possessive —yki. Carranza Romero defines maha as 'companion, partner, counterpart' (2003:121); the focus, then, is on two equal halves. This defines the relationship both between man and wife, and also between Kotos and Allawkay. Incorporated into maha, we have the concept of two huk, two complementary elements which combine to form the single unit. And it is this process of combination of complementary elements that leads to productivity and creativity, manifesting, in this case, in the festival. The dialogical base of this cooperation is indicated by three VRs concerning speech: parla- 'speak, talk'; rima 'speak, talk'; nikya- 'say, tell'. Thus, complementary elements unite in a creative process of production. In the song, this is evidenced between husband and wife, between the pachak nuna 'hundred people', and (as we see shortly) between the two halves of the village, where a correctly targeted mutual engagement (one predicated on complementary reciprocity) results in productive innovation, through the harnessing of everyone's potential.

As in the *Carnaval* song, the above verses foreground binary complementarity as a strategy of achieving shared goals. This is particularly salient in the context of gender, with the terms *maha* 'partner' and *wallqi* 'companion'. Just like the tree and its interlocutor in *Carnaval*, the husband and wife are *zuhanden* (relevant) to each other in strategic ways, insofar as their unity results in the creation of the festival. However, this unity is not pre-given, since the spouses have to enter into communicative mode in order to ascertain precisely how their potentialities can best be synchronized (as shown by the verbal roots *parla*- 'speak/talk', *rima*- 'speak/talk' and *nikya*- 'say'); this is the process of going from perception as *zuhanden* (relevant) to *vorhanden* (accurate knowledge of the specific potentialities of Self and Other which creates the framework for action), thereby perpetuating the dialogic *trace* that emanates from sharing the same universal substance as *chair*.

The same process is evident in the formation of the two halves of the village, whereby people arrive initially as an unorganized mass of individuals (común nunallantsik 'our common people' and pachak nunallantsik 'our hundred people', arriving maynachi tsaynachi 'everywhere') whose potential for strategic interaction is set in motion by dialogue (rimashllapis...parlashllapis 'talking...speaking'). The result of this interaction is the emergence of opposite groups who mirror each other, thereby foregrounding their difference as a way of negotiating similarity. Thus, as in Heidegger's Dasein, a pre-object/subject form of engagement results in the emergence of Self and Other (in-group and out-group) through the realization of potential in complementarity. Each half is maintained in

existence by virtue of mutual dialogue along the same discursive *trace*, the tacit and unquestioned basis of engagement that, as we shall see in the next song, has survival as its focus.

#### Arrival of the Grandfather and Black Man

This song describes the arrival of the *awelitu* 'grandfather' and *rukyana* 'black man' who symbolize Allawkay and Kotos, respectively, and are enacted by a member of the corresponding district. The *awelitu* descends from a location above Allawkay, while the *rukyana* ascends from a place below Kotos.

Hirkapita aywallaamun Awelituntsik kay costumbrellantsikta Cada watallan kay cargullantsikman Kay fiestallantsikman

Kanan hunaqlla aywaykaamun Rukyanashllantsikqa Qeshpikaamun, Huacho markapita Yunka markapita Pescado cargallachi Vino cargallachi

Aywallaamun Kay costumbrillantsikchi Kay nillapachi Yarpay shonqullachi aywakyaamun Rukyanashllantsikga From the hills is coming
Our grandfather, to this custom of ours
Every year, to this responsibility of ours
To this festival of ours

Today is coming
Our black man
He is appearing, from the town of Huacho
From the coast
Carrying fish
Carrying wine

He is coming
To this custom of ours
Saying so
He of mindful heart is coming
Our black man

The first verse begins with a statement of the *awelitu's* arrival: *Hirkapita aywallaamun / Awelituntsik kay costumbrellantsikta* 'From the hills is coming / Our grandfather, to this custom of ours', before describing the cyclical nature of the event: *Cada watallan kay cargullantsikman / Kay fiestallantsikman* 'Every year, to this responsibility of ours / To this festival of ours'. Again there is abundant use of the IPOSS *–ntsik*. But, this time, it is also applied to the *cargu* 'responsibility', which, in the previous song, was *cargullayki* 'your responsibility' (with second-person possessive – yki). Thus, from the implication that the festival is entirely the organizers' responsibility, there is a progression to stating that it is *everyone's* responsibility. This reflects the fact that, in the previous song, people were in the process of arriving, whereas now, almost everyone has arrived. Therefore, a single community has been formed whereas, before, it was still in the process of becoming consolidated. The use of the possessives here recalls a similar deployment in the *Carnaval* song, which indexed the circulation of resources among members of the community.

This song also dialogues with Carnaval in that both emphasize the cyclical nature of the festival, in this case with the phrase cada watallan 'every year'. This stresses that cargullantsik 'our responsibility' is built on a series of acts of relational approximation; thus, the solidarity that emerges as people arrive at the festival does not emerge from a vacuum, though neither it is automatically produced if people are unwilling to engage. As Stobart states, 'The annual repetition of the various musical genres, each connected to and creating a particular context, also instils a sense of history and serves as an important mode through which cultural knowledge and sensibilities are both grasped and transmitted' (2006:89). This actualization of latent potential dialogues with Heidegger's notion of Dasein, whereby we move forwards in the world through harnessing potentialities that exist in our environment, when these potentialities are suited to our own predisposition at any given moment. Likewise, the cycle of reciprocity allows for a progressively deeper knowledge of the Other (Heidegger's transition from zuhanden to vorhanden). The use of IPOSS -ntsik in costumbrellantsik 'our custom' and fiestallantsik 'our festival' conveys not just that the festival is 'of the group', but also that the group derives 'from the festival', given that the nature of the festival is that of people joining together (the two halves of Mangas, as well as people from various parts of the country). It is, moreover, already obvious that this is a festival of people in Mangas – rather than elsewhere; thus, the addition of –ntsik is not strictly necessary. This suggests that, as in Chapter Two (cf. pp. 74, 99), this suffix serves a primarily phatic purpose of enacting unity through expressing it.

The second verse describes the arrival of the *rukyana* 'black man' *yunka markapita* 'from the coast', or more specifically *Huacho markapita* 'from the town of Huacho'. This exists in fascinating contrast to that of the *awelitu* in the first verse, who descends from the mountains. The *rukyana* is described as *Pescado cargallachi* / *Vino cargallachi* 'Carrying fish / Carrying wine'. The *awelitu* arrives with straw, *machka* (flour) and *sango* (*machka* with water and fat added), whereas the *rukyana* arrives with fish, wine or *chicha* (a mildly alcoholic beverage made from fermented maize). Thus, the theme of reciprocity is played out between the two halves of the village, who meet and exchange goods. The reciprocity, however, is not limited to the confines of the village itself. Rather, Mangas becomes a microcosm of the relations that, for millennia, have linked the highlands with the coast: the *rukyana* is first described as coming from Huacho, a city on the coast, and later as from the *yunka*, a general term for the coastal regions. The *awelitu* was described as coming *hirkapita* 'from the hills'. The products carried by the *rukyana* and *awelitu* are also typical of their respective regions. This communal depiction of the exchange of products between coast and mountains supports Núnez's

theory that, from 8000 BCE, there was significant trade between coastal and mountain populations, with the former travelling to the Andes in search of camelids (Ilamas, alpacas and vicuñas) and the latter travelling to the coast in search of the abundant maritime harvests (Núñez 1962, in Kolata 1993:56-57). Somewhere around the fourth millennium BCE, domestication of camelids made food-production more reliable, which resulted in more organized interaction between the two ecosystems, with caravans of camelids following well-defined routes between coast and mountains, along a network of villages that followed the streams flowing down from the Andes (1993:57). This was probably realized by establishing kin relations between traders, since only this kind of arrangement could assure that, on arrival, they would be given food and shelter as well as guaranteed trade (1993:57).

Another, compatible, theory may also shed light on the origin of the practice depicted in *Masha*. Duviols postulates that the division of many Andean townships into two halves resulted from tensions created by the incursion of highland nomadic herding groups (Llacuaces) into the territory of valley-dwelling sedentary agriculturalists (Waris) (1973:176). The solution was to divide the land clearly into two halves, with each half managed by one group: the higher land would be controlled by the herders, with the lower land comprising the domain of the agriculturalists (1973:178). The system was maintained by each group having rights of access to the commodities produced by the other group. In Kolata's words, 'Conflict was prevented by creating a dynamic, although potentially unstable, social organization with community authority invested equally in the two moiety leaders' (1993:102).

The theories of both Núñez and Duviols dialogue closely with what we observe in the words of the *Masha* songs. Núñez's account is consistent with the emphasis on trade between coast and mountain in the song: the *rukyana* comes from the coast and the *awelitu* comes from the mountains, and both bring products from the respective areas. The fact that the *awelitu* and *rukyana* are counterparts of each other strongly resembles Núñez' theory of kin-like relations between traders. The meeting between Kotos and Allawkay, and the exchange of products typical of different ecosystems, can be explained in terms of the complementarity between higher and lower lands as described by Duviols (Burga has analysed the division in Mangas in a similar way (1998:40)). Thus, whereas Núñez's theory offers a plausible explanation for the division between coast and mountain, Duviols offers an interesting perspective on the division of the village into two halves. Barth also notes how ethnicity can be maintained through ecological interdependence, whereby different groups 'may provide important goods and services for each other, i.e. occupy reciprocal

and therefore different niches but in close interdependence' (1969:19). In the theories of both Núnez and Duviols, the stress is on unity between distinct elements with the fundamental motive of survival. As Urton states for elsewhere in the Andes, 'it is the dialectical relationship between communalism and differentiation which, in the first place, motivates work by everyone in the community on certain tasks but which at the same time insists that such tasks should be performed by people working in their different *ayllu* [community] groupings' (1981:231). Likewise, Baumann describes the tendency, in Andean patterns of thought, to view everything as 'related to everything else in a mesh of hierarchically ordered relationships of exchange between complementary opposite pairs' (1996:22).

The unity that results from this ecologically motivated process of approximation and differentiation is expressed by the IPOSS -ntsik, which is deployed both for the awelitu 'grandfather' and for the rukyana 'black man'. Whereas this suffix denoted only Kotos affiliation in the first song, here it denotes affiliation to both districts which have now come together as a single unit. Thus, a single community is both described and enacted through the shifting denotations of the same possessive suffix. The 2EVI suffix -chi conveys the sense of expectation that the rukyana will be bringing the commodities mentioned. The lack of certainty conveyed by this suffix reminds the listeners that the world is capricious and that even the most seemingly predictable of circumstances cannot be guaranteed - hence the importance of being part of a strong and supportive community. The directional -mu, conveying movement towards the speaker, exemplifies the process of forming unity through increasing approximation. We witness this suffix in aywaykaamun 'is coming' and qeshpikaamun 'is appearing to us'. The locus of the opposition, the point of origin that gives the movement its relational meaning, is the suffix -pita 'from', in the two cases of markapita 'from the town/country/land of'. The fact that this approximation is latent but not always actual is emphasized by the phrase kanan hunaqlla 'today', where, as in the Carnaval song, the suffix -lla could be interpreted as both affective and limitative ('only today').

The third verse begins by emphasizing, once again, the theme of relational approximation, in the word *aywallaamun* 'is arriving'. The coming together of the group by virtue of custom, and the existence of the custom by virtue of coming together, is reinforced in *kay costumbrillantsikchi* 'this custom of ours' (where the *-ntsik* again both depicts and enacts unity). The line *kay nillapachi* 'saying this', from VR *-ni* 'say' could refer to the speech of the *rukyana* who states that he is coming, or to that of the villagers who comment on his arrival. The threefold repetition of 2EVI *-chi* again conveys an element of uncertainty, that he is expected to be arriving but it is not known for sure. I

have translated the phrase *yarpay shonqullachi* as 'mindful heart', the 'heart' being the principal denotation of *shonqu*. However, the seventeenth century chronicler Holguín suggests a much wider interpretation: 'The heart and entrails, the stomach and consciousness, judgement and reason, memory, the core of wood, wilfulness and understanding' (Holguín 1608, in Husson 1985:111, mt). Mannheim (1986:51, ft 14) suggests that 'essence' might be a better translation. For Montes, *chuyma*, the cognate of *shonqu* in Aymara (another major Andean language), denotes 'heart and everything that pertains to the inner state of the soul, emotion, sensibility, effort, judgement, understanding, knowledge, intelligence, memory, wisdom, disposition and attitude' (Montes 1986:165, paraphrased in Condori & Condori 2009:40, mt). *Shonqu*, then, combines the emotional and the rational, incorporating the pragmatic and affective nature of community whose basis is physical and psychological security.

The conflation of these two qualities is exemplified by the verb/adjective yarpay 'to remember, mindful'. The term yarpay reflects a sense of emotional engagement as well as moral responsibility, intertwined in the act of 'remembering'. Howard notes that 'Remembering in the Andes (yarpariy in Quechua I; yuyariy in Quechua II) is a culturally vital activity involving not only the telling of stories but also the performance of rituals and participation in festivals. Forgetting (qunqay), by contrast, is the way that neglect of social and ritual obligations is described, and it is punishable in the form of sickness, crop failure, even death' (2002a:29-30). Thus, the phrase yarpay shonqullachi communicates the sense that the rukyana both acknowledges and feels his responsibility to, and integration with, the community. This mindfulness reflects the age-old cooperation between the two halves, who base their complementarity on reciprocal engagement, with the common aim of survival. This again recalls Howard: the 'cultural function of remembering in Andean ways of thinking is a regenerative one, whereby the past provides the symbolic resources for making sense of the present and projecting toward the future, in a way that allows at once for continuity and change' (2002a:46). But the dubitative -chi reminds us that this is not guaranteed and therefore requires care and willingness for it to be maintained. The suffix -lla confirms the sense of emotional engagement.

### Arrival of People from Lima

Kayllaqa nunalla 'Mamallayki taytallayki Rikyapaymushaq rirqapaymushaq' Nikyayllapashi aywaykaamun Capital markallapita Yarqarallaamunaq Vinollan cargashqalla Licornin apashqallapashi Aywaykyaamun This person
Whilst saying
"I will go and see
Your mother, your father"
Is coming out
From the capital
Carrying his wine
Transporting his liquor
He is coming here

This verse is from a song concerning the arrival of the organizers' relatives. The first line defines the new arrival as kayllaqa nunalla 'this man'. The word nuna 'man, person' is deployed mainly for people from one's community (cf. p.135); thus, its use here conveys willingness to reincorporate this person into the group, reinforced through the two affective -lla suffixes. The adjective kay 'this', normally used only for immediate objects/people, suggests a desire to welcome this person who is still on his way: aywaykyaamun 'is coming' (last line). The lines Mamallayki taytallayki / Rikyapaymushaq rirqapaymushaq 'I will go and see / Your mother, your father' are quoted speech, indicated by the following word nikyayllapashi 'whilst saying'. This sentence observes AQ head-final word-order whereby quoted speech precedes the verb that indexes it (here, VR nikya- 'say'). The same word-order is evident in the 'object followed by verb' construction, where mamallayki taytallayki 'your mother, father' precedes the parallel phrases rikyapaymushaq rirqapaymushaq 'I will go and see'. My translations are in the inverse line-order given the opposite order in English. The fact that the speech of the new arrival can be directly quoted confirms his increasing approximation, and his entering into the sphere of communication and thereby reciprocity which both index and facilitate his reincorporation into the community. We do not know whom the traveller is addressing, but the important point is that he is anticipating renewing a relation with people in Mangas. Within the quoted speech, the directional -mu also indicates a metaphorical, emotional, approximation towards the parents.

The word *nikyayllapashi* contains the 3EVI *-shi*, which indicates third-hand 'knowledge'. There is therefore still a degree of doubt about whether the quoted speech is accurate, but the very fact that someone has reported it suggests that a relation has already been formed. The traveller is described as *Capital markallapita / Yarqarallaamunaq* 'From the Capital / He left'. This evokes the widespread back-and-forth migration between Andean towns and coastal cities for better economic opportunities. Festivals provide migrants with the opportunity to maintain their ties with the community and to see relatives again (cf. quote 20, Chapter Two, p.87). The suffix *-naq*, in

yarqarallaamunaq 'left for here', indicates action completed in the past. This suffix is generally used for far-off, unwitnessed events, such as occur in myths or legends. Here, this suffix seems to emphasize the (cultural as well as physical) remoteness of Lima. The suffix also conveys the sense that the individual is following the practice of a long tradition, with its origins in the remote past – as is the case, given the millennia of trade between coast and mountains. Here, reciprocity is emphasized through the parallel lines *Vinollan cargashqalla / Licornin apashqallapashi* 'Carrying his wine / Transporting his liquor'. In the Andes, migrants who return temporarily to their community are expected to bring gifts that are impossible to find in the villages. This is a way of reinforcing communal ties. Therefore, this song reaffirms the age-old tradition of reciprocity between mountain and coast in terms of the modern context of urban migration, where reciprocity – whether communicative, emotional or material – is the vehicle of reintegration.

These two songs perpetuate the same theme of complementarity that was set out in the first song of *Masha*. The emergence of difference through strategic negotiation attains its practical goal in the exchange of goods between the two groups. This is manifest at various contexts: upper versus lower halves of Mangas; mountain versus coast; rural versus urban. In each context, difference is foregrounded (enacted) from both sides, in a process of mutual attunement oriented towards practical ends. Thus we see how the same discursive *trace* operates at many different levels, so that the *trace* (one's dialogic projection) is more fundamental than the entities that are thereby defined. We saw the same phenomenon in Chapter Two (Part Two), where another discourse (that of irreconcilability with the 'outside') operated at local, Andean and national levels. It should be emphasized here that the *trace* cannot be equated with 'motivation'; rather, the *trace* informs one's stance towards the world, and 'motivation' is one mode of experiencing (and expressing) this stance. What the *trace* conveys is that dialogue between interlocutors is necessarily conducted on the same terms (with the same assumptions), and that the terms are constantly renegotiated or reconfirmed as the dialogue progresses.

This constant renegotiation along the lines of mutual relevance again dialogues with Heidegger's distinction between *zuhanden* ('ready-to-hand') and *vorhanden* ('present-at-hand'), whereby awareness of the relevance of the Other leads to greater engagement with that Other and a consequently more accurate understanding of the possibilities for mutual interaction. This, in turn, leads to a transformation of Self and Other in the continuous dialogic process, so that the *vorhanden* (latent potential) is constantly changing and thereby engenders novel ways of being *zuhanden* (relevant) to the interlocutor (who must change in turn). This temporality that is at the centre of

Dasein is evidenced in the above songs, particularly in the cyclical nature of the festival (cada watallan 'every year'), where, on each occasion, latent potentiality is harnessed through a reenactment of complementarity that assumes novel forms in novel contexts (for example, the operation of the same discursive trace in the new urban/rural dichotomy). This cycle of strategic complementarity was also evidenced in the phrase yarpay shonqullachi 'mindful heart', whereby the black man continually re-affirms his ever-deepening attunement with his alter, the awelitu. The acknowledgement, however, that nothing is completely knowable (which is why the zuhandenvorhanden tandem is constantly dynamic) is evident in the dubitative suffix –chi, showing that, until the rukyana is physically present, there is no guarantee that he will remain of 'mindful heart'.

These verses dialogue with several of the Quechua concepts introduced in Chapter One. The enactment of reciprocal relations is an example of ayni, whereby each side engages in mutual beneficial actions for the purpose of self-perpetuation. Repeated acts of ayni, through the cyclical repetition of the festival, lead to a stabilization of such congruent relations insofar as the Other becomes increasingly knowable. This is conveyed by the concept of yachay, whereby engagement with an Other leads to a transformation of the Self and the consequent attainment of understanding (as in the cyclical interaction of zuhanden and vorhanden). In Masha, the result of this engagement is the formation of different ayllus, communities that have a strategic purpose in facilitating certain goals, as noted by Allen's definition of ayllu in terms of a shared focus (1988:257). The strategic nature of the ayllu is evidenced in the fact that different ayllus are foregrounded in different contexts (urban/rural, coast/mountain, Kotos/Allawkay), showing that the ayllu is not pre-given but re-actualized according to when it is most relevant. This re-actualization operates through a process of tinku (emergence and convergence of oppositions) whereby difference is defined so that the basis of productive unity can be negotiated. As in the Quechua concept of creation, kamay, the ontogenesis of entities is realized through the interaction of potentialities. In the next song, we explore the notion of tinku in its more violent manifestation, where mutual attunement does not preclude a degree of antagonism.

## The Bullfight

This song is performed during a mock bullfight, at the end of the festival. Each district constructs a model of a bull, and both models are placed in the centre of the town-square. The members of each district then fight against members of the corresponding district, with the men actively engaging in combat while the women throw objects to hit the men of the opposing group. At the end of the

fight, each side states that it has won but there is never an adjudicated winner. As Burga states, the bullfight serves to 'ritualize this ancient opposition, of antagonism and complementarity, between Waris and Llacuaces' (1998:103, mt) (the agriculturalists and herders, respectively). This song depicts the Andean practice of *tinku*, or ritualized warfare: 'A pan-Andean phenomenon, the *tinkuy* is a ritual battle between groups of men (and often women) which can end in death' (Harrison 1994:69, mt). A wider definition, however, is 'a place where opposites meet' (1994:135, mt) in a spirit of cooperation and competition (1994:136), which resembles Seligmann's interpretation as the 'convergence of oppositional forces' (2004:131). Stobart notes how 'tinku has been widely associated with the definition and maintenance of balanced relations, especially the dialectical dualism or "charged diametricality" of the *ayllu*...In this context the word *tinku* emerges as a form of "violent harmony" (2006:140). The further implications of *tinku* will become apparent in my exegesis of the following extract:

Alli toromi torollaaqa Allawkinupa torullaaqa Paja castillo michikoq toru torum torullaaqa Oqshapa tuktunta michikoq toru torum torullaaqa Qeqishpuntachawmi taarakoqmi

Alli torupa tsurillanmi Alli vacapa wawallanmi Qeqishpuntapa chamoqllami

Gánalo gánalo Cotosino gana al allauquino Cotosino échale échale No te chupes My bull is a strong bull
The bull of an *allauquino*My bull is a bull which grazes on tough straw
My bull is a bull which grazes on the flowers
of *oqsha*It lives in Qeqishpunta

The son of a strong bull
The son of a strong cow
Arriving from Qegishpunta

Defeat him, defeat him

Cotosino defeats the allauquino

Give it to him, give it to him, cotosino

Don't chicken out

The first verse begins with a description of the bull from Allawkay: *Alli toromi torollaaqa / Allawkinupa torullaaqa* 'My bull is a strong bull / The bull of an *allauquino*'. While Doña Clotilde sang every other verse of *Masha* from the perspective of Kotos, this (and the following) verse is sung from the perspective of Allawkay. Perhaps the most likely explanation is that Doña Clotilde is immersing herself in the ritual context of the battle, moving from one side to the other in this 'liminal' situation. This is consistent with the purpose of *tinku* as uniting through opposition, and with the fact that, according to both Beatriz and Doña Clotilde, the *awayaqs* represent a different district in different years. The verses concerning the bullfight would be uttered in a kind of 'call-and-response' manner, a verbal duel, between the *awayaq* who that year represented Kotos and the *awayaq* representing Allawkay.

The verse communicates a strong link between communal identity and strength (and therefore survival). The parallelism reinforces the correlation between being alli 'strong' and being from Allawkay, the 1EVI -mi conveys emphasis and certainty, and the affective -lla appropriates the bull through emotional engagement, illustrating the intertwining of the affective and the pragmatic (Münzel similarly notes the fusion of the 'pragmatic' and the 'ethical' among Amazonian groups, 1986:196). The fourfold repetition of the first-person singular possessive (indicated by vowellengthening) in torollaaqa 'my bull' suggests a close link between the vitality of the bull and that of the individual (given the importance of the bull for agriculture). That the bull is a model shows that the phrase is uttered not a statement of fact but as an enactment of solidarity, where the 'bull' can be seen as a totem which embodies the intertwining of strength and vitality in communal identification. The phrase paja castillo michikoq 'that which grazes on tough straw', describes the bull as eating the straw used to make castillos, or temporary architectural structures which are constructed during traditional festivals. This straw is very tough, so only the strongest of animals can eat it. Thus, the strength of the bull (and hence the community which it represents) is emphasized. Likewise for oqshapa tuktunta michikoq 'that which grazes on the flowers of oqsha', a very tough grass (Muhlenbergia peruviana). The phrase Qeqishpuntachawmi taarakogmi, literally 'that which lives in Qeqishpunta', refers to the location whence the awelitu 'grandfather' descends, and hence the quintessential origin of Allawkay. The double 1EVI -mi is highly marked, since this suffix is normally used only once in a clause; here, it seems to ground the origin of the bull more firmly, whereby strength and fertility are intertwined with Allawkay's communal identity.

Complementary unity is evidenced in the next verse, where the bull is defined as *Alli torupa tsurillanmi / Alli vacapa wawallanmi* 'The son of a strong bull / The son of a strong cow'. The parallel lines coincide with parallel genders, reflected in the term *toru* 'bull' and *vaca* 'cow'. AQ, moreover, has separate terms for 'son' and 'daughter' depending on which parent is referred to. *Tsuri* refers to the father's son, and *wawa* to the mother's son; here too, then, gender complementarity is indexed. Duality is also represented in the relation of 'parent' to 'child'. Thus, a four-fold division is presented, resulting from the combination of two dual divisions: male against female; young against old (anticipating the fourfold division of the Incan Empire, p.169, and the *Wayta Muruy* song, p.123). It is, moreover, the first (gender) division that creates the second (generational) division, so that a productive spatial dualism perpetuates the historical dynamic and allows for the continuation of life into the future.

This complementary dualism lies at the heart of the Masha songs, where the separation between distinct elements is what allows reciprocal relations to exist and creates the dynamism necessary for the production of new elements, synthesized from the interaction of the old. That is why, in Harrison's interpretation of Andean cosmology, 'the conceptualization of contradictions and oppositions is a natural and normal way of viewing the world. Things are not described statically but are considered things in movement, recombining themselves to constitute a new totality in significant juxtaposition' (1994:41-42, mt). The repetition of the 1EVI -mi adds force to the lines, grounding the relation between fertility and communal identity on an epistemological basis of certainty. Bourque likewise notes the 'intimate association between agriculture and human reproduction' in Sucre, Ecuador (1999:13-15). The sense of a new element originating from two complementary ones is mirrored in the threefold structure of the verse. In the line Qegishpuntapa chamoqllami 'Arriving from Qeqishpunta', the verb chamoq 'arriving' projects the bull from its origin in Qeqishpunta to its destination in the main square, conveying movement and dynamism in the ontogeny of elements. And, on the main square, a new complementarity is created through antagonism, as the bull meets its counterpart from Kotos. The antagonism is, paradoxically, an expression of unity, since the 'bullfight' only makes sense if both sides share the same symbolic associations; after all, a 'political confrontation can only be implemented by making the groups similar and thereby comparable' (Barth 1969:35). Allen is worth quoting at length on this point:

'Warfare of any kind expresses a group's social boundaries and is also a form of communication between the opposing groups. In *tinkuy*, one experiences an opponent's similarity to oneself as well as his or her differences. If there were no basic similarity between the combatants, they could not join in battle; but if there were no differences between them, they would not have a reason to fight. Any characteristics of the Andean *ayllu*...are expressed by means of the *tinku*: the *ayllu* coheres as a faction and defines its boundaries while simultaneously being incorporated into an *ayllu* of a higher order' (2002:177).

This is precisely what we see in these songs, where Kotos and Allawkay gain their unity as Mangas through antagonism – since it is the antagonism that emphasizes their differences and hence the very basis of their complementarity. Likewise, Mirande defines the Aymara notion of *taypi* 'centre' as having 'a double force, centripetal and centrifugal, which allows opposites to unite without merging' (2005:364-365, mt). We see the same process in the very structure of the verses, which are often characterized by semantic parallelism: difference is set up as complementarity (2005:367). As Mannheim states, Quechua poetic parallelism entails a 'cognitive focus on commonalities and specific differences' (1998:267), which do not exist as inherent relations, rather as strategic connections whose pragmatic value can be reaffirmed or negated by changing contexts. Lienhard

(1993:93) and Husson (1985:352) argue that Quechua parallelism communicates a dualistic interpretation of reality; parallelism does not, of course, *entail* a dualistic worldview (it is a widespread poetic device in widely varying cultures across the globe, cf. Fox 1974:1989), but it can be a particularly potent means of conveying it.

The final verse illustrates the new opposition (the fight) that results from the oppositions which created the bull in the first place (the bull and the cow). Unlike the other Masha verses, this one is in Spanish. The linguistic contrast reflects the contrast in tone, from a description of the bull to the incitement of action, and the actualization of the bull's potential. The fact that Spanish is used in more 'serious, 'official', contexts means that its use here may serve to heighten the emotional tone; the contrast between the two languages may also reinforce the sense of complementary antagonism, particularly in view of the metaphorical effect of codeswitching in many contexts (cf. Gumperz 1977). Thus, bilingualism furnishes Andeans with extra rhetorical resources: 'Both Quechua and Spanish are used in various ways, essentially to create special poetic and expressivecommunicative effects' (Julca-Guerrero 2009b:69). The first three lines, Gánalo gánalo / Cotosino gana al allauquino / Cotosino échale échale 'Defeat him, defeat him / The cotosino defeats the allauquino / Give it to him, give it to him, cotosino', could not be a stronger depiction of antagonism (incidentally, the verse also illustrates that Doña Clotilde once again positions herself from the Kotos perspective). However, Beatriz told me that no winner is ever declared in these confrontations. Each half is, after all, equal. The focus, then, is not on victory as an ultimate goal, but on the process of interaction, the fight itself. The final line, No te chupes 'Don't chicken out', emphasizes the vitality of the fighter, specifically his courage.

In the fight, we also see that it is antagonism at one level (between two halves) that creates unity at another level (within each half). However, the depiction of antagonism and unity here is more pervasive than the consolidation of one group by contrast with another. In *tinku*, the opposition does not just unite the opposed groups *internally*, but also *with each other*, by emphasizing the differential basis of complementarity. As Bastien states of *nuwasi*, the Aymara cognate of *tinku*, 'It is a way of uniting opposite sides in a dialectic that clearly defines and recognizes the other as well as establishes their interdependence' (1992:159). This point is stressed by a Bolivian folkloric association, cited by Stobart: "Tinku is the name of the ritual battles in which two opposing [groups] meet one another...It resembles a combat between warriors, but in reality it concerns a rite: which unifies rather than separates...From the confrontation is born life, [which] is the realm of fertility and reproduction" (webpage of 'Fraternidad Taller Cultural Tinkus Wist'us', in Stobart 2006:134).

This quote stresses the creative element that arises out of oppositions, since it is the very opposition that creates each half in the first place. Their antagonism is part of their unity, and this, ultimately, has its origin in ecology, where each group assumes a different role and thereby facilitates its own survival through reciprocity with other groups. Arnold and Yapita similarly state that 'Andean societies reproduce themselves by appropriating the strength of the Other, and then in revivifying the Other, but now as a part of the Self' (2006:161-162). This coincides with Sallnow's discussion of *tinkus* as moving from a state of entropy to order, from an unstable, undirected dualism to a stabilized complementarity (1987:142-143); it also echoes Turner's (1969) discussion of *communitas* as a liminal context within which stable relations are partially abandoned so that they can be reformed in ways that reveal their practical rationale.

The ecological basis of *tinku* battles is likewise noted by Bolin's citation of an informant in southern Peru: "Pachamama [Mother Nature] needs a few drops of blood and we all come together to provide this offering. So we meet as opponents and end in solidarity" (1998:95). This ultimate solidarity was only realized through the reinforcing of differences: 'One *suyu* [village-quarter] fought against the others to assure everyone knew whether they belonged' (1998:94). Similarly, Poole showed how the *yawar mayu* dance, performed during *tinku* rituals, 'carries marked connotations of fertility, initiation, and renewal' (1991:320); significantly, *yawar mayu* means 'river of blood', whereby 'the blood shed on the battlefield is said to "feed" the earth mother, thus increasing her fertility and generosity' (Bolin 1998:99) (see also Arguedas 1958). Likewise, Sallnow noted how, in a village near Cuzco, 'the *tinkuy* was explicitly portrayed as a sacrifice, or at least a bloodletting, to the local *Apus* [deities] in return for the fertility of the soil and the welfare of people and animals' (1987:299). In the concept of *tinku*, then, we see how communality – social identity – is rooted in survival, which itself depends on a form of complementarity that must emphasize its differences if it is to retain its productivity.

This is what we witness in the *Masha* songs. Difference and similarity are simultaneously stressed at various levels in order to create a social dynamic that is elastic, and that can respond to the vicissitudes of a capricious environment, where relations of absolute adherence would snap due to their inflexibility, and the complete absence of relation would mean isolation and ultimate extinction. In the *Masha* songs, then, 'social identity', is created neither through pure 'process' nor pure 'essence', but through a dynamic where the internal cohesion of entities results from their external cohesion with the environment – since it is only through interaction that they take form in the first place. Harris applies Granet's comments on China to the Andes: "We never find absolute

oppositions: the left is not necessarily entirely so, nor is its opposite" (Granet 1973, in Harris 1986:24, mt). As Howard-Malverde states, the power of the boundary 'originates from its essentially ambivalent status – at once a point of separation and a point of unity' (1990b:107, mt).

This song perpetuates the theme of the strategic harnessing of difference for self-perpetuation, thereby fusing *chair* (the emergence of Self and Other through physical interaction) with the *trace* (the emergence of Self and Other along a shared discursive trajectory). In the *Masha* songs (as in all of the songs in this Chapter), the verses reveal this underlying discourse to be physical survival, which, for conscious beings, may be experienced as motivated but which, in reality, is the product of a chain of previous interactions that have led to the emergence of life as a self-perpetuating manifestation of its own. It is this predication of the *trace* (discourse) on *chair* (evolution of matter) that allows us to talk of discursive strategy in the songs as instances of the *trace*, without falsely attributing any teleological motivation to the *trace*. The sense of 'motivation', rather than being intrinsic to the *trace*, is instead one of the ways that the *trace* manifests itself along its unmotivated trajectory. Thus, 'motivation' is an expression of 'disposition', and this disposition is formed through prior historical acts of engagement, both during our lifespan and prior to our lifespan, in the actualization of various potentialities that led to our manifestation as what we are. Thus, the most fundamental *trace* of all is *chair*, the ability of matter to interact.

This fusion of the *trace* in *chair* is conveyed by the Quechua concept of *tinku*, which operates in various contexts in this song. First, the harnessing of complementary difference for productive ends is conveyed by the distinction between the parent bull and the cow, where their reality as inhabiting the same *chair*, yet forming different manifestations (male/female), allows them to reproduce and thereby perpetuate themselves in the form of the young bull. The fourfold division between male/female and parent/child thus perfectly encapsulates the historical nature of being as conveyed by Heidegger's *Dasein*, whereby a form of interaction (i.e. reproduction between male and female) results in the projection of both into the future, in the new form of their offspring. In turn, the young bull engages in its own form of dialogue with its counterpart from Kotos, so that the same discourse of targeted opposition is reformulated in a novel context. This new context of interaction likewise perpetuates the historical dynamic insofar as it functions to distinguish the two groups that, as we saw in the previous song, can engage in their own forms of productive exchange (*ayni*). Thus, as in Heidegger's *Dasein*, latent potentiality (*vorhanden*) is actualized through engagement between entities that are mutually *zuhanden* (relevant to each other), which allows for further forms of

interaction. In the next song, we shall explore further instances of *ayni*, and how self-perpetuation depends, as in *Carnaval* and *Masha*, on strategic negotiation with relevant others.

## **Wayta Muruy**

Wayta Muruy, literally 'sowing of flowers', is a genre where people 'dance out' certain agricultural activities. It is performed in festivals between April and June. I found versions of the songs from three villages in Pomabamba province. Here, the version from Pajash is presented, performed by Doña Catalina Salvador Salinas. The main performance is the spreading of cut flowers by the dancers (hence the genre's name). The flowers constitute a gift to a religious figure (in this case, Christ), and also symbolize the sowing of seeds, with clear pre-Hispanic origins. The whole festival takes place in front of the church, in the main square of Pajash. The principal dancers are: warmi willka (granddaughter); ollqu willka (grandson); chakwas (old woman); awkis (old man). This fourfold complementarity of age and gender recalls the ontogenesis of the bull in Masha (p.119), and likewise depicts the process of creation (of new generations) through complementary opposites. A fifth character is that of the capitán yunka, who helps the other four characters in the activities. Carranza Romero describes the figure of the yunka as a 'dancer who helps the female dancers (pallas) in the Anaca dance' (2003:290, mt) (Anaca is another kind of dance in Pomabamba and elsewhere, though, as is evident in Wayta Muruy, the yunka is present in other dances, too). The Wayta Muruy demonstrates that 'Agricultural production links work with love, with happiness. For that reason, singing and dancing accompany agricultural labour' (Montoya et al. 1999:27, mt). Arnold and Yapita, moreover, argue that, in Aymara cosmology, songs are a way of liberating energy for a productive harvest the following year (1998:164-165).

Tayta Cristi Asunción Ima shumaqmi shuyaamun Caña dulce mallkintsikta entregashunmi Caña dulce plantantsikta entregashunmi Naranjada plantata entregadanagmi

Tsaqullay, tsaqullay, awkin runa, tsatsa runa Tayta Cristu Asunción Warmi willka, ollqu willka, awkis, chakwas Alli shumaq tsaquyamunki Naranjada mallkintsikmi

Sindi waqra tuuruntsik Abrillakunqaman Mana shumaq troncuta Hipimuptiyki Father Christ of the Ascension How beautifully he awaits us We will give him our plant of sugar cane We will give him our crop of sugar cane I am about to give you the orange plant

Cut, cut, old man, elder man
Father Christ of the Ascension
Granddaughter, grandson, old man, old
woman
Clear the vegetation well, our orange plant

Our horned bull that ploughs Might open up If you do not remove the trunk Carefully Alli shumaqlla sindiylla sindiy Capitán yunka, awkis, chakwas

Alli shumaq sindimunki

Mana pantar Mana cricinqatsu

Ayway toruntsikta ashimunki

Yapyaykunapaq

Wawra kachita aparkur

Mikutsipar

Ayway rogapar, shoqapar

Apamunki, achkumunki, laasumunki

Señorllay capitán yunka Qarapaay yachanganpita

Allimunki.

Envernado/shqa tsay toruntsik, yunka

señorllay

Waqrashuptiyki tsay chukaru toruqa

Kachita uchutsinki Kachiwan rogapanki

Shoqapanki

Kurpata mashashun Kurpantsikta wiruyaamuy

Alli shumaq, alli shumaq wiruyallaamunki

Caña dulcintsikta planta

Caña dulcintsikta planta malograykanman

Awkin runa, tsatsay runa Alli shumaq parqulla, parqulla

Alli yaku parqullay

Plantanta mama seguiaga pargunampag

Naranjada plantantsikta suwayanqa Caña dulcintsikta, caña dulcintsikta Mishi makin apanqa plantantsikta

Alli shumaq cirkuykamunki

Mishi maki, Iluta siki Tsay waytata apaskin Tsay waytata ushaskin

Misalla blanca, mesalla Awkin runa, tsatsay runa Hamaykuy, mikuyay, almorzay Sow, sow well,

Captain yunka, old man, old woman,

Sow well Erring not It will not grow

Go and look for our bull In order to plough Bringing shining salt

Feeding it

Go and beg it, comforting it Bring it here, escort it, transport it

Honourable capitán yunka,

Treat it in the way to which it is accustomed,

Persuade it.

It has been hibernating, this, our, bull,

honourable yunka

If this stubborn bull should butt you

Give it salt to suck, Beg it with salt, Comfort it

We will heat the balls of earth in the sun Make our balls of earth grow stalks Make them grow stalks well

Our plant of sweet cane

Our plant of sweet cane could get damaged

Old man, elder man Irrigate, irrigate well

With good water, irrigate well

So that mother stream can irrigate her plant

They will steal our orange plant
Our sweet cane, our sweet cane
Thieving hands will carry off our plant

Enclose it well

Thieving hands, useless bottom Are carrying off this plant Are destroying this plant

White table, table Old man, elder man Rest, eat, have lunch The first verse relates to Christ, *Cristi*. The word *Cristi* is an affectionate term which indicates that Christ is not presented as a remote figure, rather as a close friend or relative; *tayta*, literally 'father' but a term of affection and respect for any male, can also be interpreted in this way. In the second line, *Ima shumaqmi shuyaamun* 'How beautifully he awaits us', the beauty originates from the relation, namely Christ's openness to receiving the devotees. The aesthetic dimension in *shumaq* 'beautiful' is emphasized by the 1EVI –*mi*. As in my own experience, Román Mendoza notes how, in indigenous communities in Ancash, 'there is an accentuated concept for all types of natural and artificial beauty' (2000:349, mt). Stobart notes how this affective and aesthetic use of language serves to approximate Self to Other as part of the process of realizing complementary unity:

'This affective language stresses close empathetic – even sentimental – relations, serving as a means to appeal to the generative power or spirit (animu) of the object, being or place, and to set it into "communicative mode". Playing music and dancing also open these lines of communication and invoke particular modes of relationship – where well being and (re)productive potential are largely understood in terms of the quality of relations with the various personified places, objects or beings' (2006:9).

This entering into communication through affective language is precisely what is occurring in this verse, where the affective and pragmatic, ethical and rational, intertwine in the common orientation towards survival. The reciprocal relation is also conveyed by the directional —mu, which normally indicates movement towards the speaker: 'In an unmarked situation, the location of the speaker will be automatically interpreted as the point of reference for —mu' (Adelaar 1997:140). In this case, however, it is the speaker who is moving towards Christ. Thus, the suffix can be interpreted metaphorically to indicate an emotional, relational, approximation, whereby Christ disposes himself to receiving the devotees. The reciprocal basis of this relation is suggested by the fact that, with this suffix, 'there is the suggestion of a circular movement, as the effects of the action referred to are expected somehow to revert to the speaker' (1997:141-142). As Condori and Condori note, 'The festival is, for the Andean, a sacred space where one enters into communion with one's gods and one's ancestors; the relation that is generated requires reciprocity with beings of other spheres' (2009:52, mt).

The remaining two lines exemplify this reciprocity: Caña dulce mallkintsikta entregashunmi / Caña dulce plantantsikta entregashunmi 'We will give him our plant of sugar cane / We will give him our crop of sugar cane'. Here we witness a clear relation between religion and survival, typical in the Andes, whereby Christian religious figures are intertwined with the production of food. The expectation is that, by receiving the fruits of harvest from his devotees, Christ will facilitate a bountiful harvest next year. Thus, the more valuable the product that is given (and little is more

valuable than food for survival), the more auspicious the result will be. Pragmatism does not contradict, but is reinforced by, an affective, relational and aesthetic dimension. Arnold and Yapita also note the expression of this close relation between Catholic deities and agriculture in Aymara songs (1998:115). Moreover, 'it is believed that it is precisely the general intimacy of this personal communication between the human *mamalas* [mothers] and their spiritual counterparts, the *mamalas* of food-products, which results in the success of future harvests' (1998:164, mt). Thus, as in *Wayta Muruy*, the integrative role of communication between human, spiritual and natural elements results in success through the productive harnessing of complementary roles.

The term caña dulce 'sugar cane' is a Spanish phrase with Spanish word-order (noun preceding adjective, the opposite of AQ); thus, the term has been adopted as a set phrase, opaque to AQ grammar, reflecting the foreign origin of this crop. The Spanish VR entrega- 'hand over' is used instead of AQ equivalent makiratsi-, with Spanish phonology (the [e] is not raised to [i]). The parallelism of the lines, with AQ mallki 'plant' followed by its Spanish cognate planta, heightens the sense of reciprocity, while the 1EVI -mi builds certainty into this. The IPOSS -ntsik conveys the sense of group-unity by defining the plant as 'belonging to everyone'. By handing it over to Christ, then, the community incorporates Christ into the same web of relations. Indeed, Bourque notes how, in the Andes, 'identity' can be renegotiated by interacting with non-human as well as human elements (1999:17). But the motivation for this inclusion is because Christ is not like everyone else – he has certain powers over the natural world which the community does not have, and this is the reason for relating to him in the first place. Thus, community is built as much through difference as through similarity. The final line confirms the inclusion of Christ as part of the group, with the object changing from third person (grammatically unmarked category) to second-person -q, coinciding with the suffix -naa (shortened to -na because of the -q) which indicates imminent action ('about to'). Thus, Christ becomes a direct interlocutor. The naranjada 'orange' refers to the colour of sugar cane; it is also tempting to see an allusion to the sun, a fundamental element of Andean religion and mythology.

The second verse refers to the four characters, representing two genders and two generations, who act out fundamental agricultural processes. The elder man is induced to *tsaqu*-, or fell shrubs to create fields for sowing. There is semantic parallelism with *awkin* and *tsatsa*, both denoting an 'elderly man'. The second line shows that the action is performed with a view to Christ (here *Cristu* – from Spanish *Cristo* 'Christ'). The third line lists all of the performers in turn: the young girl; the young boy; the old man; the old woman. As well as illustrating the productive synthesis of

complementary opposites (two genders uniting to create two generations, and thereby temporal progression), the foursome also symbolizes the whole community, and arguably reinforces the fact that everyone has their own role and is expected to cooperate for everyone's benefit. In the line, Alli shumaq tsaquyamunki 'Clear the vegetation well', we see again the intertwining of the aesthetic and pragmatic, where a job well done is alli shumaq 'very beautiful'. The directional —mu serves to soften the imperative, which thereby acts more as a suggestion than a command; thus, the implication is that unity is built through cooperation rather than coercion. In the fifth line, the IPOSS—ntsik reinforces the creation of unity through cooperation, by defining the plant as existing for everyone's benefit. Thus, agriculture is both the motivation for communal unity (cooperation is prerequisite for successful agriculture) and also perpetuates this unity (without agriculture, the community would not survive).

The third verse explains the importance of the actions described in the previous verse. The first line describes the tuuru 'bull', again appropriated by -ntsik. In the festival, the bull is enacted by three men. This does not mean that the bull is, from an emic point of view, 'unreal': 'In certain feasts one observes runas that wear the skin of a bear or the flower of a plant...It is not...that they represent this or that plant or animal, but that in those circumstances they are that plant or animal' (Vásquez 1998:114). Reference is made to the bull's waqru 'horn', conveying the animal's strength and vitality. The word sindi probably originates from Spanish sendero 'path'; here, it refers to the furrows ploughed by the bull and into which seeds are placed. The second line states that the bull abrillakunqaman 'might open up', comprising: VR abri- 'open' (Spanish); affective -lla; reflexive -ku; third-person future -nqa; conditional -man. The meaning is clear on analysis of the third and fourth lines: Mana shumaq troncuta / Hipimuptiyki 'If you do not remove the trunk / Carefully'. Any broken trunks left in the field might pierce the bull's skin (cause it to 'open'). The affective -lla conveys empathy, showing that the welfare of the bull is not simply a practical necessity but also a moral obligation. The fourth verse conveys the same obligation for the seeds. The first three lines induce the yunka, old man and old woman to Alli shumaqlla sindiylla sindiy 'Sow, sow well'. The affective -lla, use of shumaq 'beautiful' and directional -mu again convey a caring, advisory tone, where the actors are encouraged, rather than coerced, to perform the activity. Here, sindi takes the form of a verb, 'sow', illustrating how a Spanish loan is subject to the fluidity of AQ word-categories.

The fourth and fifth lines illustrate the importance of responsibility: *Mana pantar / Mana cricinqatsu* 'Erring not / It will not grow'. Only if the seeds are treated with care will the plant grow and reciprocate by producing the food necessary for survival. The parallel repetition of the negative

mana 'not' reinforces the warning, and also the two-way exchange: if negativity exists at one side, it will be reproduced at the other. This is conveyed by the SQ concept of ayni, as described by Allen:

'At the most abstract level, *ayni* is the basic give-and-take that governs the universal circulation of vitality. It can be positive, as when brothers-in-law labour in each others' fields; or it can be negative, as when the two men quarrel and exchange insults. This circulation – be it of water or human energy – is driven by a system of continuous reciprocal interchanges, a kind of dialectical pumping mechanism. Every category of being, at every level, participates in this cosmic circulation. Humans maintain interactive reciprocity relationships, not only with each other but also with their animals, their houses, their potato fields, the earth, and the sacred places in their landscape' (1997:77).

The fact that reciprocity is not always positive or peaceful is illustrated in the warning at the end of this verse, in the examples of competition and dissonance in the *Masha* songs, and in the *Negritos* song which we shall soon come to.

The fifth verse begins by persuading the actors to fetch the bull, so that the field may be ploughed: Ayway toruntsikta ashimunki / Yapyaykunapaq 'Go and look for our bull / In order to plough'. The third to fifth lines again stress cooperation over coercion: Rawra kachita aparkur / Mikutsipar / Ayway rogapar, shoqapar 'Bringing it shining salt / Feeding it / Go and beg it, comforting it'. By enticing the bull with salt, the actors are entering into reciprocal relations with the bull, recalling Bolin's comment on treatment of camelids in southern Peru: 'Alpacas and llamas are not to be dominated and looked upon as mere resources. They must be respected in their own right, and the relationship is built on perfect reciprocity' (1998:66). Likewise, Montoya et al. argue that, in the Andes, 'Animals are treated like humans (with love, rage, insults)' (1999:29, mt). Here, we see this in the VRs roga- 'beg' and shoqa- 'console'. I witnessed similar treatment when a farmer spotted me on the road and asked me to help with milking a cow! He spoke to the animal as if speaking to a child, calming it and comforting it during the milking process. The suffix -pa denotes a short period of time; here, its diminutive role is probably affective. The treatment of Christ, the plants and the bull concord with Vásquez' interpretation of Andean practice more generally: 'The focus is on mutual attunement...for inasmuch as mutual conversation flowers, nurturing flows. Dialogue here does not end in an action that falls upon someone, but in a reciprocal nurturing' (Vásquez 1998, in Apffel-Marglin 1998:26). The last line conveys the fact of bringing the bull towards the group, through the following VRs: apamu- 'bring'; achku- 'tie rope around' (here I have glossed it as 'escort'); lasa- literally 'carry' but here it can be interpreted as 'transport'. Thus, the two men who enact the bull are led to the main square by a third.

The sixth verse also describes the treatment of the bull: Señorllay capitán yunka / Qarapaay yachanqanpita / Allimunki 'Honourable capitán yunka / Treat it in the way to which it is accustomed / Tame it'. The yunka is addressed respectfully as Señorllay, shown by the Spanish honorific Señor 'Sir', affective — Ila and affective/semi-possessive — y. Qarapay contains the VR qara- 'gift, bestow', again demonstrating the enticement of the bull through reciprocity, and the human-like manner in which it is treated. In the song, then, reciprocity is not only material, but involves genuine emotional engagement with the Other. This arguably has evolutionary advantage: something that is felt to be worthwhile is likely to be realized more effectively than something which is only perceived as a necessary sacrifice. This is why the nervous (cognitive) and endocrine (emotional) systems work in tandem, whereby thought and emotion, while distinct, are mutually reinforcing (even when emotion runs 'counter' to reason, this is arguably only because there is a level of thought that seems to 'justify' the emotion). To quote Trask,

'The hypothalamus, which is the switchboard of the brain, receives both nerve and chemical messages. It sends out messages in two ways, by impulses through the nerve networks and by hormones to the pituitary gland. These hormones travel along the inside of the nerve axons, so that there is a close association between the two systems. When information enters the brain as nerve impulses and the response is hormone secretion the cycle is a neuroendocrine reflex' (1971:137-138).

The intertwining of thought and emotion in the common aim for survival is indicated in the Andean texts by the concomitant intertwining of the affective and pragmatic.

The phrase *yachanqanpita* comprises: *yacha-* 'know, become accustomed to'; nominalizer *-nqa*; 3PRES *-n*; *-pita* 'from'. The phrase can therefore be translated as 'in the way to which it is accustomed'. This implies that auspicious relationships are gradually built up over time, through repeated reciprocal actions. What is stressed, then, is an abidingness in the relationship between bull and *yunka*, which does not mean that the relationship is always empirically in force, rather that every new agreement is projected from a history of past agreements (this projection is conveyed by the directionality of *-pita* 'from'). The cumulative result is a latent mutual understanding which facilitates the process of making new cooperative endeavours in the future. At the emotional level, this could be tantamount to 'trust'. In Heidegger's terminology, it is the transition from *zuhanden* 'ready-at-hand' to *vorhanden* 'present-at-hand' (i.e. greater knowledge of the Other, which allows for an even deeper complementary synthesis). We saw the same phenomenon in the cyclical rotation of the *Masha* festival, where migrants would renew their latent ties with kinsfolk, and where the two halves would reinforce their differences and similarities. *Wayta Muruy* and *Masha* 

both serve as an annual lesson on the cultivation of proper relations. This is evident in the songtexts, the dances, and the organization of the festival, which involves reciprocal obligations between the organizers and participants (as we shall see later on).

The verb-form allimunki comprises: adjective alli 'good'; directional -mu; 2PRES -nki. It can therefore be literally translated as 'you make good', though here its most plausible interpretation is 'you persuade', since the aim is to tame the bull so that it wishes to cooperate. The directional -mu is again deployed to soften the imperative; the fact that this suffix also conveys a degree of benefit to the speaker suggests that, by being kind to the bull, the yunka is also kind to the speaker, indicating the presentation of reciprocity as auspicious for all (particularly since the capitana can be considered the 'voice of the community'). The fourth line refers to the fact that the bull has just woken up, so he is likely to be in a rather bad mood! The word envernado/envernashqa was given differently on different occasions, once with the Spanish past participle marker -ado and once with the AQ equivalent -shqa, showing the porous boundary between both languages, which are now equally as native for many speakers and often not distinguished. Both Spanish and AQ endings are applied to this originally Spanish root (inverna- 'hibernate'), modified according to AQ phonology which often does not distinguish between /e/ and /i/; hence enverna-. The remaining lines tell the yunka what to do if the bull is aggressive: Waqrashuptiyki tsay chukaru toruqa / Kachita uchutsinki / Kachiwan rogapanki / Shoqapanki 'If this stubborn bull should butt you / Give it salt to suck / Beg it with salt / Comfort it'. Again, the focus is on cultivating proper relations. If the bull is aggressive, it should not be punished, but instead persuaded by giving it salt and, again, by rogapay 'begging' and shoqpay 'comforting' it. This is, after all, a more efficient way of securing success: the bull will work better if it does so willingly, and aggression is a waste of energy, particularly in the high Andes where the air is thin, the temperature low, and the soils poor. By taking the Other on its own terms, the Self can enhance its survival prospects to a greater extent.

The seventh verse refers to the *kurpa*, or balls of earth, which are made around the seeds to maximize their chances of survival: *Kurpata mashashun / Kurpantsikta wiruyaamuy / Alli shumaq*, *alli shumaq wiruyallaamunki* 'We will heat the balls of earth in the sun / Make our balls of earth grow stalks / Make them grow stalks well'. Again, the IPOSS *–ntsik*, which conveys no information that is not already obvious, serves an enactive purpose in defining the *kurpa* in terms of the group, and the group in terms of the *kurpa*, building unity through shared effort. Indeed, the suffix *–ntsik* can be interpreted as a triangle, where the apex – the object 'possessed' – unites the two otherwise distinct sides which relate to it – the 'possessors'. It is perhaps because of this intuition that the

number 'three' is so important in Andean cosmology (pp.169-170), and that the concept of *tinku* (p.117) has arisen, where two complementary equivalents meet in the middle, the middle being a liminal sphere of creation, building unity through approximation and differentiation. The next two lines reinforce the reciprocal basis of agriculture in the phrase *alli shumaq*, with its emotive and aesthetic connotations, and the affective suffixes, *—lla* and *—mu*. If reciprocal relations are maintained, the *kurpa* will *wiru-* 'grow stalks' (the seeds will sprout), showing a clear correlation between reciprocity and regeneration, productivity and fertility. The fourth line is a warning of what will happen if reciprocity is not respected: *Caña dulcintsikta planta malograykanman* 'Our plant of sweet cane could get damaged'. The IPOSS *—ntsik* reinforces that the welfare of the plant is the welfare of the group.

The eighth verse induces the elder man to parqu-'irrigate' the seeds. Again, he is advised to do so alli shumaq 'carefully, beautifully', and with alli yaku 'good water'. This is Plantanata mama sequiaqa parqunampaq 'So that mother stream can irrigate her plant', whereby a physical process is also described in terms of reciprocity, just as a mother gives milk to her child. This recalls a verse recorded in Southern Peru by Carrillo: 'Dilated stream with a smooth surface, Step on it! / It will carry its waters to our seeds, Step on it! / Step on it with strength, Step on it! / Step on it again with strength, step on it! / Thanks to you, our plants have their flower, Step on it! / Their beautiful fruits their propagation, Step on it!' (1986:79, my translation of Carrillo's Spanish translation from Quechua). In both this verse and the Wayta Muruy, the stream is addressed as an animate being. In Wayta Muruy, the stream is an agent, since the elderly man only provides the necessary conditions under which the stream can follow her natural tendency of nurture and, in the extract from Carrillo, because the stream is given thanks and addressed in the second person.

Noriega notes that, in Andean poetry, 'nature is not a passive intermediary; every one of its elements fulfils the function of companion, enemy, witness, divinity and *raison d'être* of man at every moment. For that reason, the poetic subject dialogues with nature, appealing and turning to it each instant' (1991:222, mt). Similarly, Godenzzi argues that, in the Andes, 'the land is an animated being and, consequently, the relation which is established between the *runa* ('human being') and the land is not that which obtains between a subject and object, but an interaction between animated entities which are ultimately mutually dependent' (2005:53, mt); Arnold and Yapita noted that, in their Aymara community in Bolivia, 'during every phase of agricultural work, nothing is done in silence, one always talks to the land as if it were a person' (1998:143, mt). These comments closely reflect the treatment of *mama sequia* 'mother stream' in this verse. Urton argues that, in his

fieldsite in southern Peru, 'reservoirs and irrigation canals – and probably water in general – are crucial to the definition of social versus non-social space' (1981:53). Sherbondy argues for a similar social role to water, citing the widespread Andean belief that ancestors journeyed along subterranean channels and emerged at springs on the territory of the *ayllu* (1992:54); thus, 'Different peoples or *ayllus* could link themselves to others on the ideological basis of the connections between bodies of water and thus form local regions' (1992:57). This process of linkage concords with Allen's observations in southern Peru that 'Rivers and streams provide a tangible manifestation of the *samis*' [spirits'] flow and they are conceptualized in terms of a vast circulatory system that distributes water throughout the cosmos' (2002:36). These quotes all suggest a close relation between reciprocity, circulation and the creation of communal identity on the basis of survival, just as is expressed in the text of the *Wayta Muruy*.

The ninth verse shifts to what happens when proper relations are not observed: Naranjada plantantsikta suwayanga / Caña dulcintsikta, caña dulcintsikta 'They will steal our orange plant / Our sweet cane, our sweet cane'. This refers to the performance of the Turks, who arrive on the scene in mock Turkish costumes after the five cultivators have left, and destroy the newly sown plants; the IPOSS -ntsik stresses the sense of communal loss. The phrase mishi makin, 'cat hands', refers to the fact that cats are opportunistic scavengers which often steal the fruits of people's labour, just like the portrayal of the Turks here. The cultivators are therefore urged to circuykamuy 'circle around' the crops to protect them (VR circu- 'circle' derived from Spanish noun cerco 'fence'; continuous yka; directional -mu; 2PRES -nki). This verse illustrates the destruction caused when reciprocity is not observed, and when adequate care is not taken to protect that which is important to one's welfare. Thus, this verse is a lesson to take care of the relationships that one cultivates. The Turkish element originates from the Danza de los Moros 'Dance of the Moors', an epic genre which was sung in Europe during the Middle Ages. It had many forms, but all celebrated the victories of Christian soldiers against Muslims at the time of the Crusades (Millones 1992:26). This genre, which arrived in Peru via Mexico during the colonial era, was probably one of the main influences in the development of the Apu Inka genre that we shall explore in the next chapter (Kapsolí 1985:124). In the context of Wayta Muruy, the ethnic element is unimportant: the Turks are merely a symbol of the nonallegiance to Andean practices of reciprocity. The tenth verse marks a change of tense, from future to present, illustrating the fulfilment of the warning: Mishi maki, Iluta siki / Tsay waytata apaskin / Tsay waytata ushaskin 'Thieving hands, useless bottom / Are carrying off this plant / Are destroying this plant'. The Turks are again described as 'cat hands', and this time also as *lluta siki* 'useless bottom'. The suffix -ski following VRs apa- 'take' and usha- 'finish, destroy' denotes sudden and

resisted action (Julca-Guerrero 2009a:408), thus emphasizing the rapidity of the destruction in a moment of carelessness.

The final verse conveys reciprocity in a different context. Here, the mayordomo (organizer of the festival) invites the grandfather to have lunch (Doña Catalina told me that all five dancers are in fact invited): Misalla blanca, mesalla / Awkin runa, tsatsay runa / Hamaykuy, mikuyay, almorzay 'White table, table / Old man, elder man / Rest, eat, lunch'. The participants are thus rewarded for their efforts by being offered food. The practice of ayni (reciprocity) thereby serves to consolidate patterns of allegiance and cooperation, ensuring the maintenance of balanced relations that allow for the continuation of life. Food, being the sine qua non of regeneration and perpetuation, is arguably the most significant element to be shared in relationships of ayni. Paulson reaches a similar conclusion: 'Because Andean relationships of reciprocity are initiated, sacralized, and sustained through the ritual sharing of food and chicha [Andean alcoholic beverage], food is essential not only to sustain each physical life, but also to sustain the human and spiritual relationships that allows life to go on' (Paulson 2003:251-252). After the sharing of food, the Turks then return in order to rob what has not yet been eaten, again displaying the contrast between reciprocity and egoism. According to Doña Catalina, the Turks rob because tienen envidia 'they are jealous'. Jealousy, more than egoism, can be seen as the opposite of reciprocity. Whilst reciprocity is beneficial both for Self and Other, jealousy is the complete denial of the Other, the severing of any meaningful social ties. Estermann states for the Andes in general that 'Reciprocal rituals (despatch, pay) are an essential condition for the Pachamama to continue to be generous and for life to be maintained' (1998:235, mt); 'Violations of this system of communal "justice" are severely punished, because they risk the economic process of cultivating land and the coexistence of the population' (1998:237, mt). Communal identity, then, is built on reciprocity, a practical system of ethics which has its roots in the quest for survival. In addition, according to Estermann, 'interpersonal coherence (collective authenticity) takes precedence over personal coherence (existential authenticity)' (1998:248, ft. 30, mt) in the Andes. Whilst I do not wish to generalize about a whole complex region on the basis of a few song-texts, Estermann's comments ring true to the optic of the texts throughout this study, where individual wellbeing is predicated on being part of a strong, resilient group: 'an isolated person, with no relations, is a dead entity' (1998:98, mt).

The central Quechua concept in this song is, once again, *ayni*, where reciprocal relations are established between various elements as a mode of mutual attunement that is conducive to survival. This was particularly clear in the treatment of the bull, who, as with the tree in *Carnaval*, is

dialogued with, in such a manner that the potentialities of productive exchange can be gauged. Likewise, the seeds are treated with care since otherwise they will not grow, the participants in the festival are rewarded with food as an incentive to take part, the environment is rendered conducive for *mama sequia* 'mother stream' to nurture the young plants, and Christ is gifted sugar cane as a means of ensuring his protection of the crops. The concept of *patsa* (*pacha*) is also important in these verses, insofar as elements of the non-human environment are treated as meaningful interlocutors, the strategic interaction with whom allows for the circulation of *kallpa* (vital energy) among all forms.

This mutual attunement again dialogues with Derrida's notion of the *trace*, not, it must be reminded, in a teleological sense, but in the purely factual sense that the underlying orientation towards survival manifests in a particular form of opposition wherein the opposed elements realize particular potentialities in context-specific ways. This is the cyclical transition that Heidegger describes from *vorhanden* (potential to affect in specific ways) to *zuhanden* (perception of this potential) to *vorhanden* (whereby the form of interaction changes the potential, for example by actualizing it as in the case of *Wayta Muruy*). This evolution of Self and Other through the process of their interaction is conveyed by the Quechua concept of *yachay*, which, as Stobart (Stobart 2002:81) notes, entails both a transformation of Self and a capacity to affect the relevant Other. The 'fuller state of being' (Howard 2002:19) that Howard ascribes to *yachay* dialogues with all three notions of *chair*, *trace* and *Dasein*, whereby no entity is complete, but constantly assuming novel forms in response to its environment. Thus, the bull is treated *yachanqanpita* 'in the way to which it is accustomed', which, as the derivation from the root *yacha*- indicates, conveys an ever-deepening mutual attunement between the bull and its human interlocutor over time; *zuhanden* (relevant) potentialities become increasingly stabilized as part of the *vorhanden* nature of the relation.

As in *Carnaval* and *Masha*, the reciprocal obligations in *Wayta Muruy* are both ethical principle and pragmatic strategy, informed by the unquestioned assumption (the *trace*) that survival is a mutual goal, as determined by the unmotivated evolution of *chair*, one of whose ramifications is the formation of life as a self-perpetuating manifestation of reality. It is interesting to note that, whilst Catholicism has been incorporated into the *Wayta Muruy* ritual in the form of Christ, this is realized in such as form as to perpetuate the underlying discourse (*trace*) of the ritual, as based on *ayni*. Christ is not unconditionally worshipped; rather, the tacit expectation is that he will fulfil his duties by reciprocating the kindness in turn. Christ is treated in a similar way to the *rukyana* and *awelitu* in

*Masha*, as an entity that holds different kinds of potentialities to humans, potentialities that, through *ayni*, can be harnessed in useful ways.

Another point of dialogue with *Masha* occurs in the gender-complementarity which manifests in production of future generations. In *Masha*, we saw this in the formation of the young bull through the reproductive interaction (*tinku*) of its parents, and we witness a similar phenomenon in the fourfold nature of the participants in *Wayta Muruy*: young boy; young girl; old man; old woman. Thus, the interaction between entities manifests itself in temporal progression and thereby perpetuates the historical dynamic. The way that this dynamic is perpetuated is not random, for interaction depends on the latent potentialities of entities that, when they interact, realize themselves in particular ways. Neither, however, is the perpetuation of history fundamentally goal-directed, because potentialities (dispositions) are engendered through previous acts of interaction, as Derrida conveys in his notion of the *trace* as an unquestioned basis for discourse. Likewise, Heidegger's notion of *Dasein* shows how the Self is constantly evolving according to latent potentialities (*vorhanden*) that become *zuhanden* (relevant) in interaction, and result in novel potentialities as *vorhanden*.

Insofar as the trace necessarily creates opposing positives and negatives, the ideal of ayni is contrasted with its alter, both in the warning against taking sufficient care (Caña dulcintsikta planta malograykanman 'Our plant of sweet cane could get damaged') and in the enactment of the Turks who, through egoism, steal the fruit of other people's labour. Thus, just as chair reminds us that any act of dialogue is founded on basic similarity, so the opposing sides of the trace convey how the actions of the Other are not entirely removed from the capabilities of the Self. In Wayta Muruy, then, the abject actions of the Other can be interpreted as a tacit acknowledgement that even the respectable and ethically-minded participants have the potential to turn to egoism and destruction. As in Chapter Two (Part Two), the abject Other is only abject because it is a latent potentiality within the Self. This latent potentiality is objectified, rendered concrete in the form of the Turks, in an attempted exorcism of those undesirable dimensions of Self so that their potentiality may never be actualized. Thus, as Derrida notes, the trace ramifies into many levels: the productive oppositions in ayni themselves form part of a larger opposition between ayni and non-ayni (life-enhancing and lifenegating). And this larger opposition serves to reinforce the productive opposition of ayni. In the next song, we shall see how this relation between ayni and non-ayni is negotiated, as one man tries to convince his female interlocutor to favour egalitarian reciprocity over discrimination.

#### **Negritos**

The dance of Negritos is widespread in the Andes, and is performed by a small group of men who depict slaves of African descent (the negritos) working under a capitán, literally 'captain'. I only found lyrics to the dance in Pomabamba province. The songs specific to the Negritos were in Spanish, but were interspersed with chimaychis in either language. The dance is often burlesque and has sexual connotations. This song is one of the sixteen sung by the Negritos in the village of Huanchacbamba. I found it in a notebook given to me by Don Marianito, a folklorist and shaman who also furnished me with the text of Apu Inka, presented in Chapter Four. The song describes the Negritos' encounter with the Antis (see photo, p.96), a group of female performers who enact the dance of the same name. In Pomabamba, rumour has it that this dance originated from the rainforest, also suggested by the following: 'Anti (pluralized by the Spanish to Antis), the word from which Andes is derived, originally meant not the mountains, but people: the forest dwellers at the eastern margin of the Inca empire' (Gade 1999:31). Don Marianito explained that the Negritos and Antis would exchange verses, in a 'call-and-response' manner – which can be interpreted as another form of tinku, akin to the bullfight which we witnessed in the Masha songs. This is the only text I have found where the Negritos engage in verbal interaction with another group. The Antis' text seems to have been lost (in memory as well as in writing), but the overall theme of the exchange, and its importance for our discussion of communality created through reciprocity, is clear from a reading of just the Negritos' half:

Acércate bella noble guiadora Venir pues guiadora valiente ¿Por qué eres tan orgullosa Contra negretos africanos?

Te deré lo que pretendo decerte Y luego comunicaré de corazón Al fin te pido bella guiadora Que serás bien recibida

No procures afligerte A voz de cajón y clarenes Porque ese van deciendo Que hemos de tener mal fin

Flor de rima rima
Regadita de aguas puras
¿Por qué quieres despreciarme?
Confiado en los blancos
Siempre guidar marchitada

Come closer, noble *guiadora*Come, then, brave *guiadora*Why are you so proud
Against black Africans?

I'll tell you what I hope to tell you And then I'll say it with my heart Ultimately, beautiful *guiadora*, I ask that you be well received

Do not try to be disdainful With the voice of drums and bugles Because these only tell us That we will finish badly

Flower of rima rima
Showered with pure waters
Why do you wish to despise me?
Trusting in the white people
Always to lead withered

Brindemos cristal de licores Con estos dulces *majores* Desfrutar todas las prencesas Matezado con altura

El amor que te tengo En mi corazón se queda Viene un fuerte remolino Mi bella prencesa se la lleva

Qué hermosura eres, prencesa Con tres plumajes de colores Qué bella te veo con tus velos Y tus collares de oro y plata

Por estas bellas prencesas El negreto se encuentra rendido Mi corazón lleno de alegría Desfrutemos nuestra danza Let us drink crystals of liquor
With these sweet *majores*So that every princess may be joyous
Adorned with elegance

The love which I have for you Remains in my heart If a strong eddy should come My beautiful princess will be carried off

What beauty you are, princess
With three colourful feathers
How beautiful I see you with your veils
And your necklaces of gold and silver

Because of these beautiful princesses The black man finds himself overcome My heart filled with happiness Let us enjoy our dance

The first verse introduces the notion of separation, and the desire to reduce the distance: Acércate bella noble guiadora / Venir pues guiadora valiente 'Come closer, noble guiadora / Come, then, brave quiadora'. The quiadora (from VR quia- 'guide'; agentive -or; feminine -a) refers to the leader of the Antis, who intones the verses. The quiadora is described as bella 'beautiful' and noble 'noble'. This, whilst stressing the attraction of the singer to the guiadora, also emphasizes the gulf between them, for the term noble conveys a sense of hierarchy which, combined with bella 'beautiful', suggests that she is removed in the way that a goddess is haughty and distanced from the more mundane world of her worshippers. The placing of noble 'noble' before the noun is a literary and often honorific style in Spanish where (apart from a handful of adjectives such as bella) the noun generally precedes the adjective. This is very different from the kind of honorification which we will see in Chapter Four, where the Inca is honoured by virtue of his close relation with the people. The word valiente 'brave' conveys a sense of fierce independence, for this is a term strongly associated with warfare. The distance of the guiadora from the singer is explicitly mentioned in the third and fourth lines: ¿Por qué eres tan orgullosa / Contra negretos africanos? 'Why are you so proud / Against black Africans?' The term orgullosa 'proud' is here deployed in a negative sense, in that the quiadora looks down upon the male singer (many waynus also complain of a lover's arrogance, often due to a differential in socioeconomic status). The implication is that the guiadora is disdainful of her counterpart's poverty, recalling the fact that the Negritos are depictions of Africans who were forced to work on plantations of the European-descended élite.

The communicative gap between Negrito and Anti is also evident in the word contra 'against', which has no direct translation in Quechua. Whilst the Masha texts posit a strong dichotomy between the two halves of the village, the division is a communicative, relational one, whereas, in the present song, the division is one of unwillingness to interact on the part of the quiadora. This is confirmed by the strong hints of racism in the same line, where the *quiadora* is proud and distant because her interlocutors are negritos africanos 'black Africans'. It is plausible that the strong identification by Andeans in Huanchacbamba with African slaves derives from the fact that both have been marginalized and exploited groups. The guiadora's disdain also reflects the experiences of many Andeans when they travel to criollo towns and are subject to severe discrimination as a result of their accent, use of Quechua, or style of dress. Indeed, this line of the song contains one linguistic element which commonly incites discrimination, namely the conflation of [i] with [e], in negreto (as opposed to negrito) (a similar process occurs with [u] and [o]). This results from the fact that, in AQ and unlike Spanish, these are not separate phonemes. The use of the interrogative form encourages the opening of dialogue, in that a response is clearly expected. It also prompts listeners to reflect on their situation, as to why discrimination occurs. This may be a way of creating unity out of a common sense of injustice, and of encouraging people to consider how the discrimination can be This verse (and the theme which permeates the song) dialogues with Bastien's interpretation of nuwasi (the Aymara cognate of tinku) as 'a process of mediation to re-establish a balanced (non-hierarchical) opposition' (1992:159).

The first two lines of the second verse are notable in their emphasis on dialogue: *Te deré lo que pretendo decerte / Y luego comunicaré de corazón* 'I'll tell you what I hope to tell you / And then I'll say it with my heart'. These two lines comprise four verbs all relating to communication: *deré*, from *diré* (first-person future 'say'); *pretendo* (1PRES 'claim, hope'); *decer* (from *decir*, infinitive 'say'); *comunicaré* (first-person future 'communicate'). This implies that, through dialogue, the gap between the *negrito* and the *guiadora* will become narrower, for a communicative field will have been set up between them, with mutual understandings. Given the obvious reproductive connotations of the song (in that the opposing pairs are male and female), we can see this discussion of communication as a kind of copulation, where understanding is the fruit of symbiosis between the two interlocutors. Once this communicative copulation has been achieved at one level, it can progress to a more fundamental level where, from being purely linguistic (evident in the two uses of the VR *deci-* 'say'), it becomes *de corazón* 'with the heart'. Thus, these two lines imply the beginnings of the historical process that originates in the first communicative encounter, where layers of meaning are built on layers of meaning, just as trust and affect grow with time. We also

saw this in *Wayta Muruy*, where the bull is treated *yachanqanpita* 'in the way to which it has become accustomed' (p.129), in the reintegration of migrants into their community through reciprocity in the *Masha* songs (p.116), and in the cyclical rotation of festivals in general.

The fact that there is a distinction between what is said through words and what is said by the heart implies a mistrust of the use of language; this is also evident in the discussion of Felipe in the *Apu Inka* (Chapter Four, p.174). The verb *pretendo* 1PRES 'claim, hope' is also ambiguous in implying uncertainty about how genuine the communication is. It is likely that this verb is deployed in place of the AQ dubitative –*chi*, whereas the more definite final line would correspond to –*mi*, which is certain and emphatic. Thus, it is possible that the AQ evidential system is maintained as a conceptual schema in the Spanish verses of the *Negritos*. The mention of *corazón* 'heart' as the final locus of communication recalls the discussion of its AQ cognate, *shonqu*, where the heart encapsulated reason, emotion, ethics and even essence (pp.114-115). Through emotional and cognitive approximation, the *negrito* thus aims to form a productive unity with the *guiadora*, grounded in genuine communicative reciprocity.

The final two lines, *Al fin te pido bella guiadora / Que serás bien recibida* 'Ultimately, beautiful *guiadora /* I ask that you be well received', are somewhat ambiguous. The informal second-person singular object *te* 'to you' makes it clear that the request is directed towards the *guiadora* herself. Yet the request is that she be well received. This, at first, is puzzling: how is it possible to request to an individual that (s)he be well received? Surely this depends on the people who receive her, not on the person who is received. However, this is not necessarily the case. The suggestion here is that the *guiadora* is herself responsible for how well she is received. The focus, then, is on communicative reciprocity, whereby a relation can be formed only when both sides are willing to form it. The *guiadora* is implicitly told that she can only be received if she is willing to move towards the receiver. The fact that this is conveyed in implicit, rather than explicit, form suggests caution, where the speaker is hedging his bets, testing the water, so that he does not give too much if the *guiadora* is unwilling to give in turn. This recalls the ambivalence of VR *pretend-* 'claim', where the communication cannot be entirely genuine if it is not based on the trust that develops after several encounters.

The phrase *al fin* 'in the end, ultimately' conveys precisely this sense of bonds being made through time, where layers of reciprocal encounters build on previous layers to form the stable base for genuine bonds of trust and affect. If, as the *negrito* hopes, the *quiadora* is well received, then the *fin* 

'ending' is also a new beginning. The expression *al fin* can also be used in a colloquial sense to introduce the conclusion of one's previous utterances. Thus, the ambiguity again allows the speaker to hedge his bets, in that the *guiadora* can interpret a variety of possible messages; nonetheless, the *negrito* allows for their communication to become gradually closer if the *guiadora* is willing to attune herself to the same wavelength. The word *bella* 'beautiful' conveys distance as much as attraction, being deployed in an honorific rather than affective sense. All in all, the ambiguity of the words allows the speaker to convey willingness to open relations with the opposite party, whilst also being a get-out strategy which allows him to state that the meaning has been misinterpreted should the *guiadora* not be willing to accept. Thus, the *negrito* avoids the risk of giving more than he receives. This can be understood in terms of *tinku*, where meaning is constantly re-negotiated in accordance with what one comes to know about the Other. This dialogic process is not without danger, hence the *negrito*'s caution. Allen expresses the danger inherent in dialogue in the following passage:

'through *tinkuy*, social unity is created dialectically and expressed in terms of complementary opposition. Although *tinkuy* refers to ritual dance-battles, the word has wider applications...When streams converge in foaming eddies to produce a single, larger stream they are said to *tinkuy*, and their convergence is called *tinku* (or *tingu*). *Tinkus* are powerful, dangerous places full of liberated and uncontrollable forces' (Allen 1988:205).

In the case of the *negrito's* encounter with the *guiadora*, there is no history of prior actions to enhance the probability of an auspicious result for both. Thus, the inherent 'beauty and violence' (Stobart 2006:144) of *tinku* – the approximation and the antagonism – have not yet been harnessed towards productive ends. The *tinku* is still in flux, negotiation, so ambiguity and ambivalence are necessary if the *negrito* is not to lose control completely. In the *Negritos* song, we see how deep intersubjective engagement is not automatic, but depends on reciprocal openness, or mutual willingness to engage (as suggested by the neurological studies of Brass, Ruby and Spengler whereby our intersubjective potentiality could be inhibited if closure were desired cf. p.55). If the *Anti* is willing, she will interpret his message correctly, and the dialogue can follow its natural intersubjective course. If not, then by hedging, the *negrito* has not given so much that it can be used against him.

The first two lines of the third verse, *No procures afligerte / A voz de cajón y clarenes* 'Do not try to be disdainful / With the voice of drums and bugles', are a warning not to stand aloof and maintain distance. The verb *afligerse* (*afligirse*) literally means 'to get upset', but, according to Don Marianito, the line means *no te pongas sobrada* 'do not become disdainful, haughty'. This suggests that the *guiadora* is only feigning to be upset, perhaps to avoid her interlocutor because of his low social

status. The fact that this melodrama would be *A voz de cajón y clarenes* 'With the voice of drums and bugles' (instruments that are commonly played in Andean festivals) probably alludes to the volume of the *guiadora's* voice as she complains. The third and fourth lines return to the theme of communication: *Porque ese van deciendo / Que hemos de tener mal fin* 'Because these only tell us / That we will finish badly'. The use of the continuous aspect in the form *deciendo* (from *diciendo* 'saying', VR *dec-* 'say'; gerund *-iendo*) conveys an underlying and preoccupying uncertainty. The notion of *mal fin* 'bad ending' is ambiguous. Is the ending bad for each as individuals, or for the possibility of them joining together? The implication is that both interpretations are correct, given the indications in our various texts that survival is the product of cooperation.

Several scholars, moreover, have noted the importance of gender-complementarity in the Andes. Silverblatt notes how, in Incan society, 'male and female occupations – defined as interdependent and complementary activities – were conceptualized as forming the basic unit of labor required for the reproduction of Andean society' (1980:154). Further, 'A dialectical view of oppositions, often phrased in terms of sexual parallelism, was a fundamental cosmological principle shared by Andean peoples' (1980:159), whereby the principal deity, Wiraqocha, combined 'both male and female sexual elements' and thereby contained 'all the forces that these elements symbolize: "the sun, the moon, day, night, winter, summer" (Pachacuti Yamqui 1950:220)' (1980:159). Silverblatt concludes that 'These forces stemming from the interplay between the model's male and female constituent parts were conceptualized as creating the driving energies of the universe. Thus, a fundamental cosmological structure which conditioned the Andean conception of the universe was in large part based on a dialectical view of the relations between the sexes' (1980:159). Harris, commenting on her findings in the contemporary Andes, states that 'It is the fruitful cooperation between woman and man as a unity, which produces culture, and which is opposed to the single person as a-cultural; culture is based on duality' (1986:25, mt). The dependence of each individual on gendercomplementarity is emphasized by Bourque, who cites Allen: 'Allen (1988:85) notes: "While each man and woman is a complete individual with both male and female qualities, the two unite to form another individual of a higher order: a warmi-qari, the nucleus of the household". In Sucre, Ecuador, the Quichua term has been replaced by the Spanish "marido-mujer", but the ideal of complementary and reciprocal necessity remains the same' (Bourque 1999:11, see also Bourque 1997:162).

What all of these authors suggest is that the *mal fin* 'bad ending' is much more profound than the end of a possible relationship. It is the denial of the possibility of survival, the unbalancing of the natural order where incompleteness means isolation and extreme vulnerability. The songs in this

chapter have, after all, illustrated how production and continuity depend on strategic unity which harnesses differences in the realization of shared goals. The phrase *mal fin* links with *al fin* in the previous verse, stressing the notion of an 'ending'. This serves to highlight the nature of the encounter as a progression from one state to another, unknown, state, demonstrating how interaction perpetuates the historical dynamic. Either the ending could be unity (*bien recibida*) or alienation (*mal fin*).

The fourth verse begins by comparing the *guiadora* to a flower: *Flor de rima rima / Regadita de aguas puras* 'Flower of *rima rima /* Showered with pure waters'. This kind of comparison is very common in *waynus*, and reflects the relationship between reproduction, agriculture and survival. The name of the flower, *rima rima* (*Krapfia weberauerii*), continues the theme of communication: *rima*- is the original VR for 'speak'. Today, however, it usually denotes negative gossip, with the old Spanish loan *parla*- used for 'speak' instead. Thus, we see a contrast between the *negrito*, who, in the second verse, states that he will communicate first with words and then with his heart, and the *guiadora*, who communicates only with words, but negatively; this again may reflect a mistrust of language. The second line probably refers to the privileges that the *guiadora* enjoys, particularly on analysis of the fourth line. The third line, ¿Por qué quieres despreciarme? 'Why do you wish to despise me?', is the opposite of reciprocity, in that individual pride is emphasized over unity. As we saw during the analysis of *Wayta Muruy*, egoism is antithetical to survival, given that survival is only possible through reciprocity.

The fourth and fifth lines, Confiado en los blancos / Siempre guidar marchitada 'Trusting in the white people / Always to lead withered', are a clear allusion to the racial inequalities that have existed in Peruvian society for centuries, where there was widespread exploitation of indigenous and Africandescended people by the European-descended elite. The absence of gender agreement in confiado (which would normally take the feminine ending –a) is characteristic of Andean Spanish. Here, the text implies that the guiadora has received privileges, been regadita de aguas puras 'showered with clear waters', as a result of her association with the exploiters. However, this is not conducive to a healthy existence because it rests on a state of inequality: the elite are always her superiors and she likewise exploits those in a less favourable position. This is why, if she follows this path, and continues to despise the negrito, she is destined to Siempre guidar marchitada 'Always to lead withered'. She may indeed lead, but this won't lead to flourishing and fulfilment because it is a denial of reciprocity. To cite Estermann, 'For Andean philosophy, the individual as such isn't just "nothing" (a "non-entity"); it is something completely lost if it isn't located in a network of multiple

relations. If a person doesn't belong to the local community (*ayllu*), because (s)he has been expelled or because (s)he has excluded him/herself through his/her own actions, it's as if (s)he didn't exist anymore' (1998:97-98, mt). Therefore, 'To disconnect oneself from natural and cosmic links...would, for the *runa* of the Andes, mean signing one's own death warrant' (1998:98, mt). In this song, then, reciprocity is not just advised but inevitable: positive reciprocity results in a fruitful outcome for all concerned; negative reciprocity is the process whereby ill effects boomerang back on those who conduct negative actions.

With the fifth verse comes a change of tone: Brindemos cristal de licores / Con estos dulces majores 'Let us drink crystals of liquor / With these sweet majores'. From the previous verses, which discuss the possibility of the quiadora entering into a relation with the negrito, comes an inducement to imbibe in food and drink, the sharing of which would indicate a greater unity. The phrase cristal de licores 'liquors of crystal' refers to a brand of beer, Cristal, ubiquitous at Andean festivals. The second line, Con estos dulces majores 'With these sweet majores' refers to an Andean sweet dish. However, cristal 'crystal' and dulce 'sweet' also seem to refer to the guiadora, particularly with the mention of aguas puras 'pure water' in verse four, and the fact that dulce is often used in amorous contexts; again, this possible play on words reflects the ambivalence and thereby the hedging. The third line, Desfrutar todas las prencesas is also ambiguous, due to the use of the infinitive which renders the verb disfrutar 'enjoy' devoid of a subject. One possible meaning is that it is the prencesas 'princesses' (i.e. the Antis) who enjoy themselves. This is the interpretation I have chosen in my translation, 'So that every princess may be joyous'. Another possibility is that the phrase refers to the *negritos*, who 'enjoy the princesses' in a sexual sense (the preposition *de*, which follows disfrutar and precedes its object in standard Spanish, is usually absent in Andean Spanish); this interpretation concords with the sexual overtones of the song. The negrito allows the quiadora to interpret the true meaning if she wishes to attune herself, but doesn't give too much away in case she remains aloof. The word prencesa (from Spanish princesa, with vowel-lowering [i] > [e]) is a term of endearment for young women, but here it also links with the theme of hierarchy and exploitation. Thus, this term is also ambivalent, conveying either strong attachment or the opposite sense of remoteness. I have translated the last line, Matezado con altura, as 'Adorned with elegance', as this is more natural in English. However, altura means 'height', and therefore suggests aloofness despite being, on the surface, a term of respect. In this line, too, there is ambivalence.

The sixth verse begins with a frank declaration of love: *El amor que te tengo* 'The love which I have for you'. The ambiguity returns, however, in the second line, which states that the love *En mi* 

corazón se queda 'In my heart will stay'. One possible interpretation is that the love exists in the person's heart. Another interpretation, however, is that the love will go nowhere outside of his heart, will not touch the heart of the guiadora. This second meaning is congruent with the rest of the verse: Viene un fuerte remolino / Mi bella prencesa se la lleva 'If a strong eddy should come / My beautiful princess will be carried off'. The notion of the 'eddy' relates to the theme of aguas puras 'pure waters' and cristal de licores 'crystals of liquor', and endows the natural elements with agency, as we saw in Wayta Muruy (pp.131-132). In the Andes, rivers are both a source of life and an agent of destruction, particularly in the rainy season where floods and strong currents frequently cause loss of life. In this verse, the 'eddy' may be anything – the allure of wealth, another man, or even just its literal meaning. Nonetheless, the obvious association with raging torrents foregrounds the vulnerability of life in the Andes, which requires strong reciprocal bonds in order to survive; thus, the lines are as much a warning against egoism as a regret at the possibility of losing the guiadora's affection. There is an interesting deictic transformation within this verse. In the first line, the guiadora is directly addressed as te 'you', whereas, in the last line, she is addressed in the third person, 'my beautiful princess'. While this may be honorific use of the third person, it also suggests distancing in that, grammatically at least, she is no longer a direct interlocutor.

The seventh verse describes the beauty of the quiadora, reverting to the second-person form: Qué hermosura eres prencesa / Con tres plumajes de colores / Qué bella te veo con tus velos / Y tus collares de oro y plata 'What beauty you are, princess / With three colourful feathers / How beautiful I see you with your veils / And your necklaces of gold and silver'. Again, the word prencesa 'princess' can be interpreted affectively or critically. The remaining lines describe the guiadora's beauty in terms of her dress, specifically her tres plumajes de colores 'three colourful feathers', her velos 'veils' and her collares de oro y plata 'necklaces of gold and silver'. This mention of wealth can be interpreted as a veiled criticism of the material success of those who exploit others by being confiado en los blancos 'trusting in the white people' (i.e. in the elite), negating reciprocity and thereby isolating themselves. The eighth verse concludes the song with characteristic ambiguity: Por estas bellas prencesas / El negreto se encuentra rendido 'Because of these beautiful princesses / The black man finds himself overcome'. The most obvious reading is that the *negrito* is overcome by his attraction towards the *guiadora*. However, a more sinister interpretation is that the *negrito* has been 'defeated' in the same way that Africans and indigenous Andeans have been exploited by the European-descended elite. This interpretation is highly plausible given the superior wealth of the guiadora, her association with the exploitative elite, and the indications of her unwillingness to

relate to the *negrito*. Huanchacbamba, where this text was performed, is, moreover, on the site of an old hacienda, where residents were exploited by the landowners.

The ambivalence dissipates for the concluding two lines: *Mi corazón lleno de alegría / Desfrutemos nuestra danza* 'My heart filled with happiness / Let us enjoy our dance'. The tone is that of *carpe diem*, despite the underlying uncertainty. The *alegría* 'happiness' is nonetheless non-committal, since it could result more from the music than love for the *guiadora*. Overall, then, this song illustrates a desire to form a unit through communicative reciprocity, but part of this reciprocity is in meeting the *guiadora* only halfway, not giving her too much of oneself should she reject the *negrito's* advances. There is also a strong but tacit criticism of the adverse effects of socially negating pride. A link is formed through the very act of communication, but it depends on the *guiadora* whether to convert it into a productive unity through mutual attunement. The tension in this song reflects Stobart's comments that, 'For young women, singing *takis* [songs] is a powerful expression of independence, freedom and sexuality whilst at the same time a critical force in shaping and defining their identity, as well as potentially securing a marriage partner' (2006:129). The extent to which the Self maintains its independence in contrast to the Other depends on the degree, and direction, of congruence between their predispositions, as we shall see on examination of Heidegger at the end of this chapter.

The negrito's first form of interaction with his counterpart is to express his interest towards her: Acércate bella noble guiadora / Venir pues guiadora valiente 'Come closer, noble guiadora / Come, then, brave guiadora'. Thus, he makes it clear that the guiadora is zuhanden (relevant) to him, suggesting that they may form part of a productive complementarity. This initial engagement, however, reveals that the guiadora is at first unwilling to respond with equal openness, and the negrito reacts to her distancing by withdrawing slightly. This was evidenced in the several examples of hedging, whereby the negrito mitigated his desire for openness with a cautious reserve. This is a clear instance of the trace in action, whereby lack of full engagement between interlocutors is itself a form of dialogue on the same terms, insofar as the parameters of dialogue are continuously negotiated.

The scenario also reveals the temporal progression of *Dasein* through interaction, for the latent potentiality of the *negrito* (i.e. one of relative openness) changes to a more cautious disposition. Thus, one's projection towards others changes according to the projection of the Other towards Self, as conveyed by Heidegger's depiction of the transition from *zuhanden* (potentiality) to *vorhanden* 

(actualization of potentiality through particular forms of interaction), which in turn informs future modes of engagement as *zuhanden*. How one perceives the Other (*zuhanden*) informs how one behaves (what one, in effect, becomes) (i.e. *vorhanden*) in the context of that specific interaction. Once again, we are reminded of the temporal nature of Being in *Dasein*, whereby our situatedness in a particular context (*Geworfenheit* 'thrownness') allows for particular modes of engagement (*Verfallen* 'fallenness') which inform the stances we take up towards in future encounters (*Existenz* 'existence'). In the context of the *Negritos* song, the subject modifies his initial openness in response to the *guiadora's* relative closure, yet retains his desire to interact in an albeit circumscribed form.

My account of this song in terms of the *trace* and *Dasein* dialogues with several of the Quechua concepts that I have fed through this thesis. While *ayni* (productive reciprocity) has not yet been achieved, contrary to the *negrito's* wishes, the meeting can certainly be interpreted as a kind of *tinku* (convergence through opposition). The nature of the Other is ascertained through interaction which unavoidably entails a process of mutual attunement (modification of one's self-projection in accordance with the self-projection of the Other). The process can also be understood in terms of *yachay*: getting to know the Other by affecting and being affected in turn. While the main theme of this song is the *guiadora's* unwillingness to 'open up', her very conveyance of this unwillingness is itself a revelation of Self, namely her potentiality to be distant and haughty in certain contexts! The *negrito* endeavours to actualize other latent potentialities that he senses in his interlocutor, and which may be more conducive to his underlying goals (probably reproduction).

The Negrito desires to move from knowledge of the guiadora's potentialities in superficial situations (i.e. her potentiality to be haughty) to deeper knowledge of her potentialities in more abiding situations (i.e. those that develop through trust), as illustrated by the distinction between simple communication and communication de corazón 'from the heart'. This deepening of mutual attunement over time recalls the designation of the rukyana as yarpay shonqullachi 'mindful heart' in Masha, the treatment of the bull yachanqanpita 'in the way to which it is accustomed' in Wayta Muruy, as well as the cyclical rotation of festivals more generally. Thus, the Negritos song conveys the unfinished business of yachay, where knowledge 'of' something is never complete, because different potentialities become actualized in different situations. This dialogues with the everevolving nature of Merleau-Ponty's chair, where no entity is entirely self-contained, with the infinite deferral of meaning in Derrida's trace, where meaning is never conclusively located in just one 'concept', and with the ever-evolving nature of Heidegger's Dasein, where Being is not definable in

terms of particularized qualities but rather in terms of continuously evolving stances. The *Negritos* song dialogues with the presentation of the Turks in *Wayta Muruy* by illustrating just how easy it is for people to choose a path of egoism and destruction over the life-enhancing principle of *ayni*. This recognition of the precariousness of Self arguably serves to reinforce, for participants, the underlying rationale of engaging in socially minded forms of behaviour (just as, in Chapter Two (Part Two), the acknowledgement of the existence of the non-Andean alter led to a strict bracketing that negated, ideologically, the incursion of this Other into the Self). This again recalls the *trace*, whereby the positive (in this case, *ayni*) only makes sense in relation to the possibility of its negative (egoism).

#### Conclusion

At the start of this chapter, I stated that the chapter's central focus would be on the notion of ayni, which I defined as congruent with the English term 'reciprocity'. From the elucidation of ayni in the Andean songs would come a point of dialogue between the Andean data (on the one hand) and the European philosophies of Merleau-Ponty, Derrida and Heidegger (on the other hand). This dialogue has been the main thrust throughout this chapter, foregrounded especially in the summaries that follow my textual analysis of each song. This dialogue between data and theory has also involved dialogues internal to both the data and theory: comparisons have been drawn between the different songs, while chair, trace and Dasein have all been set in dialogue with each other. My purpose in this conclusion is to synthesize these different dialogues that have developed over the course of the Chapter. First, I present a more extensive review of Dasein than in Chapter One, in order to illustrate precisely how Merleau-Ponty's notion of chair, and Derrida's notion of trace, at once inform and are partially implied by Dasein. This anticipates the final synthesis in Chapter Five. The fact that the theory evolves incrementally in the thesis means that the 'framework' of analysis is not an inert and monolithic block imposed at the outset, but instead constitutes a dialogue of its own, one which, moreover, is brought into relation by the parallel dialogues within the data. The other half of this chapter's conclusion is the illustration of how this theoretical dialogue in turn illuminates these data-internal dialogues.

# Synthesis of Chair, Trace and Dasein

Heidegger's treatise fundamentally concerns the issue of 'Being'. He argues, in the introduction to his main treatise, *Sein und Zeit* (*Being and Time*), that, since the time of Socrates, European philosophy has neglected the question of Being by focusing erroneously on the nature of individual

beings (entities) and considering the question of Being – in its universal sense – as meaningless. In an effort to understand the nature of Being, Heidegger creates the term German *Dasein*. Most generally, this refers to the 'human being', though interpretations differ as to what aspect of humanity is stressed. For Brandom (2002:325), *Dasein* is the specific *mode* or *style* of 'being' enacted by humans, while, for most other scholars (e.g. Haugeland 2005), *Dasein* refers more to the *kind* of entity that humans are (Wheeler 2011, <a href="http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/heidegger/">http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/heidegger/</a>, accessed 12/06/12). Specifically, *Dasein* operates with a pre-intellectual grasp of what it means to develop through interaction with other entities. This is evident in the etymology of *Dasein*: prefix *da*- 'there'; *sein* VR 'be'. *Dasein* therefore entails situatedness in a specific context, grounding human existence in inextricably relational terms. Interaction with the world is not something that people choose; rather, it is what it means to be a person in the first place: 'So far as *Dasein* is at all, it has Being-with-one-another as its kind of Being' (1927/1962:163).

In Dasein, our inherent quality as situated within, and open to, our environment means that elements of the environment are not just out-there, but are perceived in terms of their relevance to ourselves. Heidegger describes elements that are engaged with in this way as zuhanden 'ready-tohand' (1927/1962:101), able to be deployed in the manner of 'tools'. Here, 'tool' is to be taken in a much wider sense than mere 'instrument'; what the term zuhanden conveys is the fact that entities appear to us as relevant, able to be related to in specific ways that concord with our predisposition, as affordances for action (cf. Gibson 1979). Dasein's defining-out of entities as zuhanden is therefore informed equally by the predisposition of the perceiver and of the entity that is engaged with. The latter projects itself into the world (simply by existing) and the former interprets this as a potentiality for a particular form of engagement, depending on the former's predisposition at that time. A concrete example is that I may feel the difference between infra-red and ultra-violet light (the former burns less than the latter), but I cannot engage with it visually since I am not biologically able (predisposed) to do so. A less absolute (but equally pertinent) example is that, if I am cold, I will view a blanket as something that I can put on my bed, whereas, if I am too hot, I will instead view it as something to remove. In both examples, potentiality-for-action is informed by mutual attunement of predispositions (ayni).

The Andean songs suggest that this mutual attunement can be extended to all living forms, in the sense that all organisms respond to the environmental influences around them, but always in the context of pre-existing dispositions from both sides (e.g. the tree in *Carnaval* and the bull in *Wayta Muruy*, who react reciprocally to favourable actions towards them). The potentiality-for-action that

is entailed by *Zuhandenheit* can even be extended to the non-living world, if we read it as potential-to-affect. Indeed, Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* conveys how the reactivity of matter leads to entities *per se* (not just human ones), since the entity is defined in terms of what it affects and how it is affected; this is conveyed by the Quechua concept of *patsa* (*pacha*) which signals the operation of *ayni* across all domains of the natural world. If, as encouraged by the Andean expressions, we incorporate Merleau-Ponty's insights on *chair* into *Dasein*, the two philosophies provide a potent framework for understanding the nature of Being in a sense that is congruent with the Andean texts.

For Heidegger, our self-realization through engagement with elements that are zuhanden (relevant to us) is only possible if, at first, 'Dasein has no conscious experience [either] of the items of equipment in use as independent objects', or 'of himself as a subject over and against a world of objects' (Wheeler 2011, http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/heidegger/, accessed 12/06/12). At first glance, this may seem contradictory. How is it possible to engage with something if the distinction between Self and Other is not consciously perceived? However, Heidegger is not saying that there is no difference between perceived and perceiver. He is saying that the perceiver's subsequent awareness of this difference is predicated on a prior state of simple engagement within which Self and Other take form. Through engagement, the perceiver comes to be aware of itself as having particular latent properties and a particular disposition, a stance towards the element that it beholds and that likewise comes to be perceived as a separate entity that affords a particular course of action. The defining-out of Self and Other is thus realized through a non-subject-object form of engagement where there is only latent potentiality, yet to be realized as 'properties' of distinct 'entities'. While I have used the term 'awareness' as relating to conscious beings, it must be reiterated that the same framework can be applied to all entities. 'Awareness' is simply an instance of the more general category of 'affectability' or 'reactivity'. The reciprocal reaction of two chemical elements – which realize their potentialities only through interaction – can equally be understood in terms of *Dasein* (if we incorporate *chair*) without the necessity of any conscious experience of this.

Now, the latent potentialities of each entity-in-waiting do not emerge from a vacuum. A crucial dimension of *Dasein* is that it is the prior acts of engagement with the diverse phenomena of the world across the historical trajectory that lead to *Dasein* acquiring a certain predisposition in the first place. This is what Heidegger terms the *vorhanden* – those potentialities for action that do, in fact, inhere in the Self and surrounding World. The *vorhanden* can be roughly glossed as 'property', insofar as they are the factual realizations of potentiality that inform future possibilities for interaction. (In reality, 'property' is an inaccurate translation because the flowing nature of time

means that, just before potentiality is fully realized as property, it becomes a new potentiality that undergoes the same process over and over again; this is clear in the fact that the 'present' is never quite localizable. Similarly, the Quechua concept of *yachay* conveys how full knowledge is never *quite* attained, because everything is constantly evolving. But we can justify the imperfection of translating *vorhanden* as 'property' insofar as language urges us to quantify and define, and thereby precludes any possibility of *conclusively* expressing Heidegger's philosophy. Ultimately, *Dasein*, *chair* and *trace* have to be grasped intuitively, and this is part of the purpose of the dialogue in this thesis.)

It is the cyclical interaction between *Vor*- and *Zuhandenheit* that opens up a dialogue with Derrida's *trace*. As we saw in Chapter One, the *trace* can be understood as an unmotivated discursive inertia which engenders specific dispositions. These dispositions then inform the kinds of dialogue we enter into in future situations. Just as the realization of *vorhanden* as 'property' is also the projection of new potentiality as *zuhanden* (ability to affect and react in specific ways), so the trajectory of the *trace* leads on from past predispositions in such a manner as to create new dispositions based on what has gone before. The inherent movement of the *trace* dialogues with the cyclical temporality of *Vor*- and *Zuhandenheit*. There is, however, an important disjuncture between the two philosophers: while Heidegger takes *Dasein* as the foundational concept of his analysis and defines it in terms of 'temporality', Derrida's strategy is to focus on the *relation* between words, ideas or concepts. Derrida does not define anything in terms of the *trace* in the way that Heidegger defines the 'human being' in terms of *Dasein*, because the act of doing so would be to privilege the 'substantive' over the 'processual'. By seeking to *define* humanity in terms of *Dasein*, and *Dasein* in terms of temporality, Heidegger slips back into the realm of the ontological, which is precisely what he wishes to escape from.

This reluctance to fully let go of the 'category' (the inertia of the *trace*?) may account for why Heidegger centres his attention on the 'human being', and does not engage with the full potential of his ideas in accounting for the mutual constitution of beings in general. Derrida's *trace*, being one of many terms that Derrida sets into dialogue with each other, is not definable in terms of anything and has no pretensions to apply to certain 'categories' of reality. Thus, rather than seeing temporality as the foundation for Being (understood as *Dasein*), Derrida posits 'pure movement' as the process whereby entities come into existence (Derrida 1967:92). Thus, Derrida's notion of *trace*, like Merleau-Ponty's *chair*, allows us to extend Heidegger's ideas beyond the conceptual level, by not privileging any dimension of reality (e.g. the 'human') in the manner of *Dasein*. While Derrida and Merleau-Ponty came from different philosophical schools (deconstructionist and phenomenological,

respectively), each with different aims and orientations, their notions of *trace* (Derrida) and *chair* (Merleau-Ponty) exhibit many similarities, namely their preoccupation for exploring what lies beneath the substantive and their conclusion that the 'thing' (whether entity or concept) is mutually constructed through relation. The *trace* conveys mutual constitution primarily in the sphere of discourse, while *chair* grounds this on the physicality of our existence (an important distinction which I will draw on more in Chapter Five). When *Dasein*, *trace* and *chair* are placed in dialogue, they provide a robust means of accounting for the Andean expressions in this thesis, all of which indicate the mutual constitution of beings. None of these three terms is self-sufficient: the situatedness of *Dasein*, the movement of the *trace* and the physical presencing of *chair* are all necessary in order to understand how entities are ever contingent and dynamic, constantly ramifying into novel forms of being.

For Heidegger, the temporal nature of *Dasein* is manifest in three dimensions, or 'horizons' (1927/1967:175-180). The first, *Geworfenheit* 'thrownness', means that the human actor finds him/herself ineluctably in a particular environment (that is the *da*- 'there' of *Dasein*), so that his/her possibilities of action are limited. The second horizon, *Verfallen* 'fallenness', represents the actor's engagement with phenomena in the current environment. The third horizon, *Existenz* 'existence', entails *Dasein's* potentiality-for-being (*Seinkönnen*), insofar as, based on its interactions in the present, it projects itself in a particular way towards the future, only for the cycle to repeat itself again as 'thrownness'. Korab-Karpowicz puts the relationship between these three horizons nicely: original time

'is a movement through a world as a space of possibilities. The "going back" to the possibilities that have been (the past) in the moment of thrownness, and their projection in the resolute movement "coming towards" (the future) in the moment of existence, which both take place in "being with" others (the present) in the moment of fallenness, provide for the original unity of the future, the past, and the present which constitutes authentic temporality' (2009, <a href="http://www.iep.utm.edu/heidegge/">http://www.iep.utm.edu/heidegge/</a>, accessed 12/06/12).

Taken together, these three terms describe the way in which *Dasein* realizes itself through interaction with the environment, whereby circumstantial phenomena contribute to *Dasein's* acquisition of a certain predisposition, which is constantly negotiated (either strengthened or realigned) through interaction with future phenomena in accordance with that predisposition. We can therefore talk of *Dasein* as motivated only in a contingent sense: our predisposition is experienced as motivation, as strategies of engagement, but this predisposition is attained only through prior acts of interaction that lie at an ontologically deeper level than any conscious attempt

to control them. Thus, Heidegger's philosophy, like *chair* and *trace*, advocates neither free will nor determinism: we do not have complete free will because our disposition depends on previous interactions, but neither are we are fully determined because these interactions are informed equally by both sides, in a dialectic process that, in the Andes, is denominated *ayni*, *tinku* and *yachay*.

### Dialogue with the Andean Songs

Now I summarize how the notion of *Dasein*, strengthened by the dialogue with *chair* and *trace*, dialogues with the Andean songs in this chapter. In *Carnaval*, we saw the operation of *ayni* in the circulation of resources, where, as in *chair* and *Dasein*, Self and Other emerged through interaction: each individual could only sustain him/herself by partaking in a web of interdependence with others. This recalled the Quechua concepts of *kallpa*, which, like *chair*, is both a dynamic and unifying agent, and *kamay*, where creation derives from the interaction of potentialities. The historical nature of this process of mutual emergence, conveyed by the temporality of *Dasein*, was evident in the cyclical rotation of the festival from year to year. The predication of *ayni* on dialogue, as conveyed by Derrida's *trace*, was exemplified in the act of 'speaking' (*rimay*) to the tree. As Heidegger reveals through the transition from *zuhanden* (possibility to interact) to *vorhanden* (the parameters of interaction), entities become related to at ever-deepening levels by way of this dialogic process. Thus, the dialogue with the tree could be interpreted as a process of mutual attunement, in line with *yachay*, whereby knowledge is never complete but instead in a continuous process of dialogue, just as *Dasein* (taken as the 'being') is constantly evolving through interaction.

The *Masha* songs likewise conveyed the operation of *Dasein*, *chair* and *trace* in many instances. In the first song, the sharing of the same *chair* allowed for the dialogic emergence (through the *trace*) of complementary opposites: the husband and wife (the complementarity of which was indexed by the Quechua terms *maha* 'partner' and *wallqi* 'companion'), and the two halves of the village (who mirrored each other, by waiting and being waited for). In both cases, the complementarity was brought into strategic mode by dialogue, which allowed for the initial potentiality as *zuhanden* (ready-to-hand) to realize itself as *vorhanden* (present-at-hand, a concrete and stable basis for subsequent interaction), and thereby engage in the creative process of *kamay*.

The second and third *Masha* songs built on the first song, insofar as the *vorhanden* complementarity, established between the two halves, became a new *zuhanden* potentiality for

productive exchange. This potential realized itself (became *vorhanden*) in the *ayni* that operated between the *rukyana* and *awelitu* (on the one hand) and between urban migrants and local residents (on the other hand). We saw, moreover, how the same discursive *trace* that lay at the basis of this interaction (complementary opposition for the purpose of survival) operated at many levels: mountain/coast; upper *ayllu*/lower *ayllu*; rural/urban. Thus, as in *Dasein*, the entity is definable in terms of the dialogues that are entered into, rather than a numerable set of intrinsic 'properties'. The temporal nature of *Dasein* was expressed in the cyclical dynamic of the festival, a cycle which is not mere repetition but ever-evolving configuration of the relational process (as shown by the operation of the same *trace* to the new rural/urban context). This dialogues with the openness (and thus incompleteness) of *yachay*, where knowledge is attained through the neverending reciprocal chain of *ayni*.

The fourth *Masha* song likewise illustrated how the historicity of *Dasein* derives from a state of interaction out of which entities derive their existence. The Quechua concept of *tinku* conveyed how entities continuously redefine themselves and re-emerge from a pre-ontological state of interaction, along a specific historical trajectory. Concretely, the reproductive interaction between parent-bull and parent-cow engendered a form of self-perpetuation in the form of the young bull, which was at once different from its parents and yet also the fusion of them. Thus, the *vorhanden* (pre-existing) states of 'male' and 'female' became a *zuhanden* potentiality for novel modes of self-projection (as *vorhanden*) into the future, in the creative enterprise of *kamay*. This interactivity through *tinku* was possible because of the sharing of the same substance (*chair*) and was directed along an unmotivated discursive inertia (the *trace*), which, in this instance, was the reality of life as self-perpetuating through reproduction. The continuous operation of the *trace* through the *vorhanden-zuhanden* tandem was evident in the fact that the young bull in turn partook of a new opposition with its counterpart from the other *ayllu*. And this opposition fed back into the discourse of the strategic separation of both *ayllus* which allowed for the production of *ayni*, and perpetuated the same *trace* of 'survival through reciprocity'.

Wayta Muruy dialogued similarly with Dasein, chair and trace. The Quechua concept of ayni was evident in the mutual attunement of the interlocutor with the bull, the seeds, the stream, and the main participants, in treating them in ways that would encourage them to perform the tasks that the interlocutor wished to be completed. Thus, through mutual attunement (ayni) in a process of convergence (tinku), each side realized its zuhanden potentialities as vorhanden properties (from able-to-do to having-done) (kamay). The inclusion of non-human element in this dialogue recalled

the Quechua concept of *patsa* (*pacha*), whereby the universe can be interpreted as a sphere of engagement between diverse potentialities in the overall flow of *kallpa* (vital energy). Thus, as in the other songs in this chapter, the basis for interaction is the sharing of the universal and dynamic substance of *chair*.

The temporal progression that is implicit in any form of interaction and that is fundamental to *Dasein* was illustrated particularly in the treatment of the bull and the four-fold division of the participants. In the case of the bull, the phrase *yachanqanpita* 'in the way to which it is accustomed' conveyed, as is implicit in the root *yacha*- (*yachay*), the ever-deepening nature of understanding through mutual attunement. Thus, *zuhanden* potentiality is constantly realizing itself as *vorhanden* property which, in the very instant of realization (*kamay*), becomes a new *zuhanden* potentiality for further forms of interaction. Likewise, and similarly to the discussion of the bull in *Masha*, the dual division between gender and age among the participants conveys the historical dynamism of reproductive interaction, where the fusion of two entities results in the ontogenesis of new entities with novel potentialities. This process, however, continues to operates along the same discursive trajectory of the *trace*, which, as in *Masha* and *Carnaval*, remains the self-perpetuation of life through interaction. This *trace* also operated in the contrast between the socially-minded participants and the egoistic Turks, which functioned, so I argued, in order to maintain life-enhancing social stability. Again, *zuhanden* potentiality (to avoid being egoistic) was actualized as *vorhanden* property (social mindfulness).

Finally, the *Negritos* song also dialogued with *Dasein*. The *negrito* first conveyed his appreciation of his interlocutor as *zuhanden* (relevant) in a positive way, but, in attunement with her distancing, began to distance in turn. He hedged his comments to avoid opening up too much in the event that the *guiadora* might turn hostile. Thus, in accordance with the projection of the *guiadora's* behaviour, the *negrito's* potentiality for distancing was actualized. Thus, in accordance with Derrida's *trace*, the parameters of meaning were continuously negotiated between the interlocutors. Nonetheless, the fact that the *negrito* is unwilling to fully abandon his goal of productive interaction (probably reproduction) suggests that he senses a *vorhanden* potentiality in the *guiadora* that might yet remain unactualized. Thus, in an understanding of the emergence of properties through congruent interaction, the *negrito* aims to negotiate the parameters of dialogue along his predisposed lines, encouraging the *guiadora* to actualize her latent capacity for open exchange (so that the *vorhanden* disposition can be actualized in a way that is relevant, *zuhanden*, to the *negrito*).

We do not know whether the *negrito* is ultimately successful, but the important point for this thesis is that the song's rationale is the ability – indeed, unavoidable necessity – of entities to change through interaction, a historicity that is central to *Dasein*. The inherent interactivity of entities is conveyed by the Quechua concepts deployed in this chapter, particularly *ayni*, *tinku*, *yachay*, *kallpa* and *kamay*. As with the Turks in *Wayta Muruy*, the *Negritos* song shows that we all have the capacity to engage in life-enhancing cooperation or life-denying egoism (the oppositions that are engendered by the discursive *trace*). Which potentiality is realized depends on which discourses one is exposed to, and how one is disposed to relate to these discourses, or, in other words, precisely how the *zuhanden* potentialities become actualized as *vorhanden* properties.

In this chapter, we have seen how the notions of *chair*, *trace* and *Dasein* all dialogue with the Andean philosophical visions that emanate from the songs. This dialogue reveals 'identity' to be neither meaningless nor fully definable, for meaning inheres in the reactivity that allows entities to develop in the first place. Webb beautifully expresses the foundational insight that unites the various philosophical expressions in this chapter:

'In Andean thought, the relationship between entities or energies is considered an everchanging condition, one that is constantly shifting, creating, and recreating itself with each encounter. Because of this, the achievement of "balance" is never a static condition but is always context-dependent and requires continual maintenance according to each circumstance. Self-other encounters are therefore never taken for granted but reassessed with every situation. There is an acknowledgement that self and other are never and can never be separated, for each depends on the other for mutual recognition and reciprocity' (2012:73).

The next chapter explores a discourse that may seem difficult to reconcile with the philosophical visions that we have just engaged with. Central to the chapter is a vision of intrinsic difference and ultimate incompatibility. Nevertheless, I shall show that this discourse can also be understood within the same dialogic framework that I have developed throughout the course of this thesis, just as the opposing halves of Chapter Two met somewhere in the middle. In the following pages, however, this meeting – the foundational tinku – is a clash of titans, as two civilizations rush headlong towards a battle whose explosive force still resonates across the mountains, valleys and plains of a whole continent.



An ancient depiction of the sun at the archaeological site of Rarapunta, above Pacllón. In the next chapter, we shall see the importance of the sun for Andean politics and religion.



Don Marianito performing an Incan ceremony for Pachamama (Mother Earth). The surrounding students depict *chaskikuna*, the messengers of the Incas.

#### **Chapter Four**

### The Last Inca: Poetic Perceptions of the Past

The songs in the last chapter depicted ayni or 'reciprocity' as the vehicle for harnessing our intersubjective capacity to develop through interaction. The songs in this chapter are, in many respects, opposite to this. They depict closure and isolation, the inhibition of intersubjectivity. But concomitant with this is an equal desire for unrestrained communion with those deemed nonthreatening, indeed life-enhancing. With the negation of the threatening Other comes a universalization of that part of the environment that is willingly appropriated. We shall witness these themes in two main genres: Apu Inka, from Pomabamba province; Pallas from Bolognesi. Central to these texts is the depiction of the Inca and his encounter with the Spanish conquerors in the sixteenth century, when the Incan Empire fell to the armies of Spain. Such depictions of the 'Death of the Inca' are found across the Andes, and vary widely. They are principally performed in Ecuador, northern and central Peru, Bolivia, northern Chile and north-west Argentina, though less in the Incan heartland (Millones 1992:35). As Cornejo-Polar states, 'The catastrophe of Cajamarca [where the Spanish seized power from the Incas] made its mark forever in the memory of the Indian people and was emblemized in the death of Atahuallpa [the last Inca]: a fact and symbol of the destruction not only of an empire but of the order of the world (1990:170, mt). Cervone notes how the utopian depiction of the 'Inca' has been an important rhetoric also for political organizations, such as the Tupaq Amaru rebellion in 1781 and the Sendero Luminoso (Shining Path) (1998:107).

The earliest record of colonial dramatizations of the Incan/Spanish encounter dates from around 1555 in Potosí, Bolivia, as noted by Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela in the *Historia de la Villa Imperial de Potosí* (c. 1705) (Chang-Rodríguez 1999:49). The first concrete example of such a drama, however, was collected in the eighteenth century by Baltazar Jaime Martínez Compañón y Bujanda, Bishop of Trujillo. No text survives, but there are two illustrations of a drama entitled *La Degollación del Inca* ['The Beheading of the Inca'] (Millones 1992:34). A movement which has in all probability influenced the subsequent dramas is that of *taki onqoy* (*taqui onqoy*) 'dance sickness', a messianic movement that initiated around 1565, when Titu Cusi staged his rebellion against the Spanish yoke. This movement predicted the end of the Spanish Empire and the regaining of Andean sovereignity through the rebirth of indigenous gods (though, differently to the 'Death of the Inca' dramatizations, the focus was on local, not Incan, gods) (Chang-Rodríguez 1999:48). Another dramatization which

has probably influenced contemporary depictions is the conflict between Moors/Turks and Spaniards (Kapsolí 1985:124); we saw a reference to this theatrical discourse in *Wayta Muruy*, where the Turks were depicted as the antithesis of respectable behaviour. In the dramatizations, it is instead the Spaniards who assume the role of the Turks, in contrast to the morally enlightened Incas. Most contemporary examples of the 'Death of the Inca' reconstruct the capturing of the last Incan emperor, Atawallpa, by the Spanish conquistadors in 1532, though precisely which monarch is depicted varies from place to place.

There have been several studies on such dramatizations. One of the earliest commentaries was published by Balmori in 1955 regarding a text which he collected in Bolivia. Lara (1954/1989) published a dramatization which he claims to have obtained in Chayanta, Bolivia, although Itier (2000) has argued, on the basis of philological evidence, that the text was largely Lara's own creation. Howard (2002) examines the Chayanta text in the light of Itier's critique, in order to reveal changes in epistemology following the Conquest. In 1985, Meneses published a text from Llapo, Ancash, that was dated 1932, followed by Millones' (1988) study on a text performed in Carhuamayo, central Peru, and his subsequent (1992) comparison of this text with other dramatizations across the Andes. Beyersdorff (1993) discusses both historical and contemporary texts which she collected in Oruro, Bolivia. Wachtel (1977) compares a range of popular dramatizations of the Conquest across the Andes and Mesoamerica. González Carre and Rivera Pineda (1982) have examined a text which they collected in Santa Ana de Tusi, central Peru, while Burga (1988) explores the relation between dramatizations of the Conquest and other festivals in the Andes. Montoya (1993) explores the political and historical themes that are negotiated in the dramatizations, while Cornejo Polar (1990) argues that the dramatizations have resulted in the recreation of heterogeneity within Peruvian literature. Chang-Rodríguez (1999) traces the development of the dramatizations through history, and explores their dialogues with contemporary sociopolitical contexts. Husson (1997) takes a philological approach in order to expose the origins of the dramatizations. Two studies have been published which contain brief overviews of dramatizations in Pomabamba and Bolognesi provinces. Both centre on the departmental capitals, Pomabamba (Kapsolí, 1985) and Chiquián (Flores-Galindo, 1988).

Howard notes that, nowadays, such dramatizations are part of urban-*mestizo* tradition rather than rural communities (2002:23). I found that Bolognesi and Pomabamba were exceptions to this general tendency, since most of the settlements I visited had their own version of the *Pallas* or *Apu Inka* in addition to the traditional agricultural festivals. This is the case for the communities whose

songs are depicted in the present chapter. Nonetheless, it was also true that hardly anywhere in these two provinces was untouched by modernization: even the smallest settlements had their own schools with Spanish-speaking teachers. Thus, the 'true' indígena proved, in these provinces, to be a romantic myth that existed only in people's minds. If the indígena does not exist (is always 'somewhere else'), then is it accurate to call these discourses indigenista? The latter term is generally used to index romantic visions of aboriginal identity that are largely perpetuated by those who have assimilated into Hispanic society. It therefore contrasts with the 'true' indigenous expressions of 'native' communities. But if the 'true indigenous' category is nowhere to be found, then the term indigenista largely loses its contrastive meaning. The rural enactments of a romanticized Incan past thus refute any classification as either indígena or indigenista, because they show just how fluid and relative the terms 'rurality' and 'urbanity', 'indigenous' and 'Hispanic' actually are. In this chapter, and building on Chapter Two (Part Two), I shall argue that one of the main motivations for the texts' enactment is precisely this sense of dissonance between a priori categories and the interconnected, merging nature of daily life. The dramatizations' way of responding to this interconnectedness is, ironically, to reinforce the categories all the more. The texts in my corpus are atypical in one other dimension: most of the aforementioned dramatizations take the form of dialogue, whereas the texts I collected are musicalized poetic narratives. Lira and Farfán (1955) collected a similar elegy to the Pallas and Apu Inka in southern Peru; they suggest that the poem was written in the eighteenth or nineteenth century.

During this chapter, I illustrate how, through a wide variety of rhetorical features, the texts construct a rigid dualism between 'Andeans' and 'Spaniards'. The former are associated with an idealized, divine Incan community, while the latter are demonized as morally vacuous and fundamentally irreconcilable. The deployment of the present tense evidences the contemporary orientation of these depictions of the past, which, so I argue, are created with a view to resisting contemporary marginalization. As Chang-Rodríguez states, 'These different versions illustrating how history has been reinterpreted and dramatized in diverse regions of the old Inca empire underscore the continuing opposition of the Andean people to the dominant culture and their longing for a more equitable social order' (1999:38). My subsequent theoretical analysis of the texts builds on my conclusions to Chapter Two: I argue that discrimination has led to a split within the Self, resulting in abjection of the threatening, but internalized, Other, and the psychological bracketing of that part of Self that is deemed non-threatening. This bracketing is realized through a homogenous portrayal of each category, which allows for the negation of any relation between them. The key philosophical notion in this chapter will be Derrida's trace, which I invoke in order to show that the supposed

irreconcilability in fact confirms the hegemonic discourse of ethnic segregation. Thus, as in Chapter Two (Part Two), the very strategy of resistance perpetuates the same discriminating discourse that it purports to challenge. As illustrated in Chapter Three, Derrida's *trace* exists in complementary relation with Merleau-Ponty's *chair* and Heidegger's *Dasein*. Nevertheless, for the purpose of clarity, I have chosen to focus only on the *trace* in this chapter. In Chapter Five, all of the chapters will be synthesized in a global interpretation of 'identity'.

### **Apu Inka**

Apu Inka denotes the festivals and component songs performed throughout the province of Pomabamba for the patron saint of each village. The majority of the Apu Inka texts, which exhibit significant geographical variation, are now in Spanish. However, the villages of Vilcabamba and Huanchacbamba still preserve older texts in AQ, which run to several thousand words, in contrast to the shorter versions elsewhere. Here, I present extracts from the Huanchacbamba version, which is sung in that village in mid-September during the festival in honour of the Virgin and San Juan (St. John). The festival comprises the following characters: the Inca; Atawchi (brother of Atawallpa and Waskar, the two last rivals for the throne); three ñustas (Incan princesses); a ruku (elderly man with powers of divination through coca, maize and the traditional drink, chicha); Mama Warmi (mother of the Inca); Ollu Pisha (wife of Manku Qhapaq, the first Inca); sargentu (protector of the Inca); pispi cóndor (the condor); capitana (who sings most of the verses, except those sung by the Inca). While there is a limited list of characters, the whole community traditionally accompanies the performers. Don Marianito (DM), the custodian of the text and performer of the Inca, told me that, in his ancestors' days, fourteen ñustas were performed, each representing one of the fourteen Incas reputed to have existed. Whilst DM has the entire text written in a notebook, he mentioned that, before the advent of literacy, the Apu Inka was taught jointly by the capitana, who recited the verses, and a maestro 'master', who corrected the apprentice's errors. Thus, the verses were sung only by those trained to do so, a profession which required many years of practice and which still means that capitanas are reluctant to divulge the text, unless for a significant financial reward. Lara also notes how the text he claims to have collected required much financial negotiation (1957/1989:23-24).

As with all of the oral traditions in this thesis, the text is difficult to date, though it is likely to have gone through various stages of modification, with the blueprint perhaps even predating the arrival of the Spanish. In tracks five to nine of the accompanying CD, one can hear the songs from the

Pomabamba version of the *Apu Inka*, sung by Célica Álvarez Jaramillo. These songs are different from the Huanchacbamba text, but nonetheless provide an auditory introduction to the genre.

According to Carranza Romero, the term apu denotes both 'the most important person in an ayllu' and the 'spirit or power of the mountain; the Apu reveals itself to, and protects, those who appeal to it' (2003:34, mt). Similarly, Skar states that apu 'means forceful or powerful and can be used about a person as well as of the spirits. The term apu used about a person carries the connotation of honourable, but the status as such is based on power' (1982:21). Earls states the following about the wamani, an equivalent term for apu in the southern Andes: 'Associated with each ranch, and generally inhabiting a mountain close by, is the guardian deity and ancestor of the lineage, the Wamani...The Wamani is the most important deity of the Quechua pantheon for people's daily life. He has power over life and death...and is considered the absolute proprietor of the ranch' (1973:398, mt). The notion of apu, then, synthesizes communal identity in the person of a single leader, and grounds this solidarity on a power that emanates from the natural and divine realms. These themes are fundamental in the texts which we now proceed to examine in their portrayal of 'identity'. I have presented the following songs in the order in which they appear in the Apu Inka festival. Not all songs or verses can be presented, for reasons of space, but I have ensured that the omission of elements has in no way affected my interpretation. The titles for each song are those deployed by DM, and, in common with the previous chapter, are descriptive, either in terms of the prevailing message of the song, or the actions performed while the verses are sung.

### Inka Hipimuy

The festival opens with this song, whose title translates as 'bringing out the Inca':

Sargentullay vasallullay Kuyay runan inkantsikpa Inkantsiktam willaramunkina Ñustakuna chaallamunqantana Aqllakuna ripurimunqantana

Qatiy killa wayra chaki Qori pluma plumallaykiwan Qatiy killa wayra chaki Qori pullkana wayratsipankina Sergeant, vassal
Dear man of our Inca
Tell our Inca
Of the *ñustas'* arrival
Of the *aqllas'* coming

Moon-chaser, feet of wind With your feathers, feathers of gold Moon-chaser, feet of wind Sound your golden flute Tsatsay runa versoy runa Qori killay riwillaykiwan Tsatsay runa amawta inka Qaparikunkinam luwarikunkinam Elder man, learned man
With your sphere of golden moon
Elder man, wise Inca
Already you are calling, already you are
proclaiming

Kachaspari tushullaykiwan Ñawpallaykiman ripurimuni Qapaq inka chaskillaamay Taytantsikta/mamantsikta kushitsinaykipaq With your graceful dance
I arrive before you
Inca, creator, receive me
So you may please our father/mother

The first verse requests the sargentu 'sergeant' – aide, protector and vasallu 'vassal' of the Inca – to notify the Inca of the arrival of his *ñustas* and *aqllas* (female dignitaries). The request is couched in affective language, with the affective suffixes -lla and -y (the latter can also serve as first-person possessive), and the phrase kuyay runan inkantsikpa 'dear man of our Inca', where the most literal meaning of kuyay is 'love' or 'beloved'. The IPOSS -ntsik in Inkantsik 'our Inca' creates communality through common allegiance to the Inca. As with the several uses of this suffix in Chapters Two and Three, here its use is not strictly necessary, since there is no other, 'foreign', Inca against whom he could be contrasted. Thus, the purpose of this suffix seems to be phatic and community-building. The cooperative, rather than coercive, basis to the request is demonstrated by the suffix -mu (in willaramunkina) which serves to soften the imperative. Throughout this chapter, we shall see how the Inca is portrayed in benevolent terms, a trend which was already apparent in the sixteenth century writings of Garcilaso: 'The Inca, in the Comentarios Reales, was presented as a huacchacuyac, as John Murra indicates, "loving and kind towards the weak" (1978:176), a kind of beneficent father or generous governor with his subjects' (Burga 1998:328, mt). In the fourth and fifth lines, there is semantic parallelism between AQ chaamu- 'arrive' and Southern Quechua (SQ) ripumu- 'come'. Borrowing from another language to create semantic couplets has been a common Andean practice since pre-Hispanic times (cf. Itier 1992:1013 for SQ, and Muysken 1990:169-173, for Spanish in the contemporary Andes). As we progress through the text, we shall see many more SQ words with the theme of time and space; I discuss the implications of this later. As for why SQ is chosen here, this was the administrative language of the Incan Empire – the royal language – and is hence appropriate in the context of the song. Use of SQ serves to highlight the departure from ordinary space-time, and allows participants to enter more fully the imagined world of the Incas. The prestige of SQ has survived to this day: the majority of people I interviewed stated that SQ was quechua legítimo/verdadero/puro 'legitimate/true/pure Quechua', in contrast to other varieties (including their own), viewed as *dialecto nomás* 'mere dialect'. In truth, there is doubt as to whether SQ was the original language of the Incas themselves (p.49).

The second verse refers to the condor, performed by a male dancer who wears the animal's skin. Arnold and Yapita note how, 'All across the highlands, there is a network of beliefs related to the condor and its relation to production and reproduction of food-products' (1998:129, mt). Here, the condor is intimately associated with the Inca retinue, recalling Armela's comment that, in the Andes, the condor represents the apu (1971:143). In the song, the bird is referred to as qatiy killa wayra chaki 'moon-follower, feet of wind'. This alludes to the height and speed at which it soars. The condor's flight can be interpreted as an evocation of the vastness of the Empire. The Inca's realm stretches both horizontally and vertically, for the condor courses over the land, fast as the wind (wayra chaki), and soars so high that it almost touches the moon (qatiy killa). In the second line, qori pluma 'golden feathers' probably alludes to the sun's light on the condor's wings. The Apu Inka includes many references to qori 'gold', which, according to DM, symbolizes both the sun - for its colour – and the Inca, who was considered the sun's offspring. The last line refers to a pullkana or 'flute' which the condor plays during the festival and which is also of a golden colour. The notion of wayra 'wind' is reinforced in the parallelism between wayra chaki 'feet of wind' and wayratsipankina, which comprises: VR wayra- 'wind, blow'; causative -tsi; augmentative -pa; 2PRES -nki; temporal -na 'already', so that the whole meaning is roughly 'make blow a lot'. Armela notes that, when the condor circles above a population, it foretells the death of a notable figure (1971:143); thus, in the Apu Inka, the condor may also foreshadow the demise of the dynasty.

The third verse directly addresses the Inca himself, described as *tsatsay* 'elder' and *versoy* 'learned, wise'. *Tsatsay* conveys wisdom and strength, and can also mean 'patriarch' (Carranza Romero 2003:248). This term therefore reinforces the status of the Inca as leader of his people. *Versoy* 'learned' is a modification of *versado* 'well-versed' (Spanish), which, etymologically, has a clear focus on language as the basis of knowledge, more typical of European than Andean thought. Thus, the word appears to have been incorporated irrespective of etymology. This is supported by DM's explanation that the Inca is learned solely because of his divine origin. The *riwi* (in *riwillayki*) was a stone ball hurled at enemies in pre-Hispanic warfare. According to DM, the *riwi* of the *Apu Inka* is golden, and would cause objects to disintegrate when the Inca held it up, clearing the path ahead. While the moon (*killa*) is mentioned in the text, the association with the sun (the Inca's divine father) is obvious in the golden colour of the *riwi*, so that the Inca's possession of this sphere reinforces his status at the centre of the social order just as the sun is at the centre of the natural order; the Inca is

therefore imbued with the cosmic energy of his father (the sun and moon can be seen as extensions of a single dynamic entity, given the unity of gender which we witnessed in the previous chapter). The association between the *riwi*, the Inca and the sun is more than metaphorical, otherwise the *riwi* would not be perceived as endowing the Inca with divine powers. Indeed, Biondi and Zapata argue that 'metaphor [based on similarity] is predominant in literate cultures, articulated around phonetic writing and the book; and metonymy [based on contiguity] is predominant in oral cultures, whose axis is the spoken word' (2006:410, mt). In this verse, the *riwi* can be interpreted as the contiguous element that links the Inca with the sun.

In the third line, the term amawta 'master of knowledge, wise man' acts in parallel with versoy to emphasize the Inca's omniscient, semi-divine, nature. In the fourth line, the semantically parallel verbs qapari- and luwari- 'shout, make noise' refer, according to DM, to the sounding of the pututu (horn made of a conch-shell), deployed by the Inca as a signal of his arrival in a new town. The sounding of the pututu serves again to transport participants to the imagined world of the Incas. The fourth verse contains two more SQ terms, kachaspari 'brilliant, beautiful' and ripurimuni 'I come', which foreground the origins and prestige of the Inca. In kachaspari, the word's register foregrounds its meaning. The term *ñawpallaykiman* 'before you' (*ñawpa* 'before'; affective -lla; second-person possessive -yki; directional -man 'towards') indicates respect for the Inca, particularly with the affective -lla. The Inca is addressed as qapaq 'creator'. The first consonant of qhapaq, a SQ loan, is normally aspirated. DM, however, pronounced it without the aspiration, being a native speaker of AQ, where aspirates are absent. Thus, in common with the other texts in this thesis, I have written the word as I heard it pronounced. Taylor argues that the term denotes 'ostensible, visible power of (s)he who unites material wealth with other forms of power', such as bravery or vital energy (1987:27). Harrison states that 'Qapaq – a reiteration of (s)he who animates with its essential life-spirit, order and structure – transmits the idea of the concentration of power, not free, but ordered and providing life and strength' (1994:123, mt). Thus, this term describes the Inca not simply as a political ruler, but as imbuing life into the community united under him. Moreover, Qapaq is a Catholic eulogy to God – also termed Qapaq –, sung for Holy Week and funerals in the town of Pomabamba. This term therefore reinforces the divine nature of the Inca. The Inca's divinity is also evident in lines three and four: Chaskillaamay / Taytantsikta (mamantsikta) kushitsinaykipaq 'Receive me / In order that you may please our father (mother)'. Here, the Inca is a mediator between the devotee and the Saint or Virgin (depending on whom the festival celebrates). Indeed, the Saint/Virgin and Inca are described in the same way: taytantsik (mamantsik) 'our father (mother)' and Inkantsik 'our Inca'. This recalls Skar's findings in southern Peru that 'To communicate

with *hanaqpacha* [sky] it is necessary to do so through *apus'* (1982:11). The intertwining – but not merging – of Andean and Catholic references provides the resources for representing a common 'Incan' identity as an identity that is divinely sanctioned. This will become more apparent as we progress.

In this song, the focus is on presenting the cohesion of the Incan community, grounded on the basis of unconditional respect. A particularly salient example was the phrase *kuyay runan inkantsikpa* 'dear man of our Inca', which simultaneously conveyed the love at the basis of this unity (*kuyay*) and the solidarity in relation to the Inca (*inkantsik* 'our Inca'). Likewise, the use of SQ transported people to the space-time of the Empire. The Chayanta play that Lara claims to have collected displays similar themes: the Inca's subjects are described as his 'sons' (*churiykikuna*), and Sairi Túpaj, one of the main protagonists, states that *pay jina allin runaqa / k'achaqa mana ujwan kanchu* 'another man as notable / and generous does not exist' (1957/1989:54). In the *Apu Inka*, the super-human, divine, nature of the Inca was conveyed particularly by the term *qapaq* (*qhapaq*) 'creator, giver of life', by his role as mediator between devotees and the Saint or Virgin, and by the references to gold (sun) and silver (moon) which reinforce his celestial parentage. Similarly, the reference to the condor conveyed the boundless, seemingly universal, expanse of the Empire. The following verses illustrate how the breadth of the Empire is physically embodied by the festival's participants.

# Camino del Inca

The Spanish title of this song translates as 'The Inca's Path' or 'The Inca's Walk'. According to DM, it refers to the Inca's frequent journeys throughout the Empire to survey his territory. Participants act out this journey in miniature, within the confines of Huanchacbamba. I have selected the most relevant couplets for our discussion:

Kollkan Paata kuyay palacio

Manco Capacpa kipu kamayoqnin

Qillqay yachaq amawta Inca Ripurishunna kipullaykiwan

Rumpillanman ripurishunna Antarawan kena y pututo

Tsatsay runa ñawpa inca Riwillaykiwan hukwarishpana Kollkan Paata dear palace Manku Qapaq, animator of the kipu

Learned Inca, master of writing With your *kipu* we now set forth

Towards the *rompe* we will go With *antara*, *quena* and *pututo* 

Elder Inca, foremost Inca Clearing obstacles with your *riwi*  Hirka qaqapis witikunqanam Tsayllay shumaq riwillaykiwan Hills and rocks will give way With that, your beautiful *riwi* 

Amarukancha Cuzcuymanta Wayna Qapaq qori palacio Amarukancha of Cuzco

The golden palace of Wayna Qapaq

Manam ari relubrallantsu Mamantsikpa (taytantsikpa) Qorikanchannawqa It does not shine

Like our mother's (father's)

Qorikancha

¿Ima laaya rima rima wayta Qorikancha resay wasintsikpaq?

Where are the *rima rima* flowers For Qorikancha, our house of prayer?

Hatun calle Huancayomanta Mana pantay kuyay naani Large road from Huancayo
Dear road that does not err

The first verse alludes to Kollkan Paata, the legendary palace of Manku Qapaq, the first Inca (Bauer 1996:328); the palace is grounded in affectionate terms with kuyay 'loved'. The Spanish loan palacio 'palace' reinforces the prestige of the Inca; that a Spanish term is deployed in celebration of the conquered empire shows that Spanish is now a second native language which can be rhetorically deployed without any association with the European invaders. The word is not even phonologically integrated into AQ (there was no vowel-raising [o] > [u]). The second line refers to Manku Qapaq himself. The reference to the origin of the Empire arguably creates a feeling of continuity through time, whereby the individual monarchs are presented as manifestations of a single lineage. A sense of Andean solidarity is enacted through grounding in the distant past. The kipu, also mentioned in this verse, was a system of knotted threads used by pre-Hispanic Andean civilizations to store information; this information was interpreted according to the pattern of knots. Kipu kamayoq denotes the Incas' record-keepers, who acted as custodians of the kipus; here, the phrase suggests that the record-keepers would accompany the Inca during his travels. The Inca is subsequently defined as qillqay yachaq. The root yacha- denotes 'wisdom' and 'profound knowledge' (Carranza Romero 2003:285, mt), where yachaq (VR yacha-'know'; agentive -q) means '(s)he who knows, who understands, healer, sage' (2003:284, mt). For Howard, yachay is a 'transformational process which has to do with achieving a fuller state of being, in the sense that it is a process through which persons or states of affairs become "other" than what they were before the process was undergone'; knowledge is therefore gained intersubjectively, 'rather than as ready established, objectified fact, alienable from the experiential process in which it takes shape, and there to be

"got" in an instrumental way' (2002b:19, see also Stobart 2002:102). This suggests that, in line with Mohanty (2000), the basis of knowledge is also a question of identity, for Self and Other both change through interaction.

The other term is qillqay. Crickmay explains this word as follows: 'Appropriated as a noun by the Spanish to describe alphabetic writing, its previous verbal usage described the performance of many of the plastic arts, including painting, sculpting, engraving, carving and embroidering (de la Jara 1964:12), a range of skills in which a design is either brought out of or united with a plain surface' (2002:44). Crickmay argues that the conceptual basis of qillqa- is therefore "to make visible" or "to reveal" a latent image which has a communicative rather than a purely decorative function' (2002:44); Scharlau and Münzel argue that it meant 'indicate' or 'make a sign' (1986:7, mt). Carranza Romero describes Qillqay Rumi as a location containing stones with 'geometrical engravings which seem to be traces of the movement of the stars or the plan of a city' (2003:182, mt), which concords with Crickmay's explanation of the term as 'engraving' and 'carving'. In my experience, the term almost always denoted 'writing', though, contrary to Crickmay's findings, I heard it used mostly as a verb; Quechua word-categories are, in any case, highly porous. DM stated that the Inca was qillqay yachaq because of his knowledge of the kipu; this concords with the twofold mention of the kipu in close approximation to qillqay. The kipu, a system of knotted threads, has been discussed as an Andean form of 'writing' in scholarship (cf. Quilter & Urton 2002), given its capacity to communicate fairly detailed pieces of information. Moreover, DM described how the Inca would interpret natural signs in order to predict the future. This can be understood as a kind of mental cartography – a drawing of connections or engagement with various natural features – which is consistent with Scharlau and Münzel's (1986) interpretation of qillqay in terms of semiotics, and Crickmay's interpretation as "to make visible" or "to reveal" (2002:44). Astvaldsson (2006), moreover, argues that 'reading' can, in the Andes, be conceptualized as a way of locating oneself within the environment ('reading' the land). Thus, the phrase qillqay yachaq can plausibly be understood as 'interpreter of signs'. This concords with the general theme in endowing the Inca with a supernatural, semi-divine, aura, emphasizing his privileged relationship with the forces of nature and strengthening his role as the guiding principle under which people are united. Another, compatible, possibility is that DM was attempting to raise the prestige of Incan society by associating it with 'writing' as a standard of civilization. If this is true, then it would suggest a tacit belief in the superiority of European literary norms, despite his conscious adulation of the Incas as opposed to Hispanic society. The second line of the second couplet displays more SQ in ripurishunna 'we will go now', with the SQ VR ripu- 'go'.

The third couplet encourages the participants to enter the rompe. Here, Incan time is conflated with that of the festival; this, rather than rendering the experience less authentic, serves to emphasize the interpenetration of past and present, and the grounding of contemporary solidarity on a pervasive Incan essence. The participants proceed with three indigenous instruments: antara and kena, kinds of flute, plus the pututu horn (pronounced by DM as potuto, with vowel-lowering [u] > [o], as per Spanish phonology). The Spanish conjunction y 'and' coincides with the AQ nearequivalent -wan; this is a common tautology in modern AQ. The following couplets remind us of the Inca's magico-religious strength. He is addressed as tsatsay 'old, wise' and ñawpa 'foremost', and is able to move objects from a distance with the magical riwi (which I have argued embodies the energy of sun, pp. 193-194): Riwillaykiwan hukwarishpana 'Clearing obstacles with your riwi' (hukwariy literally means 'to move aside'). The next couplet reinforces the power of the riwi: Hirka qaqapis witikunqanam / Tsayllay shumaq riwillaykiwan 'Hills and rocks will give way / With that, your beautiful riwi'. Lara's text similarly makes reference to a golden sling (warak'a) which, when thrown by the Inca, can even destroy stars (1957/1989:74). These lines perpetuate the theme of an unstoppable journey, even more fundamental than great physical features. The indefatigable movement of the Inca conveys his inherent dynamism, a dynamism that can never be vanquished by mere physical features, for the Inca is the offspring of the sun on which everything depends. Solomon found that the notion of 'movement' had a similar role in conveying dynamism and fecundity in the Bolivian Andes: 'to move forward in space means to continue to be in force, to be alive, vibrant'; the Quechua notion of movement, 'while superficially similar to the English idea that "to move forward" is to "promote" (transitive) or to "progress" (intransitive), is actually very different, invoking at the same time a model from the past that must be followed' (1997:46). Indeed, in the Apu Inka, the notion of 'movement' intertwines the fabric of time and space, for the Inca not only travels across his ancient realm, but, in so doing, re-actualizes this realm in the context of the contemporary ritual.

In the next couplet, reference is made to the palace of *Amarukancha*; the name of the palace derives from the snake-figures carved on the walls (*amaru* is 'snake' in SQ). The second line reinforces that this was the *qori palacio* 'golden palace' of Wayna Qapaq, father of the last two rulers, Waskar and Atawallpa. This mention of Incan sites again stresses spatiotemporal unity and grounds participants' commonality more firmly in terms of the Empire. The affective/semi-possessive –y in *Cuzcuy* emphasizes the participants' common appropriation of this city; note the SQ suffix –*manta* 'from, of' (the AQ equivalent is –*pita*). Cuzco is pronounced in its hispanized form ([k] instead of [q]); I offer an

explanation of this later. Amarukancha, though beautiful, *Manam ari relubrallantsu / Mamantsikpa (taytantsikpa) Qorikanchannawqa* 'Does not shine / Like our mother's (father's) Qorikancha'. This is arguably because Qorikancha, being an intrinsically religious building, is where the association between Inca and divinity is most apparent. Qorikancha is equated with the church in Huanchacbamba: ¿Ima laaya rima rima wayta / Qorikancha resay wasintsikpaq? 'Where are the rima rima flowers / For Qorikancha, our house of prayer?'. This equation, as well as reinforcing the Incan world through citation of famous places, arguably serves to create an embodied feeling of Incan allegiance as they 'see' Qorikancha before them and 'feel' themselves to be part of an ancient retinue. Mannheim similarly notes how 'Peruvian Quechua storytellers personalize mythic tales by situating them in local places, thereby linking those present to a moral past' (Mannheim 1991, paraphrased by Ochs & Capps 1996:25). The reference to the *rima rima* flower (*Krapfia weberauerii*) denotes a common Andean practice of adorning religious figures with flowers (as witnessed in *Wayta Muruy*, Chapter Three).

The theme of the journey is perpetuated in the couplet *Hatun calle Huancayomanta / Mana pantay* kuyay naani 'Large road from Huancayo / Dear road that does not err'. The adjective hatun 'large' can refer to both width and length; Huancayo is a city in central Peru through which the principal Incan road passed. It is interesting to compare the Spanish calle 'street' with its AQ cognate, naani: the Spanish word describes the road's importance (it is hatun 'large'), whereas the AQ term describes it affectionately (it is kuyay 'dear, loved'). This may reflect the common association of Spanish with more serious functions, and Quechua with more emotive functions (Hornberger 1988; Gugenberger 1999; de Bedia & de Martinez 2001), but is not categorical since the accompanying adjective for calle, (i.e. hatun 'large') is not Spanish but AQ. The description of the road as mana pantay kuyay naani 'dear road that does not err' conveys the stability and infallibility of this main artery which binds the Empire together. The unerring nature of the road thus reinforces the solidity of the Empire as a whole, and can be seen as a metaphor of the proper channelling of vital energy throughout the Empire (the circulation of kallpa, cf. p.214). During the festival, moreover, this road is equated with a path in Huanchacbamba along which the participants walk on the imagined journey to Cajamarca (where the Incan retinue met the Spanish conquerors). This means that the kuyay naani is also a road to the distant past, for those who follow it metamorphose into the flesh and blood of their ancestors. The road, then, is a gateway to the very core of individual and social identity; it can never err because it is the path to self-realization, as individuals and as a community. This resonates with Stobart's experience in the Bolivian Andes: 'It is this power and desire – taking the form of a melody or "path" - which propels living beings forward in a quest for knowledge and

thereby for reaching their potential' (2006:102). In *Apu Inka* as in the other songs in this thesis, this quest for reaching one's potential is realized only through interaction, since potential can only arise if there is a social environment within which it takes form.

In this song, the notion of the 'journey' is played out in the following ways: 1) the allusion to past Incas to illustrate temporal continuity; 2) the mentioning of Incan monuments to reinforce integration with the Incan world, and the equation of two of these monuments (Qorikancha and the Inca road) with local features (the church and a village-path, respectively) so that this integration is embodied and thereby actively experienced; 3) the Inca's indefatigable perseverance in his removal of physical objects to open up the path; 4) the mention of the path as hatun calle 'large road' and kuyay naani 'dear road' in the final verse. In all of these ways, the procession of participants in Huanchacbamba is imaginatively re-invented as a royal retinue across the vast expanse of the Inca's territory, while the village becomes a microcosm of the Empire itself (just as, in Chapter Three, Mangas became a microcosm of the coast/mountain dichotomy). In the magically reinvented space of Apu Inka, the Empire is re-lived, experienced in all its physical and spatial dimensions. Moreover, as people assume the persona of their ancestors, the communal bonds that are reinforced during any festival become communal bonds of the Incan forefathers, with the result that the festival merges past and present to reaffirm the historical roots of contemporary identity. Rowe states of a similar text, 'The imaginary and the real are intertwined in a temporal scheme which unites past, present and future in simultaneity' (1993:48, mt). Thus, narrative 'can transport narrators and audiences to more authentic feelings, beliefs, and actions and ultimately to a more authentic sense of life' (Ochs & Capps 1996:24). Likewise Kaulicke: 'Myths are also "figures of memory". In this way, history becomes myth through memory, which doesn't imply a conversion towards the unreal, but, on the contrary, comprises a kind of normative and formative strength that is perpetuated. In this sense, memory has a sacred character, manifest in its presentation in festivals, in exalted communication, separate from the daily or the ordinary' (2003:18, mt). Indeed, what is true of the Brazilian Xavante, as Graham describes, is equally true of the Apu Inka: 'When young Xavante men of Brazil publicly narrate dream-songs, their form and composition link them to the past of their elders, while their collective performance links them to a present cohort of peers and ultimately legitimizes them to transmit dream-songs to future generations' (Graham 1994, paraphrased by Ochs & Capps 1996:24). As DM emphatically stated, vivimos lo que vivían nuestros ancestros 'we live what our ancestors lived'. By communing with the vital energy of the ancestors, participants in the Apu Inka reinforce their sense of cohesion and thereby their resilience for the future.

Camino, then, encompasses several related meanings (recalling Turner's (1967) discussion of the polysemy of symbols): a path in Huanchacbamba; a principal road of the Incan Empire; a channel for the vital force of the Empire; a journey along the path in Huanchacbamba; a journey along the Incan road; a journey across time to the era of the Incas; a metamorphosis into one's ancestors; a journey to the perceived core of Self; a journey towards greater social unity. These meanings all combine in the *Apu Inka*, so that Andean identity is lived as multifaceted, dynamic, organic, tantamount to the principle of life itself. The *camino*, moreover, is a way of physically embodying this identity. Mendoza's research in southern Peru is illuminating on this point:

'along the path [pilgrims] learn about and remember, through sight (*rikuy*), the vast and beautiful territories that surround them and the special places marked as important and/or sacred. [T]he music that accompanies them plays a central role in the visual experience while walking, sustaining my argument about the Andean sensorial model. That is, the importance of the unity of the visual, auditory and kinesthetic in the cognitive experiences of Andeans' (2011:11-12).

The camino in the Apu Inka seems likewise to be a way of grounding the ideology of Incan solidarity as a physically experienced reality, where people engage kinaesthetically with the concept of spatiotemporal approximation by moving from one place to another, and commune with the Empire visually (by 'seeing' Incan monuments before them) and aurally (by listening to the pututu, quena and ampara, together with the voice of the capitana). Several other scholars have noted this intricate relation between walking, narrative and identity in the Andes. For Allen in southern Peru, 'The mere fact of walking is experienced as an affirmation of the Runakuna's connection with the Sacred Places, so that walking itself is an affirmation of community' (2002:173). Similarly, Corr in Ecuador: 'Participants in collective rituals use the techniques of re-centering texts, tracing out local sacred pathways, and ritual intertextuality in order to sustain Salasacan collective memory...Both collective and individual experiences are organized according to the sacred landscape, especially ritual pathways, mountains, and crossroads' (2010:17). As in Apu Inka, walking and poetry have similar purposes for identity-creation: 'Just as the ritual circumambulations of the alcaldes [honorific role in festivals] express a common identity through ties to land, the prayer texts express this common identity through links to a shared past and shared links to space and time' (2010:73). Radcliffe (1990) also signals the importance of walking along specific routes as a way of asserting communal identity.

Abercrombie, describing an Aymara community, notes that 'the story is a narrative icon of the original journey remembered through it. This, and all, oral narrative is remembered and shaped by

poetic rules of composition, character development and plot, all of which are embodied in the social space-time established by the sun's movement along his itinerary' (1998:346). Therefore, a single term (t''aki) denotes oral narrative, paths, and individual and collective organization of festivals. States Abercrombie, 'All these things are t''akis because they are sequential strings of action in movement which begin, subjectively, in one place and time and end in another' (1998:320-321). For the *Apu Inka*, the process is more intersubjective than subjective, since individual realization is dissolution within a single, idealized Incan community. Howard-Malverde's findings on narrative in Huamalíes, central Peru, are also pertinent:

'The narrative's episodic structure emerges directly from its nature as a tracing of routes over a landscape. The mythic ancestors enter into contact with each other at specified points on the territory. Their movements between places serve to symbolise the network of political and sacred power relations which defined the internal identity of the community and its links to the outside...The configurations of the landscape can thus be seen to be in iconic relation to the narrative structure: the one is a direct reflection of the other (1990a:60-61).

Thus, as in the *Apu Inka*, 'Topography provides a cognitive bridge between past event and present experience' (1990a:78). The re-creation of Huanchacbamba as a microcosm of the Empire over which the participants travel is, more than a symbol, a deep embodiment of the communality felt to be rooted in an essentialized and idealized past, a past which is, I later argue, reasserted as a strategy of comprehending and thereby overcoming marginalization from the outside and fragmentation from within. The next song perpetuates this theme by further reinforcing the divine attributes of the Incan Empire and the inalienable cohesion of its subjects.

#### Harawi mañakuna / Adoración

This song has Spanish and AQ titles. The AQ *Harawi Mañakuna* refers to the genre of *harawi*, which, as in the *Carnaval* of Chapter Three, is often vibrant, conveying themes of fertility, but in the *Apu Inka* is graceful and ponderous. *Mañakuna* (VR *maña-* 'request, appeal to'; reflexive –*ku*; nominalizer –*na*) denotes an appeal, usually on the grounds of reciprocal obligation or empathy. *Adoración* 'adoration', by contrast, implies a unidirectional subordination of the individual without the explicit expectation of reciprocity. The alternative titles reflect the syncretic nature of Andean religion, characterized by the combination of Catholic and indigenous elements.

## Sung by the capitana:

Kawsachunna Tata Wiraqocha Kawsachunna Qusquy Ilaqta Tawantinsuyo Wiraqocha hanaq patsachaw kaykaamoq Chakiykiman kimsa kuti qoqorishpanam Long Live Father Wiraqocha
Long Live the City of Cuzco, Tawantinsuyo
Wiraqocha, who from the sky looks over us
Three times kneel down towards your feet

# Sung by the Inca:

Titicaca yaku mamaata rikarinaapaq Alli wiyaw

Intipa churin killapa wawan Alli wiyaw

Paharinnam ripurillaashun *Alli wiyaw* 

Cajamarca llaqtantsikman

Alli wiyaw

Qori challpi apukishpay

Alli wiyaw

Qaparikuyna luwarikuyna

Alli wiyaw

Llapan ayllu wiyarinampaq

Alli wiyaw

Hanan ayllu urin ayllu

Alli wiyaw

To see my mother, the water of Titicaca

Listen well

Son of the sun, son of the moon

Listen well

Tomorrow we head forth

Listen well

To our city of Cajamarca

Listen well

Governors with golden challpi

Listen well
Call, proclaim
Listen well

So that every ayllu may hear

Listen well

Upper *ayllu*, lower *ayllu* 

Listen well

The first two lines repeat SQ *kawsachunna* (*kawsa*- VR 'live'; *-chun* third-person desiderative; temporal *-na*). While the VR *kawsa*- denotes the act of living, the subjunctive *-chun* performs a desiderative function which the temporal *-na* 'already' heightens through immediacy. The global meaning is similar to 'Long live X!'. *Tata Wiraqocha* 'Father Wiraqocha' contains SQ *tata* 'father' and the supreme Andean deity *Wiraqocha*, who, according to DM, is the same as the Christian God. This term comprises *wira* 'fat' and *qocha* 'lake', reflecting the nature of fat and fluid as basic elements of survival in the high Andes. Harrison notes how the conflation of Wiraqocha with God is partly due to the 'desire of the first priests to prove that the Incas were close to discovering the One and True Christian God (the European concept), so that many Spanish discussions appear to describe Viracocha [Wiraqocha] as male and closely linked to the entity of God the Father' (1994:124, mt). Here, the noun *tata* 'father' illustrates the influence of Christianity on the conceptualization of this

originally androgynous pre-Hispanic deity. Wiraqocha is in a parallel relationship with Qusquy llaqta Tawantinsuyo 'Tawantinsuyo, of Cuzco city'. Tawantinsuyo, literally SQ 'land of four quarters', was the official name of the Incan Empire; llaqta 'town, city' is also a SQ loan. The syntactic inseparability of Qusquy llaqta 'Cuzco city' and Tawantinsuyo creates the sense that this relation is intrinsic, whereby Cuzco is not arbitrarily the capital, but the vital core whence the rest of the Empire emanates, just as the Inca is the core of people's unity. The affective/first-person singular possessive –y in Qusquy sets up a close relation with the city, appropriating it to the extent that it is part of one's personal identity. The parallelism of Wiraqocha and Tawantinsuyo serves to reinforce the link between the political and the spiritual: just as Wiraqocha is the highest spiritual entity, so the same is true politically for Tawantinsuyo. This reinforces the portrayal of the Inca as having both political and cosmic legitimacy. Similar parallelism between tata 'father' and Qusquy llaqta 'city of Cuzco' reinforces that Cuzco is the 'parent' of the Empire, just as Wiraqocha is the ultimate creator. SQ is plausibly deployed here because kawsa 'life' is a fundamental concept, the basis of existence; by relating 'life' to the prestige language of the Incas, the text reinforces the dependence of life on the political order.

The third line refers to Wiraqocha as residing in the hanaq patsa 'sky'. The directional -mu (the vowel is lowered from [u] > [o] because of the [q]) in kaykaamog conveys the notion that Wiragocha exists for the participants' benefit, is orientated towards them (cf. shuyaamun 'waits for us', pertaining to Christ in Wayta Muruy, p.155); hence kaykaamoq 'the one who exists for our benefit'. The third line describes the act of kneeling before Wiraqocha three times. This number is of widespread significance in the Andes. Arnold and Yapita describe how, according to one Aymara consultant, 'every element of the natural world, as in the Christian Trinity, has a tripartite nature. It is believed that a person comprises three aspects or "souls": the name of the individual (suti), the soul (ajayu) and the shadow of the soul (janayu)' (1998:140, mt). Allen states that the 'ayllu is triadic because three is the perfect number – and three is the perfect number because it is balanced and unbalanced at the same time' (2011:97). This is true to the concept of tinku, discussed in the previous chapter: two entities derive their existence from their harmonious and antagonistic interaction; the interaction itself, the point of contact, is the unknown 'third party' into which each entity spills and out of which each originates, in a continuous cathartic process (in Heideggerian terms, it is the temporal foundation of Being). This also corresponds with the synthesizing nature of the IPOSS -ntsik, which acts as the 'apex' that unites two elements in a common relationship. For DM, the reference to this number in the text recalls the Holy Trinity and also the three worlds in Andean cosmology: hanaq patsa 'sky'; kay patsa 'earth'; uku patsa 'underworld'. As Skar states of his fieldsite in Apurímac: 'Generally speaking, most seem to agree on a three levelled system; the *kaypacha* or world we live in (*kay* = here, this), *hanaqpacha* or the world above (*hanaq* = above, upper), and *ukupacha* or the world below (*uku* = inside, interior)' (1982:2). The tripartite division of the world also illustrates *tinku*: the *hanaq patsa* and *uku patsa* are relatively stable, whereas their locus of interaction, *kay pacha*, is dynamic and uncertain, being the 'level where gods, men, and the dead come together' (1982:3). In Baumann's words, 'Kay pacha symbolizes the transition from world below to world above...It is in this world that the unification of polar fundamental forces is accomplished; these forces are the basis for each continuous act of reproduction' (1996:25).

The following verses are sung by the Inca, and the *ñustas* respond with *alli wiyaw* 'listen well'. The first verse refers to the Incan origin myth, whereby the sun and moon created the founders of the dynasty, Manku Qapaq (the first emperor) and Mama Uqllu (his sister), then sent them to earth to emerge from Lake Titicaca: *Titicaca yaku mamaa* 'my mother, the water of Titicaca'. As Bauer notes,

'Origin myths in ancient stratified societies functioned as important means to support the privileges of the rulers. The source of social inequality is defined and justified through the primordial actions of cultural heroes. The re-enactment of those actions, within the codified contexts of rituals, re-established the ruling elites' ancestral linkages with mythical personages and events as well as their access to universal forces' (1996:333).

This was doubtless true of the Incas who aimed to ground their claim to power on an alleged divine origin. Here, however, the same myth is deployed not as an instrument of domination but arguably of resistance, whereby the unity of Andean peoples under the Incan banner creates a sense of solidarity, and the divine association expresses an innate strength and moral rectitude, powerful psychological strategies in the face of marginalization. The only difference between this and domination is, nonetheless, one of circumstance, for the resistance itself relies on an unequal dualism between 'good' Andeans and 'bad' Europeans (as we shall soon witness). The phrase intipa churin killapa wawan 'son of the sun, son of the moon' refers to the Inca's divine origin, whereby those united under him are united by cosmological bonds; the Inca's denomination as intipa churin was recorded by Garcilaso in the sixteenth century (Burga 1998:328). The word-choice illustrates the Andean belief that the sun is masculine and the moon is feminine, for churi (or tsuri) is the son of a male, whereas wawa is the son of a female. Skar found a similar cosmological dualism in his fieldsite: 'The two major gods of hanagpacha... are the sun, inti, and the moon, killa. The inti is a symbol of masculinity, power and energy; the killa is considered feminine and related to fertility' (1982:6). In the Conchucos Valley, the sun is termed rupay, whereas inti is used in other AQ varieties and also in SQ. Here, the term is probably a SQ borrowing, given its referral to the Inca.

The next verse contains two SQ words: paharin 'tomorrow' and ripu- 'go'. The destination is Cajamarca, resonant in the minds of Andeans, for this is where Atawallpa will meet the Spanish and ultimately be executed. The IPOSS -ntsik in llagtantsik 'our town' creates unity by appropriating the town for everyone, synthesizing the group under the banner of the Empire. The penultimate verse refers to the apukishpay or governors of each of the four provinces, who, according to DM, wore a golden crown called a challpi, and accompany the Inca on his journey here. The royal pututu is sounded, shown by Qaparikuyna luwarikuyna 'Call, proclaim', which follows directly into the last verse: Llapan ayllu wiyarinampaq 'So that all communities (the whole community) may hear'. The universal pretensions of this line convey a strong sense of unity across the whole Empire. The Empire is defined as an ayllu, which Carranza Romero describes as a 'community, group of people who have family, historical or geographical links' (2003:41, mt), and by Allen as an 'indigenous community or other social group whose members share a common focus' (1988:257). Allen's definition confirms the pragmatic nature of communal identity, whereby the latter is not an analytical prime but rather motivated around a particular purpose (as we have seen throughout this thesis). Thus, the self-identification of Huanchacbambinos as Incans – and as part of a larger Andean ayllu or community – conveys a strong sense of solidarity, the reasons for which I examine in this chapter's conclusion. The phrase *llapan ayllu* is grammatically ambiguous: *llapan* is 'all', 'every' or 'entire', and can therefore be singular or plural. This ambiguity arguably serves to merge all communities under one universal community, synthesized through common allegiance to the Inca. The following line, hanan ayllu urin ayllu 'upper ayllu, lower ayllu', refers to the bipartite division of Andean settlements, (which was foregrounded particularly in the Masha songs). The phrase could refer to the halves of Huanchacbamba or to the northern and southern halves of the Empire, of which Huanchacbamba is a microcosm.

This song again emphasizes the cohesion of the Incan Empire, particularly through the following examples: the inseparability of the Empire from its capital in *Qusquy llaqta Tawantinsuyo* 'Tawantinsuyu, of Cuzco city'; the appropriation of Cuzco by the semi-possessive suffix –y; the group possessive –ntsik, whereby a community is forged by common relation. Likewise, the absence of plurals in the phrase *Llapan ayllu wiyarinampaq* 'So that all communities (the whole community) may hear' suggests that the Empire is a super-ayllu out of which all other forms of relation emanate. Just as this arguably equates the 'Incan community' with 'God's community', so the divine nature of the Inca is reinforced by the mention of his celestial parents, his ultimate emergence from Lake Titicaca, his transcendence, as *Apu*, of any individual monarch, and the parallelism of *Wiraqocha* (the

supreme deity) and *Tawantinsuyo* (the Empire) which sets both into meaningful relation. It is interesting to note that Lara's play, as in this song, contains references to the Inca as *Intipa churin* 'son of the sun' (e.g. 1957/1989:60). In the next song, we shall see how the Huanchacbamba text's attribution of divine unity to the Incan Empire is ideologically predicated on opposition to an irreconcilable alter.

### Pizarrowan Kaptinqa Kaynawmi

This song describes the Inca's first awareness of the Spanish arrivals, alluded to by the prosaic title 'With Pizarro, it is like this'. Pizarro was the leader of the Spanish army in Peru. The following extract is sung by the Inca Atawallpa:

Kanan punchaw rakipunakushun Llapan allpay qorintsikta Pakarishpa waqakushpa Wiracocham castigamantsik

Kunan punchaw yarqayamunnam Wakinqam chaallamunna Kullu rupashqa Rumi shapra wañuynii kallanqa

Kuyay runa llakipaallanqa Kunan traicionamanqa Felipillo tumbecino Okru kushma sanpelayo

Mananam kananqa llakikuutsu Vasallukuna guerraqam Intukunapaq

Hina hina wañullaashaq Katakarka plazachawchi Makii paqtanqanyaq Qori qellay suwarishqa Usharillaashaq

Intushqa kanantsikpaq

Today we will divide among us The gold of our entire land As we hide it, as we weep, Wiraqocha punishes us

Today they are coming towards us Others are arriving Burnt tree-trunks Lichens, will be my death

Dear people will share my sadness Now will betray me Felipillo of Tumbes Good-for-nothing, scoundrel

I am no longer sad Vassals, to war, To join together So we may unite

All the same, I will die
On the square of Cajamarca
Until my hands are bound,
Gold and silver stolen,
I will end

Pero kananmi willayayaq Vasallukuna Qori qellay usharinga España llaqtapam apakuyanga But I now inform you Vassals The gold and silver will end They will take them to the land of Spain

Atawallpa states that the Empire's gold shall be divided among the people: rakipunakushun 'we will divide among us' (VR raki- 'separate'; benefactive pu-; naku- 'between members of a group'; IFUT -shun). This phrase, particularly the benefactive pu- and reciprocal naku-, portrays the Inca and his subjects as fair and altruistic, obeying the principles of reciprocity that are central to the ayllu, and which contrast later with the greed of the Europeans. The second line highlights the immense wealth of the Empire: Llapan allpay qorintsik 'The gold of our entire land'. The word llapan 'all' can refer both to the immensity of the land (allpa) and to the abundance of gold (qori), while the possessive/affective -y stresses the intimate link between the people and the span of the Empire, and the IPOSS –ntsik defines the gold as belong to everyone and everyone as united through their common relation to the wealth. Thus, the Empire is portrayed not just as intrinsically wealthy, but as wealthy because of its strong moral grounding in reciprocity. Nonetheless, the Empire is suffering as a result of its single hubris. The phrase Wiracocham castigamantsik 'Wiraqocha is punishing us' is, according to DM, a reference to Atawallpa's assassination of his half-brother, Waskar (Huáscar in Spanish), following the bitter rivalry between the two claimants. The phrase castigamantsik denotes punishment of all of the Inca's subjects (IOBJ -ma...tsik; 3PRES -n), not just Atawallpa, indicating the indissociability of the subjects' destiny from that of the Inca. The VR castiga- 'punish' is a Spanish borrowing; the clear split between 'right' and 'wrong' and the sense of innate justice implied by this term cannot be accurately translated into AQ (the closest terms are ahay and piñapaay 'to be angry', qayapaay 'to shout at' and wanatsiy 'to correct'). This suggests that elements of Christian cosmology have been adopted for an ideological purpose.

In the second verse, the Inca foretells the arrival of the Spanish, revealing his nature as an omniscient *amawta* 'master of knowledge'. Key here is the word *wakinqam* 'others', reinforced by the topicalizer -q and 1EVI-m. This is different from the term *huk*, also 'other' in the *Masha* songs (p.136); whereas *huk* conveys wholeness, *wakin* conveys distance, and is derived from the pronoun *wak* 'over there'. These 'others' are likened to *kullu rupashqa* 'burnt tree-trunks' (the African slaves brought to work on plantations) and *rumi shapra* (literally 'stone-beard', which, according to DM, refers to 'lichen', and here refers to the Europeans' beards). These metaphors contrast sharply with the Inca, who *relumbran* 'is shining'. Whereas the Inca is described in terms of the natural order, the *wakinqam* convey a disorder in nature, where the burnt tree-trunks index destruction and the lichen

represents a grotesque caricature of the common Andean comparison between human beauty and flowers. The Inca categorically states that these monstrous harbingers of destruction *wañuynii kallanqa* 'will be my death'. There is no attempt to account for the base nature of the *wakinqam* (Atawallpa's actions, by contrast, can at least be related to if only through punishment). The *wakinqam*, being simply 'others', are not only opaque; they are mere shadows of humanity, lacking the moral substance that permits any kind of meaningful relation.

The next verse foretells the treason of Felipe, a subject of Atawallpa who serves as translator between the Incan and Spanish delegations. Felipe ultimately provokes the Europeans to execute Atawallpa through a mistranslation. The treason of Felipe is common 'knowledge' in the Andes, though accounts of the nature of his treason vary. Chroniclers such as 'Pedro de Cieza de León, Agustín de Zárate and Mario Góngora, all writing between 1509 and 1530, affirm that Felipillo was "traitorous, lying and inconstant" (Lockhart 1972:451, in Howard-Malverde 1990a:58). parallelism of the phoneme /k/ in kuyay 'loved' and SQ kunan 'now', and of third-person future -nqa in *llakipaallanga* 'will share my sadness' and traicionamanga 'will betray me' heightens the contrast between the mutual trust of the Inca and his subjects (on the one hand), and the Inca's betrayal by Felipe (on the other hand); concretely, a phonological and morphosyntactic similarity is created, against which the semantic contrast is more sharply set in relief. The phrase kuyay runa conveys solidarity through bonds of affect, where runa can be in-group term for indigenous Andeans (p.135), and kuyay denotes 'love'. Thus, kuyay runa defines indigenous Andeans as existing in a relationship of trust and affection among each other and towards the Inca, grounding commonality on a basis of solidarity. The adjective tumbecino refers to Felipe's birthplace in Tumbes, the settlement in northern Peru where the Spanish first disembarked. But it is also arguably a play on words, for tumpa- means 'suspect, suspicious' in AQ, and the Spanish [b] equates with AQ [p]; devoicing of the [b] produces tumpe which resembles tumpa-. The double-entendre heightens the sense of hypocrisy and concealment. The final line brusquely dismisses Felipe as oqru kushma 'ragged shirt' and sanpelayo 'good-for-nothing', indicating the Inca's absolute rejection of his betrayer. The character of Felipe recalls the quotes in Chapter Two (Part Two), where speakers complained of many Andeans renouncing their identity for socio-economic ascent, and the veiled criticism of the guiadora's discrimination in the Negrito's song (Chapter Three). Felipe's betrayal is therefore arguably a warning to young Andeans not to follow suit and forsake their community. As Rowe notes of a similar text, the past enters the present to form future responsibilities (1993:47).

The next verse changes tone as the Inca states *mananam kananqa llakikuutsu* 'I am no longer sad'. For, by resisting the Europeans, the citizens of the Empire will unite. Key here is the root *intu* 'defeat another group by uniting in opposition' (Carranza Romero 2003:84, mt); this is repeated in *intukunapaq* (VR *intu-*; reflexive –*ku*; purposive –*paq*), where the reflexive –*ku* emphasizes unity at the most personal level, and in *intushqa* 'united' (with past participle marker –*shqa*). In *kanantsikpaq* 'so we may be', the IPRES –*ntsik* combined with purposive –*paq* also conveys this sense of forward-moving unity, while the term *vasallukuna* (*vasallu* 'vassal'; plural –*kuna*) is emphasized by occupying a single line, and stresses unity through a common bond to the Inca. Thus, solidarity is affirmed in opposition to an external foe. The result will be *guerraqam* (Spanish *guerra* 'war', emphasized through the topicalizer –*q* and 1EVI –*m*). The Spanish origin of this root does not seem to impact on its ability to convey indigenous solidarity. Atawallpa is resigned to his fate: *Hina hina wañullaashaq / Katakarka plazachawchi* 'All the same, I will die / On the square of Cajamarca'. This refers to Atawallpa's execution in Cajamarca by the Spanish forces. DM mentioned that Katakarka was the original name of Cajamarca, but I have not found any sources to confirm this, and the modern name has, in any case, a clear Quechua etymology ('town of stones').

The third line refers to the imprisonment of Atawallpa, whose hands were tied to prevent him from escaping (*makii paqtanqanyaq* 'until my hands are bound'). The fourth line conveys the Europeans as thieves as well as murderers: *Qori qillay suwarishqa* 'Gold and silver stolen'. The phrase *usharillaashaq* 'I will end' conveys the certainty of his demise. The temporal suffix *-ri* (denoting rapid action) in *suwarishqa* and *usharillaashaq* conveys the suddenness of each event. The final verse opens with the Spanish conjunction *pero* 'but', now common among AQ-speakers. This emphasizes the force of the proclamation, while the repetition of *vasallukuna* 'vassals' again stresses unity. The Inca foretells that *Qori qellay usharinqa* 'The gold and silver will end', and that *España llaqtapam apakuyanqa* 'They will take it to the land of Spain'. The absence of evidentials in this verse conveys certainty but also the fact that the events have not yet been witnessed: were there any doubt, dubitative *-chi* or reportative *-shi* would have been added; had the knowledge been gained through experience, the 1EVI *-mi* would have been used. Thus, the Inca is presented as a prophet whose word carries certainty without his direct witnessing of the events.

This song's presentation of the Europeans as morally base, incommunicable 'others' recalls similar constructs in other Andean contexts. Howard-Malverde notes how one manifestation of the devil in Cañar, Ecuador, is as a *mestizo patrón 'mestizo* landowner or overseer' mounted on a black mule (1984:55-56). Allen cites the belief, in her southern Peruvian fieldsite, in *ñak'aqs* 'slaughterers',

'supernaturally evil Mestizos who fall on nighttime travellers and kill them with their knives. They may mesmerize the victim with their flaming eyes and extract their body fat. All outsiders, particularly men, are considered potential  $\tilde{n}ak'aqs'$  (Allen 2002:88). Canessa comments on the Aymara equivalent, the *kharisiri*: 'Every occurrence of *kharisiris* is a marking of the border; it casts in vivid and terrifying colours the boundary between alterity and identity and every time a *kharisiri* appears, the diffuse boundary between *Jaqi* [insider] and *Q'ara* [outsider] is dramatically sharpened' (2000:709). Moreover,

'The non-Indian identity of *kharisiris* is of particular significance. Outsiders are defined by their lack of reciprocal relations with other people: they lack the kinds of relations among people, and between people and the tellurian spirits, that define humanity. Not only do outsiders, *Q'aras*, refuse to engage in these kinds of relationships, but they steal the creative force that these relations engender. If Andean moral relationships are defined by reciprocity..., the *kharisiri* is clearly antithetical to these relationships: stealing is non-reciprocity *par excellence'* (2000:713).

Likewise Mannheim: 'Ayni [one form of reciprocity] is understood by Runa, not as an abstract principle of governing social interaction, but as the fundamental organizing basis of the material world. And so, throughout southern Peru, Quechua speakers treat the boundary between Quechua speakers who live by the law of reciprocity and Spanish speakers who do not as a distinction of primordial social importance' (1991:19-20).

Thus, while the Europeans are interpreted as a divine punishment of Atawallpa and his subjects, they in fact serve to reinforce Andean solidarity. Their greed shows them to be completely unrelatable, moral vacua whose only purpose is to punish and destroy. The advantage of this approach for the indigenous participants is that they can account for their marginalized social position in a way that still casts them in a superior moral light. Their poverty is not *real* poverty; their marginalization is not *real* marginalization. For the Europeans are in no way superior to Andeans. The wealth of the Europeans is the wealth of the Incas illegitimately transposed, the object of predation by nefarious outsiders. The glory of Andean civilization is still the natural order despite its single hubris, and, since its society is founded on the laws of reciprocity, everyone shares in this glory. So the notion of 'punishment' does not threaten a positive self-identification as 'Andean'; rather, it bolsters it by defining their lack of prosperity in terms of their general moral superiority (since they have not stolen), and by viewing the material success of the Europeans as their *own* inheritance from which they are only temporarily removed because of a single act. While

the Europeans are portrayed as unrelatable, I shall argue, in this chapter's conclusion, that they nonetheless provide the opposition through which the 'Andean' acquires its existence as a category.

This is the first of the songs to introduce the Spaniards, who are defined as an irreconcilable alter. They are first introduced as a form of punishment from Wiraqocha (nowadays equated with God), in such as manner as to negate, from the outset, their plenitude as beings worthy of consideration. Their emphatic designation as wakingam 'others' reinforces this, as does their description as thieves, and their imagistic association with deformed nature act as a macabre parody of the just universe of the Incas. Lara's text likewise conveys a rigid opposition between the Inkakuna 'Incas' and auqasunk'akuna 'bearded enemies' (1957/1989:30). In Apu Inka, the depiction of Felipe, the mediator, as a traitor serves as a potent warning to remain on one side of the dichotomy. The twofold repetition of the verbal root intu- 'unite against an external enemy' hints at the deeper ideological undercurrents of the text: namely, that the rationale for imagining Incan 'unity' is to distance oneself from the threatening Other. Against this bleak picture of the Europeans, the Incas cannot fail to emerge as paragons of virtue. Their impeccable reciprocity is evident in the Inca's command that rakipunakushun 'we shall divide among us' Ilapan allpay qorintsik 'the gold of our entire land'.

While there is no denying the brutality of the European colonizers, the glorification of the Incas is certainly a romantic view of what was, after all, a powerful ruling class that held sway by subjugating other kingdoms with a fist of iron. As Millones states, 'nobody governs more than fifty ethnic groups without the backing of a machinery of warfare and an apparatus of control which ensures the privileges of those who seize power' (1992:59). The following extract of an Incan war-chant gives a somewhat different picture of the Incas to that of the Apu Inka: 'We will drink with the skull of the enemy / We will use his teeth as necklaces / We will play the flute with his bones / With his hide we dance' will play the drums and (Guaman Poma 1936:314; 1980:287, in Millones 1992:55, my translation from Millones' Spanish). Hardly an exemplar of universal love. By ideologically demonizing the Spaniards and glorifying the Incas, the Apu Inka perpetuates a discourse of intrinsic irreconcilability that is central to the very discrimination the song aims to resist. This is where the discourses in this chapter dialogue with Derrida's trace, which, as we have seen throughout this thesis, communicates how discourse perpetuates itself along the inertia of a particular dialectic trajectory, giving rise to opposing categories. Just as Allen notes how warfare depends on a tacit assumption shared by both sides (2002:177) – a foundation for tinku – so, in this case, resistance operates on the very same terms as that which it is resisting. And these terms are a

discourse of ethnic irreconcilability between two reified groups - Andean and European - which, if they meet, is only interpretable as a form of treason to one particular side. We saw the same kinds of discourse in Chapter Two (Part Two), where the non-Andean Other was both the alter to be conclusively rejected and the origin of the emergence of 'Andean' as a category in the first place. The uncompromising nature of this bracketing betrayed its underlying flaw, which was also its motivation: the fact that it was impossible, in reality, to prevent the mutual influence of Europeanand Andean-derived elements in daily life (and in one's own personal heritage). This discourse of irreconcilability is strikingly perpetuated in the following song:

#### Adoración Ushaskiptin

In the festival, this song immediately follows the one above, and is sung by the capitana while everyone walks three times around the church. It translates as 'When the Adoration is Finished'.

Tawantinsuyo tawa suyo Tawan dedon inkallaypa Kikillanwan pitsqan dedon Llapan kallpanwan paqtarishqa

Tawantinsuyo Chinchaysuyo Kuntesuyo Qollasuyu Antisuyu Tawa Ilaqta inkallaypa qori palacio Qori bastón bastonllaykiwan Inka pallanga gagatam ishkaytsaanki

Kawsatsun Apu Inka Manco Qapaq Wiracocha Kawsachunna Apu Inka Atawallpa Qolla qapaq

Kawsachunna Cajamarca Intipa churin tiyanampaq Kawsachunna llapan ñusta Kunan tushur takirnin

Mayintsikqa yana puyukuna Wañutsimagnintsik chaallamunga Reypa shutinchaw Willakuywan qontsu poqru

Tawantinsuyo, four regions Four fingers of the Inca With him alone, five fingers Forged with all his might

Tawantinsuyo, Chinchaysuyu Kuntisuyu, Qollasuyu, Antisuyu A golden palace of the Inca in four lands With your staff, your staff of gold Inca, you will split rocks in twain

Long live the Inca Lord Creator Manku, Wiragocha Long live the Inca Lord Atawallpa, Creator of Qolla

Long live Cajamarca For the son of the sun to rest Long live all ñustas Who now dance and make music

Hordes of black insects Will arrive to kill us In the name of their King With their message of dregs and mucous Intipa churin wamayantsu Killapa wawan tutaqantsu Mayintsikqa karpis yana puyukuna Waktsayaarmi ushakanqa The son of the sun is not afraid The son of the moon is not sad Though the black pests be many In poverty they will end

The first line squarely locates the participants within the Incan Empire: *Tawantinsuyo tawa suyo* 'Tawantinsuyo of four quarters'. The inseparability of the Empire from the Inca himself is revealed in the next two lines, whereby the four *suyu*, or regions, are identified with the Inca's four fingers, his thumb representing himself, equal to one whole *suyu*. The fifth *suyu*, the Inca, is the entity that synthesizes the remaining four, for he is head of the whole Empire. This is strikingly affirmed in the last line: *Llapan kallpanwan paqtarishqa*. The VR *paqta*- in *paqtarishqa* (with past participle marker *—shqa*) translates as 'to equal, compare, fit exactly (like a ring on a finger), be enough' (Carranza Romero 2003:153, mt). In this context, it can be understood as the Inca's act of joining the disperse parts of the Empire together so that they remain in balance. Ossio argues that, in Incan times,

'time was structured in a quinquepartite division and now, according to modern versions, it is structured in a tripartite division. I consider that there is no contradiction since it seems that quinquepartition is a variant of tripartition. This emerges, for example, from the names of fingers on the hand, where the only ones which have their own names are: thumb, middle finger and little finger' (1973:XLI, mt).

The link between the number five and the number of fingers is intriguing in the context of this verse. Ossio's postulation that quinquepartite and tripartite divisions are the same is plausible, if one considers the other two fingers as liminal zones between each main division. This is congruent with the idea of *tinku*, whereby there is an ill-defined zone of interaction between two clearly defined entities, just as *kay patsa* is the dynamic seat of interaction between *hanaq* and *uku patsa* (p.205).

Various interpretations of the term *kallpa* (in *llapan kallpanwan*) have been grouped by Godenzzi. For Santo Tomás, *kallpay* [*callpay*] denotes *fuerza* 'energy, force, strength' (1560/1951:245-246, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt); González Holguín defines *kallpa* [*callpa*] as *las potencias* 'power, capacity' (1608/1989:45, 527, in Godenzzi 2005:60); an anonymous source defines it as *fuerza*, *vigor*, *trabajo* 'strength, vigour, work' (Anonymous 1586/1951:20, in Godenzzi 2005:60). For Lira, *kallpachay* denotes 'animation, the act of animating or encouraging, to transmit energy, strengthen, invigorate, communicate strength' (1982:99, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt); for Herrero & Sánchez de Lozada, it means 'to make stronger or more vigorous, strengthen' (1983:122, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt), while, for Beyersdorff, it means 'to fertilize the land with guano' (1984:45, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt).

Godenzzi argues that this term (as well as *kamay*, pp.221-222) represents an 'economy of reciprocal animation of the world: each element interacts with others, allowing the transmission of vital energy so that, both singularly and as a unity, each element can completely fulfil its functions' (2005:65, mt). For Taylor, the term *kallpa* 'is used to indicate the power that results from effort and, above all, the power of the shaman' (1987:27, mt).

Adelaar suggests that kallpa is 'one of the very rare cases of a non-derived noun which denotes an abstract notion' (1994:6-7, mt), which leads him to conclude that it may initially have been a physical attribute of the body, such as blood (1994:7, mt). However, I would argue that this term is not abstract if one understands it as a process that is actively felt - emotionally, cognitively and physically – as suggested by the numerous examples of reciprocity in this thesis; there are, after all, several terms that allude to the emotions in AQ. Price-Williams (1974:103), moreover, questions the applicability of the abstract/concrete divide outside the Western tradition, arguing that it reflects specific epistemological tendencies in Europe rather than being a universally valid dichotomy. The description of the Inca having forged together the Empire Ilapan kallpanwan 'with all his kallpa' likens him to a god, who embodies vital energy which spills out into the act of creation. Arguably, then, the Empire is indissociable from the Inca because it is a manifestation of the Inca himself. The Inca is thereby a true Apu, a guiding spirit out of which order arises and is maintained. The Inca's kallpa is what circulates among the Andean community, and can be interpreted as the stuff of Andean social identity as presented in this text. It is, to recall Durkheim (1912/2001), the religious energy that emanates from common orientation round a totem - and the totem, the unifying principle, is the Inca. The depiction of the Empire as a manifestation of the Inca's divine energy recalls the following comment by Allen: 'Tirakuna [akin to Apus] are not spirits who inhabit the places, but the Places themselves, who live, watch, and have ways of interacting with the human beings, plants, and animals that live around and upon them' (2002:26). We can likewise interpret the Incan Empire as an organic entity whose life-blood is kallpa, and whose heart is the Inca who channels this kallpa along productive paths and throughout the whole system. After presenting the Inca as the synthesizing factor of the Empire, the verse lists the specific parts (organs), the four suyus, which he brings together: Chinchaysuyu, Kuntesuyu, Qollasuyu and Antisuyu (in the verse, the final [u] is lowered to [o] as per Spanish phonology). The Inca's presence throughout the Empire is confirmed by the existence of a golden palace in each suyu.

The final two lines describe how, with his *qori bastón* 'golden staff', the Inca *pallanqa qaqatam* 'will break boulders', making them *ishka*- 'split in half'. This recalls the *riwi* (p.193), whereby the Inca's

power derives from his nature as heir to the sun, reflected in the golden colour of the magical object. Political unity, then, is divine unity. The following verse is a eulogy to the Apu Inka: Kawsatsun Apu Inka 'Long live the Inca Lord!' (note the SQ kawsa- 'live'). Three individual rulers are then eulogized in turn: Manku Qapaq (the first Inca); Wiraqocha (the second Inca; here apparently not the supreme deity of the same name); Atawallpa (the last Inca). Why should three Incas be eulogized if there is only one Apu referred to? Moreover, it is unclear precisely which monarch is performed in the festival, except at the very end where it is clearly Atawallpa. But if Atawallpa is the Apu, how do we reconcile the strong indications that the Inca is equated with divinity, on the one hand, with the free admittance of his guilt, which we will see in the final song? All of these apparent dilemmas can be resolved if we see the Inca not as a single person, but, in line with the definitions of apu on p.191, as a natural spirit. In this reading, each individual Inca is a manifestation. The particular identity of the monarch does not seem important in the festival; rather, what matters is 'being Inca'. I therefore suggest that we can take Apu as 'Inca-essence', which concords with the Inca's role in forging and maintaining the Empire in the previous verse, and with my interpretation that the Inca is the stuff of Andean solidarity. In the words of Columbus, 'the "all powerful" Inka does not so much stand for an individual as much as he stands for fertilizing forces. That is, he represents to the highest degree the relatively inclusive "we" (2007:20). The penultimate line eulogizes the city of Cajamarca, the Inca's final destination. There is some SQ influence in churin 'son' (tsurin in AQ) and tiyanampaq 'so that he may sit' (VR tiya- 'sit'; taaku- in AQ). The first example is possibly unintentional given the close phonetic correspondence, but the second is clearly different from the AQ, and is probably used as an honorific register. The final line bids long life to the *ñustas* (princesses), who dance and play music (with SQ *kunan* 'now').

The next verse refers to the arrival of the Europeans, compared to *puyukuna*, which denotes any small and pestilent insect; the phrase *mayintsik* 'huge quantity' confirms their abundance, and recalls the biblical passage of the plagues of Egypt, also sent as a divine punishment. The word *wañutsimaqnintsik* (VR *wañu-* 'die'; causative –tsi; IOBJ –ma...-ntsik; agentive –q; empty suffix –ni) roughly translates as 'the act of killing us'; thus, line two states unequivocally that the Europeans have arrived to kill the Andeans, *reypa shutinchaw* 'in the name of the King [of Spain]'. The term *rey* 'king' is used to denote the Spanish ruler. The fact that the King of Spain cannot be called *Apu* confirms that the latter term is more than just 'monarch': the word *apu* stresses the link between political order, community and spiritual integration with the natural world. In the case of the *Apu Inka* text, the term denotes the one true leader of the only authentic nation: that of the Incan *ayllu*. The Spaniards could not be more different: the phrase *willakuywan qontsu poqru* compares the

newcomers' message of doom to *qontsu*, the slimy residue of *chicha* (a traditional Andean beverage), and *poqru* 'mucous'. Clearly, this is not very complimentary. Everything in this verse contrasts the moral and orderly nature of Andean society with the base and chaotic character ascribed to the Europeans. The first two lines remind us of the Inca's divine origin: *intipa churin* 'child of the son'; *killapa wawan* 'child of the moon'.

The parallelism continues in the words wamayantsu (VR wama- 'be afraid'; verbal pluralizer -ya; 3PRES -n; negative -tsu) and tutaqantsu (VR tutaqa- 'become dark'; negative -tsu), which indicate that the Inca, despite his imminent demise, is not suffering. The reason is that Mayintsikqa karpis yana puyukuna / Waktsayaarmi ushakanga 'Though the black pests be many / They will finish by growing poor'. The implication is that greed, the refusal to abide by the natural laws of reciprocity, must automatically lead to self-destruction, just as a plague ends when all the food has been terminated. This is the consequence of being distanced from the Apu, and serves as a potent moral lesson to respect the reciprocal laws of the community. Abercrombie describes a similar imaginative demonization of those who do not obey the law of ayni. This is the figure of the kharisiri among the Bolivian Aymara: 'The kharisiri takes vital generative powers out of the proper form of circulation among gods, men, and animals, in order to produce an antisocial kind of wealth that cannot sustain itself' (1998:405). Likewise, the verse in Apu Inka suggests that, though the invaders seem to thrive at the expense of Andeans, the latter will regain their supremacy as the former race towards selfdestruction. This can be interpreted as giving hope to a people who have felt exploited and marginalized by mestizo society. The suggestion that the Inca's sadness is precluded by the unity of his people suggests that the essence of the Inca will not die; rather, it will live on, latently, binding Andean society until the day when the Apu can rise with its people and assume its natural place at the head of the cosmic and divine order. The discourse of the Inca's return is indeed common throughout the Andes (Ossio 1973; Galindo 1986). In Pease's words, 'Everything that exists after the European invasion is a chaos, a disorganized and non-Andean world. For that reason, Andeans await the rebirth of Inkarrí, and there lies the veracity and the severity of Reyes who says "You are not Peruvians, you are Spanish or mixed, you are the family of Pizarro. I am Reyes, the family of Inkarey" (Ortiez 1970:35, in Pease 1973:450-451, mt). While the Apu Inka does not explicitly convey the notion of Inkarrí, the hope in the final struggle suggests that the Incan spirit will indeed live on.

The above song reinforces the cohesion of the Incan community, which is depicted in terms of the Inca's divine powers and in contrast to the Spanish Others. The mention of different Incan rulers reinforced the *Apu's* spatiotemporal transcendence. This likewise informed the participants' almost

mystical sublimation of Self in an inalienable Incan community that knows no bounds. The vital energy of the world - kallpa - was thereby appropriated by the participants as pertaining solely to this community, so that that which is non-Incan could be defined as a mere shadow with only the illusion of existence. The Inca's *qori bastón* 'golden staff' which *pallanqa qaqatam* 'will break boulders' reinforced the Inca's divine powers emanating from the sun.

The Spaniards continue to be depicted in stark moral contrast in this vision of absolutes: they are equated with *puyukuna* 'pestilent insects', recalling the biblical plagues of Egypt. The Inca nonetheless proclaimed that the newcomers' moral decadence would ensure their ultimate demise. Similarly, in Lara's Chayanta play, the Inca curses Pizarro at the hour of his own death: Pizarro 'will remain eternally stained with the blood that he spills. The people of this land will never look up to him. He will wander without rest and, by ferocious enemies, will be destroyed. He will curse eternally the unyielding power of the Inca' (1957/1989:38, mt). Wachtel, comparing Lara's text with another dramatization collected by Balmori in Oruro, notes how both versions 'have one theme in common: victory of Indians over Spaniards' (1977:38). As in the *Apu Inka*, the Spaniards' military victory entails their deeper moral failure, so that, at a deeper level, the Andeans emerge as victorious. This is a powerful rhetorical strategy for resisting marginalization, for it says that the very act of domination is self-negating. As Millones paraphrases the overall theme of these texts: 'the moral triumpth of the vanquished disqualifies the evil actions of an unworthy conqueror' (1992:61, mt).

While this discourse is concordant with the Quechua concepts of *ayni* (egalitarian reciprocity) discussed in Chapter Three, the tone of the *Apu Inka* is one of unconditional adulation rather than the more pragmatically (though emotionally engaged) voices of the preceding chapter. This, as well as the several references to divinity, leads me to suggest that the anonymous authors of *Apu Inka* have identified a point of congruence between Andean *ayni* and Christianity, so that the former is reified in order to present Andean society as the one and only mode of being that truly represents divinity. This ignores the fact that *ayni* entails competition as well as compromise, being not so much based on an abstract 'morality' as opening the possibility for productive relations. It also erases the fact that Andean political elites were often just as dominating as the European colonizers (this is why I have taken great care to avoid making general concepts about 'Andean philosophy', preferring instead to talk of philosophical *tendencies* that are expressed in the texts). Again, however potent the strategy of resistance may be, its potency derives from operating on the same terms as the hegemonic discourse of discrimination: there are still two irreconcilable groups, one of

which must win and one of which must lose, with no legitimate possibility of meeting in the middle or even changing one's essence as a 'winner' or a 'loser'. The irony is that the very discourse *is* a meeting in the middle: the *trace* operates unconsciously, so that both sides, by denying their undeniable hybridity, perfectly attune themselves to the cognitive orientation of the Other. The messianic nature of the Inca, in contrast to the morally base Europeans, is rhetorically perpetuated in the following verses:

### Resentimiento del Inca

This song, with the Spanish title of 'The Inca's Resentment', is sung by Atawallpa, with the *ñustas* singing *alli wiyaw* 'listen well' after verse:

Hanan saya urin saya Ishkay shutiyoqmi Cuzcuy Ilaqta

Alli wiyaw Listen well

Kunan tuparillaashaq Kunan watukarishaq Cajamarca plazantsikmi

Alli wiyaw Listen well

Tika tika maqtsirishpam Ripurishunna kuyay Ilaqtaaman Apukishpay qaparikuyna Tsayna illu tullu shimi

Alli wiyaw Listen well

Manaraq inti tutaranganyaq Manaraq killa wamayanganyaq Manaraq tullu shimi yuriptinga Naaqanam Inka Apu karqayki

Alli wiyaw Listen well

Upper part, lower part

City of Cuzco

Of two names

Now I will meet

Now I will visit

Our square of Cajamarca

Spreading flowers upon flowers
We will set off towards our dear city

There appears the mouth of bones

Governors, sound your horn

Not until the sun grows dark

Not until the moon grows sad

Long before bone-mouth was born

Long ago, you were Lord and Inca

Ama suwa ama qela ama llulla Vasallukuna Ho Wiracocha inti patsa kamaq Kunan rimayniita willatsillaaman

Alli wiyaw

Titicaca yurikonqaaqa Cajamarca wañukunqaaqa Qori qillay shuntaraqtan

Alli wiyaw

Pachakamaqchaw shuntaskatsinki ¿Ima haqiyraq haqirillaashaq? Coricancha Cuzcuy markata

Do not steal, do not be lazy, do not lie Vassals Oh Wiraqocha, Creator of sun and earth Now leads me to proclaim

Listen well

My birth in Titicaca
My death in Cajamarca
Gold and silver heaped together

Listen well

You horde it in Pachakamaq What is to become of the world I leave? Qorikancha, my Cuzco, my land

The song opens with reference to the Empire's capital, Cuzco, described in terms of the Andean bipartite division of hanan saya 'upper half' and urin saya 'lower half'. The division is reinforced in ishkay shutiyogmi 'of two names'. As Davies notes, the 'division of Cuzco into two halves lies at the very root of its system of government, since...Hanan Cuzco assumed a certain primacy in war and secular government, whereas Hurin [Urin], where Coricancha [Qorikancha] and countless other temples and shrines were situated, was the seat of religious hierarchy' (1997:139). A similar moiety division in Huanchacbamba means that the division of Cuzco can be actively experienced, whereby the sense of Incan commonality is embodied as well as imagined. The second verse describes the Inca's imminent arrival in Cajamarca, where he will meet the Spanish. There is parallelism with repetition of SQ kunan 'now' followed by two semantically related AQ VRs: tupa- 'meet'; watuka-'visit'. The main plaza 'square' of Cajamarca is appropriated by IPOSS –ntsik (plazantsik), confirming the sense of a single community stretching over a vast territory. The next verse alludes to the spreading of tika tika 'flowers' on the street (recalling Wayta Muruy) as the retinue sets out kuyay llaqtaaman 'towards my dear city' of Cajamarca. (The word t'ika 'flower' is a SQ loan; I have written it without the ejective because this is the way DM pronounced it, the ejective being absent in AQ; Carranza Romero also writes tika this way, cf. 2003:234). The adjective kuyay 'loved, dear' conveys the Inca as loving and benevolent. The third line requests the apukishpay (governors of each suyu) to *qaparikuy* 'make noise', or sound the *pututu* on arrival in Cajamarca (note also the SQ *ripurishun* 'we will go'. The last verse, Tsayna illu tullu shimi, 'Over there appears the mouth of bones', alludes to Felipe (cf. p.209). The analogy conveys the death and destruction wrought by Felipe, in plain

opposition to Inca's vitality and benevolence. *Simi* denotes 'speech' as well as 'mouth'. Thus, the text displays mistrust of language, which may be an allusion to the widespread discrimination of Quechua-speakers since the European invasion (cf. pp. 50-54).

The following verse emphasizes the ancient origin of the Incas and the conflation of their destiny with the natural order. Only *Inti tutaranqanyaq* 'When the sun grows dark', only *Killa wamayanqanyaq* 'When the moon grows sad', will the Inca dynasty fade. Moreover, *naaqanam* 'long before' *tullu shimi yuriptinqa* 'the mouth of bones [Felipe] was born', the *Apu* already existed. This illustrates that the *Apu* is not a single ruler, rather the entire Incan lineage, presented as contiguous with the present cosmological era. The 'naturalness' of the Inca, and the 'humanity' of nature, are both stressed: as the dynasty is ending, the moon grows sad and the sun grows dark. The next verse reinforces the laws which the Incas are said to have laid down: *ama suwa*, *ama qela*, *ama llulla* 'do not steal; do not be lazy; do not lie'. Here, the Inca's voice is messianic, intensified by *vasallukuna* 'vassals' which suggests the unity of a people around their prophet. The Europeans are a complete contrast to these laws, in stealing gold (first law), thereby profiting at someone else's expense (second law), and in feigning hospitality by inviting Atawallpa to Cajamarca (this doesn't feature in the text I have collected, but was explained by DM and is depicted in the *Pallas* songs below) (third law).

As well as reinforcing the moral supremacy and natural order of Andean society in contrast to the Europeans, the messianic tone reminds participants that the laws are still applicable and that the Inca remains latent, the binding principle of Andean unity. This can be seen as a warning against integrating with Hispanic society, which, according to the text, does not obey these laws. The third line alludes to Wiraqocha, the supreme god, identified as *Inti patsa kamaq* 'Creator of the sun and earth'. The term *kamaq* (VR *kama*; agentive –q) has received attention from various scholars, mostly summarized by Godenzzi. For Garcilaso, *kama* [cama] denotes the Spanish ánima (Garcilaso de la Vega 1609/1973:72, in Godenzzi 2005:61), generally translated as 'soul' but with a life-giving connotation as in the VR anima- 'animate'. For Santo Tomás, the verb kamani- [camani] means 'fill', 'rear, or do something again', 'skim', 'fit in a place', 'fulfil'; kamaynin is 'the soul [ánima] thanks to which we live'; kamaq is 'breeder, or the one who does something again' (Santo Tomás 1560/1951:245-6, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt). For González Holguín 1989, kamaq [camak] means 'God, creator God'; sara [çara] camak [kamaq] allpa denotes 'land that is fertile for corn'; VR camani is 'bear fruit, produce or rear'; VR kamani [camani] means 'fit, enter well'; kamay [camay] is 'my obligation' (González Holguín 1608/1989: 47, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt). One anonymous colonial

source lists *kamachini* [*camachini*] as 'to order someone to do something', *kamayoq* [*camayoc*] as an 'official', and *camascaruna* as 'magician' (Anónimo 1586/1951:21,145, in Godenzzi 2005:60, mt).

Modern sources describe kamay as 'Creation, the act of creating' (Lira 1982:100, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt), and as 'to create', 'to do/make' (Cusihuamán 1976:62, in Godenzzi 2005:63, mt). In addition, Godenzzi notes how, in numerous ritualistic usages of kama-, the morpheme denotes 'animation' or 'transmission of vital force' (Godenzzi 2005:61, mt). Summarizing the above usages, Godenzzi concludes that 'The term kamay contains two fundamental concepts: that of globality (all, total, fill, etc.) and that of orientation (until, responsible to, deserves, etc.) (Taylor 1976:234), so that Itier (1992b:1023) can define it as "to adjust to a volume", based on Domingo de Santo Tomás' definition "to fit in a place" (Godenzzi 2005:64). From this central definition, various meanings can be generated, such as 'to ensure that everything which has a purpose can fulfil it completely' or 'to transmit energy so that everything that should be can be' (Godenzzi 2005:64). Howard-Malverde argues that kamayuq [kamayoq] means 'the one who has the power to animate', and 'is the quintessential power to bring about transformation in the external world, in Quechua philosophy. The concept of kamayuq is the best illustration of the interdependency of economic and spiritual life in the Quechua productive enterprise' (1992:3). This links with the previous chapter, where we witnessed the creation of unity through reciprocity, and where the ethical could not be disassociated from the pragmatic. Thus, 'Kamay refers to creation not in the sense of making something from nothing, but in the sense of controlling how something happens, of directing its mode of existence' (Allen 2002:34). Whilst, in this verse, patsa kamag (pachakamag in SQ) refers to Wiragocha, this interpretation of kama reinforces my interpretation of the Apu as a guiding principle for the kallpa 'energy' channelled through the Empire, and as the productive synthesis of Andean commonality. Godenzzi notes that 'the term kamay, under the influence of missionary preaching, has undergone semantic changes; rather than meaning "transmission of vital energy", it becomes a medium for other meanings such as "to create" or "to make" (2005:63, mt). Thus, it is possible that, in this verse, it denotes 'creation' rather than the indigenous notion of 'animation', particularly given the conflation between Wiragocha and the Christian God. The Inca, nonetheless, appears to be more in line with Allen's interpretation. Indeed, Godenzzi notes how kallpa (deployed here in reference to the Inca) has largely retained its pre-Hispanic meaning, unlike kama (referring, in the text, to Wiraqocha) (2005:62).

The phrase rimayniita willatsillaaman is ambiguous. Either the -man is the conditional suffix or it is the first-person object-marker -ma plus 3PRES -n. The lengthening of -llaa does not help us

because this would occur anyway in either interpretation (it could either be a morphophonological process before the conditional suffix, or indicative of the first person singular). The other morphemes are: VR willa- 'inform'; causative -tsi; affective -lla. Thus, willatsillaaman could mean 'causes me to inform' or 'I would cause to inform'. Rimayniita is the object form of 'my words'. Given the supremacy of Wiraqocha, I would argue that willatsillaaman means 'causes me to inform', whereby the Inca's divine association means that he voices the words of God, strengthening the association between the ten commandments of Moses and the three laws of the Inca. The next verse begins by encapsulating the Inca dynasty from its birth in Lake Titicaca (with Manku Qapaq) to its death in Cajamarca (with Atawallpa). The vowel-lengthening on the nominalizer -nqa (to create -ngaa) shows that this is related in the first person, equating the dynasty with the lifespan of a single entity, and confirming the nature of the Apu as an Incan essence rather than a single ruler. The third and fourth lines refer to the wealth deposited in Pachakamaq (a pre-Hispanic temple on the coast) for shipping to Spain. The final rhetorical question ¿Ima haqiyraq haqirillaashaq / Corikancha Cuzcuy markata? 'What is to become of the world I leave / Qorikancha, the town of Cuzco?' (literally, 'What left-thing will I leave?'). This refers to the imminent execution of Atawallpa, the last physical manifestation of the Apu. The sentence prompts participants to critically reflect on their contemporary situation. The rhetorical question illustrates uncertainty; the Inca cannot read the future because it pertains to a different time-period. In hagirillaashaq, the suffix -ri and affective -Ila convey poignancy. The mention of Cuzco serves to define the Empire as the manifestation of this city, and Qorikancha as the most important location in Cuzco given its religious significance and link between Incan and divine orders.

In this song, the Inca's divine benevolence was reiterated through his loving (*kuyay*) relationship with Cajamarca, while his messianic and prophetic role was conveyed by his Moses-like proclamation of the three laws of the Empire, his pain at what will come after his demise, and the equation of the dynasty with a single lifetime. Building on similar analyses in Chapter Two (Part Two), I argue that, by transcending the boundaries between individuals, this spatiotemporal continuity serves to extend the bracketed non-threatening Self to all of the members of the Incan 'community', thereby serving as a refuge from the threat of the hegemonic Other. The significance of this Other is minimized by defining Felipe – the traitorous hybrid – as a recent emergence in contrast to the immeasurable span of the Incan Empire.

The designation of Felipe as *tullu shimi* 'mouth of bones' is almost certainly a reference to the Spanish language which was imposed on the indigenous population during the colonial period and

which has, to varying degrees, been an instrument of marginalization ever since. Just as Felipe's significance is minimized by reference to his age, so the importance of the Spanish language is denied, insofar as it has no substance, being dry and desiccated. Lara's text likewise contains reference to the linguistic conflict, when Sairi Túpaq states: *Manan watuyta atinichu / Auqa sunk'aj rimayninta* 'I do not grasp the meaning / Of the enemy's words' (1957/1989:100). Ironically, however, the meaning has been grasped so well in real life that it has become a tacit cognitive orientation among the subjugated: the irreconcilability of the two groups, one of which (whether Andean or Spanish) must emerge victorious. The contrast is therefore a reaffirmation that both groups (Andean and Spanish) derive their ontological existence from the unmotivated trajectory of the *trace*, and, by defining themselves as one group or the other, partake in this form of antagonistic communion. In the last song of the *Apu Inka*, we shall see how the single hubris of the last Incan ruler serves all the more to reinforce the Andeans' alleged superiority over the European newcomers.

## Tambo Inkapa

This song is sung by the *capitana*. A *tambo* (*tampu* in Quechua) is a storehouse for foodstuffs and other essentials. DM explained that the Incas would stop at *tampus* during their long journeys. Thus, the *Tambo Inkapa* 'Inca's Tambo' simulates the Inca's rest during his journey to Cajamarca. The term *tambo* is phonologically adapted to Spanish with vowel-lowering [u] > [o] and voicing [p] > [b].

Tsatsay runa amawta inca Qori riwi riwillaykiwan Ima mayutan mana tsimpana Ima qochatan mana regina

Mananapis kutimushuntsu Kunanllanapis Qatswarikullaashun Llapallantsikqa

Weqillaami shikwarillan Pachak wata paqtarinnam Pachakuteq willakunqam Intipa churin usharinanta Elder man, master Inca
With your sphere, your golden sphere
What river have you not crossed?
What lake have you not known?

No longer will we return Only now Shall we dance All of us together

My tears are falling
One hundred years are almost over
Pachakutiq foretold
The son of the sun will end

Illun rikariina vasallukuna

Kullu rupashqa

Shaqtay kushmakunata Tsaynam inka tsaynam apu Cajamarca plazantsikchaw

Aku ñusta llapan apukishpay Cajamarca bañus wasiman

Tsaypin inka ripumunqa apuntsik

Pachakuteq nimanqannaw

Kaymi inka kaymi apu Qori wasi killay lashtana

Kunanllanam llapan vasallokuna Tuparintsik tushukurintsik

Intintsikpis tutaqanmi Kay patsapis karkaryanmi Kallpallaypis ushakanmi

Kuyay wawqiita wañutsinqaata Waskar Inka Apu kanganta kananga nogallaapis

wañushagmi

Wawqiita wañukuynin

Hanan rumi tsakapita unyarullaaman

Vassals, I see appearing

Burnt tree-trunks

Shirts of the *shaqtay* plant Already, Inca, already, Lord

They are on our square of Cajamarca

Let us go, ñusta, all generals of the Lord

To the baths of Cajamarca

There the Inca, our Lord, will journey

As Pachakutiq foretold

Here, Inca, here Apu,

Is the golden house, bathed in moonlight

Only now all vassals Will meet, will dance

Our sun grows dark
The earth trembles
The energy is waning

My dear brother, Waskar Inca, whom I killed

Being Lord, now I must also die

The death of my brother

I hurled him from a bridge high on the

mountain slopes

The first verse reinforces the Inca's wisdom and power, through *tsatsay* 'old' and *amawta* 'learned master' and by alluding to the magical *riwi*. Lines three and four state that the Inca has crossed every river and knows every lake. Thus, the Empire is, as in Incan times (Davies 1997:173), equated with the world itself, defining Incan solidarity as a universal – messianic – and natural state. The second verse poignantly acknowledges the dynasty's imminent demise: *Mananapis kutimushuntsu* 'We will never return again'. *Kunanllanapis* 'only now' (SQ *kunan* 'now') *qatswarikullaashun llapallantsikqa* 'will we all dance'. The phrase *llapallantsikqa* 'all of us' comprises: *llapa*- 'all'; affective –*lla*; IPOSS –*ntsik*; topicalizer –*qa*. The combination of these morphemes is a powerful reassertion of group-identity: *everyone* (*llapa*-) is dancing; there is an affective bond between participants (-*lla*); the participants are part of a single group (-*ntsik*); all of this is emphasized by –*qa*. Likewise, the affective –*ri* and –*lla*, and reflexive –*ku*, in *qatswarikullaashun* 'we will dance', convey an intertwining of Self and Other as part of an indivisible community. Thus, a note of reassurance accompanies this verse: come what may, the people will remain united.

The third verse begins with the sorrowful expression Weqillaami shikwarillan 'My tears are falling', emphasized by the affective -lla and -ri. Here, the capitana, in line with her role, voices the sentiments of the population at large. The remaining lines confirm the fulfilment of Pachakuteq's prophecy that the dynasty would end after one hundred years. Pachakuteg is believed to have expanded the Incan territory to imperial dimensions through his wave of successful conquests. The reference to pachak wata 'one hundred years' refers to the fact that the Empire lasted for just under a century. Thus, Pachakuteq foretells, after this time-period, Intipa churin usharinanta 'That the son of the sun will end'. The fourth verse marks another turning point as the Europeans are seen for the first time. The word illun 'they appear', rather than chaakuyan 'they arrive', serves to dehumanize the newcomers, who are spotted in the distance akin to wild animals from which a safe distance should be kept. This emphasizes the moral and psychological gulf between the two peoples. The phrase kullu rupashqa 'burnt tree-trunks' once more describes the newcomers as deformed nature (cf. p.212). The third line likens the dark colour of the newcomers to clothes made from the black fibres of the shaqtay plant (Agave species), common in the vicinity. The final two lines state that the Europeans have already arrived on the main square of Cajamarca (again appropriated by IPOSS ntsik), foreboding the Inca's imminent demise.

The fifth verse conveys the inescapability of destiny, as the ñustas and apukishpays are urged to proceed with the Inca to Cajamarca, Pachakuteq nimanqannaw 'as Pachakuteq foretells'. The text makes reference to the bañus wasiman 'thermal baths' of Cajamarca where the Inca will recline after the long journey. There are two SQ morphemes in the third line: locative -pi (instead of AQ -pa) 'by' in tsaypi 'by there'; ripu- 'go'. The first case is atypical (all other examples in Apu Inka are -pa), so it was probably triggered by the following SQ root ripu- which, in the Apu Inka, always occurs instead of AQ aywa- (DM, who dictated the text, is familiar with both AQ and SQ). The sixth verse begins with the announcement to the Inca that they have arrived at the qori wasi 'golden house' or temple of Cajamarca (equated with the local church). According to DM, lashtana (VR lashta- 'spread'; nominalizer -na) refers to the large quantity of semi-liquid gold which was spread onto the walls of the Incan temples. This interpretation, however, is not congruent with killay ('moon'; affective -y); why should the moon be mentioned if the reference is to gold? It seems more plausible that this line refers to the moonlight which spreads over the church and would illuminate the (imagined) golden colour of the building. DM's interpretation, however, is revealing in that it shows a fundamental motivation to convey the wealth and grandeur of the Empire, a fact that is strongly represented in other parts of the text. The third and fourth lines reinforce the sense

of a close community synthesized by the Inca, in *llapan vasallokuna* 'all vassals', and the IPRES –*ntsik* in the two verbs. The impending doom is indicated by the assertion that they will dance together *kunanllanam* 'only now' (SQ *kunan* 'now'; affective –*lla*; temporal –*na*; 1EVI –*m*).

The seventh verse begins by referring to intintsik 'our sun'; the IPOSS suffix -ntsik appropriates the sun for the group, emphasizing the intertwining of the social, natural and divine which is the basis on which Andean identity is reaffirmed. The sun tutaqan 'darkens', which refers to an eclipse, an omen of catastrophe in Andean cosmology: 'It is...believed that the eclipse of the sun announces the death of men and the eclipse of the moon the death of women' (Skar 1982:6). Likewise, kay patsa 'the earth' karkaryan 'trembles, shivers'. This alludes to an earthquake, another harbinger of destruction in this highly seismic region. 'Earthquake' is normally translated as patsa muyun 'the earth moves' (VR muyu- 'move'), whereas karkarya- 'tremble, shiver' generally applies to people when they tremble from fear or shiver from cold. Thus, the earth doesn't just move; it feels the impending catastrophe of the Incan order and trembles in empathetic response. The phrase kallpallaypis ushakanmi could be translated as 'the strength is ending' or 'my strength is ending', since -y can serve both affective and first-person possessive functions. Given the conflation of the Incan and natural orders, both interpretations are plausible, for the Inca's destiny is not separate from the destiny of the world at large. This coincides with the meaning of patsa (pacha): 'Pacha means in a narrow sense earth, including space, time, history, world - in a broader sense, however, also cosmos. Pacha expresses in its spatial and chronic aspects the inner connectedness of the whole on all levels of world constructs' (Baumann 1996:25).

What this verse describes is a *pachakuti*, literally 'world-turning' (Howard-Malverde 1990a:64). According to Estermann, 'In the ethnical sense, *pachakuti* is the last and most radical remedy to restore a severely disrupted balance. Cosmic disorder, the result of a series of very serious infractions against the principle of reciprocity (such as occurred during the Conquest), can only become order again (*pacha*) through a violent and radical "turn" (*kutiy/kutiña*)' (1998:252, ft. 34, mt). Atawallpa's assassination of his brother has impeded the proper circulation of *kallpa*, throwing the world into disarray, and the old order must end for a new one to arise. The universality of the destruction is highlighted by parallelism, whereby each line begins with a noun followed by *pis* 'also', and ends with a verb; the 1EVI *mi* after each verb emphasizes the certainty of doom. It is notable that, while the *hanaq patsa* 'sky' and *kay patsa* 'earth' are both undergoing disaster, the *uku patsa* 'underworld' seems to be stable. This recalls Allen's findings that the underworld was an 'interior dimension of experience' (2002:48) where significant past events recede and lie dormant.

As Allen puts it elsewhere, 'To say the anterior worlds are "destroyed" doesn't mean that they no longer exist; it means that they influence our world by indirect means. They continue to exist, but not "in clarity" (sut'ipi)...They are past-as-potential future,...waiting for their time to come around again' (2011:114). Thus, the end of the Inca's world does not mean its annihilation. At special times, the spirit of the Inca enters each participant, transforming them from marginalized outcasts to dignitaries in the ancient retinue of the Inca who journey through time and space across the vast reaches of a glorious Empire. Imbued with the vital force, the kallpa, of the ancestral spirit, the participants reaffirm their ancient bonds with land and community, so that Andean unity is refreshed, re-lived and reaffirmed. Thus, as Millones states, the drama of the Inca does not so much express the 'existence of a remote "other" place where the Inca lies hidden away, but instead the capacity...to actualize his presence, which...can be attained by way of magical acts and the elaboration of rituals' (1992:65, mt).

The last verse is Atawallpa's final realization and admittance of the true reasons for the Empire's demise. Coming to terms with his actions in grim resolution, he proclaims: *Kuyay wawqiita wañutsinqaata Waskar Inka / Apu kanqanta kananqa noqallaapis wañushaqmi* 'My dear brother, Waskar Inca, whom I killed / Being Lord, now I must also die'. The bitter regret is evident in *kuyay* 'dear', and in his acknowledgement of *Apu kanqanta* 'he was Lord' (*apu* 'spirit, ruler'; VR *ka-* 'be'; nominalizer –*nqa*; 3PRES –*n*; object-marker –*ta*). The third line reinforces the horror of Atawallpa's actions, which haunt him as he cries in dismay *Wawqiita wañukuynin* 'The death of my brother'. The grief and repentance culminate in the terrible admittance of the final line: *Hanan rumi tsakapita uñarullaaman* 'I hurled him from a bridge high on the mountain slopes'. The use of the conditional –*man* is hard to translate, but probably conveys disbelief at his own actions, or perhaps a lasting unwillingness to fully admit it to himself.

The role of Atawallpa is indeed ambiguous. On the one hand, he perpetuates evil, is the cause of the dynasty's demise and serves as a lesson against jealousy, the cardinal sin if good behaviour is defined as reciprocity. On the other hand, he is an Inca and is adulated as such in the majority of the text. This adds weight to my interpretation of the *Apu* as an Incan essence rather than a single ruler. Atawallpa certainly has some of the *Apu* in him. He was, after all, the last monarch, as well as the brother of Waskar and son of Wayna Qapaq. But he is not fully Inca because he usurped the throne, and this was because his claim was not legitimate. Atawallpa's nature as an illegitimate son was described to me by DM, and is also attested by Bermúdez-Gallegos' interpretation of Garcilaso's (1609) chronicle: 'Wayna Capac was legitimately married to the mother of Huascar [Waskar], Mama

Ocllo, but this was not the case with the mother of Atahualpa, a princess from Quito with whom he lived in concubinage' (1993:336, mt). In reality, the rules of Inca accession were fairly ill-defined; there had been several feuds long before Waskar and Atawallpa (Rostworowski 1998:18). The redefinition of legitimacy in such straightforward terms thus seems to borrow from the European concept of direct inheritance through birthright: the first son inherits the throne provided he is born in wedlock. Garcilaso probably reinvented the rules of accession in order to cater to Catholic predilections. The following could equally be applied to the *Apu Inka*:

'To explain the treason of Atahualpa [Atawallpa], to which the fall of the Empire is ascribed, Garcilaso must create an enemy among the indigenous people, ultimately arriving at the conclusion that Atahualpa betrayed Huascar [Waskar] and his people because he [Atawallpa] was not the authentic descendant of the Incas. When he contrasts Atahualpa with the Spanish conquistadors, he describes him as a victim, since they are even worse than the indigenous enemies' (Bermúdez-Gallegos 1993:340, mt).

This means that Atawallpa can at least be related to – he is, after all, Andean, whereas the Europeans are foreign, plague-like and nihilistic. Thus, Andean supremacy remains unquestioned, and its single hubris reconfirms, in the minds of participants, the need to join together as one community and avoid the egoism that is believed to emanate from Hispanic society. Taylor, cited by Niles, makes a similar point regarding the role of oral poetry in promoting ethical behaviour: 'By means of its performative break with everyday speech...poetry as voiced aloud in early societies "evoked memories of the ethos of the community and thereby provoked hearers to act ethically" (Taylor 1986:125-126, in Niles 1999:86). In the case of *Apu Inka*, we can replace 'early societies' by 'contemporary oral societies'. The rhetorical power of the *Apu Inka* likewise derives from its liminal, ritual, context, where the 'performative break' in the tectonic crust of everyday life allows for the upswelling of an Incan 'essence' from below. An essence that is imagined as lying latent beneath the surface and that gives life and warmth to those who continue to live according to its principles.

The *Tambo Inkapa* concludes the *Apu Inka* with a synthesis of the main themes that run through the whole narrative. The universal travels of the Inca, the prophecy of the early emperor Pachakuteq, the universal pretensions of *Ilapan vasallukuna* 'all vassals' and the empathetic response of nature, all serve to reinforce the cohesion of the Incan community as well as its emanation from divinity. Wachtel notes how, in both the Chayanta and Oruro versions, the sun is likewise veiled in smoke (1977:38). In the former, moreover, the wind is described in empathetic terms – *Ilaki wayra waqasqan* 'the sad wind is crying' (Lara 1957/1989:94, mt) – just as, in the *Apu Inka*, the earth shivers rather than merely moving. As in the previous songs, the Tambo Inkapa describes the

Spaniards as physically as well as morally remote: they *illun* 'appear' from a distance, and again exhibit characteristics of deformed nature. While Atawallpa's assassination of his brother is the hubris that has incited divine punishment, this serves the purpose of reinforcing, rather than threatening, the supremacy of Andeans over Europeans. It removes agency from the dominating group and places control firmly in the hands of indigenous people who have ultimate accountability for what has happened. Thus, the discourse of Christianity is tailored to an underlying strategy of resistance, which itself is formed on the basis of an underlying cognitive orientation – the *trace* – that stresses the ontological existence of two irreconcilable and unequal groups, an orientation that is shared both by the discourse of discrimination and the resistance to this discourse.

#### Southern Quechua in the Apu Inka

Throughout the Apu Inka, we have seen various SQ borrowings. I found the following SQ morphemes: ripu- 'go'; 1PRES -ni in ripurimuni 'I come'; kachaspari 'brilliant, beautiful'; qhapaq (pronounced qapaq by DM) 'creator'; kawsa- 'live'; third-person desiderative -chun in kawsachun 'long live'; tata 'father', in Tata Wiracocha 'father Wiraqocha'; llaqta 'town, city'; Tawantinsuyu 'land of four quarters, Incan Empire'; inti 'sun'; paharin 'tomorrow'; kunan 'now; churi 'son'; tiya-'sit'; t'ika (pronounced tika by DM); locative -pi in tsaypi 'by there'; -manta 'from'. Unlike the Spanish loans, none of these SQ morphemes is used in common speech in Huanchacbamba; thus, I suggest that their use is rhetorically motivated. I argued that, overall, SQ terms indicated alignment to the Inca since this was the prestige language of the Empire. Banti and Giannattasio note how 'borrowing from other languages and dialects...occurs frequently in poetic diction - as well as in ritual and religious registers - for mystifying and intensifying the verbal message. The use of uncommon and alien forms marks the text as esoteric' (2004:307). This is illuminating in general terms, but doesn't answer the question of why some terms and not others were borrowed from SQ. Whilst the corpus of SQ terms is small, I have tentatively identified two main themes: terms relating to vitality, and spatiotemporal terms. The following relate to vitality: kawsa- 'live'; ghapaq 'creator'; tata 'father'; inti 'sun'; churi 'son'; t'ika 'flower'. The following are spatiotemporal: ripu- 'go'; llaqta 'town, city'; Tawantinsuyu 'land of four quarters, Incan Empire'; paharin 'tomorrow'; kunan 'now'; manta 'from'; locative -pi. The SQ suffixes -ni (1PRES) and -chun (third-person desiderative) were doubtless triggered by the accompanying SQ root. There remain two morphemes which do not fit into the above categories: kachaspari 'brilliant, beautiful'; tiya- 'sit'. These can be explained by their relation to the prestige of the Inca, for whom a kachaspari 'beautiful' dance is performed, and who tiyan 'sits' on his throne.

Naturally, I cannot draw broad conclusions on such a minute corpus, but, if my interpretation is correct, it fits with the overall theme of the text. Namely, the association between SQ and terms of vitality would reflect the nature of the *Apu* as a life-giving force, while the SQ spatiotemporal terms may reflect the nature of the text as a journey – a journey from present to past, a journey from the days of the Incas to their eventual downfall, a journey from Cuzco to Cajamarca, and a journey inwards to the core of one's self-ascribed essence as people and as a group. Given the indications that the spirit of *Apu Inka* is the central thread of Andean unity, it is not surprising that the journey, which follows the line of this thread, should be expressed in the language of the Inca. This interpretation of the use of SQ is offered as a suggestion, no more, given the small quantity of data.

# Phonological Modification of Quechua Words

Several Quechua words exhibit some modification into Spanish phonology. In my transcription, I have used Spanish, rather than AQ, orthography to indicate this. Thus, [k] is c rather than k, [w] is hu rather than w, and [x] is j rather than h. Sometimes, Quechua uvular [q] was replaced by Spanish velar [k]. This process of velarization occurred with the following words: Wiragocha > Wiracocha; Qorikancha > Coricancha; Qapaq > Capac; Titiqaqa > Titicaca; Qahamarka > Cajamarca. Another process was vowel-lowering of [u] > [o], again in accordance with Spanish phonology. This occurred with the following words: Wankayu > Huancayo; Titu > Tito; suyu > suyo; tampu > tambo (here also voicing of the plosive); Manku > Manco. Why should these terms exhibit phonological integration into Spanish, whereas other Quechua terms are not integrated? The answer, I suggest, lies in the fact that the words are all either place-names (Cajamarca, Huancayo, Tito, Titicaca), or terms relating to specifically Incan cosmology or political organization (Wiracocha, Coricancha, Capac, suyo, tambo, Manco). Place-names are nowadays almost always uttered in Spanish, even if the surrounding words are Quechua. The terms relating to the Incan world are no longer used in daily speech, given their loss of relevance to contemporary reality. Nonetheless, they have entered Spanish which, being a literary language, can conserve them. Moreover, the literary nature of Spanish brings with it a whole tradition of historical analysis in which archaic terms take on a new kind of relevance instead of being simply forgotten. Thus, it would seem that Spanish is better placed than Quechua to retain words that no longer relate to contemporary reality. In the Apu Inka, the originally Quechua terms are then re-integrated into Quechua via borrowing from Spanish. Thus, the Spanish phonology of traditional Incan terms suggests that the Apu Inka is the work of a society that has been largely alienated from Incan culture (if it was ever particularly integrated in the

first place), and that the assertion of an Incan 'worldview' is not so much cultural continuity as cultural reinvention, motivated by contemporary needs and desires. Another process was the elimination of ejectives (as in  $t'ika \ t'ika > tika \ tika$ ) and aspirates (qhapaq > qapaq); this can be understood insofar as these phonemes do not exist in AQ.

### **Las Pallas**

We now turn to a different oral tradition, *Las Pallas*, sung in the province of Bolognesi. Like the *Apu Inka*, the *Pallas* songs are performed as part of patron saint festivals, and recount the demise of the Incan Empire. The verses are sung by the performers of the eponymous *pallas*, or Incan princesses. There are generally also performers of the Inca, Sinchiruna (Atawallpa's general), Pizarro and Felipe; different villages may have other characters as well. More Spanish pervades the *Pallas* than the Huanchacbamba version of *Apu Inka*, and there is less allusion to pre-Hispanic cosmology, but the themes are similar. Unlike the songs of the *Apu Inka*, the following songs all come from different villages. The *Pallas* texts in Bolognesi are significantly shorter than the original *Apu Inka* versions in Pomabamba province. The first song is one which I transcribed in the village of Pacllón. It comes from a large corpus of songs pertaining to the *Pallas* festivities, and I have selected it because of the interesting examples of code-switching and bilingual wordplay, in addition to its portrayal of the general theme of suspicion between the Incas and Spaniards.

# Tambo (Version from Pacllón)

The term *tambo* denotes the various stops which the Incan retinue made while journeying around the Empire. In this dramatization, it refers to Atawallpa's final stop in Cajamarca before being executed. The verses are sung in the chapel, just before the enacted execution. They were recited by Doña Hilda Osoriano, the *capitana* (who also sang the *Carnaval* song in Chapter Three), while my interpretation was aided by Doña Dora Ibarra, also from Pacllón. Doña Osoriano can be heard singing this song on track four of the accompanying CD.

Embajadami aw Pizarro y Atawallpa Los conquistadores sospechaman Que el Inca procede a mala vía En sus ejércitos numerosos Embassy of Pizarro and Atawallpa The conquerors suspect That the Inca treads an evil path In his many armies Ima invitación kay invitación Malalaguerollay invitación **whistle of waychaw** Gran Pizarruntsikshi invitamantsik Ciudad de Cajamarkallayman

Malalaguerollay invitación Arrozlla pantaslla invitación Gran Pizarruntsikshi persiguimantsik Ciudad de Cuzcollaychawshillay whistle of waychaw

Apuraykullayraq mamay ñushta Malalaguerolla invitación **whistle of waychaw** Hakalla relleno comidallan Gran Pizarruntsikshi invitaman

Manjarlla blanculla invitación Malalaguerochi kallarqa Gran Pizarruntsikpa invitación Ciudad de Cajamarcallaychaw

Palacionllantsikpa alturanchaw
Pajaro solitarium waqaykallan
whistle of waychaw
Malalaguerochi Atawallpa
Wanuylla muertilla hanallantsikchaw

What invitation is this invitation?
Cursed invitation

whistle of waychaw
Our Great Pizarro, they say, invites us
To the city of Cajamarca

Cursed invitation
Invitation of rice and bread
Our Great Pizarro, they say, persecutes us
In the city of Cuzco
whistle of waychaw

Make haste, ñushtas,
An evil omen is inviting us
whistle of waychaw
Stuffed guinea pig is the food
Our Great Pizarro invites us

Invitation of manjar blanco
An evil omen
Our Great Pizarro's invitation
In the city of Cajamarca

Above our palace
A solitary bird is calling
whistle of waychaw
An evil omen for Atawallpa, it seems,
Death, fatality, looms over us

The first verse opens by setting the scene of opposition between Atawallpa and Pizarro. The fact that this is not the life-enhancing opposition of *tinku* is evidenced in the VR *sospecha*- 'suspect'. The suggestion is that the Spanish arrivals suspect the Inca because of his large army, in which case *mala vía* 'bad road, bad way' would denote resistance to the Spanish, although Doña Dora stated that this phrase could also refer to the unfavourable destiny of Atawallpa, who is executed in Cajamarca. The theme of suspicion is accentuated in the second verse. The first line casts doubt on the invitation, by the Spanish, of Atawallpa to a banquet in Cajamarca: ¿Ima invitación kay invitación? 'What invitation is this invitation?'. The doubt metamorphoses into foreboding in the second line: *Malalaguerollay invitación* 'Cursed invitation' (from Spanish *malagüero* 'ill omen'), with a nuance of poignant regret conveyed by the affective suffixes –*lla* and –*y*. This is followed by a whistle simulating the *waychaw* 

bird (*Turdus chiguanco*) whose call is considered an omen of misfortune (photo p.253). This species is also named *yukis* in AQ, and *zorzal* in Spanish (see Itier 1992:1031, ft. 32, for more details on the cultural significance of this species, where it appears as *yukyuk* in a seventeeth-century Quechua text). The phrase *Gran Pizarro* 'Great Pizarro', in the fourth line, is a common refrain in the *Pallas* texts of Bolognesi, and probably refers to Pizarro's military strength, though a degree of irony can be inferred in view of his depiction as an immoral harbinger of destruction, in contrast to Atawallpa who is 'great' in his benevolence. The appropriation of Pizarro through the IPOSS *–ntsik*, combined with the evidential *–shi* (denoting reported information), conveys a willingness to trust but also an underlying uncertainty about whether this trust is genuine.

In the fourth line, three AQ suffixes are added to a single Spanish lexical unit, *Cuidad de Cajamarca* 'City of Cajamarca', namely: affective —*Ila* and —*y*; directional —*man*. Whilst all attendants described the verse as 'Quechua', it consists almost entirely of Spanish words integrated into AQ syntax and morphology. Only two short words are pure AQ: *ima* 'what' and *kay* 'this'. This kind of linguistic interpenetration was common in both provinces, whether in verbal art or ordinary conversation; Muysken (1990:174) similarly mentions *waynu* verses where almost every root is Spanish, grafted onto Quechua syntax and morphology. In Bolognesi, this coincides with significant intergenerational language-shift, though this does not preclude the long-term survival of AQ in a significantly hybridized form and with a reduced population-base. For this thesis, though, it is speakers' perceptions that matter, and we can perhaps interpret this use of 'Quechua' as a refuge within the community, safe from potential eavesdroppers from the 'outside'.

The third verse begins by reinforcing the ominous nature of the invitation: *Malalaguerollay invitación* 'cursed invitation'. The second line displays a wry bilingual play on words. Ostensibly, the line refers to the foodstuffs served at the banquet. Whilst the mention of *arroz* 'rice' is straightforward, the *pantas* 'bread' is more ambiguous. 'Bread' is *pan* in Spanish and *tanta* in AQ. The term *panta* combines both. In AQ, the VR *panta-* means 'be wrong, not identify correctly, be confused' (cf. Carranza Romero 2003:151, mt); what's more, VR *pantatsi-* (with causative –*tsi*), which sounds similar to *pantas*, means 'trick, mislead'. The phrase *pantaslla invitación* can therefore be taken as 'invitation of bread' and 'deceitful invitation'. The connection with the nature of the invitation is clear, since everyone knows that Atawallpa is captured at the banquet. Thus, ensconced in a loaf of bread hides a grain of cynicism which parodies the whole duplicity surrounding the banquet. The phrase is also self-referential: it is hard to notice the wordplay so it is itself an example of the hidden motives at play in the encounter with the Spanish. Muysken has likewise noted

examples of bilingual wordplay in Andean songs (Muysken 1990:173-174; 2004:53-54). It is clear, then, that bilingualism – itself a product of the encounter – has furnished speakers with added resources for constructing multiple layers of meaning. The presentation of the Spanish luring Atawallpa to his death through an enticing promise of food recalls Allen's description of *saqras* in southern Peru: *'Saqras* are demonic cannibals with a second mouth on the back of their necks for eating people. They inhabit isolated huts or remote villages high in the puna where they receive unwary visitors with every show of hospitality – and then lure their guests into eating meals of human flesh before they, too, are killed and added to the cooking pot' (2002:88-89) (cf. the discussion of the Aymara *kharisiri* on p.211).

The third line, *Gran Pizarruntsikshi persiguimantsik* 'Great Pizarro, they say, is certainly persecuting us' parallels its corresponding line in the previous verse, the only difference being the replacement of *invita*- 'invite' by *persigui*- 'persecute' (the second *i* represents AQ phonological integration of a Spanish word, through [e] > [i] vowel-raising). The parallelism is continued in the next line, *Ciudad de Cuzcollaychawshillay* 'in the city of Cuzco' instead of *Ciudad de Cajamarcallayman* 'to the city of Cajamarca'. Thus, the parallel structure juxtaposes the ostensible kindness of the invitation in Cajamarca with the cruelty of the persecution in Cuzco while the Inca is absent, emphasizing the duplicity of the Europeans (though in reality the Spanish had still not arrived in Cuzco by the time they met Atawallpa). The affective *–lla* and *–y* convey poignant regret, while the 3EVI suffix *–shi* in combination with the IPOSS *–ntsik* suggest a disbelief in the betrayal of trust.

Following another sinister whistle of the *waychaw*, the fifth verse encourages the *ñushtas* (largely synonymous with *pallas*) to make haste so that they can attend the cursed banquet; this conveys the inescapable nature of past acts, which continually repeat themselves on particular occasions (cf. the discussion of the *uku patsa* on pp.227-228). The third line states that *comidallan* 'the food' (Spanish *comida*; AQ affective –*lla*) will be *hakalla relleno* 'stuffed guinea pig', a regional delicacy (this term is also mixed, with AQ *haka* 'guinea pig' and affective –*lla*, Spanish *relleno* 'stuffed', and Spanish nounadjective word-order). The sixth verse describes the invitation as *Manjarlla blanculla invitación* 'Invitation of sweet milk'. *Manjar blanco* is a dessert made from milk, and is also a delicacy (the *u* in *blanculla* represents integration into AQ through [o] > [u] vowel-raising, probably triggered by the AQ suffix –*lla*). The affective –*lla* in each example adds to the false enticement. The syntax of this line is also interesting. Both *hakalla relleno* and *manjarlla blanculla* modify *invitación* by acting as an adjective, and comply with AQ adjective-noun word-order; the use of a noun acting as an adjective is a common device in AQ, where word-categories are relatively fluid (in contrast to Spanish). At a

lower level, however, both phrases deploy Spanish noun-adjective word-order, suggesting that they are adopted as a single lexical item opaque to AQ syntax. This strongly suggests that the base-language here is AQ, with Spanish acting only as a resource for vocabulary. In the second line, malalaguerochi kallarqa 'being, it seems, an ill omen', the 2EVI suffix of uncertainty, –chi, reinforces the sense of doubt, while the ironic appropriation of *Gran Pizarruntsik* 'our Great Pizarro' is repeated; the affective –lla and –y following Cajamarca can be interpreted here as an appropriation of this city, since the –y can also function as a first-person possessive (–chaw is the locative 'in').

The final verse summarizes the ominous nature of the whole song: Palaciollantsikpa alturanchaw / Pájaro solitarium waqaykallan 'High on top of our palace / A solitary bird is calling'. This links with the simulated whistle of the waychaw. In Bolognesi, the sight of a bird calling on a rooftop is said to foretell a death in the household; the sinister connotation is reinforced by the polysemy of waqawhich means 'cry' as well as 'call', by the 1EVI –m which indexes certainty, by the continuous –yka which conveys the long duration of the bird's mournful call, and by the affective –lla which here conveys regret. These two lines, described as 'Quechua' by locals, again evidence the significant interpenetration of AQ and Spanish, with waqa- the only AQ root. The sentence as a whole follows AQ syntax, but the phrase pájaro solitarium 'solitary bird' conforms to Spanish noun-adjective word-order, suggesting that it is adopted wholesale as a single phrase; this may indicate the conceptual unity of the 'solitary bird' as an omen of doom. And, indeed, another whistle splits the verse in half. In palaciollantsik, the affective –lla and IPOSS –ntsik stress the emotional unity of the group around this appropriated symbol of Incan supremacy.

The concluding sentence falls like a thunderbolt as the clouds of foreboding condense into two final lines: *Malalaguerochi Atawallpa / Wanuylla muertilla hanallantsikchaw* 'An evil omen for Atawallpa, it seems, / Death, fatality, looms over us'. The facts are starkly laid out: the evil omen affects Atawallpa himself, and this means death for everyone. The parallelism of Quechua *wanuy* 'death' and its Spanish cognate *muerti* (with vowel-raising from [e] > [i]) confirms the certainty of impending doom; here again, bilingualism serves as an additional resource for rhetorical purposes. As Husson states, 'the means of forming semantic couplets isn't fixed, rather leaves the field open to the poet's creativity; insofar as the poet is free to integrate foreign elements into a native structure, the use of a Spanish lexicon is less an impoverishment than a source of replenishment for Quechua poetry. Such a procedure is, moreover, frequent in contemporary oral tradition' (1985:26, mt). Indeed, none of the uses of Spanish in my corpus directly indexes European hostility; if anything, the Spanish loans bolster Andean solidarity. Nonetheless, the shift to Spanish in the first verse did suggest a

move towards an 'out-group' language. The notion of 'death' can be interpreted physically (in the case of Atawallpa) and metaphorically (in the case of the Empire), since the death of the Inca represented the end of Andean independence and the beginning of European domination. This is reflected in *hanallantsik* 'above us', where the IPOSS *-ntsik* suggests that death is above the whole group, not just the Inca.

The Pacllón *Pallas*, whilst constituting a different genre from another geographical area, conveys the same general themes that we saw in the *Apu Inka*. The divine unity of the Inca and his subjects was communicated, in addition to other features, by the common appropriation of the Incan palace in *palaciollantsik* 'our dear palace' and the shared destiny in the suggestion that death lurks *hanallantsikchaw* 'above us all'. The Inca's death is universally significant because, according to these dramatizations, the Inca is more than an individual monarch, but the synthesizing principle of universal harmony:

'the Inca was the incarnation of the life-principle for mankind and the universe: his death, then, has cosmic, religious significance. As the son of the Sun, by his shadow he protected his subjects; he made the mountains speak and his breath set the world in motion. At his death therefore rivers run with blood, tempests rage, mountains crumble, the sky puts on mourning....They illustrate the essential function of the Inca: he is the mediator who ensures the harmony of the universe....But the Inca's death causes cosmic breakdown' (Wachtel 1977:39-40).

The extent to which the Incas' pre-Hispanic subjects would agree with this is questionable to say the least, given their rulers' taste for subjugation. However, following the racial hierarchy imposed in the colonial (and republican) Andes, the 'Incas' have become a useful totem for the re-assertion of Andeanness as a valid category of identification. However, as I have argued throughout this chapter by recourse to Derrida's *trace*, the strategy of opposition serves to reinforce the very same racial hierarchy that led to discrimination in the first place. In this song, the Spaniards are similarly portrayed as the morally base irreconcilable alter, through the depiction of their duplicity. The next song, from nearby Carcas, presents a more open picture of hostility than the verses we have just examined.

# **Entrada** (Version from Carcas)

As in Pacllón, the Carcas *Pallas* contains a number of songs. This song is particularly interesting for the thesis because of the clear confrontation that emerges between Spaniards and Incas. The other songs of the Carcas *Pallas* do not contradict the message of the one we are about to examine, but

they focus much more on the adulation of the Inca with less mention of the Spaniards. The song is performed while the two sides – Inca and Pizarro – enter into a simulated battle, as is suggested by the title meaning 'entrance'. The battle consists of throwing caramels at each other – perhaps an ironic allusion to the fact that such sweet enticements have a distinctly hard edge. Indeed, Flores Galindo notes how, in the 1984 enactment of a similar drama in Chiquián, the throwing of caramels was quickly superceded by fist-fights between the Incan and Spanish groups (1988:74)! In the Carcas *Pallas*, as in the other dramatizations in my corpus, it is only the Incan side that utters verses.

¡Vamos vamos a la guerra! ¡Vamos vamos a la guerra! Por esta calle silenciosa Por esa calle de amargura

Incallaata perdillaatsu Coronallanta perdillaatsu Diamantinta perdillaatsu Remangallanta perdillaatsu

Ambicioso Gran Pizarro Codicioso Gran Pizarro ¿De qué ciudad has venido Con la codicia de oro y fina?

Lucharemos en la guerra Defendiendo Atahualpa Defendiendo la riqueza Defendiendo oro y plata

El valiente Atahualpa El valiente Atahualpa Pelearemos con Gran Pizarro Defendiendo la riqueza

Ambicioso Gran Pizarro Ambicioso Gran Pizarro Hina hina apakullay Coronallanta apakullay Inkallaata dejarillay

Invasores del imperio Fue Gran Pizarro sus tropas Dando muerte a Atahualpa Apoderando de oro y plata Let's go, let's go to war! Let's go, let's go to war! Along this silent street Along this bitter street

I will not lose my Inca
I will not lose his crown
Nor will not lose his diamond
I will not lose his robe

Ambitious Great Pizarro
Greedy Great Pizarro
From what city have you come
With greed for gold and finery?

We will fight in the war Defending Atawallpa Defending the riches Defending gold and silver

Brave Atawallpa
Brave Atawallpa
We will fight against Great Pizarro
Defending the riches

Ambitious Great Pizarro Ambitious Great Pizarro Just take it Take the crown Leave my Inca

Invaders of the Empire
Were Great Pizarro and his troops
Dealing death to Atawallpa
Grasping gold and silver.

The first verse throws us straight into the action: Vamos vamos a la Guerra 'Let's go, let's go to War!' This is repeated for emphasis, and sets the tone for the whole festival which is defined by the deep antagonism between the Inca and the Europeans. The third line Por esta calle silenciosa 'Through this silent street' conveys an eerie stillness, perhaps suggesting that the locals have fled or been killed by the invading army. The unease is reiterated in the fourth line: Por esa calle de amargura 'Along this street of bitterness'. The parallelism of por esa calle 'along this street' foregrounds the two modifiers silenciosa 'silent' and de amarqura 'of bitterness', and thereby also the sense of destruction wrought by the Europeans. In the second verse, the Inca's subjects resolve to defend the Inca and his wealth; the resolution is conveyed by the repetition of perdillaatsu 'I will not lose' (Spanish perd- 'lose'; AQ negative -tsu) in every line. The first-person singular possessive suffix in Inkallaata 'to my Inca' (realized through vowel-lengthening) appropriates the Inca as 'my Inca'; this, plus the affective –lla, reinforces the personal bond between the Inca and his subjects. Each of the Inca's objects is accompanied by the third-person possessive suffix -n, indicating that the object belongs to the Inca; the verbal suffix, by contrast, remains first-person. Thus, the Inca's subjects assume responsibility for the Inca's possessions, illustrating the intimate intertwining of their personal identity with their social responsibility as citizens. The shift in tone from the first verse (a cry to battle and thus a focus on the outside) to the second (a determination to preserve what one holds dear, and thus a focus on the inside) coincides with a shift from Spanish to AQ, indicating once again the deployment of AQ an in-group language.

The third verse directly addresses Pizarro, and therefore switches to Spanish. Pizarro is defined as ambicioso 'ambitious' and codicioso 'covetous, greedy', whereby non-reciprocity is depicted as a cardinal sin, a recurring theme in this study. It is clear, then, that his title *Gran* 'Great' denotes military strength rather than genuine respect. The third line, *De qué ciudad has venido* 'From which city have you come', emphasizes the Europeans' external origin, stressing that the Europeans and their descendants will always be outsiders. The final line, *Con la codicia de oro y fina* 'With greed for gold and finery', portrays the Europeans as thieves, echoing their similar depiction in *Apu Inka*; this is, indeed, a common rhetoric nowadays, where mining companies are described as stealing the country's wealth. The fourth verse reinforces the determination to unite in opposition to the Europeans: *Lucharemos en la Guerra / Defendiendo Atahualpa* 'We will fight in the war / Defending Atawallpa'. As in the *Apu Inka*, the contact between Andeans and Spanish is defined purely in terms of *guerra* 'war'; the possibility of reconciliation is not even considered. The sole focus on Atawallpa suggests that the Inca is so central to Andean society that Andean society will not suffer provided he survives. As in the *Apu Inka*, then, the Inca is depicted as the element which gives people their

essence, their raison d'être, both socially and individually. The thrice repetition of defendiendo 'defending' echoes the four-time repetition of perdillaatsu 'I will not lose' in the second verse, stressing the unity of a group against outsiders, reinforced by lucharemos 'we will fight'. The fifth verse defines Atawallpa as valiente 'brave', emphasized through repetition. The double mention of Atawallpa suggests a summoning of strength against Pizarro, mentioned only once in the verse. The fourth line reiterates the illegitimate appropriation of wealth by foreigners. As in Apu Inka, the Europeans are portrayed as poor in contrast to the Andeans, since the Incas' wealth is genuine whereas that of the Europeans is stolen; thus, contemporary social inequality is accounted for in a way that gives the participants a positive self-understanding.

The dualism is reinforced in the sixth verse, where Ambicioso Gran Pizarro 'Ambitious Great Pizarro' is repeated twice, echoing the repetition of El valiente Atahualpa 'The brave Atawallpa'; the parallelism emphasizes their contrast in moral character, and reinforces the antagonism between them. The following lines are addressed to Pizarro: Hina hina apakullay / Coronallanta apakullay 'Just take it / Take the crown'; Inkallaata dejarillay 'Leave my Inca'. Pizarro is told to take the treasure since this is now inevitable, but he is implored to leave the Inca alone. The phrase hina hina 'all the same, in any case' indicates resignation to the inevitable, while the affective -lla indicates a change of tone, this time beseeching Pizarro to have pity now that the battle has been lost. The imploration to spare the Inca conveys an intimate association with the monarch, heightened by his appropriation through the affective -lla and first-person singular possessive vowel-lengthening 'my Inca'. This once again suggests that personal identity is bound up with the Inca as the synthesizing factor of the Andean community. Additionally, the fact that the Inca's life is valued over wealth reinforces the moral gulf between the two peoples. The use of AQ, in spite of Pizarro's ignorance of Quechua, can be interpreted as a reaffirmation of one's Andean – Incan – identity, which will subsist even when everything is lost. This can be interpreted as a stoic demonstration of solidarity for participants in their marginalized position. Thus, the communicative function of the words seems to be subordinate to their phatic, enactive, purpose of reinforcing group-identity.

In the final verse, the third person preterite *fue* 'was' indicates a shift to the past tense (in Standard Spanish, the verb would be pluralized, but lack of agreement is common in Andean Spanish). Thus, the events are recounted from the standpoint of the present day, looking back. We are no longer part of the action. This allows the verse to adopt an overall perspective and summarize the facts, as well as provide a final moral evaluation of the Europeans. The use of Spanish, the language of officialdom, is consistent with the declamatory tone. Pizarro and his troops are classed as *Invasores* 

del Imperio 'Invaders of the Empire'. The term invasores 'invaders' could not be a stronger refutation of an out-group, or, indeed, of the European descendants, who are felt to have perpetuated the discrimination of Andeans since the Conquest. The invasores 'invaders' are described as Dando muerte a Atawallpa / Apoderando de oro y plata 'Dealing death to Atawallpa / Taking control of gold and silver'. Thus, the Europeans are described as ruthless villains who murdered in order to steal the Empire's riches.

Veiled in a dramatization of the distant past is an implied criticism of the injustice felt to exist in contemporary society, an injustice that rests on the unequal ethnic divisions that were institutionalized as part of colonial ideology. It would be misleading to say that this critique emanates from 'Andeans', 'indigenous people' or 'Quechuas', because such categorization would uphold the very distinctions that inform the discourse of ethnic dualism. As we also saw in Chapter Two (Part Two), moreover, people's desire to reinforce the boundaries partly emanates from their tacit acknowledgement that they belong clearly to neither category (nobody remains untouched whether culturally or biologically - by the European influence). The perceived 'threat' is therefore more than immediate – it lies deep within the Self. What we can say is that the critique emanates from people who, on the relative scale, are more influenced by Andean cultural and linguistic tendencies than those who live in more hispanized circles (on average more 'urban' and 'coastal', and with a greater preponderance of the Spanish language). And it is the hegemony of the 'Hispanic' (as a category) that the Apu Inka songs are intended to 'resist'. The 'resistance', however, reinforces the underlying discourse of ethnic irreconcilability – by merely shifting the balance of moral, cultural and, indeed, existential authenticity from one side of the dichotomy to the other. And this shows just how internalized the hegemony has become. The existential negation of the threatening Other (an Other that can only assume an absolute existence in the partly-imagined world of discourse) is tacit in the following verse, where the extension of the 'nation' to the 'Andes' leaves no room for other categories to stake a claim in the national project:

### Verso del Inca (Raquia)

This verse is part of the *Pallas* songs of Raquia; I have included one verse because of the specific mention of Peru. Past and present are fused in the depiction of the Inca in terms of the modern nation state. The verse was recited by the *capitana*, Doña Julia.

Señor Rey Inca poderoso Emperador del Perú Tome su descanso a su silla Tan brillante y reluciente Powerful Inca, Lord and King Emperor of Peru Rest on your chair That is so brilliant and radiant.

In this verse from Raquia, the Inca is defined as poderoso 'powerful'. Unlike the term kallpa in the Apu Inka, this term does not have the connotations of life-giving energy (even when deployed by AQ-speakers), and could be applied to any ruler; thus, whether or not the use of Spanish coincides with a change in worldview, the expression of indigenous cosmology is certainly more problematic in Spanish, with the result that the Inca's role in maintaining spiritual, natural and social wellbeing is not so profoundly articulated as in the Apu Inka. The second line defines the Inca as Emperador del Perú 'Emperor of Peru'. The belief that Peru is the continuation of the Incan Empire was common in interview-responses, whereby Quechua was seen as the only Peruvian language because it was spoken by the Incas. And the interview-extracts presented in Chapter Two (Part Two) also display an intertwining of Peruvian and Incan allegiance. This serves to define indigenous Andeans as the only true Peruvians, which is congruent with the depiction of the Europeans as 'outsiders' throughout this chapter. Weber likewise argues that, for Quechua-speaking groups, the 'concept of an Andean nation doesn't exist. Their concept is "being Peruvian" (1987:16, mt); here, 'being Incan' is largely synonymous with this. By defining Peruvian identity on their own terms, participants can reject discrimination as emanating from those who are not 'Peruvian' anyway, and re-appropriate a sense of legitimate control and agency that has been largely denied the indigenous population since the European invasion (recalling the redefinition of *cholo* on pp.106-108).

The irony is that the whole song is in Spanish, because, according to Doña Julia (who recited the verse), *los jóvenes ya no quieren escuchar en quechua* 'young people now don't want to listen to it in Quechua'. This recalls Gugenberger's findings among Quechua-speaking migrants in Arequipa, whereby the 'stigmatization of their identity or parts of it produces a conflict within individuals who are members of subaltern groups' (1999:259, mt). The result is that the 'individual, not knowing where and to whom (s)he belongs, feels attracted to different, often incompatible, identities' (1999:259). In our case, I suggest that, whilst people feel comfortable displaying indigenous affiliation in abstract terms (the Incas, despite the text, are, after all, a far cry from contemporary praxis in Raquia), they are not comfortable becoming too closely associated with this label in practice. Performing in such rituals allows people to define their Andeanness – which they have to come to terms with since this is their inalienable origin – in positive terms at particular moments, and yet submit to the far more powerful and almost unassailable pre-eminence of Hispanic society outside these defined periods. Moreover, while use of Quechua may still carry connotations of

marginalization (particularly in Raquia, which is on the main road between Lima and Huaraz and so in relatively close contact with *mestizo* society), the Incas are far enough removed for people to safely associate with them. Thus, indigenous affiliation is contained in such a way that it bolsters, rather than threatens, self-esteem. Indeed, were the participants entirely confident in their identity, it is unlikely that the festivals would have to reinforce their 'Andeanness' quite so energetically. The remaining two lines display the wealth, power and radiance of the Inca as do the other texts in this chapter.

The Carcas Entrada and Raquia Verso del Inca, in common with all of the songs examined in this chapter, serve to strengthen the divide between the Andean (Incan) Self and the European Other. The first verse sets the precedent for this by defining the encounter in terms of war, while the shift to AQ in the second verse coincides with a shift of focus from battle with the hegemonic 'outside' to preservation of the sacred Incan Self. The subjects' assumption of responsibility for the Inca's possessions stresses the perceived predication of their identity on the Inca, and the innocence of the Andean community is reinforced by the numerous instances of the affective suffix -lla. Lara's Chayanta text likewise contains several instances of this suffix, as in Inkallay 'my dear Inca' churillay 'my dear son' and tatallay 'my dear father' (1957/1989:36). While, for the Andeans, the priority is to save the Inca's life, the priority of the Europeans is to steal his wealth. Pizarro is thus defined as ambicioso 'ambitious' and codicioso 'greedy', the antithesis of respectful behaviour in the Andean ayllu. The ñustas in Lara's Chayanta text similarly state that chay augasúnk'aj sungunga, Inkallay / quri qulquita mañajtinri, Inkallay 'the hearts of those bearded enemies, my Inca / desire gold and silver, my Inca' (Lara 1957/1989:108, mt). In the Carcas song, the rhetorical question ¿de qué ciudad has venido 'from which city have you come?' reinforces the existential remoteness of the Spaniards, who are defined only as invasores 'invaders'.

Likewise, the Raquia verse, by defining the Inca as *Emperador del Perú* 'Emperor of Peru', automatically negates any possibility of the Europeans legitimately participating in the modern state. While the Spaniards undeniably *were* invaders, the inaccuracy of these dramatizations lies in their suggestion that the Incas were *not* invaders. Thus, moral rectitude is held *only* by the Incas, and thus *not at all* by the Europeans. The simplicity of such a depiction strongly suggests that there is a psychological motivation to keep both groups separate. And this can only be a motivation if their ideological separation is radically negated in practice. As in Chapter Two (Part Two), I argue that it is the internalized hegemonic discourse of discrimination which results in the European-derived part of Self constituting a perceived threat to the indigenous-derived part (and the 'parts' emerge *through* 

the discourse of separation, not *prior to* it). The desired resistance against a hegemonic (but internalized) enemy is similarly conveyed by the character of Khishkis in Lara's text: *kay auqasunk'akúnaj makinpi / rikukuspa, jallp'anchijta / kajninchijta kamajta rikuspa* 'we will be in the hands of those bearded enemies / when we see that, in our land / they govern' (1957/1989:118, mt). The 'enemy' governs not only in the physical territory of the Andes, but, so I have argued, deep within the Self. And this is evident in the very strategy of resistance, which reinforces the hegemonic boundary between foreign Other and Andean Self. This can be understood as an instance of Derrida's *trace*, where opposition entails the sharing of foundational assumptions that lead to the emergence of each opposed category.

#### Conclusion

All of the songs in this chapter have had one central theme: the irreconcilable divide between Incas and Spaniards, who partake in a discourse of unequal dualism where one side must emerge as victorious over the resoundingly negated Other. In the case of Apu Inka and Pallas, it is the Incas who, despite appearances, attain victory. This is because of their alleged moral superiority to the Spaniards, who fail existentially in the act of domination. In the dramatizations, an unbreachable moral gulf is portrayed: the Incas are almost flawless (with just a single hubris in the form of Atawallpa, not a 'true' Inca anyway), while the Spaniards are an entirely hopeless cause. In this conclusion, I synthesize the argument that has been developing over this chapter, namely that the texts simply reformulate the foundational hegemonic discourse of racial inequality, as did the interviewees in Chapter Two (Part Two). The motivation for this reformulation is twofold: an internalized discourse of ethnic discrimination from the Hispanic Other, concomitant with the tacit acknowledgement that this Other is inseparable from the Self. The fact that the strategy of resistance serves to reinforce the hegemonic assumptions proves just how internalized the Hispanic culture has become. And the unconscious recognition of this (if it is indeed recognized) would serve to motivate even more the ideological bracketing of each category. At the end of this conclusion, I shall show how this interpretation dialogues with Derrida's notion of the trace. That way, the specific psychological analysis fits into the broader philosophical framework of this thesis, anticipating the fusion of Derrida, Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty in the next chapter.

Whilst records suggest that exchange and diplomacy were major strategies of Incan imperialism (cf. Bauer & Covey 2002), it hardly needs saying that the Incas were not the benign rulers suggested by the *Apu Inka* and *Pallas*, nor was there ever a peaceful 'Incan community' across the Andes. The

sixteenth century chroniclers Cieza de León, Garcilaso de la Vega and Calancha all note how, in the selfsame Conchucos Valley where I recorded the *Apu Inka*, there were frequent skirmishes between the native inhabitants and the Incan invaders (Mendieta 1999:41). Various tribes initially welcomed the Spanish as liberators from Incan repression, such as the Cañari of Ecuador, whose rebellions were met with brutal Incan reprisals (Hemming 1970:152), or the residents of the area around modern Ica, who purged the traces of Inca rule after the Spanish arrived (cf. Rowe 1961:44-45). Spier argues plausibly that the Incan origin myth (the dynasty's celestial birth and its emergence from Lake Titicaca) served principally as an instrument of domination: 'the orthodoxy of the state religion was more determined by the religious needs of the central elites than by anything else. These religious needs came as a result of centrally experienced fears and anxieties, such as how to stay in power...[T]his hardly corresponded with the religious needs of the peasantry' (1991:8). Why, then, should the Incas be portrayed as the benevolent and selfless rulers that they were not? And why should Incan ideology resurface in a contemporary festival long after the Incas' demise?

In Chapter Two, I argued that interview-texts exhibited a discourse of unequal dualism, with 'Andeans' frequently classed as inferior to 'Hispanic' society (we also saw this in the *Negrito* song, Chapter Three). This was not just criticized, but also, in some of the extracts, tacitly internalized, arguably because of the hegemonic – and hence highly contagious – nature of this discourse. The fact that almost anyone in the two provinces is influenced to some extent by Hispanic society (because of its hegemony as well as the positive influences of Western society, which, along with its negative influences, cannot be denied either) meant that a conflict was generated within the Self: the discourse of inequality meant that anything 'Hispanic' negated anything 'Andean' – including, therefore, the stable base in which one had grown up and developed. In order to safeguard psychological resilience, that part of the Self that had been formed through appropriation of non-Andean elements was abjected, so that everything else could be bracketed as the 'true Self'.

I argue that the discourses in this chapter can also be interpreted in this light. The influence of Hispanic society is apparent in many ways in all of the villages whose texts I present in this chapter. There is significant media access (television, radio, press), shops with modern products, and monolingual Spanish schools with teachers from the larger towns and cities. The hispanization of specifically Incan terms in the *Apu Inka* and heavy Spanish influence in all texts reveal that the pre-Hispanic world is a far cry from contemporary reality. Moreover, the very fact that the ritual is necessary to 'remind' people of their 'origins' indicates that daily life is considerably removed from that which is portrayed in the festival. The rhetoric of cohesion as an 'Incan community' is explicable

as a desire to negate this influence and define the 'true Self' as Andean, bolstering this Self through its dissolution in an immense community stretching back to time immemorial. Flores Galindo argues that, ironically, this cohesion was partly facilitated by the reduction of Andeans 'to the common condition of Indians or colonized people' (1986:20, mt) in the Colonial period. The divine sanctioning of this community serves to strengthen the bracketed Self all the more, by presenting 'Andean society' as the only valid mode of existence, hence why the divine origins of the dynasty are continually emphasized. The Inca, moreover, maintains the coherence of the bracketed Self by representing order; Ossio notes likewise that, 'For Andeans, the concept of "Inca" essentially means Principle of Order' (1973:XXIII, mt). The abject Self is the irreconcilable Other, resoundingly negated by the universal pretensions of the bracketed Self which encompasses a community that extends over time and space, reaching upwards to divinity. This is redolent of neo-Platonism, whereby evil is not something, but nothing, simply the absence of light.

Thus, the hegemony of Hispanic society is countered by an even greater Incan hegemonic narrative, since, in a discourse of unequal dualism, this is felt to be the only way of safeguarding the bracketed Self from the threatening, powerful and internalized Other. Threatening because of the discourses of discrimination, which we examined in Chapter Two – and Huanchacbamba was itself the site of an hacienda where locals were allegedly exploited by the Hispanic-descended landowners. Demonization of the Europeans also serves to portray the perceived poverty of Andeans and wealth of Europeans as the inverse of reality (just as the discriminatory dualism is inversed), since the Europeans only acquired this wealth through stealing. Morally and legalistically, then, Andeans remain supremely wealthy. This, as well as the use of the present tense in the texts, conveys the sense of a hidden Incan reality in almost Kantian terms: a noumenal (underlying) world which is masked by the illusions of the phenomenal (experienced) world. This noumenal reality can only be accessed, cathartically, through a journey of self-realization in the festivals. In addition, defining the Europeans as a form of divine punishment reinforces, rather than challenges, the ideology of Andean supremacy, by reaffirming the Inca's ties to divinity. Inequality is only apparent because the divine does not intend to favour the Spanish, simply to teach Incan society a lesson, and this due to the single hubris of someone who was only half-Incan himself. It is clear, then, that the 'vision of the past is constantly being reconfigured according to the immediate challenges faced by the indigenous' (Albó 2004b:27).

Thrupp similarly notes how messianic movements can be viewed as 'cultural devices for relieving the painfulness of social changes that degrade or seriously jeopardize the status of a group' (1962:12).

Likewise Barabas: 'Among the conditions which explain the appearance of concrete utopian thinking is, above all, the experience of existential precariousness and collective consciousness of a total crisis' (1986:507, mt). And Stern notes the importance of Andean nativist ideologies in the attempt to redefine 'the local balance of class forces' (1983:22). This all concords with Glassie's statement that, the 'more tense the circumstance, the more likely identity is to rise into articulation' (1994:239), particularly 'during the struggles of minorities within nations or the struggles of nations against imperialist invasion, whether military or economic' (1994:240). Likewise Ingold: 'Ethnicity arises when people seek to recapture a lost or threatened sense of relational identity by expressing it in attributional terms' (1993:229). As well as serving to 'poeticize the past as a form of evasion of present realities' and 'search for new and better [socio-political] alternatives' (Burga 1998:330, mt), the utopian discourses in this chapter seem to be strategies for enhancing psychological resilience where intersubjectivity allows us to develop and stabilize, but also opens us to powerful influences which can threaten that stability. The strategy of maintaining psychological resilience, then, incorporates Hechter's (1978) distinction between 'interactive group-formation' (stressing resemblance within a given group of people) and 'reactive group-formation' (stressing historicallyrooted distinctness from other groups). Through ideological erasure (Irvine & Gal 2000), a complex reality is simplified into black-and-white terms because, ultimately, psychological survival is at stake, and this requires strong rhetorical armoury.

Burga argues that the 'new rural Andean festival, the festival of utopia, continues to function, in its basic structures, like the old rituals. The symbols change, the messages, but the old Andean order continues to exist in a subterranean manner' (1998:428, mt). By 'old rituals', Burga refers to the festivals of *tinku* and *ayni* akin to those in the *Masha* of Mangas (Chapter Three). While the structure is admittedly similar (a dualistic encounter), and this might suggest an element of continuity with (presumably) pre-Hispanic rituals, I believe the differences are more significant than the similarities. The motivation of the dualism in *Apu Inka / Pallas* is quite different to that of the bullfight in *Masha*. In *Masha*, the separation is realized for pragmatic ends – to maintain complementary difference in order to facilitate a targeted and productive synthesis. In this chapter, by contrast, the texts suggest a separation without any fundamental motivation at all. There is simply a discourse of unequal dualism shared by both sides, and each negating the other, wishing that there were no difference at all so that one side could be universal. As Mirande states, such discourses 'suppose a reformulation of the dualistic vision of the world, in which the notions of *taypi* [centre] and *yanantin* [complementarity] cannot, in the majority of cases, operate according to the basic principle of reciprocity and equilibrium between opposites' (2005:366, mt). It is questionable

whether two superficially similar structures can be meaningfully equated if their whole *raison d'être* is different, and if the discourses to which they respond are informed by entirely different concerns. This is where the detailed exegesis of texts can complement studies based on other social phenomena, by revealing discourses that may not be present in other media.

At their core, all of the texts in this thesis have been strategies for survival, and build upwards from our intersubjective nature. Chapters Two (Part One) and Two illustrate targeted engagement. Chapter Two (Part Two) and the present chapter show targeted disengagement. But, in all cases, each strategy responds to the fact that any kind of contact with our environment influences us, and thereby becomes, in a sense, part of the Self. To cite Cornejo-Polar, the dramatization of 'Inca versus Spanish' concerns 'the formation of a subject which is beginning to understand that its identity is also the destabilizing identity of the other' (1990:195, mt), an Other which is incorporated, in conflictive or harmonious fashion, into the Self. Similarly Jackson: 'intersubjectivity reflects...the way our awareness continually drifts or oscillates between a retracted, substantive, and ontologically secure sense of self and a comparatively expanded and unstable sense of self in which one is sometimes fulfilled in being with another, at other times overwhelmed and engulfed' (1998:9-10). In the case of targeted engagement through equality and complementarity, this intertwining of Self and Other is harnessed through empathy and mutual attunement, for the realization of productive ends. In the second case, where the Other is deemed a threat, the influence of that (perceived) Other on the Self is abjected, safeguarding the rest as 'authentic'.

In *Negritos*, we saw how it is possible to vary our degree of attunement, also suggested by the findings of Brass, Ruby and Spengler (2009). Nonetheless, the texts in Chapter Two (Part Two) and the present chapter have shown that we cannot close ourselves off completely, particularly if a given phenomenon or discourse is highly salient. The degree to which we are influenced would seem to depend on two principal factors: the salience of a phenomenon, and the relevance of that phenomenon to our own predisposition (ultimately, survival) (recalling Heidegger's discussion of *Dasein* as neither fully motivated nor fully unmotivated). Whether or not the Other is harnessed or rhetorically negated, it is still engaged with, since the very act of negation is a reaction, a response, to that Other. As Cornejo-Polar states of similar dramatizations, 'the representation of incommunication is, in its way, obliquely, an act of communication; but an act of communication that is incomprehensible outside a historical process which includes various temporal dimensions, each with its own rhythm, nor outside a radical and incisive socio-cultural heterogeneity' (1990:184, mt). Such heterogeneity, however, is not pre-given, but is constituted by the discourse within which

Self and Other, 'in-group' and 'out-group', 'identity' and 'alterity', 'Andean' and 'Hispanic', arise. This drama of conflict is based on the 'indispensable action of the opposites which constitute it' (1990:194, mt), and, through discourse, constitute each other as meaningful categories: 'The category as such — whether indigenous, Indian or aboriginal — is the result of a history which has created it in opposition to the "white", "Christian", "European", etc.' (Gustafsson 2009:8, mt). In Howard's words, the conflict between the two groups 'emerges in discursive performances; it does not exist as an objective abstraction and is best understood...as a relation of "antagonism" rather than one of "real opposition" (2009:24-25). The *Apu Inka* builds on a discourse of 'otherness' that has been perpetuated through history, and, in so doing, the genre contributes to the further perpetuation of this discourse into the future. This anticipates the mutual constitution of opposites in Derrida's (1967) *trace*, which we explore more fully in the next chapter.

In a deeper sense, then, we can partly agree with Burga in that this engagement is a kind of tinku, not in the sense of harnessing difference for productive ends (ayni), but in the sense of reproducing difference by participating in the same dialogue of difference. Discrimination is answered by counter-discrimination, and categories are reinforced in this dialogic process. This is where tinku dialogues closely with Derrida's trace: both terms describe how entities derive their stances from a state of interaction within which Self and Other take form. Discursive categories are not pre-given but emerge through discourse itself. The dissimilarity of these rituals with, for example, Masha is, however, relevant at this deeper level, too. Counter-discrimination results, as we have seen, in negation of the Other, in the unwillingness to engage. This means that a discourse of 'otherness' is likely to be reproduced primarily between those people with whom one wishes to engage, divorced from the active participation of the Other. With the separation of the discourse from the other side, the Other may be portrayed in ways which do not, in fact, concord with the predisposition of that Other. It may keep the Other as Other even when discrimination has ceased, or where the initial motivation for disassociation no longer operates. Those initially discriminated against may become the principal discriminators themselves. Indeed, in the Apu Inka and Pallas, the Spanish remain silent, and are represented by people with principally Andean, rather than Hispanic, origins, so that 'in-group' and 'out-group' become mutually constitutive as ideas, concepts or categories, not necessarily as products of real engagement with that putative Other. In Masha, by contrast, a discourse of 'otherness' is reproduced equally by both sides, where open engagement allows the Other to be perceived according to its true predisposition, not through mere representation of attributed characteristics.

Here, Derrida's trace departs from Merleau-Ponty's chair: while chair communicates how Self and Other emerge through active engagement, the trace conveys the mutual emergence of categories without the need to engage directly with the Other. The two halves in Masha originated through mutual consent and mutual negotiation; in the Pallas and Apu Inka, the Spaniards are only 'represented', and even their representations remain silent. There is still, in the latter festivals, a process of mutual attunement, but this process is realized only between idealized categories in the brain - the opposed concepts of 'Andean' and 'Hispanic' - not between real people who identify with each group. This crucial difference between chair and trace is what informs the two-part structure of this thesis: the dialogues of mutual engagement in Chapters Two (Part One) and Three, which contrast with the mutual emergence of categories divorced from the open participation of the Other in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four. This is not, of course, an absolute division, since, in the first group of dialogues, only those elements of the Other that were seen to be relevant were considered; the appraisal of the hidden potentialities of the Other was not, then, entirely 'open' or conclusive. And, in the second group of dialogues, the Other did participate insofar as the whole discourse was motivated by people's internalization of European features. But the difference lies in the desire to engage in the former, which contrasts from an active desire to disengage in the latter. Paradoxically, however, it was the very internalization of the Other (the discourse of irreconcilability) that led to this Other being perceived as Other, so that disengagement – abjection – was seen as the only solution.

We can question, then, whether 'This theatrical rendition of what happened centuries ago underscores the endurance of Andean culture and its ability to resist hegemonic values by redefining history in its own way' (Chang-Rodríguez 1999:56). The fallacy in this statement lies in taking *lo andino* [the Andean] as a point of departure, as an *a priori* entity in its own right, rather than attending to the question of what it means to *become* an entity in the first place. If we cast doubt on the existence of *lo andino*, then we can see that the supposed agency is illusory, because the very act of wishing to maintain the distinctness of the 'Andean' is to submit to a hegemonic discourse of incompatible difference. The dramatizations' historical role in perpetuating this discourse is evident in the strong indications, noted by Millones, that they can be traced back to a conflict between Christian Europeans (on the one hand) and Muslim Africans and Asians (on the other hand):

The *Danza de los Moros* [Dance of the Moors] "is a genre which became widespread in Europe during the Middle Ages and which has many variations. 'The form which arrived from Spain is a kind of epic with dances and rhyming verses, and sometimes also enacted as plays, which narrates the feats of the Christians in their wars against the unfaithful, and in

whose climax the Moor, *mattacino* [Matachin], Arab or Turk, is invariably defeated' (Ramos 1990:26)" (Millones 1992:26, mt).

We saw a reduced version of this in the arrival of the Turks in *Wayta Muruy*. The dramatization was introduced into Mexico around 1539, where the roles were quickly changed to Spaniards and Aztecs, whence it arrived in Peru and generally assumed the form of a conflict between Spaniards and Incas (Millones 1992:26). This transference of the Moors/Spaniards conflict to Andean soil involved more than a simple replacement of the role of 'Moors' by 'Incas'. The balance of the dichotomy also shifted, as we have seen in this chapter. The Spaniards are no longer the righteous victors, but the enemy who ultimately fail; the Incas, by contrast, emerge morally victorious. Thus, the same discourse of Christian supremacy is adopted by Andeans as a means of demonizing those who introduced the discourse in the first place.

In this process, the philosophical tendencies in the Andes that we explored in Chapter Three become reified as a Christian Good, so that those who are not 'Incan' (or 'Andean') are just as 'unfaithful' as the Moors were for Spain at the time of the Crusades. Ayllu is not just 'community', but the one and only Community of God, the Incan Community; pacha becomes not an expression of the interconnectedness of the whole universe, but a near-synonym for the extension of the Incan Empire; kallpa (life-force) becomes the personal preserve of the Incan Apu who has the sole ability to kamay (create or animate) the world that, in his benevolence, he dominates. The wholesale adoption of this Christian discourse shows just how internalized the hegemonic narrative of ethnic superiority has become, just how much the unquestioned discursive inertia of the trace can result in the subjugated being more similar than different to the subjugator. It is possible that pre-Conquest inhabitants of the Andes were already predisposed to treat the Europeans as an enemy (cf. Ossio 1973:XXIV), in which case the internalization of the discriminatory discourse may, initially, have been jointly reinforced by both sides. Indeed, the Incan rulers, just like the Spanish conquerors, legitimized their rule by defining themselves as divine missionaries (and the celestial origin myth of the Incas is incorporated into the Christian discourse of the Apu Inka and Pallas). However, the fact that it was ultimately the Europeans who had the power to impose their worldview on Andean society for several centuries, and that this has resulted in the large-scale adoption of Western norms by Andean people, strongly suggests that the dramatizations are principally informed by discourses that emanate from Europe.

This chapter has built on my psychological and philosophical analysis of the discourses in Chapter Two, where I argued that resistance to discrimination can reinforce the basis of discrimination if it

operates according to the same assumptions. Central to my interpretation has been Derrida's notion of the trace, where opposite categories are psychologically engendered through a preontological condition of discourse. The trace, so I have argued, emanates from Merleau-Ponty's notion of chair, which entails the emergence of Self and Other through engagement (despite Merleau-Ponty's focus on the 'substantive' and Derrida's focus on the 'insubstantive' or the 'gap', these two philosophers can be reconciled through the negation of any strict dichotomy between these two orientations, given that neither the 'entity' nor the 'gap' are self-sufficient concepts but instead depend on each other). The trace departs from chair when the mutual constitution of categories no longer results from direct engagement between the emergent categories of 'perceiver' and 'perceived'. This is where 'perception' becomes 'representation', and may take the form of a shift from greater to less epistemic validity. The trace and chair can be logically reconciled through the recognition that any form of categorization is ultimately a question of predisposition, both of the 'engager' and the 'engaged-with'. This is what Heidegger conveys in the cyclical transition from vorhanden to zuhanden, the realization of particular potentialities in particular ways through specific contexts of convergence. In the next and final Chapter, I trace the dialogue that has emerged between the Andean voices and European philosophical discourses chapter-by-chapter, to arrive at a final elucidation of how 'identity' can be interpreted in the light of the discussion.



The waychaw, yukis or zorzal (Turdus chiguanco). An omen of doom when it perches on top of houses. Alluded to in the Pacllón Pallas.



The seventeenth-century church in Mangas, where the *Masha* is enacted. The straw roof can be seen below the aluminium covering.

#### **Chapter Five: Conclusion**

# Identity and Alterity: Re-Uniting the Threads

The aim of this thesis was, as stated in Chapter One, to conduct an exegesis of the concept of 'identity' by way of dialogue. This dialogue involved two principal protagonists: the data collected in Peru (song-texts and interviews), and the theoretical orientations of European and Andean philosophical notions. The aim of this dialogue was to avoid imposing one interpretation over another, thereby ensuring that the fundamental assumptions of each position were brought to the fore and critically reflected on before being conditionally accepted. I argued that this dialogue between equals was where intellectual openness and ethical authenticity have a common origin, since it ensures that no voice is silenced from the outset through the unconditional adoption of unquestioned premises, but instead has the opportunity – indeed, responsibility – of defending itself through rigorous logical debate with its interlocutor. This allowed the 'emic' (local) and 'etic' (universal) to be conceptualized not as a rigid dichotomy but instead as a way of describing how one's specific historical trajectory becomes a point of access to the world at large. My 'etic' (my point of access to the world) is primarily informed by European modes of thought, so that, for me, Andean philosophical tendencies are 'emic'. For someone living in the Andes, these roles may be reversed. The reversibility of the 'emic/etic' distinction allows for universal truths to be accessed through a constant process of dialogue, provided the interlocutors are willing to continuously reconfigure their understandings in accordance with the logical conclusions of the debate.

In this final chapter, I carry this debate to its temporary conclusion – temporary because it is to be hoped that this ideal of dialogue on an equal footing will remain a concrete methodological strategy in many professional domains, and thereby continue to reveal many practical and theoretical insights. Insofar as I have engaged in deep textual analysis of the Andean texts, it is only fair for their European interlocutors to be shown the same courtesy. Thus, in this conclusion, I dovetail my summaries of the data in each chapter with an exegesis of passages by Merleau-Ponty, Derrida and Heidegger. I cite each philosopher in the original language, since one of the most evident results in this thesis is just how much is lost in translation – particularly when one deals with philosophical issues that explore the basis for any kind of entity and can therefore only be verbalized imperfectly. All three philosophers can, ultimately, be reconciled to all three of the core chapters. However, there is a more direct connection between some than between others. First we have to appreciate the more direct connections before we can see how these can be synthesized in a global

understanding. Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* dialogues closely with Chapter Two (Part One). Derrida's notion of *trace* is congruent with Chapter Two (Part Two). Heidegger's notion of *Dasein* engages in dialogue with Chapter Three. Chapter Four is in many respects an extension of Chapter Two (Part Two) and is best understood in dialogue with Derrida. I now take each chapter in turn, coupled with an analysis of the relevant philosophical passages.

#### The Dynamic Substance

In Chapter Two (Part One), we examined several interview-extracts which endowed *waynus* with a role of forging unity through intersubjective communion. Personal experiences became shared experiences, and this had the result of people merging their personal identity with the collectivity. This was only possible because there was a fundamental 'sameness' between individuals – the fact that everyone in the world shares the same substance and has access to the world in roughly the same manner. I argued for a close correspondence between the extracts and aspects of Merleau-Ponty's philosophy, specifically his notion of *chair* 'flesh'. I now engage in an exegesis of certain passages of Merleau-Ponty's *Le visible et l'invisible* [The Visible and the Invisible] (1964) where the notion of *chair* can be more fully explored.

The bedrock of Merleau-Ponty's thesis is the pre-given unity of the subject and its environment:

Je suis donné, c'est-à-dire que je me trouve déjà situé et engagé dans un monde physique et social. Je suis donné à moi-même, c'est-a-dire que cette situation ne m'est jamais dissimulée, elle n'est jamais autour de moi comme une nécessité étrangère, et je n'y suis jamais effectivement enfermé comme un objet dans une boîte. Ma liberté, le pouvoir fondamental que j'ai d'être le sujet de toutes mes expériences, n'est pas distincte de mon insertion dans le monde (1964:413).

'I am given, that is to say that I find myself already situated and engaged in a physical and social world. I am given to myself, that is to say that this situation is never concealed from me, it never surrounds me like a foreign necessity, and I am never shut inside it like an object in a box. My freedom, my fundamental ability to be the subject of all of my experiences, is not distinct from my insertion in the world'.

This passage describes how there is no perceiving subject prior to a perceived environment; by virtue of existing, I am *déjà situé et engagé* 'already situated and engaged'. This means that self-awareness and awareness of my environment arise simultaneously; through interaction, *Je suis donné à moi-même* 'I am given to myself'. There can be no Self without 'environment' – *cette situation ne m'est jamais dissimulée* 'this situation is never concealed from me' – so the

environment is not a radically alien Other, a *nécessité étrangère* 'foreign necessity'. If Self takes form within a contiguous environment, then the environment should not be considered a restriction of individual freedom – a box within which one is enclosed – but instead as the locus within which a particular trajectory of agency can develop. Perception, motivation and self-development are profoundly circumstantial. This is conveyed by the last line.

In order to appreciate the contiguity of 'subject' and 'environment', we must begin not from the abstract mind, but from the physical body:

Le corps nous unit directement aux choses par sa propre ontogénèse, en soudant l'une à l'autre les deux ébauches dont il est fait, ses deux lèvres: la masse sensible qu'il est et la masse du sensible où il naît par ségrégation, et à laquelle, comme voyant, il reste ouvert. C'est lui, et lui seul, parce qu'il est un être à deux dimensions, qui peut nous mener aux choses mêmes, qui ne sont pas elles-mêmes des êtres plats, mais des êtres en profondeur, inaccessibles a un sujet de survol, ouvertes a celui-là seul...qui coexiste avec elles dans le même monde (1964:179).

'The body unites us directly to things through its own ontogenesis, welding together the two outlines of which it is made, its two lips: the sensible mass which it is, and the sensible mass where it is born through segregation, and to which, as seer, it remains open. It is the body, and only the body, because it is a two-dimensional being, which can lead us to the things themselves, which are not, themselves, flat beings, but beings with depth, inaccessible to a subject looking from above, open only to a subject which...coexists with them in the same world'.

The body does not *become* related to the rest of the world; rather, the body's very ontogenesis and development continuously reaffirm its unity with the environment. This is because the body is only a manifestation of an underlying sameness. As Allen states of the philosophical vision in her Andean fieldsite, 'specific life forms are transitory expressions of a single underlying substance. Specific creatures exist only as long as their interactive relations with the world maintain and support their given forms' (1997:82); likewise, in the field of biology, Varela, Thompson and Rosch argue that 'organism and environment cannot be separated but are in fact codetermined in evolution' (1991:201). The body's link with the environment consists in the fact that it originates from that very environment; thus, to talk of 'subject' and 'object' is only to express how reality perceives its own unfolding through the eyes of one of its manifestations. The body's two 'lips' – inwards, towards itself, or outwards, towards the environment – do not separate from a vacuum, but are the development of different manifestations of the same substance. Thus, the environment is *la masse du sensible où il [le corps] naît par ségrégation* 'the sensible mass where it [the body] is born through segregation'. The French term *sensible* denotes 'sensitive' as well as 'able to be sensed'; the

conflation of these meanings in the one term reinforces the inseparability of 'perceiver' and 'perceived', 'subject' and 'object', in the unfolding of a universal substance. Being of the same substance, the body remains 'open' to its environment, perceiving the depth of objects empathetically, in the way it feels its own depth. This resonates with the following: 'the Andean's favoured mode of access to "reality" is not reason [alone], but a series of non-rational capacities (which are not "irrational")..., feelings and emotions, even "parapsychological" cognitive relations...The *runa* "feels" reality more than (s)he "knows" or "thinks" it' (Estermann 1998:102, mt). The unity of the sensory, affective and cognitive is, as we saw in the songs, pragmatically orientated towards survival.

That which pervades the body and the world and thereby maintains their contiguity is *chair* 'flesh'. The *chair* of Merleau-Ponty is undefinable in any categorical sense: *Ce que nos appelons chair...n'a de nom dans aucune philosophie* 'That which we call flesh...does not have a name in any philosophy' (1964:193). The reasons are clear from the following:

la chair dont nous parlons n'est pas la matière. Elle est l'enroulement du visible sur le corps voyant, du tangible sur le corps touchant, qui est attesté notamment quand le corps se voit, se touche en train de voir et de toucher les choses, de sorte que, simultanément, comme tangible il descend parmi elles, comme touchant il les domine toutes et tire de lui-même ce rapport, et même ce double rapport, par déhiscence ou fission de sa masse (1964:191-192).

'the flesh of which we speak isn't matter. It is the unravelling of the visible on the seeing body, of the tangible on the touching body, which is attested particularly when the body sees itself, touches itself, while it is seeing and touching things, so that, simultaneously, as tangible it descends among them, as touching it masters all of them and, from itself, extends this relation, and, indeed, this double relation, through dehiscence or fission of its mass'.

Merleau-Ponty states unequivocally that *chair* is more than just 'matter'. It is the *enroulement* 'unravelling', or 'overflowing', of that which is sensed on the subject that senses. It is the origin, process and product of any form of relation. *Chair* is the fact of being of the same substance, which means that any kind of perception is a perception of an entity's fundamental likeness with the Self (the body), since without this fundamental likeness, there could be no relation at all. This is evidenced in the fact that, when we sense something, we sense ourselves sensing. That is why there is a *double rapport* 'double relation', a 'dehiscence or fission' — a realization of this fundamental likeness through contact, which also involves recognition that the two manifestations (perceiver and perceived) are contingently (but not irreconcilably) distinct. *Chair* embodies the fact that there is no substance without process, nor vice-versa. To define *chair* in terms of 'matter' or 'action' would be to favour one side of a false dichotomy between 'entity' and 'process'. Their separation as analytical

constructs is not an accurate depiction of how we phenomenologically engage with the world, because dynamism is part of what it means to exist. Variety – including our own existence as entities – is testament to this; manifestations of reality must have an origin, which presupposes relation, which presupposes a single, evolving, substance. *Chair* cannot be conclusively defined because it is the spilling out of the particular into the universal, and the manifestation of the universal in diverse particularities.

#### Chair should be understood as follows:

au sens d'une chose générale, à mi-chemin de l'individu spatio-temporel et de l'idée, sorte de principe incarné qui importe un style d'être partout où il s'en trouve une parcelle. La chair est en ce sens un « élément » de l'Être. Non pas fait ou somme de faits, et pourtant adhérente au lieu et au maintenant. Bien plus: inauguration du où et du quand, possibilité et exigence du fait, en un mot facticité, ce qui fait que le fait est fait. Et, du même coup aussi, ce qui fait qu'ils ont du sens, que les faits parcellaires se disposent autour de « quelque chose » (1964:184).

'in the sense of a general thing, half-way between the spatiotemporal individual and the idea, a kind of incarnate principle which expresses a style of being everywhere where it finds a part of Being. Chair [flesh] is in this sense an "element" of Being. Not a fact or sum of facts and thereby adhering to a time and place. Much more the inauguration of the "where" and "when", possibility and requirement of the fact, in a word "facticity", that which enables the fact to be a fact. And, in so doing, that which allows them [the facts] to have sense, allows the fragmentary facts to be arranged around "something".

Chair is à mi-chemin de l'individu spatio-temporel et de l'idée 'half-way between the spatiotemporal individual and the idea' because our perception, a function of chair, is at once cognitive, affective and sensory. By defining chair as a sorte de principe incarné 'kind of incarnate principle', and as an « élément » de l'Être "element" of Being', Merleau-Ponty recalls the Greek pre-Socratic philosophers, notably Anaximander, who defined the world in terms of an apeiron 'indefinite substance', both element (stoicheion) and principle (archē) of all that exists (cf. Curd 2012, http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2012/entries/presocratics/, accessed 21/05/12). Since chair is the way that the universal substance manifests itself in particularities, it is the inauguration du où et du quand 'inauguration of the "where" and "when", the creation of circumstance within which other circumstances can arise. This is what Merleau-Ponty means by facticité 'facticity'. And sense, relevance, meaning, inheres in this building of circumstance on circumstance.

Thus, just as we saw in the Quechua concept of *tinku*, 'difference' is not a gap that acts as an obstacle to relation, but a way of describing how the openness of entities allows them to enter into

meaningful acts of congruence. What we call an 'entity' is just a manifestation of a unifying substance, so it is not cut off from the rest of the world. As the world evolves, so that entity will dissolve into generality and will give rise to new entities, or become part of a larger entity. It is more appropriate to view the entity as a wave on an ocean surface than as an object in a vacuum. Thus, cet hiatus...n'est pas un vide ontologique, un non-être: il est enjambé par l'être total de mon corps, et par celui du monde, c'est le zéro de pression entre deux solides qui fait qu'ils adhèrent l'un à l'autre (Merleau-Ponty 1964:195); 'this hiatus...is not an ontological emptiness, a non-being: it is spanned by the full being of my body, and by that of the world, it is the zero pressure between two solids which makes them adhere to each other'. Bell puts the point succinctly when he states that chair is a 'reversibility which makes possible the distinction between perceiver and perceived, identity and difference' (1998:167). Such reversibility means that cette distance n'est pas le contraire de cette proximité, elle est profondément accordée avec elle, elle en est synonyme. C'est que l'épaisseur de chair entre le voyant et la chose est constitutive de sa visibilité à elle comme de sa corporéité à lui; ce n'est pas un obstacle entre lui et elle, c'est leur moyen de communication (Merleau-Ponty 1964:178); 'this distance is not the opposite of this proximity, it is profoundly in accordance with it, it is synonymous with it. It is that the thickness of the chair between the seer and the thing is constitutive of the thing's visibility to the seer as much as of the seer's corporeity to the thing; it isn't an obstacle between seer and thing, it's their means of communication'. Since all manifestations (or 'entities') are part of the same substance, the space between perceiver and perceived is not a vacuum, but their zone of interaction, the mutual defining-out of Self and Other in ever evolving modes of being.

Thus, *chair* is both separation and relation. It is by virtue of constituting a unified reality, a universal substance, that we are able to talk of 'appropriation' (Chapters Two (Part One) and Three) or 'abjection' (Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four) at all – both presuppose matter on the same plane; excretion is of that which is no longer desirable, but which has nonetheless been constituted within the Self. The concept of *chair*, then, is a way of describing how all aspects of the world, conscious or otherwise, are fundamentally the same, only contingently unique, as variations of the unfolding symphony of the universe. This likeness, even sameness at the most basic level, is what allows for transformation, divergence, differentiation, but also what allows these various manifestations to affect each other insofar as they affect themselves. Thus, the thing itself is that which maintains it in existence *as* a thing, and this consists precisely in its interaction with its environment: *Il faut penser de la chose (spatiale ou temporelle) comme différence, i.e. comme transcendence* (1964:249); 'The thing (spatial or temporal) must be thought of as difference, i.e. as transcendence'. This is why all of

the texts in this thesis have, fundamentally, concerned survival, the maintenance of the perceiver as internally consistent, as a consolidated manifestation of reality. 'Essence' is, then, the history of ontogenesis and maintenance through environmental symbiosis (it is arguably this weight of history and intrinsic connectedness that led Plato to posit something 'behind' each apparent object). Canessa makes a similar conclusion when, citing Taussig, he comments on the philosophical tendencies of the Aymara (southern Andes): "rather than thinking of the border as the farthermost extension of an essential identity spreading out from a core, [we should] think instead of the border itself as that core" (Taussig 1993:151). One could add that this is so because it is precisely on the border that the mutually implicating dyad of alterity and identity are created' (Canessa 2005:5-6).

The themes that have emerged from the exegesis of the above passages were also salient in Chapter Two (Part One). I grouped the interview-extracts under three sub-headings: formation of waynus from a subjective state; communication of subjective experience; intersubjective basis of social unity. Under the first heading, we saw how the interviewees noted the highly personal experiences that led to the formation of waynus. This was evident in expressions such as lo que lleva adentro 'what (s)he carries inside' (quote 1), cualidad interna 'internal quality' (quote 1) and el vivir de cada persona 'each person's lived experience' (quote 2). The fact that these personal experiences resulted from prior acts of engagement, and were in turn communicated through waynu, dialogues with Merleau-Ponty's insights that the Self is always 'situated and engaged in a physical and social world' (1964:413, mt), so that the most personal of experiences are still inherently social. This means that an individual's agency 'is not distinct from [one's] insertion in the world' (1964:413) because the parameters of agency are negotiated through interaction. The Quechua concept of kallpa likewise conveyed how the dynamism of a single universal 'substance', 'energy' or 'spirit' allowed for the emergence of particular forms whose ontogenesis and continued maintenance depended on the ability to interact with elements of the environment (Godenzzi 2005:60). This ontogenesis was expressed by the concept of kamay, a continuous act of creation that emerged from the dynamism of kallpa (Godenzzi 2005:60-63).

Under the second heading, we saw how people's personal experiences (themselves socially derived) were in turn projected towards the Other by way of the *waynu*. Rather than the 'social' dimension existing only on the 'outer shell' of the person, the extracts suggested that, the more 'internal' and 'personal' the sentiment, the more appropriate it was for projection through the songs. Thus, *la gente dice lo que siente desde el corazón* 'people say what they feel from their heart' (quote 3) and in such a manner *exteriorizan penanta* 'exteriorize their suffering' (quote 4) or other emotions. The

projection of such personal dispositions was matched by a projection of dispositions on the part of the audience, who were thereby able to 'link in' with the message at a profound level. In such a way, the singer/composer transmitía su sentimiento 'transmitted his/her feelings' (quote 7), so that shongunkunamanshi Ilakitsirnin chan letraakuna 'they [the listeners] say that the words enter their heart and make them sad' (quote 6). Thus, the relationality of being extends to the very core of both entities – performer and audience. This dialogues with Merleau-Ponty's suggestion that chair – the universal substance common to all – operates in 'two dimensions' (1964:179), so that any point of contact entails the tacit awareness of both the 'centre' and the 'periphery'. This allows for a deep penetration from one entity to another, without the necessity of both entities becoming entirely submerged. Thus, the 'thickness' or depth of chair is part of the 'visibility' of the engaged-with (1964:178), through a kind of visceral empathetic knowledge of what it means to 'be' at all. This dialogues with the Quechua concept of tinku, where a congruence of dispositions results in the continuous dialectic modification of Self and Other (Bastien 1992:159). The 'meeting' that is implied by tinku results in a second process of yachay, where continued acts of engagement lead to the transformation of Self and Other in an ever-deepening process of mutual attunement (Howard 2002:19). Thus, the awareness of sharing the same kallpa (roughly equitable to chair) results in kamay (emergence of forms and dispostions) which can interact through tinku and transform each other in yachay – just as we have seen in the performative role of waynu.

Under the third sub-heading (the intersubjective basis of social unity), we saw how this congruence of predispositions resulted in the extension of Self to incorporate the Other, which likewise performed the same action. Thus, one interviewee stated that *nos olvidamos* 'we forget ourselves' in a state of undifferentiated humanity (quote 15), while another commented that *te confundes con cualquiera persona* 'you blend with anyone' (quote 16). Through the previous two stages (the formation of an internal predisposition and its externalization toward a congruent Other), Self and Other subordinate their individualities in favour of a shared sense of unitary being. The fact that this unity derives not from the negation of individual predispositions but through the reaffirmation of their intersubjective congruence dialogues with Merleau-Ponty's definition of *chair* as an embodied principle whose particularization (in specific entities) also expresses its universality (since each entity acquires its specific 'properties' through interaction) (1964:184). This dialogues with the Quechua concept of *ayllu*, which defined 'groupness' in terms of sharing a 'common focus' (Allen 1998:257). This 'common focus' is, as conveyed by *kallpa*, *kamay*, *tinku* and *yachay*, not a negation of individuality but a reaffirmation of the unitary potential of distinct predispositions in the act of congruence. Through such congruence, these predispositions are transformed but only in a way that

is compatible with the dialectic projection of the Self. Thus, *waynu* unites people not despite, but because of, their internal inclinations, and it is the very intimacy of these relations that renders them so potent.

In this section, I have summarized the congruencies between the interview-extracts of Chapter Two (Part One), Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair*, and some of the key Andean concepts that have been influential in this thesis. In this dialogue, we have seen how Self and Other are not as distinct as their appelations might suggest, but rather emerge mutually from a unitary reality. This unity is reaffirmed through the meeting of compatible predispositions in the act of congruence. In order to ascertain precisely what a 'predisposition' entails, however, and how this influences the way that we engage with our environment, we have to take the notion of 'temporality' into consideration. This is where Heidegger's notion of *Dasein* is helpful. Thus, in the next section, I conduct an exegesis of important passages from Heidegger's *Sein und Zeit* [Being and Time], followed by a recapitulation of the relevance of this study to the song-data in Chapter Three (Chapter Two (Part Two) will be covered with Chapter Four when we explore Derrida's notion of *trace*).

#### The Temporality of Being

In Chapter Three, we saw how the meeting of different predispositions allowed for the emergence of entities through a continuous dialectic process of mutual attunement. Hidden potentialities were revealed insofar as they became relevant as part of the negotiation of meaning. We saw how this transformational process of Self and Other through time was expressed by Heidegger's notion of *Dasein*, which refers to the human being that is aware of its own environment but which, for the purposes of this thesis, can be meaningfully extended to all entities that adapt through relation. As with Merleau-Ponty in the previous section, I discuss some excerpts from Heidegger in the original language (with translations), then summarize the relevance of these writings to the Andean data.

Dasein ist nie »zunächst« ein gleichsam in-seins-freies Seiendes, das zuweilen die Laune hat, eine »Beziehung« zur Welt aufzunehmen. Solches Aufnehmen von Beziehungen zur Welt ist nur möglich, weil Dasein als In-der-Welt-sein ist, wie es ist. Diese Seinsverfassung entsteht nicht erst dadurch, daß außer dem Seienden vom Charakter des Daseins noch anderes Seiendes vorhanden ist und mit diesem zusammentrifft. »Zusammentreffen« kann dieses andere Seiende »mit« dem Dasein nur, sofern es überhaupt innerhalb einer Welt sich von ihm selbst her zu zeigen vermag.

'Dasein is never "from the outset" a quasi free being in and of itself, that sometimes has a desire to take up a "relation" with the world. Such a taking up of relations with the world is only possible because the nature of Dasein is as a being-in-the-world. This constitution of

being does not initially arise because, aside from the kind of being that is *Dasein*, yet another being is present-at-hand and which meets with *Dasein*. This other being can only "meet" with *Dasein* insofar as it is at all able to reveal itself within a *world*" (1927/1967:57, mt).

What this passage conveys is the sense that *Dasein* – the locus of being – is inherently relational. It is not just an *in-seins-freies Seiendes* 'free being in and of itself', because it is impossible to 'be' anything at all except through interaction. The *In-der-Welt-sein* nature of *Dasein* (i.e. its nature as a 'being-in-the-world') means that it is always located in a particular situation, of which the context is not just that which 'surrounds' the entity, but is what allows the entity to 'be' what it is at any given moment. Therefore, the relational nature (or, as Heidegger states, *Verfassung* 'constitution') of *Dasein* is not formed through engagement between ontologically discrete entities that happen to 'acquire' interactivity in the act of engagement. Instead, the prior situatedness and relationality that leads to the genesis of any entity is what allows for future interactions with *other* entities. As in the Andean songs of Chapter Three, 'relationality' precedes 'entity'. Heidegger, like Merleau-Ponty, acknowledges the fundamental unity of the world which allows for interaction between entities. That is what Heidegger means by both engaged and engaged-with projecting themselves *innerhalb einer* Welt ('within a *world*').

The situatedness of Dasein within a particular context is what Heidegger terms Verfallen 'fallenness': Das Dasein ist von ihm selbst als eigentlichem Selbstseinkönnen zunächst immer schon abgefallen und an die »Welt« verfallen. Die Verfallenheit an die »Welt« meint das Aufgehen im Miteinandersein 'Dasein is, as its own potentiality-for-being [Selbsteinkönnen], from the outset always already 'falling off' towards the world (1927/1967:175, mt). The fallenness onto the "world" implies the getting up in togetherness [Miteinandersein]'. Here, Heidegger stresses how Dasein, as a dynamic being whose dynamism results from interaction with the environment, is ineluctably located within a particular context, within a 'world' that both constrains and affords possibilities for action. This is not to be understood as deterministic, because the way that Dasein develops is as much contingent on its own predisposition as on what is present in the environment. Thus, the Verfallen 'fallenness' or 'situatedness' of Dasein is Dasein's own Selbsteinkönnen 'potentiality-for-being'. Heidegger notes how the term 'fallenness' does not have any negative meaning; it is to be read in the manner of 'inclination' or 'projection', the 'moving towards' elements of its environment in such a manner that the dispositions and potentialities of Dasein transform through engagement. That is why 'fallenness' is the Aufgehen im Miteinandersein 'getting up in togetherness'. The word Aufgehen is difficult to translate but conveys the sense of movement that is both 'upwards' and 'onwards', so that 'fallenness' allows for the 'projection' of Self towards novel ways of being.

Heidegger defines the mode whereby *Dasein* interacts with its environment as *Zuhandenheit* 'readiness-to-hand', which Heidegger describes in terms of 'tools' but which is more profitably read as 'relevance'. The notion of *Zuhandenheit* is remarkably similar in many ways to Gibson's (1979) concept of 'affordances', in the sense that we interpret phenomena in terms of the possible ways that we can engage with them (a cake for eating, a chair for sitting on, a broken chair for not sitting on, etc.). In this context, *Dasein* has no sense of being a 'subject' that engages with an 'object'. Instead, *Zuhandenheit* operates within a pre-ontological condition of simple 'engagement' that is the true nature of Being:

in diese Seinsart des besorgenden Umgangs brauchen wir uns nicht erst zu versetzen. Das alltägliche Dasein ist schon immer in dieser Weise, z.B.: die Tür öffnend, mache ich Gebrauch von der Klinke. Die Gewinnung des phänomenologischen Zugangs zu dem so begegnenden Seienden besteht vielmehr in der Abdrängung der sich andrängenden und mitlaufenden Auslegungstendenzen, die das Phänomen eines solchen »Besorgens« überhaupt verdecken und in eins damit erst recht das Seiende, wie es von ihm selbst her im Besorgen für es begegnet.

'we do not have to first situate ourselves in this instrumental mode of being with what is around us. The daily experience of *Dasein is* already in this mode, e.g. when opening the door, I make use of the handle. The attainment of phenomenological access to the beings that approach me in this manner consists rather in the pushing aside [*Abdrängung*] of those pressing [*Andrängend*] and concomitant tendencies which set themselves out, tendencies which entirely conceal the phenomenon of a given affordance [*Besorgen*], so that, in such a manner, the being approximates itself towards *Dasein* within the mode of utility' (1927/1967:67, mt).

Here, Heidegger conveys how the mode of 'instrumentality' (*Zuhandenheit*) is not something that *Dasein* 'enters into'. Rather, it is the natural mode within which we engage with the world around us. Heidegger's use of the gerund *öffnend* 'opening' conveys this pre-ontological state of engagement, where *Dasein* is definable in terms of what it *does* (how it interacts). The foundation of our experience is not in terms of abstract 'things' but rather in terms of *Auslegungstendenzen*. This word is very difficult to translate into English, since German, like Quechua, modifies root concepts by adding a chain of compounds that follow (these are 'analytic' languages), whereas English operates more at the 'sentence' rather than 'word' level (it is a 'periphrastic' language). *Auslegen* in German means 'to set out, to stretch', while the suffix *–ung* is a nominalizer, so that *Auslegung* is 'the act of setting out, stretching out'. Added to this is *Tendenzen* 'tendencies', so that *Auslegungstendenzen* reads roughly as 'the tendencies whereby something sets itself out'. Thus, the phenomena 'set themselves out' in such a way as to 'project' themselves unavoidably towards a perceiver (*Dasein*) (just by virtue of existing).

The manner in which these *Auslegungstendenzen* 'set themselves out' is by 'coming up against' *Dasein* (i.e. projecting themselves, revealing themselves automatically). This is what Heidegger means by *andrängend* (where *drängen* is to 'push' and *an-* conveys performing action 'upon' something). Given the unity of the world, *Dasein* likewise reacts to the stimulus at the very moment the stimulus is given. For this, Heidegger deploys the term *Abdrängung* (*drängen* 'push' preceded by *ab-* 'off, away'). The *an-* and the *ab-* could be reversed: what matters is that, through the projection of two potentialities (phenomenon and *Dasein*), these potentialities actualize themselves in the act of engagement: *Dasein* is able to access the phenomenon (*Zugang* 'access') and the phenomenon is able to be accessed. I have translated *mitlaufenden* as 'concomitant' but this does not do justice to the true meaning: *mit* is the preposition 'with' while *laufend* is the gerund of *laufen* 'to walk, run, flow'. Thus, the tendencies (*Dasein* included) 'flow' together, as unitary elements of the world.

The projection of the phenomenon in terms of 'relevance' or 'affordances' (I have used Gibson's term as a translation of *Besorgen*) is not a complete revelation of the hidden potentialities that underlie the phenomenon. Insofar as the *Auslegungstendenzen* are defined by *Dasein's* disposition to perceive them (i.e. in terms of their relevance), the act of revealing some potentialities is also a hiding of other potentialities that the phenomenon may afford. This is why Heidegger also talks of the *Auslegungstendenzen* in terms of *verdecken* 'hiding' the phenomenon.

These other potentialities are revealed to us when *Dasein* is forced to view the phenomenon 'differently' to previous occasions: Woran liegt es, daß sich...der schwere Hammer...anders zeigt? Nicht daran, daß wir vom Hantieren Abstand nehmen, aber auch nicht daran, daß wir vom Zeugcharakter dieses Seienden nur absehen, sondern daran, daß wir das begegnende Zuhandene "neu" ansehen, als Vorhandenes 'How is it possible for the...heavy hammer...to show itself differently? Not insofar as we distance ourselves from the act of plying, but also not insofar as we simply overlook the purposeful character of this being, rather insofar as we see the approximating ready-to-hand object in a "new" way, as an object that is present-at-hand' (1927/1967:361, mt).

We do not see the hammer in-and-of itself either through an optional process of distancing, or through forgetting the fact that we engage with objects as tools. Neither of these would be possible because, if the basis of perception is through affordances, as possibilities for action (again to cite Gibson), then there is no way we can break out of this mode. Only if something happens to the phenomenon externally can we view it for 'what it is', as *vorhanden* 'present-at-hand'. For example,

if the hammer breaks, we cease to view it as a tool and become aware of its nature as, say, metal. The relation between *Zuhandenheit* 'readiness-to-hand' and *Vorhandenheit* 'presence-at-hand' is a circular, mutually dependent one. Heidegger notes how *Zuhandenheit* depends on *Vorhandenheit*, since the potentialities must already be *in* the world for *Dasein* to pick up on them (1927/1967:71). Likewise, from the phenomenological situatedness of *Dasein*, the perception of *Vorhandenheit* depends on *Zuhandenheit*: it is only possible for potentialities to actualize themselves through self-revelation if there is a rupture in *Dasein's* pre-existing engagement as *Zuhandenheit*.

Vorhandenheit can therefore be understood as an operation within Zuhandenheit. I would argue, in fact, that the difference between them is a matter of degree rather than kind. Heidegger's notion of Zuhandenheit should be interpreted in terms of 'relevance' rather than merely 'tools' which is too narrow a definition (otherwise we could not account for the fact that we perceive many things apart from what we are directly using at a specific point of time). Since everything around us has some relevance to us – the very fact of awareness is testament to an influence, even if our congruent action is to leave the phenomenon alone - we do not perceive objects in isolation but in terms of their interconnectedness within the environment. Thus, Zuhandenheit (relevance) is not limited to interactions between Dasein and engaged-with, but between Dasein and engaged-with plus other potentialities that affect the engaged-with from the standpoint of *Dasein*. The act of 'comparison' is thus part of Zuhandenheit, and, what's more, this comparison shifts our perception of what we engage with. Thus, the more we engage with a phenomenon, the more liable we are to see other, at first hidden, potentialities through that object's interaction with its own environment, and the more we broaden our understanding of the phenomenon in line with Vorhandenheit. Of course, this depends on the predisposition of Dasein to perceive things, since Dasein, like all potentialities, is not able to interact with every potentiality that surrounds it, and, with those that it does interact with, not all to the same degree. Thus, those vorhanden potentialities in the engaged-with may come to form a stable understanding of what that phenomenon 'is', may go unnoticed, or may be initially noticed and then forgotten, all depending on the predisposition of Dasein in congruence with the predisposition of both 'perceived' and 'that-which-affects-perceived'. I would thus argue that Vorhandenheit and Zuhandenheit are never separate, because there is no such thing as disinterested knowledge. Vorhandenheit, in this optic, can be viewed as the widening of Zuhandenheit (relevance) through the opening up of different spheres of engagement. Vorhandenheit is thus the dynamic process internal to Zuhandenheit that allows Dasein to evolve in relation to an ever-changing environment.

And this means that knowledge is transformative of Self: Verstehen ist das existenziale Sein des eigenen Seinkönnens des Daseins selbst, so zwar, daß dieses Sein an ihm selbst das Woran des mit ihm selbst Seins erschließt 'Understanding is the existential "being" of Dasein's own potentiality-forbeing (Seinkönnen), to such an extent that this "being" opens up the future orientation of its own "being" towards itself' (1927/1967:144). What this enigmatic sentence states is that Dasein transforms itself through understanding and thereby directs its own future orientation, or projection, towards the world. By existenziale Sein 'existential "being", Heidegger can be interpreted as meaning that understanding, which operates in the present moment, allows for the transformative dynamism of Dasein (i.e. the transition from Vorhanden to Zuhanden to Vorhanden). The existential nature of Dasein is to 'understand'. The disposition that Dasein acquires through engagement is its Seinkönnen 'potentiality-for-being' (i.e. the way that it might interact with future phenomena). Thus, the Woran (literally 'to what', but in this sense understandable in terms of 'future orientation' or 'future projection') is directed by Dasein's engagement with its environment. Dasein directs its own projection because Dasein is definable in terms of precisely this engagement.

The result is that the Self is always more than its apparent 'properties' at any given moment:

Auf dem Grunde der Seinsart, die durch das Existenzial des Entwurfs konstituiert wird, ist das Dasein ständig »mehr«, als es tatsächlich ist...Es ist aber nie mehr, als es faktisch ist, weil zu seiner Faktizität das Seinkönnen wesenhaft gehört. Das Dasein ist aber als Möglichsein auch nie weniger, das heißt das, was es in seinem Seinkönnen noch nicht ist, ist es existenzial.

'On the grounds of the mode-of-being that is constituted through the existential fact of projection, *Dasein* is always "more" than it is at any given moment...It is, however, never more than it is in terms of its facticity, since potentiality-for-being [*Seinkönnen*] pertains to that very facticity. Neither is *Dasein* ever "less", insofar as that which it is *not yet* in terms of its potentiality-for-being, *Dasein is* in an existential sense' (1927/1967:145, mt).

In this passage, Heidegger distinguishes between tatsächlich and faktisch. The former translates roughly as 'in actuality', which means 'at any given moment', while the latter includes the latent potentialities and not just the 'properties' (actualized potentialities). Dasein, being in continuous modification, cannot be reduced to what it is tatsächlich because its very nature is to be temporally dynamic and transformative. Entwurf is normally translated as 'project' or 'projection'. Heidegger deploys the term in order to convey how Verstehen 'understanding' forms a kind of 'schema' that informs the parameters of Dasein's future development (cf. 1927/1967:145).

I now recapitulate how Heidegger's philosophy dialogues with the philosophical expressions we saw in the Andean songs and Quechua concepts of Chapter Three. In the *Carnaval* song, the circulation of vital resources through *ayni* 'reciprocity' evidenced the fact that individuals can only exist in relation to each other, where the continued maintenance of their forms relied on strategic interactions within the social environment. The foundation for this vision was the concept of *kallpa*, whereby every being shares the same universal substance, conveyed both by Merleau-Ponty's *chair* and Heidegger's affirmation that everything inhabits the same 'world' (1927/1967:57). Likewise, *kamay* conveyed how creation derives from the interaction of potentialities. The cyclical rotation of the festival dialogues with the temporality of *Dasein*, where each new encounter deepens or reorients the relation that has developed between the ever-emerging entities. This is conveyed by the Quechua concept of *yachay*, where engagement changes the potentialities of both Self and Other. *Yachay* is remarkably close to Heidegger's notion of the *Vorhanden* (attainment of understanding) as the vehicle of *Dasein's* projection (Heidegger 1927/1967:145). The same process of mutual attunement was evidenced in the dialogic engagement of the tree.

In the Masha songs, we also saw the operation of Dasein in many dimensions. The complementarity between husband and wife was realized by each being initially zuhanden to each other, in that they afforded congruent possibilities of action. This was based on the vorhanden knowledge of the nature of the Other, i.e. as having particular potentialities that could be harnessed in relation to Self. These potentialities were actualized through congruent dialogue that, strategically directed through mutual attunement, resulted in the 'birth' of the festival. Thus, the creative process of kamay was enacted through an ever-deepening exchange (ayni) of actions through time (yachay), all harnessed in the act of meeting (tinku). This theme also surfaced in the second and third songs, in the context of the ayni that operated between rukyana and awelitu and also between urban migrants and local residents. In the fourth Masha song, we saw how the temporal nature of being can be extended beyond the perceiving subject to encompass the projection of *Dasein* into future loci of engagement. This was evident in the ontogenesis of the young bull, which resulted from the fusion of its parents, the creative product (kamay) of the actualization of vorhanden potentialities in reproductive congruence (tinku). In the bullfight, the young bull partook, in turn, of a new relation of congruence through the tinku with its opponent from the other side. Again, the zuhanden potentiality of the Other led to new potentialities of Self (Seinkönnen), namely the perpetuation of the complementarity between the two ayllus.

The Wayta Muruy song also exhibited significant congruence with Heidegger's philosophy. We saw how ayni was practised between various interlocutors, namely the bull, the seeds, the stream, and the main participants, so that, through mutual attunement, they actualized their potentialities

(kamay) in a way congruent to both predispositions. This reactivity dialogues closely with the nature of Dasein as constantly evolving through congruence between its own predisposition and the predisposition of the phenomena it encounters, and manifests in the transition of the engaged-with from zuhanden (initial relevance) to vorhanden (actualization of potentiality). This was realized through a continuous process of tinku 'meeting' within the interconnected pacha 'world'. Indeed, pacha is also highly resonant of Heidegger's affirmation that Dasein als In-der-Welt-sein ist, wie es ist 'the nature of Dasein is as a being-in-the-world' (1927/1967:57). The temporal core of being was evident particularly in the treatment of the bull yachanganpita 'in the way to which it is accustomed', whose English translation does not do justice to the Quechua sense of 'projection' that is conveyed by the dynamism of yachay (transformative nature of knowledge) and the locative -pita 'from'. This phrase thus perfectly conveys Heidegger's notion of the Entwurf (cognitive schema that is derived from engagement) which informs the future orientation of the engaging entities. This engagement is never-ending because there are always more latent potentialities than there are actualized 'properties'. This is logically so, because even the maintenance of a disposition is only a possibility (it is also possible to change one's disposition) and, in any case, no two moments are alike so the Self is never exactly as it was before. As Heidegger notes, the zuhanden (relevance) or Besorgen (affordance) is as much a covering-up as a revelation of a potentiality – because what we engage with is only the tip of the iceberg of the full range of possibilities. And this allows for the ongoing cyclical nature of engagement and transformation (the constant realization of the faktisch 'potentiality' in the tatsächlich 'property' which is also a new potentiality for future engagement).

In the Negritos song, the continuous negotiation through hedging was also congruent with Dasein as an entity that is constantly ascertaining the parameters of possible action (affordances). This can be understood within the framework of the transition from Zuhandenheit (latent potentiality) to Vorhandenheit (actualization of latent potentiality): the negrito perceives his interlocutor as having a particular disposition — a negative one — but nonetheless intuits that she may have other latent potentialities that are more conducive to his own disposition, and he aims to actualize this predisposition through congruent action. He thus projects himself (as Dasein) in relation to the guiadora's own mode of projection. The hedging can be interpreted as a mode of ascertaining whether his initial zuhanden perception of the guiadora really reflects her latent vorhanden potentialities (so that he does not reveal too much if the guiadora is indeed hostile), as well as a mode of attuning himself to the guiadora so that she will see him as zuhanden in a way that is congruent to her own disposition. Thus, through tinku (the act of meeting, the 'rubbing up' of Self against Other that Heidegger defines as abdrängen 'pushing against' and andrängen 'pushing

towards'), the parameters of *ayni* (exchange) are negotiated, so that each redefines (re-creates) the Self (*kamay*) within the dialogic process. Just as Heidegger notes in his concept of the *Entwurf* (the epistemological and existential orientation that derives from engaged *Verstehen* 'understanding'), knowledge of the Other leads to transformation of the Self, so that *Seinkönnen* (our latent potentialities) are actualized in the transformative process of knowledge that is *yachay*. This is only possible because of the *Verfallen* 'fallenness' of *Dasein* in contingent circumstances which both constrain and afford possibilities of self-development.

# The Mutual Emergence of Categories

Heidegger's Dasein dialogues closely with Merleau-Ponty's chair insofar as both stress the fundamental unity of the world. Dasein shows, however, that the way we interact with our environment is not necessarily a straightforward affair. Rather, we have dispositions which influence what we perceive and how we understand the world around us. These dispositions are formed and transformed through engagement. In Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, we saw how our intersubjective nature can open us up to discourses that deny this very nature (and the tacit recognition that it cannot be denied served to reaffirm the denial all the more). Specifically, the hegemonic discourse of ethnic irreconcilability was unconsciously accepted because of its hegemonic nature and thus pervasiveness. Thus, the 'Andean' and 'Hispanic' were unproblematically assumed to be different categories, categories which, moreover, were irreconcilable to each other (therein lies the paradox - mutually irreconcilable!), each with a foundational ontological reality. The discourse of irreconcilability between 'Andean' and 'Hispanic' proved just how reconcilable they were, in the sense that the very discourse of irreconcilability was mutually constructed from both 'sides' (anti-Hispanic discrimination resulted from anti-Andean discrimination).

Moreover, the tacit acknowledgement that the Other in fact constitutes the Self (i.e. the undeniable knowledge that one is far removed from pre-Hispanic cultural tendencies), rather than dispelling this sense of irreconcilability, served to reaffirm it. This, I argued, was because the nature of the discourse is such that the Other is defined as threatening, discriminatory, nihilistic towards those other parts of Self that are different from the 'Hispanic' prototype. The only solution that seems feasible (for the discourse is so subtlely internalized that it is not even questioned) is to draw a sharp boundary between the abject 'foreign' Self (which is defined as not really the Self at all) and the bracketed, true, Andean, Self, which can thereby be 'saved' from the onslaught of the Other. Thus,

the strategy of resistance – to affirm the 'Andean' at the expense of the 'Hispanic' – rather than being an act of autonomy, was just a reinforcement of the internalized discourse. All that happened was that the inequality shifted from one side of the divide to the other. Instead of the 'Spaniards' being superior, it was the 'Andeans' that laid claim to transcendental validity.

This, as with all of the discourses in this thesis, can be understood through the optic of Dasein, in the sense that prior forms of engagement condition the way that we interact with elements of the world around us. However, Dasein still takes the perceiving 'entity' as a point of departure (which accounts for Heidegger's tendency to limit *Dasein* to the human being). Derrida's *trace*, on the other hand, is intended to side-step the entity altogether, insofar as the trace is the abyss, the void, out of which opposing entities are constructed. Nonetheless, just as Derrida criticizes Heidegger for privileging the 'entity', so Derrida can be viewed as privileging the 'process' (or 'non-entity') which is arguably also rooted in metaphysics, despite Derrida's claims to the contrary. Since neither pure 'entity' nor pure 'process' can be taken as foundational, Dasein (leaning towards the 'entity') and trace (leaning towards 'process') can be seen as complementary, where the true nature of reality can be glimpsed in the dialogue between both terms, neither of which reify their different biases (entity- or process-oriented) to the point of absolute categories. It was useful to draw primarily on Heidegger for Chapter Three, since the texts pertained to actual physical processes that operated between physical beings; thus, Heidegger's bias towards the 'entity' was productive in showing the mutual attunement and evolution of such entities. Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, by contrast, pertained to categories of discourse more than physical encounters. This meant that Derrida's trace was a more productive analytical tool, insofar as Derrida privileges the non-substantive over the substantive. Derrida's argument that categories only arise through the simultaneous but tacit engendering of an opposed category, dialogues well with the mutual constitution of the categories 'Andean' and 'Hispanic', despite the radical denial of this mutuality among interview-respondents. Thus, I now proceed to textually examine certain passages from Derrida's De la Grammatologie [On Grammatology] (1967), followed by a recapitulation of their application to the data in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four.

Derrida is the name most associated with the philosophical perspective of 'deconstruction'. As with the phenomenological writings of Merleau-Ponty, deconstruction focuses on the gap as a way to understand the substantive. Ultimately, both Merleau-Ponty and Derrida address the question of 'being' and 'meaning', but Merleau-Ponty more from the biological perspective of our contiguity with the world (hence more from the 'being' angle), and Derrida more from the perspective of our

cognitive categories (hence more from the 'meaning' angle). Moreover, while Merleau-Ponty's *chair* shows the mutual constitution of entities in general, Derrida's *trace* offers an account of why *particular* ideas, concepts or categories (which, in this context, can be used synonymously) are generated. Derrida aims to overcome the inherent difficulties of using words to show what lies *beneath* words by deploying a wide range of terms, each relating to a specific context. Thus, our apprehension is guided intuitively, through the illumination of deconstruction in several contexts. As Bennington, states, 'these terms are singular in the sense that they remain more or less attached to the text from which they were taken, and never achieve the status of metalinguistic or metaconceptual operators' (1993:267). To avoid confusion, I centre my discussion on only one term, *trace* 'trace' (same in French and English).

The following quote is a useful point of access into Derrida's writings: *le sens de l'être n'est pas un signifié transcendantal ou trans-époqual (fût-il même toujours dissimulé dans l'époque)* (1967:38); 'the sense of a 'being' isn't a transcendental or trans-epochal meaning (it was, itself, always dissimulated in the specific period of time)'. In other words, our concepts are not absolute categories, but are always contingent on context. They are inherently relational. What underlies this relation is the 'trace':

La trace, où se marque le rapport à l'autre, articule sa possibilité sur tout le champ de l'étant, que la métaphysique a déterminé comme étant-présent à partir du mouvement occulté de la trace. Il faut penser la trace avant l'étant. Mais le mouvement de la trace est nécessairement occulté, il se produit comme occultation de soi. Quand l'autre s'annonce comme tel, il se présente dans la dissimulation de soi (1967:69).

'The *trace*, where the relation to the other is demarcated, articulates its possibility on all of the field of being, which metaphysics has determined as being-present on the basis of the hidden movement of the *trace*. The *trace* must be considered before the 'being'. But the movement of the *trace* is necessarily hidden; it produces itself as an occultation of itself. When the other announces itself as such, it presents itself in the dissimulation of itself.'

The *trace* can be understood partly as what lies between one concept and another. However, the trace is not an abyss of nothingness. Rather, it is what brings potentialities into some kind of relation, a congruence, so that the concept is created. The French où denotes both 'where' and 'when', and thereby conveys the dissolution of space and time into the general unfolding of the world, where, through congruence, *le rapport à l'autre* 'the relation to the other' is marked. The contingent unfolding of concepts through discourse is conveyed by the clause *articule sa possibilité sur tout le champ de l'étant* 'articulates its possibility on all of the field of being'; a concept is only a 'possibility' realized through discursive congruence, and this is true to any idea we have about the

world we inhabit (which is not to say that some ideas are not more truthful than others, but an *accurate* idea is still only a possibility since it is also possible to have an *inaccurate* idea). The gerund form *étant* 'being' conveys both substance and process, whereby concepts emerge discursively.

The way we conceptualize reality is the result of our engagement with the world in discourse, or, in other words, the mouvement occulté de la trace 'the hidden movement of the trace'. This is why II faut penser la trace avant l'étant 'the trace must be pondered before being'. The trace can only be intuited, never directly perceived, because, being the general flow of intersubjective thought (itself an expression of the general flow of reality), it is nécessairement occulté 'necessarily hidden'. It is a trajectory, a direction, resulting from past ideas that inform our current and future paths of inquiry. The trace is not just hidden, but is hidden by what it originates (i.e. the concepts and discourse on which they are contingent). Hence, it se produit comme occultation de soi 'produces itself as an occultation of itself'. The final line is somewhat enigmatic. But what it expresses is the fact that the very category of Other itself emerges discursively, and has meaning only insofar as it can be contrasted with Self. This is why the Other (as with every concept) is not a category that can be taken at face value, but involves a hidden discursive process out of which it emerges and is maintained. As Ochs and Capps note, 'narrators build novel understandings of themselves-in-theworld' (1996:22). Thus, the trace - the inherent dynamism that propels contrast and resultant discourse - pervades every concept (just as Merleau-Ponty's chair pervades everything and is what allows the distinction between Self and Other to take shape in the first place). This is exemplified in the following quote:

sans une trace retenant l'autre comme autre dans le même, aucune différence ne ferait son œuvre et aucun sens n'apparaîtrait. Il ne s'agit donc pas ici d'une différence constituée mais, avant toute détermination de contenu, du mouvement pur qui produit la différence (1967:92)

'without a *trace* retaining the other as other in the same, no difference would come into play and no sense would appear. Here, then, it isn't therefore a question of a constituted difference but, prior to all determination of content, of pure movement which produces difference'.

Difference does not result from entities, nor vice-versa; rather, the *trace* renders it possible to speak of entities and process in the first place. Thus, a concept relies on an alternative concept to take shape at all, and this is equally so for the alternative concept. Derrida's discussion of the *supplément* 'supplement' explores this from another angle, whereby one concept – what is supplemented – is ostensibly self-sufficient and complete, yet cannot be entirely so if it can be supplemented at all (1967:208). The openness of concepts is conveyed by the term *différance* (as opposed to *différence*)

(1967: 38, 92). This term denotes the process of infinite deferral of meaning that results from the inherent openness of concepts, given their mutual constitution in discourse. That différance and différence sound identical, and yet differ in a small detail of spelling, conveys the fact that différence 'difference' is part of différance (but not isomorphic), since the latter term communicates how the contemplation of difference leads to the dissolution of that difference into the universal. This means that La chose est elle-même un ensemble de choses ou une chaîne de différences « dans l'espace » (1967:137); 'the thing is itself a group of things or a chain of differences in space'. In other words, the 'thing' embodies the history of its genesis, which is interactive, and which directs its future potentiality through interaction in turn (just as Heidegger argued for the temporal basis of Dasein). Thus, La trace n'est rien, elle n'est pas un étant, elle excède la question qu'est-ce que et la rend éventuellement possible; 'the trace isn't any-thing at all, it isn't a being, it exceeds the question what is and renders it contingently possible' (1967:110). The trace is the unmotivated inertia of discourse, where our creation of meaning is itself informed by our prior dispositions, the product of engagement with the world.

Like Merleau-Ponty, Derrida acknowledges that the origin of all meaning is precisely this engagement: La différence inouïe entre l'apparaîssant et l'apparaître (entre le « monde » et le « vécu ») est la condition de toutes les autres différences, de toutes les autres traces, et elle est déjà une trace (1967:95); 'the unheard difference between the appearing and the appearance (between the "world" and the "lived") is the condition for every other difference, for every other trace, and it is already a trace'. Here, Derrida is expressing the notion of 'congruence', where meaning is created through the meeting of our predisposition with our environment, so that the flux of the apparaîssant 'appearing' forms in our minds as the apparaître 'appeared'. This means that the openness of meaning, its deferral as différance, is as much sensory as cognitive: Cette différance n'est...pas plus sensible qu'intelligible (1967:92); 'this differance is...not more sensory than intelligible'. All apparently foundational dualisms are collapsed, themselves being only the results of our tangent of engagement with the world: la trace...n'est pas plus naturelle...que culturelle, pas plus physique que psychique, biologique que spirituelle (1967:69-70); 'the trace is not more natural...than cultural, not more physical than psychical, biological than spiritual'.

In Chapter Two (Part Two), the same discourse (*trace*) of intrinsic irreconcilability was manifest at different levels: local, Andean and Peruvian. This revealed that the opposition did not depend on the 'content' of each category so much as on the discourse that brought each category into existence (as Derrida notes, the *trace* must be considered before the 'being', 1967:69). The

underlying trace of this discourse ramified in several different directions, producing opposed categories that originated mutually along the mouvement pur 'pure movement' (1967:92) of the trace. The undeniable mutual constitution of these categories was evident at all levels. At the local level, chimaychi was defined as 'Pomabamban' in contrast to modern music from abroad (quote 19), and as representative of Pomabamba ('representation' is only possible towards that which is 'not') (quote 21). At the Andean level, waynu served the purpose of 'maintaining' one's roots (with the strong implications that there was a 'danger' of forgetting, through contact with that which was not 'Andean') (quotes 27 and 28). At the national level, the purpose of the genre was to saca adelante nuestro Perú 'bring our Peru to the forefront' (quote 30) and hacer que todo el mundo lo conozca 'make the whole world aware of it [the waynu]' (quote 31), affirmations which entail the participation of the 'non-Peruvian' in the definition of the 'Peruvian'. Moreover, the juxtaposition of different levels served to perpetuate the trace even more. For example, the definition of the waynu as both 'Andean' and 'Peruvian' had the effect of eliminating from consideration the non-Andean cultures of Peru (specifically, the 'Hispanic'), so that 'Andeanness' was the sole legitimate mode of being 'Peruvian'. Thus, the juxtaposition between levels resoundingly negated the ontological validity of the 'Hispanic'. This dialogues with Derrida's notion of the supplément, whereby what is ostensibly self-sufficient cannot be so if it can be supplemented at all (1967:208). Here, the abject Self supplements the bracketed Self, since it is only through relation with the 'abject' that the 'true' Self acquires its perceived existence as a bracketed category.

The same projection of the *trace* operated in the *Apu Inka* and *Pallas* songs of Chapter Four. The songs in this chapter all re-defined 'Andeans' as 'Incas', members of an elite and morally enlightened community whose physical defeat only served to reconfirm their greater moral triumph. In this discourse of irreconcilable dualism, it was not possible for both sides to triumph at once, for each negated the other. The songs of *Apu Inka* and *Pallas* thus served a purpose of hardening the boundary between bracketed Self (the 'Andean') and abject Self (the incorporated Other). We saw how this *trace* of ethnic irreconcilability led back to at least the Middle Ages, where Spanish Christians celebrated their victories against African Muslims, showing that the 'thing' or 'category' is a 'chain of differences' through time and space (Derrida 1967:137). In the *Apu Inka* and *Pallas*, however, it is the Incas who are identified as the true Christians and the Spaniards as the unbelievers.

We saw how, as part of this process, Quechua concepts of the universe at large were 'appropriated' to signify the 'Incan' world. *Ayllu* became 'Incan community' on which all valid communities depend,

pacha became the Incan Empire and kallpa became the special preserve of the Incan Apu who also realized the ultimate act of kamay or 'creation'. Thus, as part of the movement of a trace of intrinsic distinctness, pre-ontological notions (which, like Derrida's trace, Merleau-Ponty's chair and Heidegger's Dasein precede any possibility of categorization) become transposed to the ontological level (i.e. from category-originating to category-dependent). As such, the reification of an 'authentic' 'Andean' cosmology in fact negates 'authenticity' in the very act of reification. By defining these percepts as uniquely 'Andean', they lose the very pre-ontological state that is central to their meaning (this, incidentally, shows just how important it is not to assume that the 'same' word will have the 'same' meaning in all contexts). Nonetheless, this very process can be understood in terms of the percepts themselves (if taken in their original, pre-ontological, sense). The emergence of two categories is a kind of tinku (creation of entities through congruence), which, through the discursive process, continuously re-create themselves (kamay). It is the perpetuation of the trace along an unmotivated discursive inertia where unquestioned assumptions reinforce themselves by way of the clash (itself a kind of dialogue) between categories formed by these assumptions. Thus, the trace is reproduced by an 'occultation of itself' (1967:69), through the mental 'entities' that it engenders. The process is even a kind of ayni 'reciprocity' - not between physical people, but between the categories themselves in the sense that they mutually acquire a stability that derives from the relation, even if this relation consists in the rhetorical denial of relation. Thus, the mutual constitution of beings - as conveyed by the Andean concepts, Derrida, Merleau-Ponty and Heidegger - can be equally applied to discourses that deny this mutual constitution.

# The Meaning of 'Identity': Beyond 'Entity' and 'Process' towards 'Potentiality'

What Merleau-Ponty, Derrida, Heidegger and the Andean concepts all demonstrate is the fact that 'identity' cannot be reduced simply to 'things', because the way that 'things' are defined is a question of predisposition. Neither is this predisposition reducible to 'things' because disposition is what transforms things from one moment to the next. This contingent nature of 'identity' is conveyed by Bucholtz and Hall who define 'identity' as 'an outcome of cultural semiotics that is accomplished through the production of contextually relevant sociopolitical relations of similarity and difference, authenticity and inauthenticity, and legitimacy and illegitimacy' (2004:382). There are, however, two difficulties in reconciling this definition to the texts. First, 'identity' is not a finished product, an 'outcome', but a continuous and evolving stance towards changing environmental influences (even, as in the case of the essentialist discourses of Chapters Two (Part

Two) and Four, where this contingency is denied). Second, while identity-creation is a form of 'cultural semiotics', it does not only concern the creation of 'meaning' on an abstract plane. Ultimately, the texts are about survival, and relate to our interaction with the physical environment. Our striving for survival informs how we substantialize, group together or separate, the flow of reality into 'things', on the basis of what each contingent manifestation affords us: 'We do not superimpose meaning on a world ("nature" or "physical reality") that pre-exists apart from ourselves, for to live we must dwell in the world, and to dwell we must already relate to its constituents. Meaning inheres in these relationships' (Ingold 1993:222).

This dialogues with Gibson (1979), and enaction theory, whereby 'Perception is not the mere capture of the traits of a worldly object that is pre-given, but a guide for the action of the perceiver in/with the world which (s)he perceives/creates' (Cano 2002:27, mt). Likewise, a 'performative conception of cultural process...displaces the concept of representation..., and reality is conceived as constructed and emergent, an experiential process grounded in time and place, and in relation to the individuals and groups who, through their participation, position themselves in relation to one another and the wider social order' (Howard-Malverde 1997:10). Or, if we choose to keep the term 'representation', then 'identification and re-presentation can [should] be seen as different sides of the same coin. They are the delicately intertwined processes of one's collaborative struggle to understand, and so construct, the world and one's position within it' (Howarth 2002:20).

The phrase that seems to me most adequate in conveying the nature of entification (entity-creation), as communicated in the Andean expressions, is *congruence of potentialities*. Just as two streams, when meeting, form an eddy that is united with, yet somehow distinct from, the linear flows of water that surround it, so entification, the realization of something *as* some-thing, depends on the meeting between pre-extant (but hitherto unactualized) potentialities (or predispositions). These potentialities are the contingent expressions of total reality (*kallpa*, in Quechua, or *chair*, in Merleau-Ponty's philosophy) which is by nature dynamic, so that they have different interactive properties according to what other potentialities they come across. The interactions between potentialities are experienced as the fulfilling of manifold potentialities as 'properties' of 'things'. This was conveyed by the Quechua concept of *tinku* (whereby the meeting between dispositions resulted in the continuous transformation of beings), Merleau-Ponty's notion of *chair* (which stressed the mutual emergence of Self and Other), Derrida's notion of *trace* (whereby categories are formed by a pre-ontological state of 'discourse'), and Heidegger's *Dasein* (which conveyed the constant transformation of 'beings' through interaction). Thus, we can both agree and disagree with the following:

'directly contrary to what appears to be its settled semantic career, this concept of identity does not signal that stable core of the self, unfolding from beginning to end through all the vicissitudes of history without change...identities are never unified, and, in late modern times, increasingly fragmented and fractured; never singular but multiply constructed across different, often intersecting and antagonistic, discourses, practices, and positions' (Hall 1996:3-4).

The stress on change is accurate, but the focus on fragmentation and multiplicity suggests a lack of coherence which can be unified if we see the Self and what it relates to not as a collection of rigid principles in isolation, but as a moving-in-the-world, where 'perceiver' and 'perceived' acquire meaning only in the context of their interaction. Difference does not imply fragmentation, because difference is the vehicle of dynamism, and dynamism is part of what it means to exist.

In the context of life, this dynamism has an added meaning. Life is the product of the actualization of a near-infinite chain of prior potentialities that, through congruence, have led to the emergence of a self-perpetuating system of its own. This self-perpetuation translates, from the standpoint of the living being, as the ultimate orientation towards survival. That is why, in the context of the Andean texts that we have examined in this thesis, I have generally talked in terms of 'strategies' of negotiation in accordance with 'survival' as the final goal. It must be remembered, however, that the striving for survival is not itself motivated, since 'motivation' can only be experienced following the unmotivated emergence of life. The quest for survival is just one context of the general process of actualization of potentiality through congruence (whereby living beings follow the trajectory (trace) of 'survival' in the constant perpetuation of their forms through interaction). Given that life is defined by its orientation towards 'survival', all forms of engagement, on the part of living beings, can be understood as products of this underlying trace. This was strongly suggested by the Andean songs of Chapter Three, where ayni operated in order to find optimum conditions for survival. This quest for survival was equally salient in the 'essentialist' discourses of Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, where a rigid boundary was constructed as a means of protecting oneself against a hegemonic discriminatory (and interiorized) discourse.

The difference between the texts in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four (on the one hand) and the texts in Chapters Two (Part One) and Three, however, rested in the degree of engagement with the emergent Other. In Chapters Two (Part One) and Three, the Other was engaged with directly, acknowledged as evolving in tandem with Self, because there was no prior predisposition to view that Other as threatening. In Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, on the other hand, the Other was

discourse. The very fact, however, that engagement was precluded meant that the idea of the Other as 'discriminatory' circulated intersubjectively among those with whom one wished to engage, so that the tinku (mutual emergence) of each category (Andean versus Hispanic) was no longer directly informed by mutual participation. Thus, the mental categories failed to give an accurate picture of the Other, keeping the Other as Other and precluding any possibility of reconciliation. The true interconnectedness of 'Andean' and 'Hispanic' was tacitly acknowledged, but immediately denied because of the internalized discourse of ethnic irreconcilability which led to the fear of incorporation. This resulted, in turn, in a reaffirmation of this discourse as a means to preserve the 'integrity' of that 'part' of the Self that was felt to be threatened.

The texts, then, suggest that what distinguishes 'truth' from 'falsity' is not the degree to which we are able to 'objectify' ourselves, but the extent to which we are able to overcome fear of engagement (just as the *negrito* cautiously approaches the *guiadora* with the intuition that she might be more than she seems). This can be understood by way of the dialogue between *Dasein*, *chair* and *trace*. In the case of Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, there is a dissonance between *chair* (direct engagement between emergent entities) and *trace* (emergence of categories through discourse): whilst the *trace* of irreconcilable dualism results from direct engagement, this is not direct engagement with the opposing category; thus, one never gets beyond the discourse that operates among those who share similar views. The Other is always perceived as *zuhanden* (relevant) in a particular way, namely as affording distancing rather than approximation, with the result that the true *vorhanden* potentialities of that-which-is-represented-as-Other are never revealed. It is, instead, the mental category on its own that acquires some sense of *vorhanden* reality (insofar as it operates through constant reaffirmation of itself, or re-actualization of its potentialities whenever it is invoked).

However, the dynamic and transformational nature of any entity or category (as conveyed by *Dasein*) means that the 'same' discourse is never exactly the same in different contexts, so that, despite the seeming rigidity of essentialism, the *trace* is always projecting itself in subtlely different ways. This constant evolution of the *trace* means that the person is never condemned to reproduce the same discourse (operate with the same predispositions). Indeed, a crucial feature of *Dasein* is that dispositions are always transforming in response to different contexts. Thus, while a discourse that encourages lack of engagement is, by its very nature, likely to be self-reproducing, the exposure to other discourses in non-threatening environments can allow Self to critically compare the two

discourses and ascertain which corresponds most closely to one's personal experience. This can go some way to dissolving fear and encouraging more open engagement. Such is the comparative process that leads from the transition from zuhanden (relevant to one's disposition) to vorhanden (perception of the true nature of phenomena). Of course, the two discourses will have to be sufficiently close so that the potential for comparison is perceived, without undermining the nonthreatening context within which the new discourse is introduced. Thus, through comparison, Dasein can project itself towards more inclusive (and thereby accurate) spheres of engagement, reconciling the trace (mental categories) with chair (mutual emergence of the entities through direct physical engagement). This greater awareness of extant potentialities in the world likewise enriches the potentialities of the Self in fostering more congruent – and hence more productive – modes of interaction, as saw in the relations of ayni in Chapter Three. This depends on viewing 'identity' as based not on 'entities' but instead on potentialities, potentialities that lie latent but which may be actualized through relations of congruence with other potentialities. The mutual actualization of 'potentiality' is the process of identity construction and, as conveyed by the concept of yachay, the more potentialities that are perceived (the closer one gets to vorhanden), the wider one's possibilities of interaction and self-development.

How, then, can we respond to the challenges of the term 'identity' to which I alluded on the first page of this thesis, and which motivated the study in the first place? These challenges all boiled down to the criticism that 'identity' is used in both essentialist and processual senses, which would seem to be contradictory, rendering the term analytically useless. And these two senses run through the thesis as a whole, with the former more salient in Chapters Two (Part Two) and Four, and the latter more salient in Chapters Two (Part One) and Three. Brubaker & Cooper, after their perceptive elucidation of these seeming contradictions, offer a variety terms to replace the term 'identity': identification; categorization; self-understanding; social location; commonality; connectedness; groupness (2000:14-21). These terms are very useful in highlighting different senses packaged under 'identity', but they do not get round the apparent contradictions of combining processual constructivism with the essentialist entity. In each of the above words, there is always something of the 'process' and something of the 'entity'.

I have argued, on the basis of the dialogues entered into in this thesis, that 'entity' and 'process' (those two seemingly contradictory elements in 'identity') do not stand in contradiction because neither is absolute; the world is totality in motion, and to be anything at all means to be dynamic, open and contingent. Thus, 'Identity is usable as an analytical term only if the rubric can be

connected back to the processes through which the things it names get formed' (Agha 2007:234), but this is not to imply the analytic separability of 'process' from 'substance'. The term 'identity' only appears self-contradictory if one ignores this, separating the two out so that 'process' seems a 'thing' impossible to account for (because not substantive), and 'substance' (the 'entity') appears as purely arbitrary (because not constructed) and equally unaccountable. This realization entails a view of embodied meaning not in terms of immutable concepts, but as the operation of congruencies between the contingent potentialities that lie latent in the world. This includes the growth of Self through relation with the environment: greater receptivity means more congruencies between increasingly diverse potentialities, greater apprehension of meaningfulness (significance), and greater approximation towards truth.

Arguably, 'identity' appears particularly ambiguous because it foregrounds this reality of our existence, a reality which cannot be put into a single word but emerges through combination of words in discourse. Ultimately, however, ambiguity lurks in every word unless we shift our perception to view meaning as congruence (neither pure entity nor pure relation), and come to apprehend this meaning by partaking in it ourselves. This is the ecological perspective of the voices of the mountains, voices which, through our deep engagement, have revealed other discourses and brought to the fore tacit understandings about the nature of ourselves and our place in the world. A perspective that unites cognition, emotion, sensory perception and the discourses that emerge, evolve, and transform in response to a changing environment.



Ascending to the mountains: a brass band playing waynu during a festival in Shilla, Carhuaz province. The mountain is Huascarán, the highest in Peru.



Chris, Mitzi and the author below the waterfall of Úsgor, near Chiquián, Bolognesi. This is allegedly the home of nature-spirits whose voices can be heard by the wandering traveller.

### **Bibliography**

Abercrombie, T. (1991) "To Be Indian, to Be Bolivian: 'Ethnic' and 'National' Discourses of Identity", in Urban, G. & Scherzer, J. (eds) *Nation States and Indians in Latin America*. Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 95-130

Abercrombie, T. (1998) *Pathways of Memory and Power: Ethnography and History among an Andean People*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press

Abram, D. (1997) *The Spell of the Sensuous: Perception and Language in a More-than-human World,* New York: Pantheon Books

Adelaar, W. (1994) "Conceptos abstractos y generales en quechua: Una visión diacrónica", in Beyersdorff, M. & Sáenz, S. (eds) *Andean Oral Traditions, Discourse and Literature*. Bonn: Holos, pp. 1-20

Adelaar, W. (1997) "Spatial Reference and Speaker Orientation in Early Colonial Quechua", in Howard-Malverde, R. (ed.) *Creating Context in Andean Cultures*. Oxford: OUP, pp. 135-148

Adelaar, W. with Muysken, P. (2004) The Languages of the Andes. Cambridge: CUP

Agha, A. (2007) Language and Social Relations. Cambridge: CUP

Albó, X. (2004a) "El futuro del quechua visto desde una perspectiva boliviana", in *International Journal of Sociology of Language* 167, pp. 119-130

Albó, X. (2004b) "Ethnic Identity and Politics in the Central Andes: the Cases of Bolivia, Ecuador, and Peru", in Burt, J. & Mauceri, P. (eds) *Politics in the Andes: Identity, Conflict, Reform.* Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, pp. 17-37

Alim, S. (2009) "Hip Hop Nation Language", in Duranti, A. (ed.) *Linguistic Anthropology: A Reader*. Oxford: Wiley & Blackwell, pp. 272-289

Allen, C. (1988) *The Hold Life Has: Coca and Cultural Identity in an Andean Community.* London: Smithsonian Institution Press

Allen, C. (1997) "When Pebbles Move Mountains: Iconicity and Symbolism in Quechua Ritual", in Howard-Malverde, R. (ed.) *Creating Context in Andean Cultures*. Oxford: OUP, pp. 73-84

Allen, C. (2002) *The Hold Life Has: Coca and Cultural Identity in an Andean Community*. London: Smithsonian Institution Press

Allen, C. (2011) Foxboy: Intimacy and Aesthetics in Andean Stories. Austin: University of Texas Press

Allen, R. (ed.) (2000) The New Penguin English Dictionary. Harmondsworth: Penguin

Alvarado, E. (2009) El canto del cuculí encendido: Antología de la poesía popular ancashina. Lima: Instituto de Desarrollo Gerencial

Antaki, C., Condor, S. & Levine, M. (1996) "Social Identities in Talk: Speakers' Own Orientations", in *British Journal of Social Psychology* 35, pp. 473-492

Apffel-Marglin, F. (1998) "Introduction: Knowledge and Life Revisited", in Apffel-Marglin, F. (ed.) *The Spirit of Regeneration: Andean Culture Confronting Western Notions of Development*. London: Zed Books Ltd, pp. 1-50

Arguedas, J.M. (1938) Canto kechwa. Lima: Editorial Club del Libro Peruano

Arguedas, J.M. (1949) Canciones y cuentos del pueblo quechua. Lima: Ed. Huascarán.

Arguedas, J.M. (1957) (edited by Stephan, R.) *The Singing Mountaineers: Songs and Tales of the Quechua People.* Austin: University of Texas Press

Arguedas, J.M. (1958) Los ríos profundos. Buenos Aires: Losada

Arguedas, J.M. (1965) Poesía quechua. Buenos Aires: EUDEBA

Arguedas, J.M. & Guerrero, M. (1967/1981) "La difusión de la música folklórica andina", in *Cuadernos de folklore* 1, pp. 10-22

Armela, E. (1971) "El hombre y los animales en la cultura quechua", in Allpanchis 3, pp. 135-162

Arnold, D. & Yapita, J. (1998) Río de Vellón, Río de Canto: Cantar a los animales, una poética andina de la creación. La Paz: Hisbol

Arnold, D. & Yapita, J. (2006) *The Metamorphosis of Heads: Textual Struggles, Education, and Land in the Andes*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press

Astvaldsson, A. (2002) "Coming to Power: Knowledge, Learning, and Historic Pathways to Authority in a Bolivian Community", in Stobart, H. & Howard, R. (eds) *Knowledge and Learning in the Andes: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, pp. 109-126

Astvaldsson, A. (2006) "Reading without Words: Landscapes and Symbolic Objects as Repositories of Knowledge and Meaning", in Dransart, P. (ed.) *Kay Pacha: Cultivating Earth and Water in the Andes*. Oxford: Archaopress, pp. 107-114

Aybar, E. (1980) Literatura quechua. Caracas: Biblioteca Ayacucho

Balmori, C. (1955) La conquista de los españoles. Tucumán: Universidad Nacional de Tucumán

Banti, G. & Giannattasio, F. (2004) "Poetry", in Duranti, A. (ed.) *Companion to Linguistic Anthropology*. Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 290-320

Barabas, A. (1986) "Movimientos étnicos religiosos y seculares en América Latina: Una aproximación a la construcción de la utopía india", in *América indígena* 46/3, pp. 495-529

Barber, K. (2007) The Anthropology of Texts, Persons and Publics. Cambridge: CUP

Barth, F. (1969) "Introduction" in Barth, F. (ed.) *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries: The Social Organization of Culture Difference*. Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, pp. 9-38

Bastien, J. (1992) "Shaman Versus Nurse in an Aymara Village: Traditional and Modern Medicine in Conflict", in Dover, R., Seibold, K. & McDowell, J. (eds) *Andean Cosmologies through Time: Persistence and Emergence*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 137-165

Bauer, B. (1996) "Legitimization of the State in Inca Myth and Ritual", in *American Anthropologist* 98, pp. 327-337

Bauer, B. & Covey, A. (2002) "Processes of State Formation in the Inca Heartland (Cuzco, Peru)", in *American Anthropologist* 104/3, pp. 846-864

Bauman, R. (1978) Verbal Art as Performance. Rowley, Mass.: Newbury House Publishers

Baumann, M. (1996) "Andean Music, Symbolic Dualism and Cosmology", in Baumann, M. (ed.) Cosmología y Música en los Andes. Frankfurt: Vervuert, pp. 15-66

Bell, J. (1998) *The Problem of Difference: Phenomenology and Poststructuralism*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press

Bendezú, E. (1993) "Los textos de d'Harcourt", in *Revista de crítica latinoamericana* 19/37, pp. 105-115

Bennington, G. (1993) *Jacques Derrida / Geoffrey Bennington and Jacques Derrida*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Berger, H. (1999) *Metal, Rock, and Jazz: Perception and the Phenomenology of Musical Experience*. Hanover, NH: Wesleyan University Press

Bermúdez-Gallegos, M. (1993) "Oralidad y escritura: Atahualpa, ¿traidor o traicionado?", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 19/38, pp. 331-344

Beyersdorff, M. (1993) "La 'puesta en texto' del primer drama indohispano en los Andes", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 19/37, pp. 195-221

Bigenho, M. (2004) "Why They Don't All Wax Nostalgic: Comparing Modernities through Songs from the Bolivian Andes", in Delgado, G. & Schechter, J. (eds) *Quechua Verbal Artistry: The Inscription of Andean Voices*. Aachen: Sahker Verlag, pp. 263-297

Biondi, J. & Zapata, E. (2006) La palabra permanente: Verba manent, scripta volant: Teoría y prácticas de la oralidad en el discurso social del Perú. Lima: Fondo Editorial del Congreso del Perú

Bolin, I. (1998) Rituals of Respect: the Secret of Survival in the High Peruvian Andes. Austin: University of Texas Press

Bourque, N. (1994) "Spatial Meaning in Andean Festivals: Corpus Christi and Octavo", in *Ethnology* 33/3, pp. 229-243

Bourque, N. (1997) "Making Space: Social Change, Identity and the Creation of Boundaries in the Central Ecuadorian Andes", in *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 16/2, pp. 153-167

Bourque, N. (1999) "Cooking, Ploughing and the Expression of Gender Identity in the Central Ecuadorian Andes", in *Acta Americana* 7/1, pp. 5-20

Bouysse-Cassagne, T. (1986) "Urco and Uma: Aymara Concepts of Space", in Murra, J., Wachtel, N. & Revel, J. (eds) *Anthropological History of Andean Polities*. Cambridge: CUP, pp. 201-227

Brandom, R. (2002) Tales of the Mighty Dead. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press

Brass, M., Ruby, P. & Spengler, S. (2009) "Inhibition of Imitative Behaviour and Social Cognition", in *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society* 364, pp. 2359-2367

Brienen, M. (2003) "The Andean Melodrama and How it Reflects on Bolivian Education", in Salman, T. & Zoomers, A. (eds) *Imaging the Andes: Shifting Margins of a Marginal World*. Amsterdam: Aksant, pp. 187-207

Brislin, R. (1976) "Comparative Research Methodology: Cross-cultural Studies", in *International Journal of Psychology* 11/3, pp. 215-229

Berry, J. (1969) "On Cross-cultural Comparability", in *International Journal of Psychology* 4, pp. 119-128

Brubaker, R. & Cooper, F. (2000) "Beyond 'Identity'", in Theory and Society 29/1, pp. 1-47

Bucholtz, M. (1999) "You da Man: Narrating the Racial Other in the Production of White Masculinity" in *Journal of Sociolinguistics* 3/4, pp. 443-460

Bucholtz, M. (2003) "Sociolinguistic Nostalgia and the Authentication of Identity", in *Journal of Sociolinguistics* 7/3, pp. 398-416

Bucholtz, M. & Hall, K. (2004) "Language and Identity", in Duranti, A. (ed.) *A Companion to Linguistic Anthropology*. Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 369-394

Burga, M. (1998) *Nacimiento de una utopía: Muerte y resurrección de los Incas*. Lima: Instituto de Apoyo Agrario

Buss, D. (1995) "Evolutionary Psychology: A New Paradigm for Psychological Science", in *Psychological Inquiry* 6, pp. 1–30

Butler, J. (1990) Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity. London: Routledge

Canales, F. (2005) Las representaciones sociales del consumo indebido de alcohol y la subvaloración personal en los mensajes de las canciones de la sierra peruana. PhD Thesis, Universidad Nacional de San Marcos, Lima

Canessa, A. (2000) "Fear and Loathing on the Kharisiri Trail: Alterity and Identity in the Andes", in *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 6/4, pp. 705-720

Canessa, A. (2005) "Introduction: Making the Nation on the Margins", in Canessa, A. (ed.) *Natives Making Nation*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, pp. 3-31

Cano, R. (2002) "Entre el giro lingüístico y el guiño hermenéutico: Tópicos y competencia en la semiótica musical actual", in *Cuicuilco* 9/25, pp. 1-40

Carranza Romero, F. (1993) *Resultados lingüísticos del contacto quechua y español*. Trujillo, Peru: Editorial Libertad EIRL

Carranza Romero, F. (2003) Diccionario quechua ancashino-castellano. Madrid: Iberoamericana

Carrasco, J. (1985) "El qarawi y su función social", in Allpanchis 21/25, pp. 233-270

Carrillo, F. (1986) *Literatura quechua clásica: Enciclopedia histórica de la literatura peruana* Vol. I. Lima: Editorial Horizonte

Carter, P. (2003) "Black" Cultural Capital, Status Positioning, and Schooling Conflicts for Low-Income African American Youth', in *Social Problems* 50/1, pp. 136-155

Cerrón-Palomino, R. (1989) "Language Policy in Peru: A Historical Overview", in *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 77, pp. 11-34

Cervone, E. (1998) "Festival Time, Long Live the Festival: Ethnic Conflict and Ritual in the Andes", in *Anthropos* 93, pp. 101-113

Chang-Rodríguez, R. (1999) *Hidden Messages: Representation and Resistance in Andean Colonial Drama*. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press/London: Associated University Press

Chirinos, A. (1998) "Las lenguas indígenas peruanas más allá del 2000", in *Revista andina* 32, pp. 453-479

Chirinos, A. (2001) Atlas lingüístico del Perú. Lima: Centro Bartolomé de las Casas

Coelho J., Ernesto, N. & Figueiredo, L. (2003) "Patterns of Intersubjectivity in the Constitution of Subjectivity: Dimensions of Otherness", in *Culture & Psychology* 9/3, pp. 193-208

Columbus, C. (2007) *Andean Architexts: Wordplay and the Sacred in the Andes*. Lima: Sociedad Geográfica de Lima

Condori, R.G. & Condori, E.G. (2009) *Música, danza y ritual en Bolivia: Una aproximación a la cultura Musical de los Andes, Tarija y el Chaco Boliviano*. La Paz: Hebrón Impresores

Cornejo-Polar, A. (1990) "El comienzo de la heterogeneidad en las literaturas andinas: Voz y letra en el 'Diálogo' de Cajamarca", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 33, pp. 155-207

Corr, R. (2010) *Ritual and Remembrance in the Ecuadorian Andes*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press

Crickmay, L. (2002) "Transmission of Knowledge through Textiles: Weaving and Learning How to Live", in Stobart, H. & Howard, R. (eds) Knowledge and Learning in the Andes: Ethnographic Perspectives. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, pp. 40-55

Curd, Patricia (2012) "Presocratic Philosophy", in Zalta, E. (ed.) *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2012 Edition), forthcoming URL = http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2012/entries/presocratics/, accessed 21/05/12

Dauenhauer, N. & Dauenhauer, R. (1998) "Technical, Emotional, and Ideological Issues in Reversing Language Shift: Examples from Southeast Alaska", in Grenoble, L. & Whaley, L. (eds) *Endangered Languages: Language Loss and Community Response*. Cambridge: CUP, pp. 57-98

Davies, N. (1997) The Ancient Kingdoms of Peru. London: Penguin Books.

De Bedia, A. & De Martinez, L. (2001) "Situación del bilingüismo quechua-español en Jujuy", in *Cuadernos* 16, pp. 123-131

De la Cadena, M. (2000) *Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919-1991*. Durham (North Carolina): Duke University Press

Dedenbach-Salazar Sáenz, S. (1997) "Point of View and Evidentiality in the Huarochirí Texts (Peru, 17<sup>th</sup> Century)", in Howard-Malverde, R. (ed.) *Creating Context in Andean Cultures*. Oxford: OUP, pp. 149-167

Delgado, G. & Schechter, J. (eds) (2004) *Quechua Verbal Artistry: the Inscription of Andean Voices*. Aachen: Shaker Verlag

Derrida, J. (1967) De la grammatologie. Paris: Éditions de Minuit

D'Harcourt, R. & D'Harcourt, M. (1925) La musique des Incas et ses survivances. Paris

Dufwenberg, M & Kirchsteiger, G. (2004) "A Theory of Sequential Reciprocity", in *Games and Economic Behavior* 47, pp. 268-298

Durkheim, E. (1912/2001) The Elementary Forms of Religious Life. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Duviols, P. (1973) "Huari y Llacuaz: Agricultores y pastores: Un dualismo prehispánico de oposición y complementariedad", in *Revista del Museo Nacional* (Lima) 39, pp. 153-187

Earls, J. (1973) "La organización del poder en la mitología quechua", in Ossio, J. (ed.) *Ideología mesiánica del mundo andino*. Lima: Edición de Ignacio Prado Pastor, pp. 393-414

Edwards, J. (1985) Language, Society and Identity. Oxford: Blackwell

Egúsquiza, A. (2000) Serenatas andinas. Lima: Ediciones IDG

Escóbar, G. (1984) "The Words of the Quechua Waynos of Cuzco", in *Latin American Indian Literatures* Vol 8/1, pp. 1-12

Estermann, J. (1998) Filosofía andina: Estudio intercultural de la sabiduría autóctona andina. Quito: Abya-Yala

Fabián, M. (2003) Canis: Lírica y narrativa oral. Lima: Ediciones Wamanwaca

Falk, A. & Fischbacher, U. (2000) "A Theory of Reciprocity", in *University of Zürich Institute for Empirical Research in Economics Working Papers* 6, pp. 1-47

Feke, M. (2004) Quechua to Spanish Cross-Linguistic Influence among Cuzco Quechua-Spanish Bilinguals: The Case of Epistemology. PhD Thesis, University of Pittsburgh

Femenías, B. (2005) *Gender and the Boundaries of Dress in Contemporary Peru*. Austin: University of Texas Press

Figueroa, C. (1981) "Malaya mi suerte: Ideología determinista en el huayno", in *América indígena:* Órgano oficial del Instituto Indigenista Interamericano 41, pp. 135-149

Finnegan, R. (1992a) *Oral Poetry: Its Nature, Significance and Social Context*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press

Finnegan, R. (1992b) *Oral Traditions and the Verbal Arts: a Guide to Research Practices*. London: Routledge

Flores Galindo, A. (1988) Buscando un Inca: Identidad y utopía en los Andes. Lima: Editorial Horizonte

Fock, N. (1981) "Ecology and Mind in an Andean Irrigation Culture", in *Folk: Dansk Ethnografisk Tidsskrift* 23, pp. 311-330

Fox, J. (1974/1989) "'Our Ancestors Spoke in Pairs': Rotinese Views of Language, Dialect, and Code", in Bauman, R. & Sherzer, J. (eds) *Explorations in the Ethnography of Speaking*, Cambridge: CUP, pp. 65-85

Gade, D. (1999) Nature and Culture in the Andes. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press

Gálvez, E. (2006) "Lengua, conflicto cultural y expresión emocional: Discursos ideológicos y psicológicos del carnaval andino", in *Revista de psiquiatría y salud mental* Hermilio Valdizán 7/2, pp. 87-108

Gärdenfors, P. (2008) "The Role of Intersubjectivity in Animal and Human Cooperation", in *Biological Theory* 3/1, pp. 51-62

Gelles, P. & Escobar, G. (1996) 'Glossary', in Mamani, G. C. & Huamán, A. Q. (1996) *Andean Lives*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Gibson, J. (1979) The Ecological Approach to Visual Perception. London: Houghton Mifflin

Gilbert, P. (1989) Human Nature and Suffering. New York: Guilford Press

Giles, H., Bourhis, R. & Taylor, D. (1977) "Towards a Theory of Language in Ethnic Group Relations", in Giles, H. (ed.) *Language, Ethnicity and Intergroup Relations*. London: Academic Press, pp. 307-348

Giles, H. & Johnson, P. (1987) "Ethnolinguistic Identity Theory: A Social-Psychological Approach to Language Maintenance", in *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 68, pp. 69-100

Gillespie, A. & Cornish, F. (2009) "Intersubjectivity: Towards a Dialogical Analysis", in *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 40/1, pp. 19-46

Glassie, H. (1994) "On Identity", in Journal of American Folklore 107/424, pp. 238-241

Gluckman, M. (1965) Politics, Law and Ritual in Tribal Society. Oxford: Basil Blackwell

Godenzzi, J. (2005) En las redes del lenguaje: Cognición, discurso y sociedad en los Andes. Lima: Universidad del Pacífico

Goldblum, N. (2001) The Brain-Shaped Mind: What the Brain Can Tell Us about the Mind. Cambridge:

Golte, J, Oelting, E. & Degregori, C. (1979) "Canciones como expresión del pensamiento campesino andino", in *Indiana* 5, pp. 253-288

Gonzáles, T. (2000) 'The Cultures of the Seed in the Peruvian Andes', in Brush, S. (ed.) *Genes in the Field: On-Farm Conservation of Crop Diversity*. London: International Plant Genetic Resources Institute, pp. 193-218

González, M. (2010) *Translating Quechua Poetic Expression in the Andes: Literature, the Social Body, and Indigenous Movements.* PhD Thesis, University of Michigan

Gonzalez Carre, E. & Rivera Pineda, F. (1982) "La muerte del Inca en Santa Ana de Tusi", in *Bulletin de l'Institut Français d'Etudes Andines* 11/1-2, pp. 19-36

Gouldner, A. (1960) "The Norm of Reciprocity: A Preliminary Statement", in *American Sociological Review* 25, pp. 161-178

Gugenberger, E. (1995) Identitäts-und Sprachkonflikt in einer Pluriethnischen Gesellschaft: eine Soziolinguistische Studie über Quechua-Sprecher und-Sprecherinnen in Peru. Vienna: WUV-Universitätsverlag

Gugenberger, E. (1999) "Entre el quechua y el castellano: Manifestaciones del conflicto de identidades etnolingüísticas en un pueblo joven de Arequipa", in *Lexis: Revista de lingüística y literatura* 23/2, pp. 257-300

Gumperz, J.J. (1977) "The Sociolinguistic Significance of Conversational Code-switching", in *RELC Journal* 8/2, pp. 1-34

Gustafsson, J. (2009) Tiempo, espacio, comunidad: Fronteras, identidad y utopía en el proyecto de 'Comunidad Intercultural Tawantinsuyu',

www.insumisos.com/lecturasinsumisas/Tiempo\_espacio%20y%20comunidad.pdf, accessed 01/10/12

Haarman, H. (1986) Language in Ethnicity: A View of Basic Ecological Relations. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter

Haboud, M. (2004) "Quichua Language Vitality: An Ecuadorian Perspective", in *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 167, pp. 69-81

Hall, S. (1996) "Introduction: Who Needs Identity?", in Hall, S. & du Gay, P. (eds) *Questions of Cultural Identity*. London: Sage, pp. 1-17

Hamel, R. (1995) "Conflictos entre lenguas y derechos lingüísticos: Perspectivas de análisis sociolingüístico", in *Alteridades* 5/10, pp. 79-88

Hames-García, M. (2000) "Who are Our Own People?: Challenges for a Theory of Social Identity", in Hames-García, M. & Moya, P. (eds) *Reclaiming Identity: Realist Theory and the Predicament of Postmodernism*. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 102-132

Harris, O. (1986) "Complementariedad y conflicto: Una visión andina del hombre y la mujer", in *Allpanchis* 25, pp. 17-42

Harris, O. (1995) "Ethnic Identity and Market Relations: Indians and Mestizos in the Andes", in Larson, B. & Harris, O. (eds) Ethnicity, Markets, and Migration in the Andes: At the Crossroads of History and Anthropology. London: Duke University Press, pp 351-390

Harrison, R. (1994) Signos, cantos y memoria en los Andes: Traduciendo la lengua y la cultura quechua. Quito: Abya-Yala

Harrison Macdonald, R. (1979) Andean Indigenous Expression: A Textual and Cultural Study of Hispanic-American and Quichua Poetry in Ecuador. PhD Thesis, University of Illinois

Hastings, A. & Manning, P. (2004) "Introduction: Acts of Alterity", in *Language & Communication* 24, pp. 291-311

Hatfield, E., Rapson, R. & Le, Y. (2009) "Emotional Contagion and Empathy", in Decety, J. & Ickes, W. (eds) *The Social Neuroscience of Empathy*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press, pp. 19-30

Haugeland, J. (2005) "Reading Brandom Reading Heidegger", in *European Journal of Philosophy* 13/3, pp. 421–428

Hechter, M. (1978) *Internal Colonialism: The Celtic Fringe in British National Development, 1536-1966.* London: Routledge

Heidegger, M. (1927/1962) Being and Time. New York: Harper & Row

Heidegger, M. (1927/1967) Sein und Zeit. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag

Hemming, J. (1970) The Conquest of the Incas. London: Macmillan

Hermans, H. & Dimaggio, G. (2007) "Self, Identity, and Globalization in Times of Uncertainty: A Dialogical Analysis", in *Review of General Psychology* 11/1, pp. 31-61

Hintz, D.J. (2007) Aspect and Aspectual Interfaces in South Conchucos Quechua: The Emergence of Grammatical Systems. PhD Thesis, University of California

Hintz, D.M. (2007) Past Tense Forms and their Functions in South Conchucos Quechua: Time, Evidentiality, Discourse Structure, and Affect. PhD Thesis, University of California.

Hornberger, N. (1988) Bilingual Education and Language Maintenance: A Southern Peruvian Quechua Case. Dordrecht: Foris Publications

Hornberger, N. (1993) "The First Workshop on Quechua and Aymara Writing", in Fishman, J. (ed.) *The Earliest Stage of Language Planning: The "First Congress" Phenomenon*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, pp. 233-256

Hornberger, N. & Coronel-Molina, S. (2004) "Quechua Language Shift, Maintenance, and Revitalization in the Andes: The Case for Language Planning", in *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 167, pp. 9-68

Howard, R. (2002a) "Spinning a Yarn: Landscape, Memory, and Discourse Structure in Quechua Narratives", in Quilter, J. & Urton, G. (eds) (2002) *Narrative Threads: Accounting and Recounting in Andean Khipu*. Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 26-49

Howard, R. (2002b) "Yachay: The Tragedia del Fin de Atahuallpa as Evidence of the Colonization of Knowledge in the Andes", in Stobart, H. & Howard, R. (eds) *Knowledge and Learning in the Andes: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, pp. 17-39

Howard, R. (2007) *Por los linderos de la lengua: Ideologías lingüísticas en los Andes*. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos

Howard, R. (2009) "Beyond the Lexicon of Difference: Discursive Performance of Identity in the Andes", in *Latin American and Caribbean Ethnic Studies* 4/1, pp. 17-46

Howard, R. (2011) "The Quechua Language in the Andes Today: Between Statistics, the State, and Daily Life", in Heggarty, P. & Pearce, A. (eds) *History and Language in the Andes*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, pp 189-213

Howard R. (2012) "Shifting Voices, Shifting Worlds: Evidentiality, Epistemic Modality and Speaker Perspective in Quechua Oral Narrative (Central Peru)", in *Pragmatics and Society*.

Howard-Malverde, R. (1984) "'Dyablu': Its Meanings in Cañar Quichua Oral Narrative", in *Amerindia* 9, pp. 49-78

Howard-Malverde, R. (1990a) *The Speaking of History: "Willapaakushayki" or Quechua Ways of Telling the Past*. London: University of London Research Papers

Howard-Malverde, R. (1990b) "Upa. La conceptualisation de la parole et du silence dans la construction de l'identité quechua", in *Journal de la Société des Américanistes* 76/1, pp. 105-120

Howard-Malverde, R. (1992) *Quechua Concepts of Production and Possession: An Ethnolinguistic Approach*, outline of paper, Liverpool, February 1992

Howard-Malverde, R. (1997) "Introduction: Between Text and Context in the Evocation of Culture", in Howard-Malverde, R. (ed.) *Creating Context in Andean Cultures*. Oxford: OUP, pp. 3-18

Howarth, C. (2002) "Identity in Whose Eyes? The Role of Representations in Identity Construction", in *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 32/2, pp. 145-162

Hurtado, W. & Santander, M. (1994) *Poesía quechua diglósica*. Lima: Ediciones Universidad Nacional Agraria la Molina

Husson, J. (1985) La poésie quechua dans la Chronique de Felipe Waman Puma de Ayala. Paris: L'Harmattan

Husson, J. (1997) *Une survivance du théâtre des Incas: le cycle dramatique de la mort d'Atawallpa*. Doctoral thesis, Université de la Sorbonne Nouvelle-Paris III

Hymes, D. (1974) "Ways of Speaking", in Bauman, R. & Sherzer, J. (eds) *Explorations in the Ethnography of Speaking*. London: CUP

Ingold, T. (1993) "The Art of Translation in a Continuous World", in Pálsson, G. (ed.) Beyond Boundaries: Understanding, Translation and Anthropological Discourse. Oxford: Berg, pp. 210-230

Irvine, J. & Gal, S. (2000) "Language Ideology and Linguistic Differentiation", in Kroskrity, P. (ed.) *Regimes of Language: Ideologies, Polities, and Identities*. Santa Fe, NM: School of American Research Press, pp. 35-83

Itier, C. (1992) "La tradición oral quechua antigua en los Procesos de Idolatrías de Cajatambo", in *Bulletin de l'Institut Français des Études Andines* 21/3, pp. 1009-1051

Jackson, M. (1998) *Minima Ethnographica: Intersubjectivity and the Anthropological Project.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Joseph, J. (2004) Language and Identity: National, Ethnic, Religious. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan

Jovchelovitch, S. (2007) *Knowledge in Context: Representations, Community, and Culture.* London: Routledge

Julca-Guerrero, F. (2009a) Quechua ancashino: Una mirada actual. Lima: CARE Peru

Julca-Guerrero, F. (2009b) "Word Borrowing and Code Switching in Ancash Waynu Songs", in Language, Meaning and Society 2, pp. 69-106

Kapsoli, W. (1985) "La muerte del rey inca en las danzas populares y la relación de Pomabamba", in *Tierra Adentro* 3, pp. 139-176

Kaulicke, P. (2003) "Memoria historiografiada y memoria materializada: Problemas en la percepción del pasado andino preeuropeo", in *Estudios Atacameños* 26, pp. 17-34

Keysers, C. & Gazzola, V. (2009) "Expanding the Mirror: Vicarious Activity for Actions, Emotions, and Sensations", in *Current Opinion in Neurobiology* 19, pp. 1-6

King, K. (1999) "Language Revitalization Processes and Prospects: Quichua in the Ecuadorian Andes", in Language and Education 13/1, pp. 17-37

Kinnvall, C. (2004) "Globalization and Religious Nationalism: Self, Identity, and the Search for Ontological Security", in *Political Psychology* 25, pp. 741–767

Kolata, A. (1993) The Tiwanaku: Portrait of an Andean Civilization. Oxford: Blackwell

Korab-Karpowicz, W. "Martin Heidegger", in *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, http://www.iep.utm.edu/, accessed 12/06/12

Kutsch, R. (2010) *Indigenous and Popular Thinking in América*. Durham (North Carolina) & London: Duke University Press

Laidlaw, J. (1995/2003) *Riches and Renunciation: Religion, Economy, and Society among the Jains*. Oxford: Clarendon

Laing, R., Phillipson, H. & Lee, A. (1966) *Interpersonal Perception: A Theory and Method of Research*. London: Tavistock Publications

Lara, J. (1957/1989) *Tragedia del fin de Atawallpa/Atau Wallpaj p'unchykakuyninpa wankan*. Buenos Aires: Ediciones del Sol

Lara, J. (1969) La literatura de los quechuas: Ensayos y antología. La Paz: Editorial "Juventud"

Lau, G. (2010) "House Forms and Recuay Culture: Residential Compounds at Yayno (Ancash, Peru), a Fortified Hilltop Town, AD 400–800", in *Journal of Anthropological Archaeology* 29/3, pp. 327-351

Le Page, R. & Tabouret-Keller, A. (1985) *Acts of Identity: Creole-based Approaches to Language and Ethnicity*. Cambridge: CUP

Lewis, M. P., Simons, G. & Fennig, C. (eds) (2013) *Ethnologue: Languages of the World, Seventeenth edition*. Dallas, Texas: SIL International. URL: http://www.ethnologue.com

Lichtenberg, J., Lachmann, F. & Fosshage, J. (1992) *Self and Motivational Systems: Toward a Theory of Psychoanalytic Technique*. Hillsdale, NJ: Analytic Press

Lienhard, M. (1993) "La cosmología poética en los waynos quechuas tradicionales", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 19/37, pp. 87-103

Lira, J. & Farfán, J.M.B. (1955) "Himnos quechuas católicos cusqueños", in *Folklore americano* (Lima) 3/3, prologue by Arguedas, J.M.

Lord, A. (1968) "Homer as Oral Poet", in Harvard Studies in Classical Philology 72, pp. 1-46

Mannheim, B. (1986) "Poetic Form in Guaman Poma's Wariqsa Arawi", in Amerindia 11, pp. 41-67

Mannheim, B. (1987) "Couplets and Oblique Contexts: The Social Organization of a Folksong", in *Text: An Interdisciplinary Journal for the Study of Discourse* 7/3, pp. 265-288

Mannheim, B. (1991) *The Language of the Inka since the European Invasion*. Austin: University of Texas Press

Mannheim, B. (1998) "Time, Not the Syllables, Must be Counted: Quechua Parallelism, Word Meaning, and Cultural Analysis", in *Michigan Discussions in Anthropology* 13, pp. 245-287

Mannheim, B. (1999) "El arado del tiempo: Poética quechua y formación nacional", in *Revista andina* 17/1, pp. 15-64

Marr, T. (1998) The Language Left at Ticlio: Social and Cultural Perspectives on Quechua Loss in Lima, Peru. PhD Thesis, University of Liverpool

Masson, P. (1983) "Aspectos de 'cognición' y 'enculturación' en el habla interétnica: Términos de referencia y tratamiento interétnicos en Saraguro, Ecuador", in *Ibero-Amerikanisches Archiv* 9, pp. 73-129

Mayer, E. (1974) "Las reglas del juego en la reciprocidad andina", in Alberti, G. & Mayer, E. (eds) Reciprocidad e intercambio en los Andes peruanos. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, pp. 37-65

Mazzotti, J. (2003) "Bilingualism, Quechua Poetry and Migratory Fragmentations in Present-day Peru", in Sommer, D. (ed.) *Bilingual Games: Some Literary Investigations*. New York: Palgrave-Macmillan, pp. 97-119

McClelland, J. (1999) "Cognitive Modeling, Connectionist", in Wilson, R. & Keil, F. (eds) *The MIT Encyclopedia of the Cognitive Sciences*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, pp. 137-141

Mendieta, R. (1999) "The Señoríos in the Sierra and the Central Coast", in Minelli, L. & Bákula, C. (eds) *The Inca World: The Development of Pre-Columbian Peru, AD 1000 – 1534*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, pp. 37-48

Mendoza, R. (2000) *La banda de músicos: Las bellas artes musicales en el sur de Ancash*. Lima: Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos

Mendoza, Z. (2000) Shaping Society through Dance: Mestizo Ritual Performance in the Peruvian Andes. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Mendoza, Z. (2011) "Exploring the Andean Sensory Model: Knowledge, Memory, and the Experience of Pilgrimage", presentation delivered at *Cognition, Performance and the Senses* Workshop. Brighton: University of Sussex, 11-15<sup>th</sup> April 2011

Meneses, T. (1985) "Presentación en forma reiterative del drama quechua 'La muerte de Atahuallpa'", in *Revista Andina* 3/2, pp. 499-507

Merleau-Ponty, M. (1945) Phénoménologie de la perception. Paris: Gallimard

Merleau-Ponty, M. (1964) Le visible et l'invisible. Paris: Gallimard

Millones, L. (1988) El Inca por la Coya: Historia de un drama popular en los Andes peruanos. Lima: Fundación Friedrich Ebert

Millones, L. (1992) Actores de altura: Ensayos sobre el teatro popular andino. Lima: Editorial Horizonte

Mirande, M. (2005) "Memoria cultural, luchas y transacciones simbólicas en la copla cantada en la región andina de Jujuy", in Coronel-Molina, S. & Grabner-Coronel, L. (eds) *Lenguas e identidades en los Andes: Perspectivas ideológicas y culturales*. Quito: Abya-Yala, pp. 355-378

Mohanty, S. (2000) "The Epistemic Status of Cultural Identity: On 'Beloved' and the Postcolonial Condition", in Moya, P. & Hames-García, M. (eds) *Reclaiming Identity: Realist Theory and the Predicament of Postmodernism*. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 29-66

Montoya, R. (1993) "El teatro quechua como lugar de reflexión sobre la historia y la política", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 19/37, pp. 223-241

Montoya, E., Montoya, L. & Montoya, R. (1999) *Urqukunapa yawarnin / La Sangre de los cerros:* Antología de la poesía quechua que se canta en el Perú. Lima: Universidad Nacional Federico Villarreal

Mori, J. & Hayashi, M. (2006) "The Achievement of Intersubjectivity through Embodied Completions: A Study of Interactions between First and Second Language Speakers", in *Applied Linguistics* 27/2, pp. 195-219

Münzel, M. (1986) "Teil II: Indianische Oralkultur der Gegenwart", in Scharlau, B. & Münzel, M. *Qellqay: Mündliche Kultur und Schrifttradition bei Indianern Lateinamerikas*. Frankfurt: Campus Verlag, pp. 157-258

Muysken, P. (1990) "Language Contact and Grammatical Coherence: Spanish and Quechua in the Wayno of Southern Peru", in *Workshop on Constraints, Conditions and Models: European Science Foundation Network on Code Switching and Language Contact*. Strasbourg, pp. 159-188

Muysken, P. (1997) "Media Lengua", in Thomason, S. (ed.) *Contact Languages: A Wider Perspective*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, pp. 365-426

Muysken, P. (2004) "Two Languages in Two Countries: The Use of Spanish and Quechua in Songs from Peru and Ecuador", in Delgado, G. & Schechter, J. (eds) *Quechua Verbal Artistry: The Inscription of Andean Voices*. Aachen: Shaker Verlag, pp. 35-60

Niles, J. (1999) *Homo Narrans: The Poetics and Anthropology of Oral Literature*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press

Ninawaman, C. (2005) "La producción literaria en el idioma quechua como una alternativa en el fortalecimiento de la identidad e interculturalidad", in Kowii, A. (ed.) *Identidad lingüística de los pueblos indígenas de la región andina*. Quito: Abya Yala, pp. 153-177

Niño-Murcia, M. (1997) "Linguistic Purism in Cuzco, Peru: A Historical Perspective", in *Language Problems & Language Planning* 21/2, pp. 134-161

Noriega, J. (1991) "Wallparrimachi: Transición y problematización en la poesía quechua", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 33, pp. 209-225

Noriega, J. (1993) Poesía quechua escrita en el Perú: Antología. Lima: CEP

Nuckolls, J. (1993) "The Semantics of Certainty in Quechua and Its Implications for a Cultural Epistemology", in *Language in Society* 22, pp. 235-255

Ochs, E. & Capps, L. (1996) "Narrating the Self", in Annual Review of Anthropology 25, pp. 19-43

Omoniyi, T. (2006) "Hierarchy of Identities", in Omoniyi, T. & White, G. (eds) *The Sociolinguistics of Identity*. London: Continuum, pp. 11-33

Oring, E. (1994) "The Arts, Artifacts, and Artifices of Identity", in *Journal of American Folklore* 107/424, pp. 211-233

Ossio, J. (1973) "Introducción: Ideología mesiánica del mundo andino", in Ossio, J. (ed.) *Ideología mesiánica del mundo andino*. Lima: Edición de Ignacio Prado Pastor, pp. XI-XLV

Otter, E. den (1985) *Music and Dance of Indians and Mestizos in an Andean Valley of Peru*. Delft: Elburon

Paerregaard, K. (2003) "Andean Predicaments: Cultural Reinvention and Identity Creation among Urban Migrants in Peru", in Salman, T. & Zoomers, A. (eds) *Imaging the Andes: Shifting Margins of a Marginal World*. Amsterdam: Aksant, pp. 272-287

Parekh, B. (1995) "The Concept of National Identity", in *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 21/2, pp. 255-268

Parker, G. (1963) "La clasificación genética de los dialectos quechuas", in *Revista del Museo Nacional (Lima)* 32, pp. 241-252

Parker, G. (1976a) Diccionario Quechua, Ancash-Huailas. Lima: Ministerio de Educación

Parker, G. (1976b) Gramática Quechua, Ancash-Huailas. Lima: Ministerio de Educación

Paulson, S. (2003) "New Recipes for Living Better with Pachamana", in Salman, T. & Zoomers, A. (eds) *Imaging the Andes: Shifting Margins of a Marginal World*. Amsterdam: Aksant, pp. 251-271

Pavlenko, A. & Blackledge, A. (2004) "Introduction: New Theoretical Approaches to the Study of Negotiation of Identities in Multilingual Contexts", in Pavlenko, A. & Blackledge, A. (eds) *Negotiation of Identities in Multilingual Contexts*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters, pp. 1-33

Pease, F. (1973) "El mito de Inkarrí y la visión de los vencidos", in Ossio, J. (ed.) *Ideología mesiánica del mundo andino*. Lima: Edición de Ignacio Prado Pastor, pp. 439-455

Peek, P. & Yankah, K. (2003) "Introduction", in Peek, P. & Yankah, K. (eds) *African Folklore: An Encyclopedia*. London: Routledge, pp. IX-XV

Pike, K. (1954/1967) Language in Relation to a Unified Theory of the Structure of Human Behavior. The Hague: Mouton

Platt, T. (1986) "Mirrors and Maize: The Concept of Yanantin among the Macha of Bolivia", in Murra, J., Wachtel, N. & Revel, J. (eds) *Anthropological History of Andean Polities*. Cambridge: CUP, pp. 228-259

Poole, D. (1991) "Rituals of Movement, Rites of Transformation: Pilgrimage and Dance in the Highlands of Cuzco, Peru", in Crumrine, N. & Morinis, A. (eds) *Pilgrimage in Latin America*. New York: Greenwood, pp. 307-338

Pozzi-Escot, I. (1998) El multilingüismo en el Perú. Cuzco: Centro de Estudios Regionales

Price-Williams, D. (1974) "Psychological Experiment and Anthropology: the Problem of Categories", in *Ethos* 2, pp. 95-114

Quilter, J. & Urton, G. (eds) *Narrative Threads: Accounting and Recounting in Andean Khipu*. Austin: University of Texas Press

Radcliffe, S. (1990) "Marking the Boundaries between the Community, the State and History in the Andes", in *Journal of Latin American Studies* 22, pp. 575-594

Randall, R. (1987) "La lengua sagrada: El juego de palabras en la cosmología andina", in *Allpanchis* 29/30, pp. 267-305

Relucé, G. (2004) *Adolfo Vienrich: La inclusión andina y la literatura quechua*. Lima: Editorial de Universidad Ricardo Palma

Reynolds, J (2004) *Merleau-Ponty and Derrida: Intertwining Embodiment and Alterity*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press

Ritter, J. (2002) "Siren Songs: Ritual and Revolution in the Peruvian Andes", in *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 11(1), pp. 9-42

Rizzolatti, G. & Arbib, M. (1998) "Language Within Our Grasp", in *Trends in Neuroscience* 21, pp. 188-194

Rizzolatti, G. & Craighero, L. (2004) "The Mirror-Neuron System", in *Annual Review of Neuroscience* 27, pp. 169-192

Romero, R. (2001) Debating the Past: Music, Memory, and Identity in the Andes. Oxford: OUP

Rostworowski, M. (1988) "Prólogo", in Millones, L. *El Inca por la Coya: Historia de un drama popular en los Andes peruanos*. Lima: Fundación Friedrich Ebert, pp. 17-21

Rowe, J. (1961) "La arqueología de Ica", in Revista del museo regional de Ica 12/13, pp. 29-48

Rowe, W. (1993) "Dimensiones históricas de la poesía quechua: El caso de las danzas guerreras de Toqroyoq y su relación con la producción poética andina", in *Revista de crítica literaria latinoamericana* 19/37, pp. 41-62

Russell Bernard, H. (2002) Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield

Sallnow, M. (1987) *Pilgrims of the Andes: Regional Cults in Cusco*. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press

Salomon, F. & Urioste, G. (1991) *The Huarochirí Manuscript: A Testament of Ancient and Colonial Andean Religion*. Austin: University of Texas Press

Scharlau, B. & Münzel, M. (1986) *Qellqay: Mündliche Kultur und Schrifttradition bei Indianern Lateinamerikas*. Frankfurt: Campus Verlag

Seligmann, L. (2004) "The Art of Expressive Exchange: The Mediation of Quechua Identity in the Marketplace", in Delgado, G. & Schechter, J. (eds) *Quechua Verbal Artistry: The Inscription of Andean Voices*. Aachen: Shaker Verlag, pp. 123-144

Sherbondy, J. (1992) "Water Ideology in Inca Ethnogenesis", in Dover, R., Seibold, K. and McDowell, J. (eds) *Andean Cosmologies Through Time: Persistence and Emergence*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, pp. 46-66

Sichra, I. (2003) La vitalidad del quechua. La Paz, Bolivia: PROEIB

Sichra, I. (2005) "Transcending or Strengthening Quechua's Emblematic Value: Language Identity in Cochabamba", in *Working Papers in Educational Linguistics* 21/1, pp. 37-59

Skar, H. (1982) "An Andean Cosmology", University of Gothenburg Working Papers of the Department of Social Anthropology 26

Skar, S. (1994) Lives Together – Worlds Apart: Quechua Colonization in Jungle and City. Oslo: Scandinavian University Press

Silverblatt, I. (1980) "'The Universe Has Turned Inside Out...There Is No Justice for Us Here': Andean Women under Spanish Rule", in Etienne, M. & Leacock, E. (eds) *Women and Colonization: Anthropological Perspectives*. New York: Praegen, pp. 140-185

Solís, V. (2003a) "Factores que inciden en los procesos de conservación y cambio intergeneracional de la lengua quechua en dos comunidades Q'iru, Cuzco Perú", in *Memorias del Congreso de Idiomas Indígenas de Latinoamérica*, 23-25 October 2003. Austin: University of Texas, pp. 1-26

Solís, V. (2003b) "Lenguas y contactos en Ancash: Bases y prospecto para su estudio", in *Lengua y sociedad* 5, pp. 25-38

Solomon, T. (1997) Mountains of Songs: Musical Constructions of Ecology, Place, and Identity in the Bolivian Andes. PhD Thesis, University of Texas at Austin

Spedding, A. (1989) Wachu Wachu: Coca Cultivation and Aymara Identity in the Yunkas of La Paz (Bolivia). PhD Thesis, University of London

Sperber, D. & Wilson, D. (2004) "Relevance Theory", in Horn, L. & Ward, G. (eds.) *The Handbook of Pragmatics*, Oxford: Blackwell, pp 603-632

Spier, F. (1991) "Inca Syncretism", paper presented at *Annual Conference of The Society for Latin American Studies*, Glasgow, 11-13 April 1991

Spivak, G. (1988) "Subaltern Studies: Deconstructing Historiography", in Guha, R. & Spivak, G. Selected Subaltern Studies. Oxford: OUP, pp. 3-32

Stepanich, L. (1991) "Heidegger: Between Idealism and Realism", in *The Harvard Review of Philosophy* Spring 1991, pp. 20-28

Stern, S. (1983) "The Struggle for Solidarity: Class, Culture, and Community in Highland Indian America", in *Radical History Review* 27, pp. 21-45

Stobart, H. (2002) "Interlocking Realms: Knowing Music and Musical Knowing in the Bolivian Andes", in Stobart, H. & Howard, R. (eds) *Knowledge and Learning in the Andes: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, pp. 79-106

Stobart, H. (2006) Music and the Poetics of Production in the Bolivian Andes. Aldershot: Ashgate

Tajfel, H. (1982) "Social Psychology of Intergroup Relations", in *Annual Review of Psychology* 33/1, pp. 1-39

Taylor, G. (ed.) (1987) *Ritos y tradiciones de Huarochirí: Manuscrito quechua de comienzos del siglo XVII*. Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos

Thrupp, S. (1962) "Millenial Dreams in Action: A Report on the Conference Discussion", in Thrupp, S. (ed.) *Millenial Dreams in Action: Essays in Comparative Study*. The Hague: Mouton & Co., pp. 11-27

Tomoeda, H. & Millones, L. (1992) "Introducción" in Tomoeda, H. & Millones, L. (eds) 500 años de mestizaje en los Andes. Biblioteca Peruana de Psicoanálisis, pp. 13-25

Torero, A. (1974) El quechua y la historia social andina. Lima: Universidad Ricardo Palma

Torero, A. (2002) *Idiomas de los Andes: Lingüística e historia*. Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos

Trask, M. (1971) The Story of Cybernetics. London: Studio Vista

Turino, T. (1991) "The State and Andean Musical Production in Peru", in Urban, G. & Sherzer, J. (eds) *Nation-States and Indians in Latin America*. Austin: University of Texas Press, pp. 259-285

Turino, T. (1996) "From Essentialism to the Essential: Pragmatics and Meaning of Puneño Sikuri Performance in Lima", in Baumann, M. (ed.) Cosmología y Música en los Andes. Frankfurt: Vervuert, pp. 468-482

Turner, V. (1967) The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual. Ithaca: Cornell University Press

Turner, V. (1969) The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure. London: Routledge & K. Paul

Urban, G. (1991) "The Semiotics of State-Indian Linguistic Relationships: Peru, Paraguay, and Brazil", in Urban G. & Scherzer, J. (eds) *Nation States and Indians in Latin America*. Austin: University of Texas Press, pp.307-330

Urton, G. (1981) At the Crossroads of the Earth and the Sky: An Andean Cosmology. Austin: University of Texas Press

Urton, G. (1997) The Social Life of Numbers. Austin: University of Texas Press

Van Dam, A. & Salman, T. (2003) "Andean Transversality: Identity between Fixation and Flow", in Salman, T. & Zoomers, A. (eds) *Imaging the Andes: Shifting Margins of a Marginal World*. Amsterdam: Aksant, pp. 15-39

Van den Berghe, P. (1979) "Ethnicity and Class in Highland Peru", in Browman, D. & Schwarz, R. (eds) *Peasants, Primitives and Proletariats: The Struggle for Identity in South America*. The Hague: Mouton, pp. 253-266

Van der Lee, P. (2000) *Andean Music from Incas to Western Popular Music*. Göteborg: Department of Musicology, Göteborg University

Varela, F., Thompson, E. & Rosch, E. (1991) *The Embodied Mind: Cognitive Science and Human Experience*. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press

Vásquez, G. (1998) "The Ayllu", in Apffel-Marglin, F. (ed.) *The Spirit of Regeneration: Andean Culture Confronting Western Notions of Development*. London: Zed Books Ltd, pp. 89-123

Vokral, E. (1996) "La instauración del orden: Las coplas de Carnaval y su ambiente Social (provincia del Chimborazo, Ecuador)", in Baumann, M. (ed.) *Cosmología y Música en los Andes*. Frankfurt: Vervuert, pp. 397-416

Von Gleich, U. (1992) "Changes in the Status and Function of Quechua", in Ammon, U. & Hellinger, M. (eds.) *Status Changes of Languages*. Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 43-64.

Von Gleich, U. (1994) "Language Spread Policy: The Case of Quechua in the Andean Republics of Bolivia, Ecuador, and Peru", in *International Journal of the Sociology of Language* 107/1, pp. 77-114

Wachtel, N. (1977) The Vision of the Vanquished. Hassocks: Harvester Press

Webb, H. (2012) Yanantin and Masintin in the Andean World: Complementary Dualism in Modern Peru. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press

Weber, D. (1986) "Information Perspective, Profile, and Patterns in Quechua", in Chafe, W. & Nichols, J. (eds) *Evidentiality: The Linguistic Coding of Epistemology*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex, pp. 137-155

Weber, D. (1987) *Estudios quechua: Planificación, historia y gramática*. Serie Lingüística Peruana 27. Yarinacocha: Ministerio de Educación and Instituto Lingüístico de Verano

Weber, D. (1998) *Rimaycuna quechua de Huánuco: Diccionario del quechua del Huallaga con índices castellano e inglés*. Lima: Instituto Lingüístico de Verano

Wheeler, M. (2011) "Martin Heidegger", in Edward N. Zalta (ed.) *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Winter 2011 Edition), URL = http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2011/entries/heidegger/, accessed 12/06/12

Winford, D. (2003) An Introduction to Contact Linguistics. Oxford: Blackwell

Wissler, H. (2009) From Grief and Joy We Sing: Social and Cosmic Regenerative Processes in the Songs of Q'eros, Peru. PhD Thesis, Florida State University

Wölck, W. (1973) "Attitudes toward Spanish and Quechua in Bilingual Peru", in Shuy, R. & Fasold, R. (eds) *Language Attitudes: Current Trends and Prospects*. Washington DC: Georgetown Press, pp. 123-148

Yábar-Dextre, P. (1985) "Peculiarities of Vowel Length in Chiquian Quechua", in *Lenguaje y Ciencias* 25/4, pp. 109-116

Yábar-Dextre, P. (1986) "Las oraciones condicionales en el quechua ancashino, variedad de Chiquián", in Elson, B. (ed.) *Language in Global Perspective*. Dallas: SIL, pp. 407-416

Yábar-Dextre, P. (1987) "Tipos de conjugación en el quechua de Chiquián", in *Lenguaje y ciencias* 27/3-4, pp. 95-114

Yábar-Dextre, P. (1990) "El campo semántico de 'huk' (uno) en el quechua de Chiquián (Ancash)", in Lenguaje y ciencias 30/2, pp. 57-67

Yaranga, A. (1982) "El wayno en la civilización andina", paper presented at 44th International Congress of Americanists, Manchester

Zuidema, R. (1964) *The Ceque System of Cuzco: The Social Organisation of the Capital of the Inca*. Leiden: Brill

## **Images**

Image © Huhsunqu, Wikimedia Commons, <a href="http://goperu.about.com/od/planningandpacking/ss/Maps-Of-Peru\_2.htm">http://goperu.about.com/od/planningandpacking/ss/Maps-Of-Peru\_2.htm</a>, accessed 05/11/12

Sumaq Perú Travel SAC, http://www.sumaqperu.com/, accessed 05/11/12

http://www.bolognesino.wordpress.com, accessed 05/11/12

http://www.perutoptours.com/, accessed 05/11/12